

Chapter Nineteen

Innovations, Personal Opinions and Analogies

Tradition 19.1 H 156, Ch. 19, h 1

Al-Husayn ibn Muhammad al-Ash'ari has narrated from Mu'alla ibn Muhammad from al-Hassan ibn Ali al-Washsha' and a number of our people from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from ibn Faddal all from 'Asim ibn Hamid from Muhammad ibn Muslim from **Abu Ja'far^{a.s}** who has said the following:

"Amir-ul-momaneen^{a.s} said in one of his sermons to people, 'O people, mischief begins with following certain desires and obeying certain invented rules that are contrary to the rules and laws of the book of Allah^{swt}. And people nominate few and give them complete authority over themselves. So, if falsehood were clearly presented, it would not pose any difficulty to the people of Intelligence. Or if (they) say the truth, in its pure form, then there would have been no differences. But (in practice) people mix certain parts of the truth and with a few things from the falsehood and present them together to the public, and in such Satan overwhelms his friends and only those find refuge from destruction who have previously been protection from Allah^{swt} and guided to the Paradise'"

Tradition 19.2 H 157, Ch. 19, h 2

Al-Husayn ibn Muhammad has narrated from Mu'alla ibn Muhammad from Muhammad ibn Jumhur al-'Ammi in a marfu' manner (*rafa'ahu*), from the **Messenger of Allah^{swt}** who has said the following:

"When innovations (in religion) emerge within believers, it is obligatory for the scholars to share their knowledge with public, otherwise, Allah^{swt} will reprimand them."

Tradition 19.3 H 158, Ch. 19, h 3

It is narrated through the same chain of narrators from Muhammad ibn Jumhur *in a marfu' manner* from the **Messenger of Allah^{swt}** who has said the following:

"If one would meet an innovator (in religion) and endorses his position through praising his higher status, in fact, he has made an attempt to destroy Islam."

Tradition 19.4 H 159, Ch. 19, h 4

It is narrated through the same chain of narrators from Muhammad ibn Jumhur *in a marfu' manner* from the **Messenger of Allah^{swt}** who has said the following:

"Allah^{swt} has rejected repentance of an innovator (in religion)." People asked the holy Prophet^{saww} as to why is this? The holy Prophet^{saww} replied, "He has truly started loving his innovation and Allah^{swt} knows very well that he will not abandon his love for his innovation."

Tradition 19.5 H 160, Ch. 19, h 5

Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn 'Isa from al-Hassan ibn Mahbub from Mu'awiya ibn Wahab who has said the following:

"Abu 'Abdallah^{as} narrated from the holy Prophet^{saww}, who said, 'It is certain that against every innovation and plots to destroy faith, there will be a guardian of faith and its defender -an authority from my family. He^{as} will protect the religion from the attacks of enemies of Islam and reveal the 'Amr' (command) of Allah^{swt}, this authority will speak on inspiration from Allah^{swt} to revive the truth and bring it to light; repulse and foil the evil plots of the agents of wickedness and to speak for the weak and underprivileged. O people of Intelligence! take a lesson from it and trust Allah^{swt}.'" "

Tradition 19.6 H 161, Ch. 19, h 6

Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from certain persons of his people and Ali ibn Ibrahim from his father from Harun ibn Muslim from Mas'ada ibn Sadaqa from **Abu 'Abdallah (a.s.)** and Ali ibn Ibrahim from his father from ibn Mahbub *in a marfu' manner* from Amir al-Mu'minin Ali^{as} who has said the following:

"Two kinds of people are the most intensely disliked by the Allah^{swt}, the most Majestic, the Most Glorious: A person whom Allah^{swt} has left all to his own soul and he deviates from the path of justice and is intensely attracted towards his words of innovation. He seems to have full command in performing prayers and observing fasts but in fact, he is a mischief-maker to deceive people; he has strayed due to the guidance of the people before him and he himself misleads those who may follow him in his lifetime as well as after his death. He carries the responsibility for others' sins and is the hostage of his own sins.

The other person is the 'mufti or imam' who collects ignorance among the ignorant, who himself is a captive of darkness and spreads mischief. The ordinary people consider him a scholar but he has not even spent a complete day with the scholars. He has made a hasty effort to accumulate few things which are inferior in quality while turning his back on higher standard knowledge (as revealed by the Devine Imam^{as}) and in this way, he has quenched himself with the polluted water and has treasured what is of no use. He sits among the people, as a judge, to carry the responsibility of what is confusing and uncertain to others. He opposes the ruling of the judge (fatawa) before him but his judgment will not remain valid and a judge after him will over turn it, just as he has done to the judgments (fatawa) of the judges before him. When he faces one of the complex and difficult issues, he comes up with a heap of his personal opinions and then he shapes it up as a final judgment (fatawa). In fact, he has dressed himself up with doubtful issues, the same way a spider weaves his fragile web. He is not sure if he has done the right thing or the wrong one. He does not consider the fact that in an unknown case to have proper knowledge is necessary and does not see that beyond his opinion there is a school of law. He analogies one thing to the other but it does not matter to him if his opinion will turn out to be a lie. If an issue is unknown to him, he hides it to hide his own ignorance so that people will not say he does not know. He then makes a bold judgement with sheer force. Indeed, he is the key to all hazards, a rider of doubts, perplexed in ignorance and never regrets his lack of knowledge. The level of his knowledge never rises to clear-cut certainty so that he would have benefits from it. He blows out *Hadith* like winds that gust away hay. The legacies weep from him, the unjust bloodshed (judging the case of murder) shout against him. The lawful marital relations have been made unlawful because of his judgment and unlawful ones have been declared lawful. He has no confidence in his issued judgments (fatawa), he can neither be trusted for his verdicts that he has made nor was he qualified for what he may have done in the matters that he claims to have the true knowledge."

Tradition 19.7 H 162, Ch. 19, h 8

Al-Husayn ibn Muhammad has narrated from Mu'alla ibn Muhammad from al-Hassan ibn Ali al-Washsha' from Aban ibn 'Uthman from abu Shaybah al-Khurasani who has said the following:

"Abu 'Abdallah^{as} has said, 'Those (fatawa givers) who use 'Qias' (analogy) have sought knowledge through analogy and it has increased anything to their knowledge but further remoteness. The religion of Allah^{swt} is beyond the reach of analogy (Qias on similarity).'"

Tradition 19.8 H 163, Ch. 19, h 9

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from his father from Muhammad ibn 'Isma'il from al-Fadl ibn Shadhan in a marfu' manner (*rafa'ahu*) from **Abu Ja'far^{as}** and **Abu 'Abdallah^{as}** who have said the following:

"All religious innovations transform from misguidance and all misguidance lead to the Hell."

Tradition 19.9 H 164, Ch. 19, h 10

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from his father from ibn abu 'Umayr from Muhammad ibn Hukaym who has said the following:

"I asked (Imam) Abul Hassan Musa^{as}, 'May Allah^{swt} take my soul in your service, "Please make us *Faqih*, people of proper understanding in religion. Allah^{swt} has granted us the blessing of your existence among us and has made us independent of other people. This blessing is so significant upon us, that whenever we are asked questions in public gatherings, we are able to easily answer their questions. This is, indeed, Allah^{swt}'s reward because of our submission to you. However, sometimes we do come across an issue for which we have not heard an explanation from you or from your forefathers. We than reply to this issue using our best judgement while making the use of analogy on a tradition, which we have heard from you? Imam^{swt} said, "Never, never, by Allah^{swt} O ibn Hakim many people have been destroyed because of this" Ibn Hakim has said that the

Imam^{as} then said, "May Allah^{swt}'s curse be upon Abu Hanifah who used to say, "Ali^{as} said so and so, in this matter, therefore, I said so and so." Muhammad ibn Hakim has said that he told Hisham ibn al-Hakam, "By Allah^{swt}, I only wanted the Imam^{as} to give us permission to use analogy (for issuing fatawa)."

Tradition 19.10 H 165, Ch. 19, h 10

Muhammad ibn abu 'Abdallah has narrated *in a marfu' manner* from Yunus ibn 'Abd al-Rahman who has said the following:

"I asked (Imam) Abu al-Hassan^{as}, 'How would I find the signs of Allah^{swt} 's 'Touheed' in existence?'" The Imam^{as} replied, "O Yunus, do not be an innovator. The one, who depends on his personal opinions, is destroyed. The one, who abandons the members of the family of His prophet^{saww}, goes astray. Whoever abandons the book of Allah^{swt} and the words of His prophet^{saww}, becomes an unbeliever."

Tradition 19.11 H 166, Ch. 19, h 11

Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from al-Washsha' from Muthanna al-Hannat from abu Basir who has said the following:

"I asked from (Imam) Abu 'Abdallah^{as}, 'Sometimes, we encounter those issues, related to which we cannot find an answer neither in the book of Allah^{swt} nor in the *Ahadith*. Can we use our own analysis of the situation (use of analogies) and try to find a solution?'" The Imam^{as} replied, "No, you must not do so. If you would find the correct solution, you will receive no rewards for it and if you derive a wrong conclusion then you have forged lies against Allah^{swt}, the most Majestic, the most Glorious."

Tradition 19.12 H 167, Ch. 19, h 12

A number of our people has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn 'Isa from Ali ibn al-Hakam from 'Umar ibn Aban al-Kalbi from 'Abd al-Rahman al-Qasir from **Abu 'Abdallah^{as}** who has said the following:

"The Holy Prophet^{saw} said, 'All innovations (in religion) lead to misguidance and the misguidance ends up in the Hell fire.'"

Tradition 19.13 H 168, Ch. 19, h 13

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from Muhammad ibn 'Isa ibn 'Ubayd from Yunus ibn 'Abd al-Rahman from Sum'a ibn Mihran who has said the following:

"I said to (Imam) Abu al-Hassan^{as}, 'May Allah keep you well and protected, in our meetings we narrate and discuss your *Ahadith* and try to find answers to various issues from your *Ahadith*. We find, for almost every thing there is something in writing with us (*Ahadith*) and this is all because of the blessings of your existence among us. However, sometimes, we are faced with few minor issues for which we cannot find a written *hadith*, we get confused and start looking at each other. We, then, try to find a solution while making the use of analogy (the process of fatawa extraction) by considering your similar *Ahadith and* produce our best judgement (fatawa)." The Imam^{as} warned, "What do you have to do with analogy? Many people before you have been destroyed because of the use of analogy (in religion)." The Imam^{as} then said, "When you face an issue and know the rule about it, deal with it accordingly but if you do know about it then Imam^{as} pointed to his own face, meaning thereby; this will give you the answer." The Imam^{as} then said, "May Allah^{swt}'s curse be upon Abu Hanifa? Abu Hanifa who used to say, "Ali^{as} said so and so, therefore, I say so and so. The Sahabah said so and so, therefore, I say so and so. And my statements are better than theirs" The Imam^{as} then asked me, "Have you been sitting with him?" I replied, "No, I do not sit with him but, of course, such are his statements." I then said to the Imam^{as}. "May Allah^{swt} keep you well, did the holy Prophet^{saww} teach, people of his time, about everything related to them?" The Imam^{as} said, "Yes, and not only that but also all those which they would need until the Day of Judgment." I then asked, "Is there any thing lost from it?" The Imam^{as} replied, "No, it all is with the 'ahley IIm' (The Divine People)- to whom they belong."

Tradition 19.14 H 169, Ch. 19, h 14

It is narrated from him from Muhammad from Yunus from Aban from abu Shaybah who has said the following:

"I heard (Imam) Abu 'Abdallah^{as} saying, 'Ibn Shabrama's¹ knowledge has been lost (after his death). The al-Jami'ah, which belongs to us is secure, it is a large book that was dictated by the holy Prophet^{saww} to Imam Ali^{as}, who wrote it with his own hands. There is nothing, which has been left out from Al-Jami'ah. In it, is the knowledge of all lawful and unlawful matters. The people of analogy (Fatawa issuers) sought knowledge through analogy and as a consequence they kept going away from the Divine knowledge. The religion of Allah^{swt} does not consist of that which could be learnt through analogy."

Tradition 19.15 H 170, Ch. 19, h 15

Muhammad ibn 'Isma'il has narrated from al-Fadl ibn Shadhan from Safwan Yahya from 'Abd al-Rahman ibn al-Hajjaj from Aban ibn Taghlib from **Abu 'Abdallah^{as}** who has said the following:

"The Sunnah, tradition of the holy Prophet^{saww} can not be leaned through analogy. Consider a woman has to make up for her lapsed fast due to menses but it is not obligatory on her to make up for her lapsed prayers under those conditions. O Aban, when analogy (process of fatawa extraction) is used, it would only destroy religion."

Tradition 19.6 1 H 171, Ch. 19, h 16

A number of our people has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from 'Uthman ibn 'Isa who has said the following:

"I asked (Imam) Abu al-Hassan Musa^{as} about the use of analogy and the Imam^{as} said, 'What do you have to do with the guess work? Allah^{swt} will not be asked about why it was made lawful and why it was declared unlawful (He only knows the reason).'"

Tradition 19.17 H 172, Ch. 19, h 17

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from Harun ibn Muslim from Mas'ada ibn Sadaqa who has said the following:

¹ A judge during the time of Banu Abbasi .l.a.

"(Imam) Abu 'Abdallah^{as} who narrated from his father who said that Imam Ali^{as} said, 'whoever sets out for analogy his whole life will be washed away in confusion. Whoever would practice the religion of Allah^{swt} by means of analogy, his whole life will be spent under grubby condition.'" Imam Abu Ja'far^{as} then said I have heard from Imam Mohammad Baqir^{as}, "Whoever gives Fatwa on the basis of his personal opinion, he has practised the religion of Allah^{swt} through ignorance. But whoever practises this even having the knowledge of Allah^{swt}'s laws, he has acted in direct conflict with Allah^{swt} through forcing his guess work (fatawa) that makes lawful and unlawful those issues which he does not fully comprehend."

Tradition 19.18 H 173, Ch. 19, h 18

Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from al-Hassan ibn Ali ibn Yaqtin from al-Husayn ibn Mayyah from his father from **Abu 'Abdullah^{as}** who has said the following:

"Satan analogised himself with Adam^{as} saying, "Lord, You have created me from fire and created him from clay. In an analogical explanation if the substance from which Adam^{as} was made would be compared with fire it would become obvious that the earth has more 'noor' (light) and value than fire."

Tradition 19.19 H 174, Ch. 19, h 19

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from Muhammad ibn 'Isa ibn 'Ubayd from Yunus from Hariz from Zurara who has said the following:

"I asked Imam Abu 'Abdallah^{as} regarding the lawful and unlawful matters, Imam^{as} replied, "Whatever Prophet^{saww} has made lawful will remain lawful forever up to the Day of Judgment and whatever he has made unlawful will remain unlawful forever and until the Day of Judgment. There will be no one other than him^{as} and there will not come anyone to alter the religions (other than Prophet^{saww} himself). He said that Imam Ali^{as} has said, 'No one has established any innovation without abandoning an established noble tradition of ours."

Tradition 19.20 H 175, Ch. 19, h 20

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from his father from Ahmad ibn 'Abdallah al-'Aqili from 'Isa ibn 'Abdallah al-Qurashi who has said the following:

"Once abu Hanifah^{l.a.} came to see Imam Abu 'Abdallah^{as} who said to abu Hanifah^{l.a.}, "O abu Hanifah, do you practice analogy as I hear you do?"

Abu Hanifah^{l.a.} replied, "Yes, I do practice analogy." The Imam^{as} then said to him, "Do not practice it because the first person who used analogy was Satan when he said, "Lord, you have created me from the fire and created him from the clay." He analogised fire with clay. If he would have analogised the light in the clay and fire he would have learned about the difference between the two lights, the excellence of the former then would not remain obscure to him."

Tradition 19.21 H 176, Ch. 19, h 21

Ali has narrated from Muhammad ibn 'Isa from Yunus from Qutayba who has said the following:

"A man asked Imam Abu 'Abdallah^{as} about an issue and Imam^{as} replied to him. The man then said, "Have you considered if it had been so and so then what would be your judgement on it?" The Imam^{as} then said, "Wait, whatever I have said in my reply was from the holy Prophet^{saww}. We do not say anything from ourselves." (The Imam^{as} explained that they did not need reasoning process (i.e., Ijtihad-fatawa) and that all they say is from the holy Prophet^{saww}."

Tradition 19.22 H 177, Ch. 19, h 22

A number of our people have narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Khalid from his father in mursal manner (Mursalan) from **Abu Ja'far^{as}** who has said the following:

"You will not be among true believers if you follow anyone closely and intimately in the religious issues (through taqleed), which is a kind of 'Shirk; worshiping Allah^{swt} along

with someone else. Every means, including ancestral and relative relations and intimacy, innovations and doubts will be cut off on the Day of judgement, except for what was established in the holy Quran."

All praise belongs to Allah^{swt} May Allah^{swt} send peace and blessings upon Hazrat Muhammad^{saww} and his holy progeny.