

Refuting the breaking of Fast with Aamma (General Muslims)

(Refuting to the video link below)

<https://youtu.be/1eS8TXBq-7I>

Summary:

During the month of Ramazan this year (2023), the above video link was sent to us, where the speaker (the so called reformist) is seen to be trying very hard to make an issue of a non-issue which has been settled for centuries – that the slight delay in breaking Fast by the twelve Imami Shias is wrong and they should rather be embracing the practice of the Aamma (general Muslims) and break their fast and offer Maghrib Salat at the same time as the Sunnis and Salafis do – for the sake of demonstrating solidarity and unity with their Muslim brethren. Ironically, the unity would be short lived as the reformist(s) won't be joining them in the Tarawiya Salat to follow:

The reformist in the above video link (<https://youtu.be/1eS8TXBq-7I>), ignores the Holy Quran, and then ignores the criteria of establishing the authenticity of Ahadith – as well recognised by the all-Muslim sects (i.e., to compare a Hadith with the Holy Quran) but rather focuses only on the man-made and Sunni Imam fabricated criteria of *ilmul rijal* (knowledge about the character of the narrators). The real purpose of creating a storm in a teacup, apparently to create divisions and discontentment among the Shia community, as all twelve Imami followers (i.e., Usoolis and Akhbari) unanimously agree that the fast-breaking time of general Muslims is earlier than what Quran and Ahadith commend us (i.e., Verse 2:187 observe Fast to the Layl).

However, the reformist maintains the view that the *Layl* (night) occurs at the sunset, and has repeatedly shown the sun-disc descending and disappearing over a seafront. And quite discretely, the reformer labels all those who do not agree with his views as the followers of Ghulat, i.e., Abu Khatab¹ (who after renegading, was cursed by the Aimmah

¹عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ حَفْصِ بْنِ الْبَخْتَرِيِّ وَغَيْرِهِ عَنْ عَيْسَى شَلْقَانَ قَالَ كُنْتُ قَاعِدًا فَمَرَّ أَبُو الْحَسَنِ مُوسَى (عليه السلام) وَمَعَهُ بَهْمَةٌ قَالَ قُلْتُ يَا غُلَامُ مَا تَرَى مَا يَصْنَعُ أَبُوكَ يَا مُرْنَا بِالسُّنَنِ ثُمَّ يَنْهَانَا عَنْهُ أَمَرْنَا أَنْ نَتَوَلَّى أَبَا الْخَطَّابِ ثُمَّ أَمَرْنَا أَنْ نَلْعَنَهُ وَنَتَبَرَّأَ مِنْهُ

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Hafs Bin Al Bakhtary and someone else from Isa Shalqan who said,

'I was seated and Abu Al-Hassan Musa^{-asws} passed by, and with him was a goat. I said, 'O boy! What is your^{-asws} view of what your^{-asws} father^{-asws} did, ordering us with something then forbidding us from it. He^{-asws} ordered us that we befriend Abu Al-Khattab, then he^{-asws} ordered us that we curse him and we should disavow from him?'

فَقَالَ أَبُو الْحَسَنِ (عليه السلام) وَهُوَ غُلَامٌ إِنَّ اللَّهَ خَلَقَ خَلْقًا لِلْإِيمَانِ لَا رِوَالَ لَهُ وَخَلَقَ خَلْقًا لِلْكَفْرِ لَا رِوَالَ لَهُ وَخَلَقَ خَلْقًا بَيْنَ ذَلِكَ أَعَارَهُ الْإِيمَانَ يُسَمُّونَ الْمُعَارِينَ إِذَا شَاءَ سَلَبْتَهُمْ وَكَانَ أَبُو الْخَطَّابِ مِمَّنْ أُعِيرَ الْإِيمَانَ

asws) – as Abu Khatab innovated that the time of Maghrib enter upon the appearance of the stars in the sky.

Our rebuttal to the reformist of the video

(<https://youtu.be/1eS8TXBq-7I>):

The foremost is the Holy Quran and its interpretation as explained by Ahl Al-Bayt^{asws}, some of the main points of the reformist are refuted in Appendix I, with references to video minutes for the convenience of our readers.

Here, we will take those Ahadith which agree with the Holy Quran as per the well-established Ahadith authenticity criteria and not the man-made criterion of *ilmul Rijal* (the approach of the reformist in the video clip).

Allah^{azwj} says:

وَكُلُوا وَاشْرَبُوا حَتَّىٰ يَتَبَيَّنَ لَكُمُ الْخَيْطُ الْأَبْيَضُ مِنَ الْخَيْطِ الْأَسْوَدِ مِنَ الْفَجْرِ ۚ ثُمَّ أَتَمُوا الصِّيَامَ إِلَى اللَّيْلِ

And eat and drink until it is clear for you, the white thread from the black thread at dawn, then complete the Fast up to the night (2:187)

Similar to the entry of the white thread to the black thread at the dawn (fast starting time), is the entry of the night into daylight where one should see a change to the daylight prior to breaking the fast.

The one who breaks fast earlier than the prescribed time of the fast-breaking, upon him is the repeating of it. Hence, a few minutes of delay, i.e., 8-10 minutes after the metrological/calculated sunset (nearer to the equator)² rather than the eye-observed time of sunset. Prior to presenting some Ahadith, it's important to clarify how sunset is reported metrological:

The metrological announced sunset - the time at which most Muslims follow and open their Fast – is earlier than the observed sunset, as the light of sun is refracted. Near the

So Abu Al-Hassan^{asws} said, and he^{asws} was a boy: ‘Allah^{azwj} Created a people for the *Emān*, there being no decline for it, and Created a people for the *Kufr* (disbelief) there being no decline for it, and Created a people between that, Lending the *Emān* to him, named as the ‘temporary ones’. Whenever He^{azwj} so Desires, He^{azwj} Confiscates it from them, and **Abu Al-Khattab was from the ones who was Lent the *Emān***’.

قَالَ فَدَخَلْتُ عَلَىٰ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) فَأَخْبَرْتُهُ مَا قُلْتُ لِأَبِي الْحَسَنِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) وَمَا قَالَ لِي فَقَالَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) إِنَّهُ نَبْعَةٌ نُبُوَّةٌ .

He (the narrator) said, ‘So I went over to Abu Abdullah^{asws} and informed him^{asws} of what I had said to Abu Al-Hassan^{asws} and what he^{asws} had said to me. So Abu Abdullah^{asws} said: ‘He^{asws} is a spring of the Prophet-hood’.¹

² 10-15 Minutes delay in the countries located at the northern hemisphere, i.e., UK.

horizon, atmospheric refraction causes sunlight rays to be distorted to such an extent that geometrically, the solar disk is already about one diameter below the horizon when a sunset is observed.³ Therefore, the sunset is not observed until at least 2-3 minutes (time varies depending on the time of year and geographical location) after the calculated sunset time.⁴

So, the sunset which Ahadith refer to is the eye-observed sunset and not the measure/calculated one as the Islamic laws are for all times and for all people. Hence, one should adhere to the Ahadith defined Sunset criteria which will be the same for all of us.

Let's take some Ahadith to further understand to what happens if fast is opened earlier than its prescribed time and what Allah^{-azwj} Means by the Al-Layl in the Holy Quran.

One has to repeat Fast if opened earlier than Al-Layl:

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَيْسَى بْنِ عُبَيْدٍ عَنْ يُونُسَ عَنْ أَبِي بَصِيرٍ وَ سَمَاعَةَ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام) فِي قَوْمٍ صَامُوا شَهْرَ رَمَضَانَ فَعَشَبَهُمْ سَحَابٌ أَسْوَدٌ عِنْدَ غُرُوبِ الشَّمْسِ فَرَأَوْا أَنَّهُ اللَّيْلُ فَأَفْطَرُوا بَعْضُهُمْ ثُمَّ إِنَّ السَّحَابَ انْجَلَى فَإِذَا الشَّمْسُ قَالَتْ عَلَى الَّذِي أَفْطَرَ صِيَامَ ذَلِكَ الْيَوْمِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ يَقُولُ أَتَمُّوا الصِّيَامَ إِلَى اللَّيْلِ فَمَنْ أَكَلَ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَدْخُلَ اللَّيْلُ فَعَلَيْهِ قِضَاؤُهُ لِأَنَّهُ أَكَلَ مُتَعَمِّدًا .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from Muhammad Bin Isa Bin Ubeyd, from Yunus, from Abu Baseer and Sama'at,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah^{-asws} regarding a group of people who are Fasting the Month of Ramazan, so the black cloud overcomes them during the setting of the sun. So, they see it as being night, and some of them break the Fast. Then the clouds move away, so the sun is (still) there. He^{-asws} said: 'It is upon those who break (to make up for) the Fast of that day. Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic is Saying **complete the Fast up to the night [2:187]**. So, the one who eats before the entry of the night, so upon him is its making up, because he ate deliberately'.⁵

³ <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Sunset>

⁴ <https://www.reference.com/science-technology/long-sun-set-once-touches-horizon-3434d666c6ce4067>: So, once the sun touches the horizon, it takes approximately 2 to 3 minutes to go below the horizon. This is dependent on several factors, including latitude, time of year and atmospheric thickness. As the earth rotates, the sun appears to travel across the sky at a rate of 1 degree per 5.6 minutes. The disc of the sun measures approximately half a degree in diameter. Latitude, however, plays a big part in this; the closer to the equator, the more directly and quickly the sun sets. The thickness of the atmosphere that the sun's light has to travel at the horizon also alters the amount of time it takes for the sun to set. At latitudes further from the equator, sunlight has more atmosphere to travel through and thus appears to move more slowly.

⁵ Al Kafi – V 4 – The Book of Fasts Ch 19 H 2

Explanation of the Disc falls (Sunset) in Ahadith:

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ سَهْلِ بْنِ زِيَادٍ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَيْسَى بْنِ عُبَيْدٍ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَمَّنْ ذَكَرَهُ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) قَالَ وَفَتْ سُدُوطِ الْفُرْصِ وَ وُجُوبِ الْإِفْطَارِ مِنَ الصِّيَامِ أَنْ يُفُومَ بِحِدَاءِ الْقِبْلَةِ وَ يَنْفَقَدَ الْحُمْرَةَ الَّتِي تَرْتَفِعُ مِنَ الْمَشْرِقِ فَإِذَا جَارَتْ قِمَّةَ الرَّأْسِ إِلَى نَاحِيَةِ الْمَغْرِبِ فَقَدْ وَجَبَ الْإِفْطَارُ وَ سَقَطَ الْفُرْصُ .

A number of our companions, from Sahl Bin Ziyad, from Muhammad Bin Isa Bin Ubeyd, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from the one who mentioned it, from:

Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said: 'The time of the fall of the disc (sun) and the Obligation of breaking from the Fasts is that, one stands facing the Qiblah and inspects the redness which rises from the east. So when it passes overhead towards the direction of the west, so the breaking of the Fast is Obligated, and the disc falls (sun sets)'.⁶

Further Clarity on Fast Breaking time:

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ وَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ جَمِيعاً عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ حَمَّادِ بْنِ عَثْمَانَ عَنِ الْحَلْبِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) قَالَ إِنَّهُ سُبُلٌ عَنِ الْأَهْلَةِ فَقَالَ هِيَ أَهْلَةُ الشُّهُورِ فَإِذَا رَأَيْتِ الْهَيْلَالَ فَصُومِي وَإِذَا رَأَيْتَهُ فَأَفْطِرِي .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, and Muhammad Bin Yahya, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad, altogether from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Hammad Bin Usman, from Al Halby, from:

Abu Abdullah^{-asws}, said, 'He^{-asws} was asked about the crescent, so he^{-asws} said: 'It is the crescent of the month. So, whenever you sight the new moon, so Fast (from next Dawn), and when you sight it (again – after a month), so break the Fasting'. (The crescent is never visible at the meteorological reported sunset but only after its light rays begin to disappear from the eyesight).⁷

When is the Sunset (observed)?

Islam is for all times, ages – so that all people can act upon its laws, and not only those who have access to meteorological data. Therefore, in Ahadith, we are informed about the sunset, the transition of night fall, the full night (when the stars become visible) leading to the breaking of the Dawn.

⁶ Al Kafi – V 4 – The Book of Fasts Ch 20 H 1

⁷ Al Kafi – V 4 – The Book of Fasts Ch 6 H 1

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ وَ عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ جَمِيعاً عَنْ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنِ الْقَاسِمِ ابْنِ عُرْوَةَ عَنْ بُرَيْدِ بْنِ مُعَاوِيَةَ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا جَعْفَرٍ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام) يَقُولُ إِذَا غَابَتِ الْحُمْرَةُ مِنْ هَذَا الْجَانِبِ يَعْنِي نَاحِيَةَ الْمَشْرِقِ فَقَدْ غَابَتِ الشَّمْسُ فِي شَرْقِ الْأَرْضِ وَ غَرْبِهَا .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, and a number of our companions, from Ahmad Bi Muhammad, altogether from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Al Qasim Ibn Urwat, from Bureyd Bin Muawiya who said,

'I heard Abu Ja'far-asws saying: 'When the redness disappears from this side, meaning the direction of the east, so the sun has disappeared in the east of the earth and its west'.⁸

Nothing Happens to the Fast by delaying it by a few minutes:

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ حَمَّادٍ عَنِ الْحَلْبِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام) قَالَ سُئِلَ عَنِ الْإِفْطَارِ قَبْلَ الصَّلَاةِ أَوْ بَعْدَهَا قَالَ إِنْ كَانَ مَعَهُ قَوْمٌ يَخْشَى أَنْ يَحْسِبَهُمْ عَنْ عَشَائِهِمْ فَلْيُفْطِرْ مَعَهُمْ وَ إِنْ كَانَ غَيْرُ ذَلِكَ فَلْيُصَلِّ وَ لْيُفْطِرْ .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Hammad, from Al Halby, from;

Abu Abdullah-asws, said, 'He-asws was asked about the breaking of the Fast before the Prayer (of Maghrib) or after it (offering Maghrib). He-asws (the Imam-asws) said: 'If it was such that with him are a group of people, he is fearing withholding them from their dinner (not fasting), so let him break Fast along with them, but if it was other than that, so let him Pray, and let him break the Fast (after offering Maghrib Salat)'.⁹

The Definition of Al-Layl in the Holy Quran:

In the Holy Quran, *Al-Layl* is mentioned at several places, in the meanings of a cover/darkness, which, surely, is later than the metrological reported sunset, e.g.

وَاللَّيْلِ إِذَا يَغْشَاهَا

And the night when it covers it (day), [91:4]

وَاللَّيْلِ إِذَا عَسْعَسَ

⁸ Al Kafi – V 4 – The Book of Fasts Ch 20 H 2

⁹ Al Kafi – V 4 – The Book of Fasts Ch 20 H 3

And the night as it darkly falls, (Asad) 84:17

وَاللَّيْلِ إِذَا يَغْشَىٰ

(Consider) the night as it veils [the earth] in darkness, (Asad) 92:1

يُغْشَىٰ اللَّيْلُ النَّهَارَ يَطْلُبُهُ حَثِيثًا

He covers the day with the night in swift pursuit...! (Asad) 7:54

There is Vastness in the Religion:

Islam has vastness, Allah-azwj has Made ease in it so that we lead a balanced life, i.e., fulfil the duties of religion, work to meet the living expenses and take care of family and positively interact with society, below is a beautiful Hadith when people overdo and constrict upon themselves which is grossly a self-inflicted misery.

وَمِنْهُ، بِحَدِّثِ الْإِسْنَادِ قَالَ: سَأَلْتُهُ عَنِ الْجُبَّةِ الْفَرَاءِ يَأْتِي الرَّجُلُ السُّوقَ مِنْ أَسْوَاقِ الْمُسْلِمِينَ فَيَشْتَرِي الْجُبَّةَ لَا يَدْرِي أَمْ هِيَ ذَكِيَّةٌ أَمْ لَا يُصَلِّي فِيهَا

And from him, by this chain, said,

'I asked him-asws about the fur coat. The man comes to the market from markets of the Muslims. He buys the coat. He does not know whether it is purified (slaughtered animal) or no. He prays Salat in it.

قَالَ نَعَمْ إِنَّ أَبَا جَعْفَرٍ ع كَانَ يَقُولُ إِنَّ الْخَوَارِجَ ضَيَّفُوا عَلَيَّ أَنْفُسَهُمْ بِجَهَالَتِهِمْ إِنَّ الدِّينَ أَوْسَعُ مِنْ ذَلِكَ إِنَّ عَلِيَّ بْنَ أَبِي طَالِبٍ ع كَانَ يَقُولُ إِنَّ شِبَعَتَنَا فِي أَوْسَعِ مِمَّا بَيْنَ السَّمَاءِ إِلَى الْأَرْضِ أَنْتُمْ مَعْفُورٌ لَكُمْ.

He-asws said: 'Yes. Abu Ja'far-asws had said: 'The Kharijites have constricted upon themselves due to their ignorance. The religion is vaster than that. Ali-asws Bin Abu Talib-asws had said: 'Our-asws Shias are in more vastness than what is between the sky to the earth. You (Shias) are Forgiven for (your sins)'.¹⁰

¹⁰ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 76 – The Book Cleanliness – Ch 2 H 2 (Chapters on uncleanness and its purifiers)

Concluding Remarks:

Na baba na this reform is a no! To please general Muslims at the cost of the spoiling of one's own Fast, as well as causing rift and discontentment among the twelve Imami Shias, is neither a constructive campaign nor Islamic. It is harmful and destructive for shias who have been united for centuries and practicing in this way.

In additional, those who love to benefit from the knowledge of the reformist of the video clip being refuted here, must note that his beliefs are contrary to that of mainstream shia faith. For example, at **about 36:48 minutes, he categorically denied the Ism of Syeda^{asws} the daughter of Rasool-Allah^{saww}, and again at 1:14:47**, he denies that Imam Jafar^{asws} or Masomeen^{asws} had the knowledge of *Ilmul Ghaiyb* (Knowledge of the Hidden) as he has commented when referring to the actions of Abu Khatab.

Our refuting of the main points raised by the reformist are briefly included in the Appendix:

APPENDIX I

Replies to some of the main points of the reformist

The reformist is challenging the centuries old and well-established practice of fast-breaking time of the followers of Ahl Al-Bayt^{asws} (all shias either from the Usooli or Akhbari school of thoughts are united at the prevailing fast-breaking time). The reformist alleges that their delay of (8-10 minutes in most cases) in breaking Fast after the metrological announced sunset time, is based on the Ahadith narrated by Ghulat (the exaggerators) and thus, those who knowingly delay breaking their Fast beyond the time observed by the general Muslims are basically followers of Ghulat! Once again the link to the reformer’s video is given below and in Appendix we cite his quoted Ahadith and briefly refute his baseless allegations against the twelve Imami Shias fast breaking time.

(Link to the reformers allegations against 12 Imami Shias: <https://youtu.be/1eS8TXBq-7I>)

Allegations of the reformer and our defence:

In the video link (<https://youtu.be/1eS8TXBq-7I>) in general, he has a habit of long-winded talk so he does not come to the point until at **19:19 minutes**. However, prior to 19:19 minutes, the reformist emphasises the criteria of Ahadith authenticity. The reformist ignores the basic and foremost criteria - the Holy Quran - but adheres to the man-made one, the *ilmul rejal* (scrutiny of the narrators), as fabricated by the non-Shia imams – from the Ahl-e-Sunnah! Isn’t it very strange, no reference is made to the Quranic Verses related to Fasting.

A selective and devious approach is executed to destroy the unity among the Shias of Ahl Al-Bayt^{asws}, with respect to time of fast breaking, I would suggest to him to rather focus his energies and efforts on uniting the Muslim Ummah on the 1st of Shawwal where there are usually two to three days of Eid celebrations. The Idea of breaking the fast before the actual sunset comes from Ahadith found in Sahih Bukhari¹¹. In fact Allah^{azwj} Says in Holy Quran (2:187) **تَمُّوا الصِّيَامَ إِلَى اللَّيْلِ** (Complete the fast to the night)¹². Let’s move on and we will return to this Holy Verse later on.

At **20:00** minutes, finally the reformist shows his love and care for those Muslims who are ready to assassinate Shias (if and when given an opportunity) and says opening fast

¹¹ Sahih Bukhari 3:31:162

¹² Some erroneous translations read "until night" or "until nightfall" - both are incorrect, the correct translation is "to the night"

later than other Muslims simply destroys the unity among the Muslims! Hence, if possible, we should break Fast with other Muslims. He wants to be friendly with Salafis among the Muslims (@ 21:00 minutes) – the Salafis who have and always will declare Shias as Kafir and have legitimised shedding blood of Shias – history of full of examples how many twelve Imami shias they have killed!!

At 33:30 minutes, the reformist admits there is a difference of opinion among the Shia scholars with regard to time of opening Fast, but then he insists that those delay after the (meteorological announced) sunset have been wrong and were under the influence of Ghulat (the exaggerators) and alleges that the followers of imams of Ahl e Sunnah have been on the correct position with regard to opening of the fast.

At about 36:48 minutes, the reformist comes to the Book 'Rijal Al-Kashi', and presents a Hadith about the Ghulat, and alleges in the interpretation of Hadith that Syeda^{-asws} Bint –e Mohammed^{-saww} also went through all the same as other women go through (Nouzobillah), he completely rejects what has revealed in Ayat e Tathir, Hadith e Kisa, and so many other Ahadith that Allah-azwj Kept Rijs away from Syeda^{-asws} and was Tahira^{-asws} under all conditions, so were the five people^{-asws} of the Cloak. Sadly, the reformist has a completely ignorant and erroneous stand regarding the Ism of Syeda^{-asws}.

In the later part of the Hadith from Rijal Al-Kashi, he returns to the topic and says, Imam Jafar-e-Sadiq^{-asws} denounces a Ghali and says, I^{-asws} have not asked them to delay Salat of Maghrib until stars becomes visible. We do not find any issue with the quoted Hadith, as this Hadith is consistent with other Ahadith, i.e., Imam-e-Zaman^{-ajfi} says (in a Touqi Mubarak): (Imam^{-ajfi} says) He is maloun who delays his Salat of Maghrib until the appearance of the stars, Hadith is given in Appendix II.

At 48:00 minutes, the reformist alleges that Imam Sadiq^{-asws} did not know the names of all stars in the sky (Nouzobillah), but in the Hadith, Imam^{-asws} meant that there is no such star as named by Abu Khatab in the sky.

At 49:50 minutes, the reformist wishes if Shias were to merge with the rest of the Ummah, like him;

At 56:00 minutes, the reformist alleges while presenting a second Hadith from Rijal Al-Kashi, that if someone waits 20 minutes after sunset, he would miss the time of Maghrib;

Our reply: From scientific observations, depending where one is with reference to the equator, for naked eye sky observations, it takes from 40 to 140 minutes after sunset, the visibility of the stars as darkness starts to prevail. In Lahore (Pakistan) Shias offer Maghrib Salat (Break Fast after Salat) 8-10 minutes after Sunset. For example, in London (UK) today (15/05/23) Sunset was at 20:47, Maghrib time was 21:06, the stars have not appeared still at 21:38 (so over 50 minutes after the sunset stars have not become visible as there is still light in the sky). Stars start to appear at about 21:52 (~ an hour after sunset). A very similar observation in London was made on next day (sunset 20:47, Maghrib 21:06, end of Maghrib Salat 21:18 and enough still light, at 21:47 no stars until 22:00).

At 1:03, the reformist contradicts the *Usooli Rejal Ahadith* criteria by saying even if a Hadith comes from Imam Jafar e Sadiq-asws, which has sound and reliable narrators regarding delaying a few minutes Maghrib Salat after sunset, he would reject it!

At 1:11:30: minutes the reformist quotes the following Hadith:

وَرَوَى أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ جَنَاحٍ عَنْ بَعْضِ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنِ الرَّضَا ع قَالَ: إِنَّ أَبَا الْخَطَّابِ قَدْ كَانَ أَفْسَدَ عَامَّةِ أَهْلِ الْكُوفَةِ وَكَانُوا لَا يُصَلُّونَ الْمَغْرِبَ حَتَّى يَغِيبَ الشَّفَقُ وَإِنَّمَا ذَلِكَ لِلْمُسَافِرِ وَالْحَائِفِ وَ لِصَاحِبِ الْحَاجَةِ.

And Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Isa narrated on the authority of Saeed bin Janah on the authority of some of our companions on the authority of Al-Reza-asws who said:

Aba Al-Khattab was the most corrupt of the people of Kufa, and they did not pray Maghrib until the twilight had passed (stars became visible), and that (allowance) was only for traveller, the fearful, and the needy.¹³

At 1:12:17 minutes the reformist quotes the following Hadith:

أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ أَبِي حَمَزَةَ عَمَّنْ ذَكَرَهُ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ قَالَ: مُلْعُونٌ مَنْ أَخَّرَ الْمَغْرِبَ طَلَبَ فَضْلَهَا.

Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Isa, on the authority of Muhammad bin Abi Hamza, on the authority of those who mentioned him, on the authority of Abi Abdullah-asws said:

Cursed is he who is late in the Maghrib, but seek Blessing of (Allah-azwj).¹⁴

Our reply: The reformist very cunningly avoids the next Hadith (52 under the above 51 Hadith from Tahzeeb ul Ahkaam) of Imam Jafar-e-Sadiq-asws, where Imam-asws says, there is no problem with if one delays his Maghrib Salat until disappearance of redness, see below the Hadith.

وَرَوَى سَعْدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنِ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ عَلِيِّ بْنِ فَصَّالٍ عَنْ جَمِيلِ بْنِ دَرَّاجٍ قَالَ: قُلْتُ لِأَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع مَا تَقُولُ فِي الرَّجُلِ الَّذِي يُصَلِّي الْمَغْرِبَ بَعْدَ مَا يَسْقُطُ الشَّفَقُ فَقَالَ لِعِلَّةٍ لَا بَأْسَ قُلْتُ فَالرَّجُلُ يُصَلِّي الْعِشَاءَ الْآخِرَةَ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَسْقُطَ الشَّفَقُ فَقَالَ لِعِلَّةٍ لَا بَأْسَ.

And Saad bin Abdullah narrated on the authority of Ahmed bin Muhammad on the authority of Al-Hassan bin Ali bin Faddal on the authority of Jamil bin Darraj who said:

I said to Abi Abd Allah-asws: What do you-asws say about the man who prays Maghrib after the twilight has passed, and he-asws said, "there is no problem with it?" I said, "The man prays the last 'Isha' before the twilight fell, and he-asws said, "there is no problem with it."¹⁵

¹³ 51, H. تهذيب الأحكام (تحقيق خرسان)، ج2، ص: 33

¹⁴ 52, H. تهذيب الأحكام (تحقيق خرسان)، ج2، ص: 33

¹⁵ 53, H. تهذيب الأحكام (تحقيق خرسان)، ج2، ص: 33

At 1:14:37, after deliberately excluding the Hadith no. 52, the reformist quotes the next Hadith from Tahzeeb ul Ahkaam (Hadith no. 53) which has already quoted before, i.e., delaying the Maghrib Salat until stars become visible:

وَرَوَى مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنِ الْعَبَّاسِ بْنِ مَعْرُوفٍ عَنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ الْمُغِيرَةِ عَنْ دَرِيحٍ قَالَ: قُلْتُ لِأَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ إِنَّ أَنَسًا مِنْ أَصْحَابِ أَبِي الْخَطَّابِ يُسْتَوْنَ بِالْمَغْرِبِ حَتَّى تَشْتَبِكَ النُّجُومُ قَالَ أَبْرَأُ إِلَى اللَّهِ مِمَّنْ فَعَلَ ذَلِكَ مُتَعَمِّدًا.

And Muhammad bin Ali bin Mahboub narrated on the authority of Al-Abbas bin Maarouf on the authority of Abdullah bin Al-Mughira on the authority of Dharir who said:

I said to Abi Abd Allah^{-asws}, some of the companions of Abi Al-Khattab delayed the Maghrib Salat until the appearance of the stars, Imam^{-asws} said, I^{-asws} disassociate from them for Allah^{-azwj} who did it on purpose/intentions.¹⁶

At 1:14:47 minutes, the reformist says how did Imam Jafar^{-asws} knew about Ibn Khatab's acts? Did the Imam^{-asws} had the Ilmul Ghaiyb (Knowledge of the Hidden)? Then he says No, but Imam^{-asws} was informed by the people. These are the Salafi beliefs, maybe he is one of them!

At 1:17:40, he repeats the Ahadith 51 (quoted above),

At 1:17:40, he repeats the same Hadith (delaying the Maghrib until the appearance of stars) from Manlah Yahzar ul Fakkih, vol. 1, cited below:

وَقَالَ الصَّادِقُ ع - مَلْعُونٌ مَلْعُونٌ مَنْ أَخَّرَ الْمَغْرِبَ طَلَبًا لِفَضْلِهَا وَ قِيلَ لَهُ إِنَّ أَهْلَ الْعِرَاقِ يُؤَخِّرُونَ الْمَغْرِبَ حَتَّى تَشْتَبِكَ النُّجُومُ فَقَالَ هَذَا مِنْ عَمَلِ عَدُوِّ اللَّهِ أَبِي الْخَطَّابِ¹⁷.

And Al-Sadiq^{-asws} said - Cursed, cursed is the one who delays Maghrib seeking its bounty, and he was told that the people of Iraq delay Maghrib Salat until so late that the stars become visible, and he^{-asws} said, "This is the work of the enemy of God, Abu Al-Khattab."¹⁸

At 1:19:30, minutes, the reformist praises *Ilmul Rijal*, a man-made system, originating from followers of the enemies of Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws}, then the reformist talks about his love for the Aamma (the followers of the false imams).

At 1:22:00, minutes, the reformist quotes another Hadith from Manlah Yahzar ul Fakkih, vol. 1, cited below:

¹⁶ H. 53, تهذيب الأحكام (تحقيق خراسان)، ج2، ص: 33

¹⁷ (3). هو محمد بن مقلص الأسدي الكوفي غال ملعون و يكنى مقلص أبا زينب كان محمد في عصر الصادق عليه السلام وكان من أصحابه فكفر و ادعى أيضا النبوة و زعم أن جعفرًا عليه السلام اله- تعالى الله عز و جل عن قوله- و استحل المحارم كلها، و رخص لاصحابه فيها و كانوا كلما ثقل عليهم أداء فرض أتوه فقالوا: يا أبا الخطاب خفف عنا فيأمرهم بتركه حتى تركوا جميع الفرائض و استحلوا جميع المحارم و أباح لهم أن يشهد بعضهم لبعض بالزور، و قال: من عرف الامام حل له كل شيء كان حرم عليه، فبلغ أمره جعفر بن محمد عليهما السلام فلم يقدر عليه بأكثر من أن لعنه و تبرأ منه، و جمع أصحابه فعرفهم ذلك و كتب الى البلدان بالبراءة منه و باللعنة عليه و عظم أمره على أبي عبد الله عليه السلام و استفظعه و استهاله. انتهى (المستدرک) و قوله « تشتبك النجوم » أي تكثرت حتى تصير كالشبكة بتعانق بعضها بعضا و هو كناية عن ذهاب قدر يعتد به من الليل. (مراد).

من لا يحضره الفقيه، ج1، ص: 220¹⁸

وَرَوَى مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى الْحَنْتَعَمِيُّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع أَنَّهُ قَالَ - كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص يُصَلِّي الْمَغْرِبَ وَ يُصَلِّي مَعَهُ حَتَّى مِنْ الْأَنْصَارِ يُقَالُ لَهُمْ بَنُو سَلَمَةَ مَنَازِلُهُمْ عَلَى نِصْفِ مِيلٍ فَيُصَلُّونَ مَعَهُ ثُمَّ يَنْصَرِفُونَ إِلَى مَنَازِلِهِمْ وَ هُمْ يَرَوْنَ مَوَاضِعَ سِهَامِهِمْ¹⁹.

And Muhammad bin Yahya Al-Khathami narrated on the authority of Abi Abdullah-asws, peace be upon him, that he said – Rasool Allah-saww, used to pray Maghrib and he prayed with him. A neighbourhood among the Ansaar who is called Banu Salamah, their homes are half a mile away, and they pray with him, then they leave for their homes and they see the place of their arrows (the latter part of the narration is an opinion/guess of a person).²⁰

At 1:25:35, minutes, the reformist quotes another Hadith from Nahjul Balagha, letter no. 52:

أَمَّا بَعْدُ فَصَلُّوا بِالنَّاسِ الظُّهْرَ حَتَّى تَفِيءَ الشَّمْسُ [مِثْلًا] مِنْ مَرِيضِ الْعَنْزِ وَ صَلُّوا بِهِمُ الْعَصْرَ وَ الشَّمْسُ بَيْضَاءُ حَيْثُ فِي عُضْوٍ مِنَ النَّهَارِ حِينَ يُسَارُ فِيهَا فَرَسَخَانِ وَ صَلُّوا بِهِمُ الْمَغْرِبَ حِينَ يُفْطِرُ الصَّائِمُ وَ يَدْفَعُ الْحَاجُّ إِلَى مِيٍّ وَ صَلُّوا بِهِمُ الْعِشَاءَ حِينَ يَتَوَارَى الشَّقَقُ إِلَى ثُلْثِ اللَّيْلِ وَ صَلُّوا بِهِمُ الْعَدَاةَ وَ الرَّجُلُ يَعْرِفُ وَجْهَ صَاحِبِهِ وَ صَلُّوا بِهِمُ صَلَاةَ أَوْعَفِهِمْ وَ لَا تَكُونُوا قَتَانِينَ

‘As for after, pray Al-Zohr Salat with the people when the sun casts a shadow like the goat pen, and pray Al-Asr Salat with them and the sun is white in the course of the day travelling two Farsakhs in it, and pray Al-Maghrib with them when the fasting one breaks (his Fast), and the pilgrim departs (from Arafaat), and pray Al-Isha Salat with them when the redness is covered up to a third of the night, and pray the morning Salat with them and the man can recognise the face of his companion, and pray Salat with them Salat of their weak ones and do not become troublesome (by unnecessarily prolonging congregational Salat)’.²¹

Here is the reformist is confused, What’s the point here, only he, the reformist can explain in his next video?

At 1:28:15, the reformist moves to the Bihar ul-Anwaar,

مَجَالِسِ الصَّدُوقِ، عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ سَعْدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنِ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَيْسَى وَ مُوسَى بْنِ جَعْفَرِ الْبَغْدَادِيِّ مَعًا عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ الصَّلْتِ عَنِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ عَلِيِّ بْنِ فَضَّالٍ عَنْ دَاوُدَ بْنِ أَبِي يَزِيدَ عَنِ الصَّادِقِ ع قَالَ: إِذَا غَابَتِ الشَّمْسُ فَقَدْ دَخَلَ وَفَتْ الْمَغْرِبِ²².

Majalis Al-Sadduq, on the authority of his father, on the authority of Saad bin Abdullah, on the authority of Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Isa and Musa bin Jaafar al-Baghdadi, together, on the authority of Bad Allah Ibn Al-Salt, on the authority of Al-Hassan Ibn Ali Ibn Faddal, on the authority of Dawood Ibn Abi Yazid, on the authority of:

¹⁹ (2). أي إذا راموا سهامهم يرون موضعها لبقاء ضوء النهار بعد، و المراد أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله كان يجعل صلاة المغرب (سلطان) أقول: في الصحاح سهم البيت: جائزه. و قال في «جوز» الجائز: الجذع الذي يقال له بالفارسية «تير» و هو سهم البيت.

²⁰ من لا يحضره الفقيه، ج1، ص: 220

²¹ Nahj Al Balagah – Letter No. 52

²² (5) أمالي الصدوق ص 49.

Al-Sadiq-asws, said When the sun disappears (sunlight disappears), the time for Maghrib has begun.²³

At 1:29:28, the reformist quotes another Hadith, (from illul Shiria, copied in Bihar ul-Anwaar),

حَدَّثَنَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ أَحْمَدَ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ السِّنْدِيِّ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحَكَمِ رَفَعَهُ عَنْ أَحَدِهِمَا أَنَّهُ سُئِلَ عَنْ وَقْتِ الْمَغْرِبِ فَقَالَ إِذَا غَابَتْ كُرْسِيُّهَا قَالَ وَ مَا كُرْسِيُّهَا قَالَ قُرْصُهَا قَالَ مَتَى يَغِيبُ قُرْصُهَا قَالَ إِذَا نَظَرْتَ فَلَمْ تَرَهُ.

Ahmad Bin Muhammad narrated to us, from his father, from Muhammad Bin Ahmad, from Muhammad Bin Al Sindy, from Ali Bin Al Hakam, raising it,

(It has been narrated) from one of them-asws (5th or 6th Imam-asws), that he-asws had been asked about the timing for *Al-Maghrib*, so he-asws said: 'When its (sun's) chair disappears'. He said, 'And what is its chair?' He-asws said: 'Its disc'. He said, 'When does its disc disappear?' He-asws said: 'When you look, so you do not see it'.²⁴

At 1:32:48, minutes, the reformist quotes a Hadith from Manlah Yahzar ul Fakkih, see below,

وَ قَالَ الصَّادِقُ ع إِذَا غَابَتِ الشَّمْسُ فَقَدْ حَلَّ الْإِفْطَارُ وَ وَجِبَتِ الصَّلَاةُ وَ إِذَا صَلَّيْتَ الْمَغْرِبَ فَقَدْ دَخَلَ وَقْتُ الْعِشَاءِ الْآخِرَةِ إِلَى انْتِصَافِ اللَّيْلِ.

Al-Sadiq-asws, said: If the sun has set, then break Fast has come and prayer has become obligatory, and if you have prayed Maghrib, then the time for dinner has entered. The last until midnight.²⁵

From 1:43:26 minutes until the end, the reformist keeps on repeat the same points, again and again.

²³ بحار الأنوار (ط - بيروت)، ج80، ص: 56

²⁴ ILLAL AL SHARAIE – V 2 Ch 60 H 4

²⁵ من لا يحضره الفقيه، ج1، ص: 221

APPENDIX II

Don't Delay Maghrib until appearance of the stars at night

ج، الإحتجاج غط، الغيبة للشيخ الطوسي روى مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَعْقُوبَ رَفَعَهُ عَنِ الرَّهْرِيِّ قَالَ طَلَبْتُ هَذَا الْأَمْرَ طَلَبًا شَاقًّا حَتَّى دَهَبَ لِي فِيهِ مَالٌ صَالِحٌ فَوَقَعْتُ إِلَى الْعَمْرِيِّ وَ حَدَّثْتُهُ وَ لَزِمْتُهُ وَ سَأَلْتُهُ بَعْدَ ذَلِكَ عَنْ صَاحِبِ الزَّمَانِ فَقَالَ لِي لَيْسَ إِلَيَّ ذَلِكَ وَصَوْلٌ فَخَضَعْتُ

(The books) ‘Al-Ihtijaj’, (and) ‘Al Ghayba’ of the Sheikh Al Tusi – It is reported by Muhammad Bin Yaqoub, raising it from Al Zuhry who said,

‘I sought this matter with a hard search until a lot of money of mine went regarding it. I went to Al-Amry and served him and adhered with him and asked him about Master-^{ajfi} of the Time after that. He said to me, ‘There is no arrival to that’. I yielded.

فَقَالَ لِي بَكِّرْ بِالْعَدَاةِ فَوَاقَيْتُ وَ اسْتَقْبَلَنِي وَ مَعَهُ شَابٌّ مِنْ أَحْسَنِ النَّاسِ وَجْهًا وَ أَطْيَبِهِمْ رَائِحَةً بِهَيْئَةِ التُّجَّارِ وَ فِي كُمِّهِ شَيْءٌ كَهَيْئَةِ التُّجَّارِ

He said to me, ‘Come early morning for the breakfast. I arrived and he welcomed me, and there was a youth with him from the most handsome face of the people and their most pleasant of aromas, in the form of traders, and in his-^{ajfi} sleeve was something like a marking of the traders.

فَلَمَّا نَظَرْتُ إِلَيْهِ دَنَوْتُ مِنَ الْعَمْرِيِّ فَأَوْمَأَ إِلَيَّ فَعَدَلْتُ إِلَيْهِ وَ سَأَلْتُهُ فَأَجَابَنِي عَنْ كُلِّ مَا أَرَدْتُ ثُمَّ مَرَّ لِيَدْخُلَ الدَّارَ وَ كَانَتْ مِنَ الدُّورِ الَّتِي لَا نَكْتَرُ لَهَا فَقَالَ الْعَمْرِيُّ إِذْ أَرَدْتُ أَنْ تَسْأَلَ سَلْ فَإِنَّكَ لَا تَرَاهُ بَعْدَ ذَا

When I looked at him, I went near Al-Amry. He-^{ajfi} gestured to me, so I turned towards him-^{ajfi} and asked him-^{ajfi}. He-^{ajfi} answered me about all what I wanted. Then he-^{ajfi} went to enter the room, and it was from the rooms we (normally) pay any attention to it. Al-Amry said, ‘Al-Amry said, ‘When you want to ask, ask, for you will not see him-^{ajfi} afterward this’.

فَدَهَبْتُ لِأَسْأَلَ فَلَمْ يَسْمَعْ وَ دَخَلَ الدَّارَ وَ مَا كَلَّمَنِي بِأَكْثَرٍ مِنْ أَنْ قَالَ مَلْعُونٌ مَلْعُونٌ مِنْ أَخْرِ الْعِشَاءِ إِلَى أَنْ تَشْتَبِكَ النُّجُومُ مَلْعُونٌ مَلْعُونٌ مِنْ أَخْرِ الْعَدَاةِ إِلَى أَنْ تَنْقُضِيَ النُّجُومَ وَ دَخَلَ الدَّارَ.

I went to ask, but he-^{ajfi} did not listen and entered the room, and did not speak to me more than saying: ‘Accursed! Accursed is the one who delays the ‘Isha’ until the stars cluster. Accursed! Accursed is the one who delays the early morning until the stars disappear!’ And he-^{ajfi} entered the room”.²⁶

²⁶ Bihar Al Anwaar – V 52 The book of History – Imam Al-Mahdi-^{ajfi}, Ch 18 H 13

لفظ «العشاء» مصحف و الصحيح «المغرب» و ذلك لان وقته المسنون يبتدئ من سقوط الحمرة الى سقوط الشفق المساوق لاشتباك النجوم فمن آخر صلاة المغرب عن اشتباك النجوم خالف السنة كما أن وقت صلاة الصبح المسنون يبتدئ من الغلس الى ظهور الشفق المساوق لانقضاء النجوم فمن أخرها الى انقضاء النجوم قد خالف السنة.

Note: The word 'Al-Isha' is distorted (wrong), and the correct is 'Al-Maghrib', and that is because its timing is legislated as beginning from the fall of the redness to the fall of the twilight, leading to the clustering of the stars. So, the one who delays the 'Maghrib' Salat from the clustering of the stars would be opposing the Sunnah, just as the timing of the morning Salat is legislated as beginning from the dusk to the appearance of twilight leading to the disappearance of the stars. So, the one who delays it to the disappearance of the stars would have opposed the Sunnah.