

Talib Johri (late) Misleads on Taqleed

Please watch the below video link

https://youtu.be/3L92Er5_A0k

The above Video clip, has been, repeatedly shared by the supports of Taqleed and Ijtihad – Hence we decided to prepare a rebuttal

Talib Johri (Late) starts with the true Touqi (Hadith) ‘to turn to the narrators of Ahadith when faced by new issues- from Imam e Zamana-ajfj’s Touqi Mubarak’, but then misleads by claiming **(about @ 20 seconds)** that the Mujtahids are the narrators of Ahadith by depicting each one of them as Faqha. However, they (mujtahids) never narrate Ahadith but they issue fatawa (decrees) which is always based on Zan/opinion!!

Well, before we answer, let us review a very famous Hadith of Amir ul-Momineen-asws:

الحسين بن محمد الاشعري، عن معلى بن محمد، عن الحسن بن علي الوشاء، و عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن ابن فضال جميعا، عن عاصم بن حميد، عن محمد ابن مسلم، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: خطب أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام الناس فقال: أيها الناس إنما بدء وقوع الفتن أهواء تتبع، وأحكام تبتدع، يخالف فيها كتاب الله، يتولى فيها رجال رجالا، فلو أن الباطل خالص لم يخف على ذي حجي، ولو أن الحق خالص لم يكن اختلاف ولكن يؤخذ من هذا ضغث ومن هذا ضغث فيمزجان فيجيمان معا فهنالك استحوذ الشيطان على أوليائه ونجا الذين سبقتم لهم من الله الحسنى

Al-Husayn ibn Muhammad al-Ash'ari has narrated from Mu'alla ibn Muhammad from al-Hassan ibn Ali al-Washsha' and a number of our people from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from ibn Faddal all from 'Asim ibn Humayd from Muhammad ibn Muslim from Abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following:

'Imam Ali-asws, recipient of divine supreme covenant, in one of his sermons has said, 'O people, mischief begins with following certain desires and obeying certain man-made rules that are different from the rules and laws of the book of Allah. In such a case, people yield to other people as a higher authority.

If falsehood had been clear it remained so to the people of Intelligence. If truth had been clearly distinct, differences would not emerge.

However, (in practical life) people mix certain parts of truth with a few things from falsehood and present them together. In such case Satan overwhelms his friends and only those who have previously received protection from Allah-azwj remain safe.'¹

¹ Al Kafi, Vol. 1, H 157, Ch. 19, h1

(1) Who is a Faqih?

وعن محمد بن سعيد الكشي ، عن محمد بن أحمد بن حماد المروزي الحمودي ، يرفعه ، قال : قال الصادق (عليه السلام): اعرفوا منازل شيعتنا بقدر ما يحسنون من رواياتهم عنا ، فانا لا نعد الفقيه منهم فقيها حتى يكون محدثا ، فقيل له : أو يكون المؤمن محدثا ؟ قال : يكون مفهما ، والمفهم : المحدث .

And from Muhammad Bin Saeed Al Kashy, from Muhammad Bin Ahmad Bin Hamaad Al Maruzy Al Mahmoudy, with a chain going up to Al Sadiq^{-asws}, said:

'Recognise the status of our^{-asws} Shiites in accordance with how many good narrations they relate from us^{-asws}, for we do not consider the 'الفقيه' 'Faqih' from them to be a Faqih unless they are narrators of Ahadith'. It was said to him^{-asws}, 'Is a believer a narrator of Ahadith?'

He^{-asws} said: 'He is an understanding one; and the understanding one is a narrator of Ahadith'.²

Hence from above hadith, it is clear that a 'Faqih' will be that who narrates the Ahadith of Masomeen^{-asws} and not the one who practices 'Ijtihad'. The one who issues fatwa based on Ijtihad is called a 'Mujtahid.

(2) Who is a Mujtahid?

Can we call a 'Mujtahid' a 'Faqih', of course not? From the Ahadith of Masomeen^{-asws} we would like to see the word 'Mujtahid' where and in which meanings it has been used:

و قال ع عالم أفضل من ألف عابد و ألف زاهد و ألف مجتهد

Amir-ul-Momineen^{-asws} says: A scholar is better than 1,000 'Abid' (worshippers), who is better than 1,000 'Zahid'³ and a Zahid is better than 1,000 Mujtahid.⁴

In addition, Amir-ul-Momineen^{-asws}, Ali^{-asws} ibn Abi Talib^{-asws} has used it in the meanings of 'the striving and hardworking'⁵. But in another Hadith, while explaining the meanings of the Verses: **Hostile working, feels the heat of the hot fire** (88:3-4)

Imam Abu Abd Allah^{-asws} (6th Imam^{-asws}) says:

² Wasail ul Shia, H. 33453

³ Who abstain from committing sins

⁴ 364 بحار الأنوار 75 247 باب 23 ; تحف العقول

⁵ الكافي 8 67 خطبة لأمير المؤمنين ع ص : 67

فَكُلُّ نَاصِبٍ مُجْتَهِدٍ فَعَمَلُهُ هَبَاءٌ شَيْعَتُنَا يَنْطِفُونَ بِنُورِ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ وَ مَنْ يُخَالِفُهُمْ

Everyone who is hostile to ‘Aimmah-asws and yet is a Mujtahid (works hard) his deeds scatter like dust.⁶

So, anyone working hard on a mission has been classified as a ‘Mujtahid’ in the Ahadith of Ahl Al-Bayt-asws regardless of the purpose of his struggle that could be for a noble or an evil cause.

(3) The Ones Who Issue Fatwa cannot be a ‘Faqih’

Briefly, from the principles of Ijtihad, a fatwa is issued in the absence of a Hadith related to an Islamic issue, so all those who issue a fatwa cannot be classified as a true ‘Faqih’, since they attempt to extract the meanings of Islamic rulings while employing the ‘man-made’ system of Ijtihad, which consist of, as stated before, the ‘Book’, the ‘Sunnah’, ‘Ijma’ (consensus), ‘Aql’ (reason), ‘Qiyas’ (analogy), whereas a Faqih will never use such tools other than what the Holy Prophet-saww had left behind, the ‘Book and the Sunnah’.

(4) What Masomeen-asws Say about the taqleed (of a non-masoom)?

و قال ع إياكم و التقليد فإنه من قلد في دينه هلك إن الله تعالى يقول اتَّخَذُوا أَحْبَارَهُمْ وَ رُهْبَانَهُمْ أَرْبَاباً مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ فلا و الله ما صلوا لهم و لا صاموا و لكنهم أحلوا لهم حراما و حرّموا عليهم حلالا فقلدوهم في ذلك فعبدوهم و هم لا يشعرون

The Holy Imam Jafar Al-Sadiq-asws said: **‘You and taqleed? Whosoever adorns this in religion is destroyed.** Surely, Allah-azwj has Said: **‘They took their Rabbis and Monks as their Lords besides Allah (9:31),** No, by Allah-azwj! They did no pray nor fast but they made permissible which was forbidden to them and made the forbidden permissible. They emulated (did taqleed) of them in this and obeyed them and they did not recognise (that they have worshiped them).⁷

و قال ع إياكم و التقليد فإنه من قلد في دينه هلك إن الله تعالى يقول اتَّخَذُوا أَحْبَارَهُمْ وَ رُهْبَانَهُمْ أَرْبَاباً مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ فلا و الله ما صلوا لهم و لا صاموا و لكنهم أحلوا لهم حراما و حرّموا عليهم حلالا فقلدوهم في ذلك فعبدوهم و هم لا يشعرون

And he-asws Imam Ja’far Al-Sadiq-asws said: **‘Beware of Taqleed! The one who does Taqleed in his religion is destroyed!** Allah-azwj the Exalted is Saying: **‘They are taking their Rabbis and**

⁶ الكافي 8 212 حديث الصيحة ص : 209

⁷ Tas’heeh Ul Itqaad – Sheykh Al-Mufeed, pg. 72.

تصحیح الاعتقاد

their Monks as lords besides Allah [9:31]. No, by Allah-azwj! They neither prayed Salat to them nor did they Fast for them, but whenever they (priests) permitted a Prohibition for them, and prohibited upon them a Permissible, they (people) emulated them (did their Taqleed) in that. Thus, they worshipped them and there were not realising'.⁸

(5) Who Should Shias Consult in Regard to Newly Emerging Issues?

Imam-e-Zaman-ajfi has told to his representative in a letter, as quoted by Al-Tabarsi, in his book Al-Ihtijaj al-Tabarsi:

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عِصَامٍ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ يَعْقُوبَ بْنِ إِسْحَاقَ بْنِ يَعْقُوبَ قَالَ سَأَلْتُ مُحَمَّدَ بْنَ عُثْمَانَ الْعُمَرِيَّ أَنْ يُوَصِّلَ لِي كِتَابًا قَدْ سَأَلْتُ فِيهِ عَنْ مَسَائِلَ أَشْكَلْتُ عَلَيَّ فَوَزَدَ التَّوْقِيعَ بِحُطِّ مَوْلَانَا صَاحِبِ الزَّمَانِ عَ أَتَا مَا سَأَلْتُ عَنْهُ أَرْشَدَكَ اللَّهُ وَ تَبَّتْكَ إِلَى أَنْ قَالَ وَ أَمَّا الْحَوَادِثُ الْوَاقِعَةُ فَارْجِعُوا فِيهَا إِلَى رِوَاةِ حَدِيثِنَا فَإِنَّهُمْ أُجِبْتِي عَلَيْكُمْ وَ أَنَا حُجَّةُ اللَّهِ

Mohammed ibn Mohammed ibn Asim, from Mohammed ibn Yaqoob, who from Ishaq ibn Yaqoob who said the following:

Tradition from Imam Al-Mahdi-asws in a reply to Ishaq ibn Ya'qub: 'As far as newly occurring circumstances are concerned, you should refer to the **narrators of our Ahadith**, for they (the Ahadith) are my proof over you and I-asws am Allah-azwj's Proof.'⁹

(6) How important is it to Learn about the Sunnah (The Ahadith)?

عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد بن خالد، عن أبيه، عن أبي إسماعيل إبراهيم بن إسحاق الأزدي، عن أبي عثمان العبدى، عن جعفر، عن آبائه، عن أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله لا قول إلا بعمل، ولا قول إلا بنية، ولا قول ولا عمل ولا نية إلا بإصابة السنة.

A number of our people have narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Khalid from his father from abu 'Isma'il Ibrahim ibn Ishaq al-Azdi from abu 'Uthman al-'Abdi from Ja'far from his ancestors from Amir al-Mu'minin Ali, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following:

⁸ Tas'heeh Al Itiqaad (Correction Of Beliefs) – Sheykh Al Mufeed P 72

⁹ Ahtijaj al-Tabrisi, Vol. 2, pg. 469.

'The Rasool-Allah^{-saww} has said: 'There are no words without action, there are no words or actions without intention and **there are no words, actions and intentions without learning the Sunnah.**¹⁰

(7) When did Mujtahids Constructed their Own Principles of Islam:

It was embraced after the 'Ghaibat-e-Qubra' (Grand Occultation) of Imam-e-Zaman^{-ajfj}, when it was not possible to have a direct contact with the Imam (physical or via correspondence)¹¹. It was not only necessary to redefine the meanings of Ijtihad but also to redefine and reconstruct the foundation of Islam for the justification of Shia Ijtihad in order to institutionalise the system of taqleed of a non-masoom person.

In the following Hadith, the Holy Imam^{-asws} has, in fact, given out a **different set of Principles, which are closer to the Ahly e Sunnah but are considered as Farroo-e-Deen (peripheral issues) by the Shia Mujtahids:**

أبوعلي الأشعري، عن الحسن بن علي الكوفي، عن عباس بن عامر، عن أبان بن عثمان، عن فضيل بن يسار، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: بني الإسلام على خمس: على الصلاة والزكاة والصوم والحج والولاية ولم يناد بشيء كما نودي بالولاية، فأخذ الناس بأربع وتركوا هذه يعني الولاية

Abu Ali al-Ash'ari has narrated from al-Hassan ibn Ali al-Kufi from 'Abbas ibn 'Amir from Aban ibn 'Uthman from Fudayl ibn Yasar from Abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following:

'Abu Ja'far^{-asws}, recipient of divine supreme covenant, has said: **'Islam is based on five principles. They are: Prayer, al-Zakat (charity), Fasting, Hajj and al-Wilayah. The call to none of the other principles has been as emphatic as it has been to al-Wilayah. People accepted the other four but they left aside this i.e. al-Wilayah.'**¹²

By redefining and reshaping the Divine Commands (carving Usools and Faroos), a new 'Shia-Ijtihad' system was constructed by some Shia mullahs soon after the 'Grand Occultation' of the 12th Imam^{-ajfj}, which met with severe resistance from all Shias among the public as well as learned. Those days the word 'Ijtihad' was only used by Sunnis and was considered to be a forbidden 'concept'¹³ among the followers of Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws} and Shia used to narrate Ahadith and act upon religion by taking Ahadith of the Infallible Imams^{-asws}.

¹⁰ Al-Kafi, Vol. 1, H 207, Ch. 22, h9

¹¹ As was possible during the 'Ghaibat-e-Sughara' (Minor Occultation).

¹² Al-Kafi Vol. 1, H 1480, CH 10, h 3

¹³ As per many Ahadith of Masomeen^{-asws}, see for example chapter 18-20 Al-Kafi, Vol. 1 (Arabic, Urdu Usool al-Kafi, Vol. 1)

The first 'Shia-Mujtahid' who came forward, by amending the 'Sunni-Ijtihad' (first formulated by Shafai'i'), was Ibn-e-Junaid.¹⁴ Subsequent to receiving stern resistance but 'Shia-Ijtihad' was gradually accepted and its adoption served the purpose of bringing Shias closer to Sunnis system. That is how Sunni-Ijtihad became Shia! It then became the norm to criticise Sunnis' beliefs but to emulate them in Ijtihad and get a firm grip on the possibility of introducing one's own judgement on those aspects of religion which were fully covered and extensively discussed in both the Book and the Ahadith of Ahl al-Bayt-asws. Hence, Shia Ijtihad was incepted, which after strong opposition found its way into the main stream twelve-Imami Shia community, as it is found in its present form. In the 'taqleed' books of Mujtahids, taqleed is offered on the Usool-e-Deen (Principles of religion: Salat, Zakaat....) but by declaring those as Faroo-e-Deen (branches of religion) while eliminating the most important and the soul of the principles: al-Wilayah!

A purely man-made system replacing a Divine system, where a Muqallid (follower of a Mujtahid) does not know the source of a fatwa and the Mujtahid is never ever sure of his judgement (as he writes 'Wallallah ho Alim bil sawab'¹⁵, hence, the consequences of 'a blind following a blind'!

(8) Amir-ul-Momineen-asws 's Advice to Shiites:

وأما قول أمير المؤمنين (عليه السلام) فهو قوله: يا معشر شيعةنا والمنتحلين . مودتنا . إياكم وأصحاب الرأي، فانهم أعداء السنن، تفلتت منهم الاحاديث أن يحفظوها وأعيتهم السنة أن يعوها، فاتخذوا عباد الله خولا، وماله دولا، فذلت لهم الرقاب وأطاعهم الخلق أشباه الكلاب، ونازعوا الحق أهله، وتمثلوا بالائمة الصادقين وهم من الجهال والكفار والملاعين، فستلوا عما لا يعلمون، فأنفوا أن يعترفوا بأنهم لا يعلمون، فعارضوا الدين . بأرائهم فضلوا وأضلوا.

Message of Amir-ul-Momineen-asws:

'O group of our Shiites and the claimants to be those that love us-asws, **beware of the people of opinion** for they are the enemies of the Sunnah. Ahadith have run away from their memories and they have no intention of protecting the Sunnah. **They have taken the servants of Allah-azwj as their followers and their wealth to be their own riches.** After having witnessed this, **a lot of people have become obedient to them just like 'الكلاب' dogs.** They have snatched away the rights from the rightful people and **have become like the true Imams** and they are from the ignorant ones and the unbelievers and the accursed. When they are asked about something they don't know about, they do not admit their ignorance, but make use of opinion and go astray and lead others astray.¹⁶

¹⁴ See for example the book of Syed Mohammed Baqir Musawi Khawansari 'Rozat-ul-Jannat fee Ahwal al-Ulema wa Sadaat' where all details of the evolution of Shia Ijtihad are given.

¹⁵ That is my best guess but Allah-azwj Know the best.

¹⁶ Tafseer Imam Hassan Al Askari-asws – H 26