

'Whistling and Clapping are Abhorred in Islam'

Abbreviations:

saww: - Sal lal la ho Allay hay **Wa** Aal lay he **Wasallam**

azwj: - **Az Za Wa** Jalla

asws: - Allay hay **Salawat Wass Salam**

AJFJ: Aja Allah hey wa Fara Jaak

ra: - **Razi Allah**^{-azwj}

La: - **Laan Allah**^{-azwj}

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ، وَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَى سَيِّدِنَا مُحَمَّدٍ وَ آلِهِ الطَّاهِرِينَ، وَسَلَّم تَسْلِيمًا.

In the Name of Allah^{-azwj} the Beneficent, the Merciful. The Praise is for Allah^{-azwj} Lord^{-azwj} of the Worlds, and Blessing be upon our Chief Muhammad^{-saww} and his^{-saww} Purified Progeny^{-asws}, and greetings with abundant greetings.

اللَّهُمَّ صَلِّ عَلَى مُحَمَّدٍ وَآلِ مُحَمَّدٍ وَعَجِّلْ فَرَجَهُمْ وَالْعَنِ أَعْدَاءَهُمْ أَجْمَعِينَ

Whistling and Clapping are Abhorred in Islam

Whistling and Clapping used to be the Salat (Prayer) of the Mushraqueen (polytheists) during the pre-Islamic era. They would go to Kabah¹ and walk around it while whistling and clapping.

Allah^{-azwj} Says:

وَمَا كَانَ صَلَاتُهُمْ عِنْدَ الْبَيْتِ إِلَّا مُكَاءً وَتَصْدِيَةً ۚ فَذُوقُوا الْعَذَابَ بِمَا كُنْتُمْ تَكْفُرُونَ {8:35}

And it was not their Salat by the House (Kabah) except for whistling and clapping; therefore taste the Punishment due to what you were disbelieving [8:35]

وَسُمِّيَتْ مَكَّةَ مَكَّةَ لِأَنَّ النَّاسَ كَانُوا يَمْكُونُ فِيهَا وَكَانَ يُقَالُ لِمَنْ قَصَدَهَا قَدْ مَكَأَ وَ ذَلِكَ قَوْلُ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ مَا كَانَ صَلَاتُهُمْ عِنْدَ الْبَيْتِ إِلَّا مُكَاءً وَ تَصْدِيَةً فَأَلْمَكَاءُ التَّصْفِيرُ وَ التَّصْدِيَةُ صَفْقُ الْيَدَيْنِ

And Makkah is named as ‘Makkah’ because of the people that were dwelling therein (The Makeen), and it would be said for the one who was headed for it, ‘He has ‘Maka’’, and these are the Words of Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic: ***And what was their Salat by the House except for whistling and clapping of the hands [8:35]*** – so Al-Maka’a is the whistling, and Al-Tasdiya is clapping of the hands. (An extract)²

وَ اجْتَمَعَتْ قُرَيْشٌ أَنْ يَدْخُلُوا عَلَيْهِ لَيْلًا فَيَقْتُلُوهُ- وَ خَرَجُوا إِلَى الْمَسْجِدِ يُصَفِّرُونَ وَ يُصَفِّقُونَ- وَ يَطُوفُونَ بِالْبَيْتِ فَأَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ وَ مَا كَانَ صَلَاتُهُمْ عِنْدَ الْبَيْتِ إِلَّا مُكَاءً وَ تَصْدِيَةً فَأَلْمَكَاءُ التَّصْفِيرُ وَ التَّصْدِيَةُ صَفْقُ الْيَدَيْنِ- وَ هَذِهِ الْآيَةُ مَعْطُوفَةٌ عَلَى قَوْلِهِ «وَ إِذْ يَمْكُرُ بِكَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا»

And the Quraysh gathered to pounce upon him^{saww} at night and kill him^{saww}, and they went out to the Masjid whistling, and clapping, and circling the House (Kabah). So Allah^{azwj} Revealed: ***And what was their Salat by the House except for whistling and clapping of the hands [8:35]***. And this Verse is to be read together with His^{azwj} Words: ***And when those who committed Kufr plotted against you [8:30]***. (An extract)³

حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ أَبِي عَدِيٍّ الْكُوفِيُّ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ إِسْمَاعِيلَ الْبَرْمَكِيِّ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْعَبَّاسِ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا الْقَاسِمُ بْنُ الرَّبِيعِ الصَّحَّافُ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ سِنَانٍ أَنَّ أَبَا الْحَسَنِ الرِّضَا ع كَتَبَ إِلَيْهِ فِي مَا كَتَبَ مِنْ جَوَابِ مَسَائِلِهِ سُمِّيَتْ مَكَّةَ مَكَّةَ لِأَنَّ النَّاسَ كَانُوا يَمْكُونُ فِيهَا وَ كَانَ يُقَالُ لِمَنْ قَصَدَهَا قَدْ مَكَأَ وَ ذَلِكَ قَوْلُ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ مَا كَانَ صَلَاتُهُمْ عِنْدَ الْبَيْتِ إِلَّا مُكَاءً وَ تَصْدِيَةً فَأَلْمَكَاءُ التَّصْفِيرُ وَ التَّصْدِيَةُ صَفْقُ الْيَدَيْنِ.

¹ House of God in Makkah

² بحار الأنوار (ط - بيروت)، ج6، ص: 97

³ تفسير القتيبي 1: 272

Ali Bin Ahmad Bin Muhammad narrated to us, from Muhammad Bin Abu Abdullah Al Kufy, from Muhammad Bin Ismail Al Barmakyy, from Ali Bin Al Abbas, from Al Qasim Ibn Al Rabie Al Sahaf,

(It has been narrated) from Muhammad Bin Sinan that Abu Al-Hassan Al-Reza^{-asws} wrote to him in answer to what he had written asking him^{-asws}: ‘Makkah was named as Makkah because the people used to whistle therein, and it used to be said to the one who intended to it, ‘He has (gone to) whistle’, and these are the Words of Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic [8:35] **And what is their prayer before the House except for whistling and clapping of hands**. So the whistling – (It is) the beeping; and the clapping – it is the clapping of the hands’.⁴

مع، معاني الأخبار عن ابن الوليد عن ابن أبي عمير عن حماد بن عيسى عن إبراهيم بن عمر اليماني عن ذكره عن أبي عبد الله ع في قول الله عز وجل وما كان صلاتهم عند البيت إلا مكاءً وتصفيئةً قال التصفيئة والتصفيئة.

(The book) ‘Ma’any Al Akhbar – from Ibn Al Waleed, from Ibn Aban, from Al Husayn Bin Saeed, from Hammad Bin Isa, from Ibrahim Bin Umar Al Yamany, from the one who mentioned it,

‘From Abu Abdullah^{-asws} regarding Words of Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic: **And it was not their Salat by the House (Kabah) except for whistling and clapping; [8:35]**. He^{-asws} said: ‘The whistling and the clapping’.⁵

ع، علل الشرائع عن أبيه عن سعد بن محمد بن الحسين عن ابن محبوب عن سالم عن أبي عبد الله ع قال: قيل له كيف كان يعلم قوم لوط أنه قد جاء لوطاً رجالاً

(The book) ‘Ilal Al Sharaie’ – from his father, from Sa’ad, from Muhammad Bin Al Husayn, from Ibn Mahboub, from Salim,

‘From Abu Abdullah^{-asws}, he (the narrator) said, ‘It was said to him^{-asws}, ‘How did the people of Lut^{-as} know that men had come to see Lut^{-as}?’

قال كانت امرأة تخرج فتصير فإذا سمعوا الصغير جاءوا فلذلك كره التصفيئة.

He^{-asws} said: ‘His^{-as} wife went out and whistled. When they heard the whistle, they came. For that (reason) the whistling is disliked’.⁶

حدثنا علي بن عبد الله الوراق رضي الله عنه قال حدثنا سعد بن عبد الله قال حدثنا عباد بن سليمان عن محمد بن سليمان الديلمي عن الرضا ع أنه قال: كانت الحفاش امرأة سحرت ضرة لها فمسحها الله تعالى حفاشاً وإن الفار كان سبطاً من اليهود غضب الله عليهم فمسحهم فأراً وإن البعوض كان رجلاً يستهزئ بالأنبياء ع ويستهمهم ويكلخ في وجوههم ويصفيق يديه فمسحه الله تعالى بعوضاً

Ali Bin Abdullah Al Waraq narrated to us, from Sa’ad Bin Abdullah, from Abaad Bin Suleyman, from Muhammad Bin Suleyman Al Daylami, from:

Al-Reza^{-asws} has said: ‘The bat was a woman who enchanted her fellow wife, so Allah^{-azwj} Metamorphosed her as a bat; and the mouse was a tribe from the Jews. Allah^{-azwj} was Wrathful upon them, so He^{-azwj} Metamorphosed them as mice; and the mosquito was a man

⁴ ILLAL AL SHARAIE – V 2 Ch 136 H 1

⁵ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 76 – The Book of Evil deeds – Ch 102 H 1

⁶ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 76 – The Book of Evil deeds – Ch 102 H 2

who used to mock a Prophet^{-as} from the Prophets^{-as} and insult them and scowling in their faces and clapping his hands, so Allah^{-azwj} the High Metamorphose him as a mosquito (An extract).⁷

Whistling at animals is forbidden:

عَنْهُ عَنْ بَكْرِ بْنِ صَالِحٍ عَنِ الْجُعْفَرِيِّ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أبا الحسن ع يَقُولُ لَا تُصَفِّرُ بِعَنَمِكَ دَاهِيَةً وَ أَنْعِقْ بِهَا رَاجِعَةً

From him, from Bakr Bin Salih, from Al Ja'fary who said,

‘I heard Abu Al-Hassan^{-asws} saying: ‘Do not whistle at your sheep going away, and caw at them (like crows) when they are returning’.⁸

Exception for women:

Women may slap/tap out of necessity during the prayer, as one hand is mentioned in the Hadith below, but this will not hold for a man, e.g.,

عَنْهُ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ حَمَّادٍ عَنِ الْخَلَّيِّ عَنِ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) أَنَّهُ سُئِلَ عَنِ الرَّجُلِ يُرِيدُ الْحَاجَةَ وَ هُوَ فِي الصَّلَاةِ فَقَالَ يُومِئُ بِرَأْسِهِ وَ يُشِيرُ بِيَدِهِ وَ يُسَبِّحُ وَ الْمَرْأَةُ إِذَا أَرَادَتْ الْحَاجَةَ وَ هِيَ تُصَلِّي تَصَفِّقُ بِيَدِهَا .

From him, from his father, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Hammad, from Al Halby,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah^{-asws} having been asked about the man who wants the need (something) and he is in the *Salāt*. So, he^{-asws} said: ‘He can gesture by his head, and indicate by his hand, and he should Glorify; and the woman, when she wants the need (something), and she is praying *Salāt*, she can slap/tap with her hand’.⁹

Similarly, in another Hadith a praying lady can hit her hand on her thigh to indicate her need:

وَ سَأَلَهُ عَمَّارُ بْنُ مُوسَى عَنِ الرَّجُلِ يَسْمَعُ صَوْتًا بِالْبَابِ وَ هُوَ فِي الصَّلَاةِ فَيَتَنَحَّنُخَ لِيَسْمَعَ جَارِيَتَهُ أَوْ أَهْلَهُ لِتَأْتِيَهُ فَيُشِيرُ إِلَيْهَا بِيَدِهِ لِيَعْلَمَهَا مَنْ بِالْبَابِ لِيَنْظُرَ مَنْ هُوَ فَقَالَ لَا بَأْسَ بِهِ وَ عَنِ الرَّجُلِ وَ الْمَرْأَةُ يَكُونَانِ فِي الصَّلَاةِ وَ يُرِيدَانِ شَيْئاً أَوْ يُجِزُّ لهُمَا أَنْ يَقُولَا سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ قَالَ نَعَمْ وَ يُومِيَانِ إِلَى مَا يُرِيدَانِ وَ الْمَرْأَةُ إِذَا أَرَادَتْ شَيْئاً ضَرَبَتْ عَلَى فَخْذِهَا وَ هِيَ فِي الصَّلَاةِ.

Ammar bin Musa asked him^{-asws} about a man who hears a sound at the door while he is praying, so he clears his throat (to get the attention of) his maid or his family or He holds out his hand to show her who is at the door, so she could see who it was. He^{-asws} said, “There is no problem with it and about a man and a woman who are praying and they want to do something, is it permissible for them to say ‘سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ’ (Glory be to God). He^{-asws} said, “Yes,” and they can point

⁷ ILLAL AL SHARAIIE – V 2 Ch 239 H 3

⁸ Al Mahaasin – V 2 Bk 6 H 163

⁹ Al Kafi V 3 – The Book of Salāt CH 45 H 7

out toward that which they want, and if a woman wants something, she taps her thighs while she is praying.¹⁰

Rasool Allah^{-saww} strikes his^{-saww} right hand on his^{-saww} left hand (once):

الأمامي للصدوق ابن مسرور عن محمد الحميري عن أبيه عن البرقي عن أبيه عن خلف بن حماد عن أبي الحسن العبدي عن الأعمش عن عباية بن ربعي عن عبد الله بن عباس قال: أقبل علي بن أبي طالب ع ذات يوم إلى النبي ص باكياً وهو يقول إنا لله وإنا إليه راجعون فقال له رسول الله ص مه يا علي فقال علي يا رسول الله ماتت أمي فاطمة بنت أسد

(The book) ‘Al Amaali’ of Al Sadouq – Ibn Masrou, from Muhammad Al Himeyri, from his father, from Al Barqy, from his father, from Khalaf Bin Hammad, from Abu Al-Hassan Al Abdy, from Al Amsh, from Abayah Bin Rabie, from Abdullah Bin Abbas who said,

‘One day Ali^{-asws} Bin Abu Talib^{-asws} came weeping to the Prophet^{-saww} and he^{-asws} was saying: ‘We are for Allah^{-azwj} and are returning to Him^{-azwj}’. Rasool-Allah^{-saww} said: ‘Shh, O Ali^{-asws}’. Ali^{-asws} said: ‘O Rasool-Allah^{-saww}! My^{-asws} mother^{-as} Fatima Bint Asad^{-as} has passed away’.

قال فبكى النبي ص ثم قال رحم الله أمك يا علي أما إن كانت لك أما فقد كانت لي أما أخذ عمامتي هذه و أخذ ثوبي هذين فكفنها فيهما و أمر النساء فليحسن غسلها و لا تخرجها حتى أجيء فإني أمرها

He (the narrator) said, ‘The Prophet^{-saww} wept, then said; ‘May Allah^{-azwj} have Mercy on your^{-asws} mother^{-as}, O Ali^{-asws}! But, she^{-as} was a mother^{-as} for you^{-asws}, so she^{-as} was a mother^{-as} for me^{-saww} (as well). Take this turban of mine^{-saww} and take these two clothes of mine^{-asws} and enshroud her^{-as} in these, and instruct the womenfolk to be excellent in washing her^{-as} and not to bring her^{-as} out until I^{-saww} come, for her^{-as} matter is up to me^{-saww}’.

قال و أقبل النبي ص بعد ساعة و أخرجت فاطمة أم علي ع فصلى عليها النبي ص صلاة لم يصل على أحد قبلها مثل تلك الصلاة ثم كبر عليها أربعين تكبيرة ثم دخل إلى القبر فتمدد فيه فلم يسمع له أنين و لا حركة

He (the narrator) said, ‘And the Prophet^{-saww} came after some time and brought out (Syeda) Fatima^{-asws}, mother^{-as} of Ali^{-asws}. The Prophet^{-saww} prayed such a Salat upon her, he^{-saww} had not prayed it upon anyone before her^{-as} similar to that Salat. Then he^{-saww} exclaimed for Takbeers upon her^{-as}. Then He^{-saww} entered into the grave and extended (lied down) in it. Neither any sound nor movement was heard from him^{-saww}.

ثم قال يا علي ادخل يا حسن ادخل فدخلوا القبر فلما فرغ مما احتاج إليه قال له يا علي اخرج يا حسن اخرج فخرجا ثم زحف النبي ص حتى صار عند رأسها ثم قال يا فاطمة أنا محمد سيد ولد آدم و لا فخر فإن أتاك منكرو و تكبر فسألك من ربك فقول الله ربي و محمد نبي و الإسلام ديني و القرآن كتابي و انبي إمامي و وليي

Then he^{-saww} said: ‘O Ali^{-asws}, enter! O Hassan^{-asws}, enter!’ They^{-asws} both entered the grave. When he^{-saww} was free from what he^{-saww} was needy to, said to him^{-asws}: ‘O Ali^{-asws}, exit! O Hassan^{-asws}, exit!’ They^{-asws} both came out. Then the Prophet^{-saww} crawled until he^{-saww} came by her^{-as} head, then said: ‘O Fatima^{-asws}! I^{-saww} am Muhammad^{-saww}, chief of the children of Adam^{-as}, and there is no pride. So, when Munkar and Nakeer (Angels) come to you^{-as}, they will

من لا يحضره الفقيه، ج1، ص: 370¹⁰

ask you^{-as}: ‘Who is your^{-as} Lord^{-azwj}}?’ Say, ‘Allah^{-azwj} is my^{-as} Lord^{-azwj}}, and Muhammad^{-saww} is my^{-as} Prophet^{-saww}}, and Al-Islam is my^{-as} religion, and the Quran is my^{-as} Book, and my^{-as} son^{-asws}} is my^{-as} Imam^{-asws}} and my^{-as} guardian’.

ثُمَّ قَالَ اللَّهُمَّ ثَبِّتْ فَاطِمَةَ بِالْقَوْلِ الثَّابِتِ ثُمَّ خَرَجَ مِنْ قَبْرِهَا وَ حَقًّا عَلَيْهَا حَتِيَّاتٍ ثُمَّ ضَرَبَ بِيَدِهِ الْيُمْنَى عَلَى الْيُسْرَى فَنَفَضَهُمَا ثُمَّ قَالَ وَ الَّذِي نَفْسُ مُحَمَّدٍ
بِيَدِهِ لَقَدْ سَمِعْتُ فَاطِمَةَ تَصْفِيقَ يَمِينِي عَلَى شِمَالِي

Then he^{-saww} said: ‘O Allah^{-azwj}}! Affirm Fatima^{-asws}} with the firm word (Wilayah of Ali^{-asws}}). Then he^{-saww} came out from her^{-as}} grave and gathered the soil upon her^{-as}}. Then he^{-saww} struck (once) his^{-saww} right hand upon his^{-saww} left and shook them (out of sorrow), then said: ‘By the One^{-azwj}} in Whose Hand is the soul of Muhammad^{-saww}}! (Syeda) Fatima^{-asws}} has heard the clap of my^{-saww}} right hand upon my^{-saww}} left’.

فَقَامَ إِلَيْهِ عَمَّارُ بْنُ يَاسِرٍ فَقَالَ فَدَاكَ أَبِي وَ أُمِّي يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ لَقَدْ صَلَّيْتُ عَلَيْهَا صَلَاةً لَمْ تُصَلِّ عَلَيَّ أَحَدٌ قَبْلَهَا مِثْلَ تِلْكَ الصَّلَاةِ

Ammar Bin Yasser^{-ra}} stood up to him^{-saww}} and said, ‘May my^{-ra}} father^{-ra}} and my^{-ra}} mother^{-ra}} be sacrificed for you^{-saww}}, O Rasool-Allah^{-saww}}! You^{-saww}} have prayed such a Salat upon her^{-as}}, you^{-saww}} did not pray upon anyone before her^{-as}} similar to that Salat’.

فَقَالَ يَا أَبَا الْبَيْطَانِ وَ أَهْلُ ذَلِكَ هِيَ مِنِّي لَقَدْ كَانَ لَهَا مِنْ أَبِي طَالِبٍ وَ لَدَّ كَثِيرٌ وَ لَقَدْ كَانَ خَيْرُهُمْ كَثِيرًا وَ كَانَ خَيْرَنَا قَلِيلًا فَكَانَتْ تُشْبِعُنِي وَ تُجِيعُهُمْ وَ تَكْسُونِي وَ تُعْرِيبُهُمْ وَ تُدْهِنُنِي وَ تُشَعِّعُهُمْ

He^{-saww}} said: ‘O Abu Yaqzan^{-ra}}! And she^{-ra}} is deserving of that from me^{-saww}}. There were a lot of children for her^{-as}} from Abu Talib^{-asws}}, and their good was a lot, and our good was little. She^{-as}} used to satiate me^{-saww}} and let them be hungry (instead), and clothed me^{-saww}} and let them be bare (instead), and oiled me^{-saww}} and let them be scruffy (instead)’.

قَالَ فَلِمَ كَبَّرْتَ عَلَيْهَا أَرْبَعِينَ تَكْبِيرَةً يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ

He^{-ra}} said, ‘So, why did you^{-saww}} exclaim forty Takbeers upon her^{-as}}, O Rasool-Allah^{-saww}}?’

قَالَ نَعَمْ يَا عَمَّارُ التَّمْتُ عَنْ يَمِينِي فَنظَرْتُ إِلَى أَرْبَعِينَ صَفًّا مِنَ الْمَلَائِكَةِ فَكَبَّرْتُ لِكُلِّ صَفٍّ تَكْبِيرَةً

He^{-saww}} said: ‘Yes, O Ammar^{-ra}}! I^{-saww}} turned towards the right and looked at forty rows of Angels, so I^{-saww}} exclaimed a Takbeer for every row’.

قَالَ فَتَمَدَّدْتُكَ فِي الْقَبْرِ وَ لَمْ يُسْمَعْ لَكَ أُنْيٌ وَ لَا حَرَكَةٌ

He^{-ra}} said, ‘You^{-saww}} lied down in the grace and neither any sound nor movement was detected for you^{-saww}}’.

قَالَ إِنَّ النَّاسَ يُحْشَرُونَ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ عُرَاءً وَ لَمْ أَزَلْ أَطْلُبُ إِلَى رَبِّي عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ أَنْ يَبْعَثَنِي سَتِيرَةً وَ الَّذِي نَفْسُ مُحَمَّدٍ بِيَدِهِ مَا خَرَجْتُ مِنْ قَبْرِهَا حَتَّى رَأَيْتُ مِصْبَاحِينَ مِنْ نُورٍ عِنْدَ رَأْسِهَا وَ مِصْبَاحِينَ مِنْ نُورٍ عِنْدَ يَدَيْهَا وَ مِصْبَاحِينَ مِنْ نُورٍ عِنْدَ رِجْلَيْهَا وَ مَلَائِكَةً الْمُؤَكَّلِينَ بِقَبْرِهَا يَسْتَعْفِرَانِ لَهَا إِلَى أَنْ تَقُومَ السَّاعَةُ.

He^{-saww} said: 'The people would be Resurrected bare on the Day of Qiyamah, and I^{-saww} did not cease seeking to my^{-saww} Lord^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic that He^{-azwj} Resurrects her^{-as} veiled. By the One^{-azwj} in Whose Hand is the soul of Muhammad^{-saww}! I^{-saww} had not come out from her^{-as} grave until I^{-saww} saw two lanterns of light by her^{-as} head, and two lanterns of light by her^{-as} hands, and two lanterns of light by her^{-as} legs, and the two Angels allocated to her^{-as} would be seeking Forgiveness for her^{-as} up to the establishment of the Hour".¹¹

¹¹ Bihar Al Anwaar – V 35, The book of History – Amir Al Momineen^{asws}, Ch 3 H 4 a