

**QUESTIONS**

**ON**

**MOONSIGHTING**

*Bashir Alidina*

## **INDEX**

**INTRODUCTION**

**DIFFERENCES**

**A COMPLETE MONTH**

**THE FUNDAMENTAL CRITERION**

**THE CURSE**

**SOME HADEETH**

**CONCLUSION**

# INTRODUCTION

The answer lies at the door of the Holy Ahl Ul Bayt (a.s.). When you leave this door and go to seek guidance from elsewhere, whether it be from this committee, or that expert or the other, you will end up with nothing but having gone astray.

It is high time we all came back to them (a.s.) so that they (a.s.) can put us back on the right path. Each day that passes by is an opportunity for us to revert back to them (a.s.). The Holy Infallibles (a.s.) have been sent to this earth as Divine Guides in order to save mankind from destruction through differences.

This is not a comprehensive article on moon sighting, but just a solution to the problem we face today. It is due to public pressure that I have done this now, otherwise it was my intention that this should form part of my booklet 'Questions On Eids' sometime in the near future.

*Bashir Alidina*

**October 2009**

## DIFFERENCES

The basis of difference of views is not knowledge, but rather lack of it. It is not a hidden fact from people of intellect that where two people differ from each other, then either both of them are in the wrong or at least one of them is. It is simply not possible for both of them to be right.

### NAHJ UL BALAGAH – SAYING NO. 182

مَا اخْتَلَفَتْ دَعْوَتَانِ إِلَّا كَانَتْ إِحْدَاهُمَا ضَلَالَةً

Where there are two differing claims then **one of them is a straying**. (If two opposite theories are propagated, **one will be wrong** – Official translation)

And so how can anyone now justify that all these differing view coming out on moon sighting as all correct? Surely, at least one of them is wrong. One of these ‘guides’ has definitely strayed from the straight path.

In other words, If two *Mujtahids* are giving differing views on this matter then one of them is wrong and has gone astray. It is too dangerous to follow someone when we do not know whether he is on the straight path or not. And this is what we say in our daily Prayers at least ten times a day, without which our Prayers are not even valid.

اهْدِنَا الصِّرَاطَ الْمُسْتَقِيمَ صِرَاطَ الَّذِينَ أَنْعَمْتَ عَلَيْهِمْ غَيْرِ الْمَغْضُوبِ عَلَيْهِمْ وَلَا الضَّالِّينَ

[**Shakir 1:6 & 7**] Keep us on the right path. The path of those upon whom Thou hast bestowed favors. Not (the path) of those upon whom Thy wrath is brought down, **nor of those who go astray**.

And yet we still insist on following people of differing opinions when one of them simply has to have gone astray. So which one of them is it?

Those who possess knowledge will never differ as there is only one reality and they will have grasped it. It is also a well known fact that truth is only one. Wherever there is error and straying there will be differences.

أَفَلَا يَتَذَكَّرُونَ الْقُرْآنَ وَلَوْ كَانَ مِنْ عِنْدِ غَيْرِ اللَّهِ لَوَجَدُوا فِيهِ اخْتِلَافًا كَثِيرًا

[**Shakir 4:82**] Do they not then meditate on the Quran? And if it were from any other than Allah, they would have found in it many a **discrepancy**.

Whosoever displays discrepancies in his statements, will be a representative of falsehood. You can go through the whole of the Holy Quran and you will find nothing but condemnation of differences. You will never find a single Verse where differences have been appreciated. In fact the purpose of the Prophet-hood of all the Prophets (s.a.w.) has been the removal of differences between the people. I will not present all the Verses in condemnation of discrepancies here for the sake of brevity, and will only give you just a couple of them.

وَمَا أَنْزَلْنَا عَلَيْكَ الْكِتَابَ إِلَّا لِتُبَيِّنَ لَهُمُ الَّذِي اخْتَلَفُوا فِيهِ وَهُدًى وَرَحْمَةً لِّقَوْمٍ يُؤْمِنُونَ

[Shakir 16:64] And We have not revealed to you the Book **except that you may make clear to them that about which they differ**, and (as) guidance and a mercy for a people who believe.

وَلَا تَكُونُوا كَالَّذِينَ تَفَرَّقُوا وَاخْتَلَفُوا مِنْ بَعْدِ مَا جَاءَهُمُ الْبَيِّنَاتُ وَأُولَئِكَ لَهُمْ عَذَابٌ عَظِيمٌ

[Shakir 3:105] And be not like those who **became divided and disagreed after clear arguments had come to them**, and these it is that shall have a grievous chastisement.

The purpose of all Prophets was to remove difference amongst their respective nations and the purpose of revelation to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.) was to remove differences amongst us. A grievous punishment has been prepared for those that create differences.

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.) was Commanded to decide as per Divine Revelation. It has been prohibited to abandon the Divine Commands and act according to one's desires instead. The laws of *Sharia* are a test for the people so that it can be known as to who is acting according to Divine Commands and who is acting upon his own self. Those who create differences and spread them will know the result of their actions of the Day of Judgment.

قُلْ أَعْيَبَ اللَّهُ أَلْبَعِي رَبًّا وَهُوَ رَبُّ كُلِّ شَيْءٍ وَلَا تَكْسِبُ كُلُّ نَفْسٍ إِلَّا عَلَيْهَا وَلَا تَزِرُ وَازِرَةٌ وِزْرَ أُخْرَىٰ ثُمَّ إِلَىٰ رَبِّكُمْ مَرْجِعُكُمْ فَيُنَبِّئُكُمْ بِمَا كُنْتُمْ فِيهِ تَخْتَلِفُونَ

[Shakir 6:164] Say: What! Shall I seek a Lord other than Allah? And He is the Lord of all things; and no soul earns (evil) but against itself, and **no bearer of burden shall bear the burden of another**; then to your Lord is your return, so He will inform you of that in which you differed.

وَلَا تَزِرُ وَازِرَةٌ وِزْرَ أُخْرَىٰ وَإِن تَدْعُ مُثْقَلَةٌ إِلَىٰ حِمْلِهَا لَا يُحْمَلُ مِنْهُ شَيْءٌ وَلَوْ كَانَ ذَا قُرْبَىٰ إِنَّمَا تُنذِرُ الَّذِينَ يَخْشَوْنَ رَبَّهُم بِالْغَيْبِ وَأَقَامُوا الصَّلَاةَ وَمَن تَزَكَّىٰ فَإِنَّمَا يَتَزَكَّىٰ لِنَفْسِهِ وَإِلَى اللَّهِ الْمَصِيرُ

**[Shakir 35:18]** And a burdened soul cannot bear the burden of another and if one weighed down by burden should cry for (another to carry) its burden, not aught of it shall be carried, even though he is near of kin. You warn only those who fear their Lord in secret and keep up prayer; and whoever purifies himself, he purifies himself only for (the good of) his own soul; and to Allah is the eventual coming.

**Everyone will have to bear their own burden.** This is a negation of the view that if one were to act according to the *Fatwa* of a *Mujtahid* then the responsibility lies solely with the *Mujtahid* and one will be free from its consequences.

In the Sight of Allah (s.w.t.) the creators of differences are a people gone astray. Let us now look at some of the *Hadeeth* of the Holy Imams (a.s.).

#### **AL KAFI - H 643, Ch. 41, h7 (EXTRACT)**

أما علمنا فظاهر، وأما إبان أجلنا الذي يظهر فيه الدين منا حتى لا يكون بين الناس اختلاف، فإن له أجلا من ممر الليالي والأيام، إذا أتى ظهر، وكان الأمر واحدا. وأيم الله لقد قضي الأمر أن لا يكون بين المؤمنين اختلاف

The Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq (a.s.) said: **'Our knowledge is clear.** The appearance of the appointed time for us in which religion will stand supreme through us so much so that there will remain no differences among people, for such time there is an appointed time that passes through the nights and days. When that time comes, the Command of Allah will be only one. **I swear by Allah, it is already decreed that there will be no differences among the believers'**.

#### **AL KAFI - H 639, Ch. 41, h3**

وبهذا الاسناد، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: قال الله عزوجل في ليلة القدر " فيها يفرق كل أمر حكيم " يقول: ينزل فيها كل أمر حكيم، والمحكم ليس بشيئين، إنما هو شئ واحد، فمن حكم بما ليس فيه اختلاف، فحكمه من حكم الله عزوجل، ومن حكم بأمر فيه اختلاف فرأى أنه مصيب فقد حكم بحكم الطاغوت

Through the same chain of narrators it is narrated from Abu Ja'far (a.s.), recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "Allah, the Most Holy, the Most High, has said about the Night of Determination, ' . . . in this night every absolute command coming from Us becomes distinguishable.' (44:4) He has spoken of absolute and strong command.

Absolute and strong command is not two things. It is only one thing. One who judges without disharmony and differences, his judgment is of the judgment of Allah, the Most Holy and the Most High. **Whoever judges in a disharmonious manner, with differences, and considers it as the rightful way of judging, he has judged with the judgment of the devil.**

We have this ridiculous situation where people of the same city have ended up celebrating Eid on different days, sometimes over three days and sometimes there is a two day gap in between with two emulators of the same *Mujtahid* living in the same place having done it on different days. How bad can it possibly get before people realise that this is wrong?

Then the representatives of the *Mujtahids* come over to us and say in blatant violation of the statement of the Holy Imam Ali (a.s.) quoted above, that both the *Mujtahids* are correct and it does not matter whether we fast on a particular day or celebrate *Eid*. Let us now look at what the Holy Imam Ali (a.s.) has said about these *Mujtahids*.

## NAHJ UL BALAGAH – SERMON NO. 18

في ذمّ اختلاف العلماء فيالفتيا وفيه يذم أهل الرأي ويكل أمر الحكم في أمور الدين للقرآن

ثَرَدُ عَلَى أَحَدِهِمُ الْقَضِيَّةَ فِي حُكْمٍ مِنَ الْأَحْكَامِ فَيَحْكُمُ فِيهَا بِرَأْيِهِ، ثُمَّ تَرَدُّ تِلْكَ الْقَضِيَّةُ بِعَيْنِهَا عَلَى غَيْرِهِ فَيَحْكُمُ فِيهَا بِخِلَافِ قَوْلِهِ، ثُمَّ يَجْتَمِعُ الْفُضَاءُ بِذَلِكَ عِنْدَ إِمَامِهِمُ الَّذِي اسْتَفْضَاهُمْ فَيُصَوِّبُ آرَاءَهُمْ جَمِيعاً، وَاللَّهُمُّ وَاحِدٌ! وَنَبِيُّهُمْ وَاحِدٌ! وَكِتَابُهُمْ وَاحِدٌ! أَفَأَمَرَ اللَّهُ - سُبْحَانَهُ - بِالْاِخْتِلَافِ فَأَطَاعُوهُ! أَمْ نَهَاَهُمْ عَنْهُ فَعَصَوْهُ! أَمْ أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ سُبْحَانَهُ دِيناً نَاقِصاً فَاسْتَعَانَ بِهِمْ عَلَى إِتْمَامِهِ! أَمْ كَانُوا شُرَكَاءَ لَهُ فَلَهُمْ أَنْ يَقُولُوا وَعَلَيْهِ أَنْ يَرْضَى؟ أَمْ أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ سُبْحَانَهُ دِيناً تَاماً فَقَصَرَ الرَّسُولُ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ عَنْ تَبْلِيغِهِ وَأَدَائِهِ؟ وَاللَّهُ سُبْحَانَهُ يَقُولُ: وَفِيهِ تَبْيَانٌ لِكُلِّ شَيْءٍ، وَذَكَرَ أَنَّ الْكِتَابَ يُصَدِّقُ بَعْضًا، وَأَنَّهُ لَا اِخْتِلَافَ فِيهِ، فَقَالَ سُبْحَانَهُ: . وَإِنَّ الْقُرْآنَ ظَاهِرُهُ أُنِيقٌ وَبَاطِنُهُ عَمِيقٌ، لَا تَفْنَى عَجَائِبُهُ، وَلَا تَنْقُضِي غَرَائِبُهُ، وَلَا تُكْشِفُ الظُّلْمَاتُ إِلَّا بِهِ .

## IN CONDEMNATION OF THE DIFFERING VIEWS OF THE THEOLOGIANS

‘When a problem is put before anyone of them he passes judgement on it from his imagination. When exactly the same problem is placed before another of them he passes an **opposite** verdict. Then these judges go to the chief who had appointed them and **he confirms all the verdicts**, although their Allah is One (and the same), their Prophet is one (and the same), their Book (the Qur'an) is one (and the same). **Is it that Allah ordered them to differ and they obeyed Him? Or He prohibited them from it but they disobeyed Him?** Or (is it that) Allah sent an incomplete Faith and sought their help to complete it? Or they are His

partners in the affairs, so that it is their share of duty to pronounce and He has to agree? Or is it that Allah the Glorified sent a perfect faith but the Prophet fell short of conveying it and handing it over (to the people)? The fact is that Allah the Glorified says: . . . *We have not neglected anything in the Book (Qur'an) . . .* (Qur'an, 6:38) And says that one part of the Qur'an verifies another part and that there is no divergence in it as He says: . . . *And if it had been from any other than Allah, they would surely have found in it much discrepancy.* (Qur'an, 4 :82). Certainly the outside of the Qur'an is wonderful and its inside is deep (in meaning). Its wonders will never disappear, its amazements will never pass away and its intricacies cannot be cleared except through itself”.

This sermon has cut off all the tongues of falsehood and has not left any excuse for those that issue differing views and verdicts.

These people have left us in confusion and doubt. There is no religion in this. **The Divine Religion is based on conviction, not on doubt.**

#### **AL KAFI - H 2870, CH 165, h 5**

الحسين بن محمد، عن أحمد بن إسحاق، عن بكر بن محمد، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: إن الشك والمعصية في النار، ليسا منا ولا إلينا

Al-Husayn ibn Muhammad has narrated from Ahmad ibn Ishaq from Bakr ibn Muhammad from abu ‘Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: “Abu ‘Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, has said, ‘**Doubts and disobedience are in the fire. It is not from us nor is it directed to us.**’”

#### **AL KAFI - H 2872, CH 165, h 7**

عنه، عن أبيه، رفعه إلى أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: لا ينفع مع الشك و الجحود عمل

It is narrated from him (narrator of the *Hadith* above) from his father in a marfu’ manner from abu Ja’far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: “Abu Ja’far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, has said, ‘**No deed with doubt and denial will be of any benefit.**’”



## A COMPLETE MONTH

There is not point in getting involved in complicated calculations which have resulted in the fiasco that we have these days. The situation today has now become a farce and nobody has got a clue whether they are coming or going. The best solution is to go to the Divine Guides that Allah (s.w.t.) has Sent and take their advice.

### AL KAFI – BOOK OF FASTING, VOL. 4 – H3

أبي عبد الله ع قال شهر رمضان ثلاثون يوماً لا ينقصُ ولا ينفصُ والله أبدأ

The Holy Imam J'afar Al Sadiq (a.s.) said: The month of **Ramadhan is of thirty days**. By Allah (s.w.t.) it will **never** be deficient.

### AL KAFI – BOOK OF FASTING, VOL. 4 – H2

عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ تَبَارَكَ وَ تَعَالَى خَلَقَ الدُّنْيَا فِي سِتَّةِ أَيَّامٍ ثُمَّ اخْتَارَ لَهَا عَنْ أَيَّامِ السَّنَةِ وَالسَّنَةُ ثَلَاثُمِائَةٍ وَ أَرْبَعٌ وَ خَمْسُونَ يَوْماً شَعْبَانَ لَا يَتِمُّ أبدأ رَمَضَانَ لَا يَنْقُصُ وَ اللَّهُ أبدأ وَ لَا تَكُونُ فَرِيضَةٌ نَاقِصَةٌ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ يَقُولُ وَ لِنُكْمِلُوا الْعِدَّةَ وَ شَوَّالٍ تِسْعَةٌ وَ عَشْرُونَ يَوْماً وَ ذُو الْقَعْدَةِ ثَلَاثُونَ يَوْماً لِقَوْلِ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ وَاعِدْنَا مُوسَى ثَلَاثِينَ لَيْلَةً وَ أَثَمْنَاهَا بِعَشْرِ فِتْمٍ مِيقَاتُ رَبِّهِ أَرْبَعِينَ لَيْلَةً وَ ذُو الْحِجَّةِ تِسْعَةٌ وَ عَشْرُونَ يَوْماً وَ الْمُحَرَّمُ ثَلَاثُونَ يَوْماً ثُمَّ الشُّهُورُ بَعْدَ ذَلِكَ شَهْرٌ تَامٌّ وَ شَهْرٌ نَاقِصٌ

The Holy Imam Ja'fa Al Sadiq (a.s.) said: 'Surely Allah (s.w.t.) the High created the earth is six days and then specified the days of the year to be 354 days. **Sha'ban will never ever be complete while Ramadhan will never be deficient by Allah!** The obligations are never deficient. Surely Allah the Mighty has Said 'And complete the number (2:185). Shawwal will be of 29 days and Zilqaad will be of 30 days. Allah (s.w.t.) the Mighty said 'And We appointed a time for Musa of thirty nights and completed them with ten and so the appointed time of his Lord was complete forty nights. And Zilhajj will be of 29 days and Muharram will be of 30 days. Then the other months besides these will either be complete or incomplete.

These Hadeeth are in full accordance with the Divine Verse

شَهْرُ رَمَضَانَ الَّذِي أُنزِلَ فِيهِ الْقُرْآنُ هُدًى لِّلنَّاسِ وَبَيِّنَاتٍ مِّنَ الْهُدَى وَالْفُرْقَانِ فَمَن شَهِدَ مِنْكُمُ الشَّهْرَ فَلْيَصُمْهُ وَمَن كَانَ مَرِيضًا أَوْ عَلَى سَفَرٍ فَعِدَّةٌ مِّنْ أَيَّامٍ أُخَرَ يُرِيدُ اللَّهُ بِكُمُ الْيُسْرَ وَلَا يُرِيدُ بِكُمُ الْعُسْرَ وَلِتُكْمِلُوا الْعِدَّةَ وَلِتُكَبِّرُوا اللَّهَ عَلَى مَا هَدَاكُمُ وَلَعَلَّكُمْ تَشْكُرُونَ

[Shakir 2:185] The month of Ramazan is that in which the Quran was revealed, a guidance to men and clear proofs of the guidance and the distinction; therefore whoever of you is present in the month, he shall fast therein, and whoever is sick or upon a journey, then (he shall fast) a (like) number of other days; Allah desires ease for you, and He does not desire for you difficulty, **and (He desires) that you should complete the number** and that you should exalt the greatness of Allah for His having guided you and that you may give thanks.

Now if the holy month of Ramadhaan will always be of thirty days, and the month of Shabaan will never be of thirty days, where is the problem? All, I repeat, **ALL** the problems we have today are related to moon sighting of the first of the month. But the point I am making is that if the moon of the first of the month is difficult to sort out, then it does not matter because the full moon of the middle of the month will **ALWAYS** be seen. Just look at the full moon of the month of Shabaan, add the number of days to make it twenty nine. The following day will be the first of the Holy month of Ramadhaan which will last thirty complete days. And hey presto! Next day will be Eid Ul Fitr.

### **ALL DIFFERENCES REMOVED BY THE SIMPLE STATEMENTS OF THE HOLY INFALLIBLES (A.S.).**

All you have to do is to listen to them and not ignore them. They (a.s.) are the true *Marajas*. All things return to them. They (a.s.) are the Divine Guides sent for mankind to remove differences among the people.

### **THE HOLY PROPHET (S.A.W.)**

Surely the best example for us to follow is that of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.).

لَقَدْ كَانَ لَكُمْ فِي رَسُولِ اللَّهِ أُسْوَةٌ حَسَنَةٌ لِّمَن كَانَ يَرْجُو اللَّهَ وَالْيَوْمَ الْآخِرَ وَذَكَرَ اللَّهَ كَثِيرًا

[Shakir 33:21] Certainly you have in the Messenger of Allah an excellent exemplar for him who hopes in Allah and the latter day and remembers Allah much.

فَأَمَّا الَّذِي رَوَاهُ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْحُسَيْنِ بْنِ أَبِي الْخَطَّابِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ إِسْمَاعِيلَ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ يَعْقُوبَ بْنِ شَعِيبٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ قَالَ قُلْتُ لِأَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَ إِنَّ النَّاسَ يَقُولُونَ إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَ صَامَ تِسْعَةَ وَ عَشْرِينَ يَوْمًا أَكْثَرَ مِمَّا صَامَ ثَلَاثِينَ يَوْمًا فَقَالَ كَذَبُوا مَا صَامَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَ إِلَّا تَامًّا وَ ذَلِكَ قَوْلُ اللَّهِ تَعَالَى وَ لِكُمْلُوا الْعِدَّةَ فَشَهْرُ رَمَضَانَ ثَلَاثُونَ يَوْمًا وَ شَوَّالُ تِسْعَةَ وَ عَشْرُونَ يَوْمًا وَ ذُو الْقَعْدَةِ ثَلَاثُونَ يَوْمًا لَا يَنْقُصُ أَبَدًا لِأَنَّ اللَّهَ تَعَالَى يَقُولُ وَ وَاَعَدْنَا مُوسَى ثَلَاثِينَ لَيْلَةً وَ ذُو الْحِجَّةِ تِسْعَةَ وَ عَشْرُونَ يَوْمًا ثُمَّ الشُّهُورُ عَلَى مِثْلِ ذَلِكَ شَهْرٌ تَامٌّ وَ شَهْرٌ نَاقِصٌ وَ شَعْبَانُ لَا يَتِمُّ أَبَدًا

The narrator said to the Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq (a.s.): 'The people are saying that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.) used to fast 29 days more often than he (s.a.w.) used to fast 30 days', He (a.s.) said: '**They lie! The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.) did not fast except a complete month and it is the Command of Allah (s.w.t.) 'And complete the number (2:185).** The month of Ramadhan is of thirty days, and Shawwal is of twenty nine days and Zulqadah is of thirty days. There is no deficiency ever Allah (s.w.t.) the Mighty said 'And We appointed a time for Musa of thirty nights and completed them with ten and so the appointed time of his Lord was complete forty nights. And Zuhijjah is of twenty nine days and the others will be either complete or incomplete and Shabaan will never be complete.

I know that I have quoted a very similar Hadeeth above but in this one it is clearly stated that the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.) used to fast a complete month. **This Hadeeth has been repeated many times in Shia source books and is correct.** (References are available for the inquiring mind).

## QUESTIONS

If the Holy prophet (s.a.w.) **ALWAYS** used to fast thirty days in *Ramadhan*, then why are we doing otherwise?

If the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.) is the best example for us, then why are we following other people?

## THE FUNDAMENTAL CRITERION

It is unanimously agreed among all that the fundamental criterion for the start and the end of the Holy Month of *Ramadhan* is to be on the physical sighting of the moon.

### WASAAIL US SHIA – CH 3 H2 - 13340

محمد بن الحسن بإسناده عن علي بن مهزيار ، عن محمد بن أبي عمير ، عن أبي أيوب وحمام ، عن محمد بن مسلم ، عن أبي جعفر ( عليه السلام ) ، قال : إذا رأيتم الهلال فصوموا ، وإذا رأيتموه فأفطروا ، وليس بالرأي ولا بالتظني ولكن بالرؤية

The Holy Imam Muhammad Al Baqir (a.s.) who said: ‘When you see the moon then start your Fast and when you see the moon then complete it, and **do not go by opinions and conjecture, but go by sighting**’. (This is to be found in many other Shiite source books including Al Tehzeeb Ul Ahkaam, Al Istibsaar, Al Kafi, Man La Yahzur Ul Faqih etc.).

I, for one, have been living in the city of London for more than twenty years and have never personally sighted the moon, and neither have any of my friends. The sky is almost always cloudy and overcast. We have always been advised to follow the *Mujtahids* who have presented two different theories.

The view of one of the *Mujtahids* was that if the moon is sighted somewhere in the east with who we share the night then that is good enough for us and we can celebrate Eid day along with them even though they may be half way across the world.

And then the other *Mujtahid* went overboard on astronomical calculations and gave us a different theory based on the angle of horizon. There was much discussion about these and computers were used to simulate the movements of the planets to calculate the angle of horizon accurately.

All this has led to the fiasco that we find ourselves in today.

Let us now look at what the Holy Imam (a.s.) has said about this.

## WASAAIL US SHIA – CH 15 H 1 - 13459

محمد بن الحسن بإسناده عن محمد بن الحسن الصفار ، عن محمد بن عيسى قال : كتب إليه أبو عمر : أخبرني يا مولاي ، إنه ربما أشكل علينا هلال شهر رمضان فلا نراه ونرى السماء ليست فيها علة ويفطر الناس ونفطر معهم ، ويقول قوم من الحساب قبلنا : إنه يرى في تلك الليلة بعينها بمصر ، وإفريقية ، والاندلس ، هل يجوز - يا مولاي - ما قال الحساب في هذا الباب حتى يختلف الفرض على أهل الامصار فيكون صومهم خلاف صومنا ، وفطرهم خلاف فطرنا ؟ فوقع : لا تصومن الشك ، أفطر لرؤيته وصم لرؤيته

Sheykh Toosi has narrated from Muhammad Bin Isa who said that Abu Amr wrote a letter to the Holy Imam Ali Naqi (a.s.) that: ‘My Master! Sometimes we cannot see the moon despite the fact that there are no clouds and the sky is clear and so the people do not fast and we also do not fast along with them. Among us there are some people of calculations (Ahl Ul Hisaab) who say that on this night the moon will be sighted in Egypt, Africa and Andalusia (Spain). My Master! **Can we rely on these people of calculations in this matter due to which arise differences in different cities with regarding to the start and the end of the fasting, their fasting is on a different day from ours and their Eid Ul Fitr is on different day from ours?** The Holy Imam Al Naqi (a.s) wrote back with his (a.s.) signature: ‘Fasting is not to be done with doubt. Open your fast by sighting and close it by sighting’. (Also In Tehzeeb Ul Ahkaam)

What is to be done with these theories now?

## WASAAIL US SHIA – CH 15 H2

جعفر بن الحسن السعيد المحقق في (المعتبر) عن النبي (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم) قال : من صدق كاهنا أو منجما فهو كافر بما انزل على محمد (صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم)

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.) said: ‘Whoever verifies the soothsayer or the astrologer (astronomer?) is an unbeliever in that which has been revealed upon Muhammad (s.a.w.)’

## THE CURSE

It makes me wonder whether we as a people are subject to a curse since we do not seem to get our *Eid* day to be correct and are always in doubt about it. Take a look at these two *Hadeeth* regarding the accursed people.

- محمد بن يحيى، عن محمد بن أحمد، عن السياري، عن محمد بن إسماعيل الرازي عن أبي جعفر الثاني (عليه السلام) قال: قلت له: جعلت فداك ما تقول في الصوم فإنه قد روي أنهم لا يوفقون لصوم؟ فقال: أما إنه قد اجيبت دعوة الملك فيهم قال: فقلت: وكيف ذلك جعلت فداك؟ قال: إن الناس لما قتلوا الحسين صلوات الله عليه أمر الله تبارك وتعالى ملكا ينادي أيتها الامة الظالمة القاتلة عترة نبيها لا وفقكم الله لصوم ولا لظفر.

The narrator asked from Imam<sup>asws</sup>: What would you say about those people who claim that their enemies will not get the opportunity to fast? Imam<sup>asws</sup> replied: True, this is due to the prayers of an angel. I asked; why is it so? Imam<sup>asws</sup> responded, Allah<sup>azwj</sup> asked one of His angels to declare the following when people martyred Imam Hussain<sup>asws</sup>: O! The nation of Rasool Allah<sup>asws</sup> why did you stage brutality against the family of Prophet<sup>saww</sup> and killed them, Allah<sup>azwj</sup> would not give you an opportunity to fast and give away 'Fitra'. - **Faroo-e-Kafi, tradition 2, vol. 3, pp. 357**

علي بن محمد، عن ذكره، عن محمد بن سليمان، عن عبد الله بن لطيف التفليسي عن رزين قال: قال أبو عبد الله (عليه السلام): لما ضرب الحسين بن علي (عليهما السلام) بالسيف فسقط رأسه ثم ابتدر ليقطع رأسه نادى مناد من بطنان العرش ألا أيتها الامة المتحيرة الضالة بعد نبيها لا وفقكم الله لاصحى ولا لظفر، قال: ثم قال أبو عبد الله (عليه السلام): فلاجرم والله ما وفقوا ولا يوفقون حتى يثأر ثائر الحسين (عليه السلام).

Imam Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup> said: When Imam Hussain<sup>asws</sup> head was detached, an announcement was heard, coming from the skies, O! Mislead and misguided nation of Prophet<sup>saww</sup>, Allah<sup>azwj</sup> will not allow you to offer sacrifice, offer Fitra. Imam<sup>asws</sup> said, By my Lord<sup>azwj</sup>, they have not and will not be blessed (for the feasts) until the revenge of Imam Hussain<sup>asws</sup> is taken. - **Faroo-e-Kafi, tradition 3, vol. 3, pp. 357**

Are we supposed to celebrate this Eid in the first place? Take a look at this one!

أحمد بن محمد، عن علي بن الحسين، عن عمرو بن عثمان، عن حنان بن سدير، عن عبد الله بن دينار، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: قال: يا عبد الله ما من عيد للمسلمين أضحى ولا فطر إلا وهو يجد دلال محمد فيه حزنا، قلت: ولم ذلك؟ قال: لأنهم يرون حقهم في يد غيرهم.

Imam Mohammed Baqir<sup>asws</sup> said: There is not a single Muslim who would not vicariously feel **the grief** on Eid-ul-Fitr and Eid-ul-Qurban. I asked, what is the reason? Imam<sup>asws</sup> replied, because he will see (particularly on these days) rights of Mohammed<sup>saww</sup> and Alay Mohammed<sup>asws</sup> in the hands of their enemies - **Faroo-e-Kafi, tradition 2 vol. 3, pp. 357**

I have always seen people celebrating on this day and never mourning. Yes, there is indeed a minority who do sit in mourning for the Holy Imam Husayn (a.s.) and grieve over him on *Eid* day, but that is only a very small minority.

It makes me wonder whether the majority have got it all wrong again.

## SOME HADEETH

For those of you who wish to know more *Hadeeth* about this matter, I am quoting some of them hereunder.

### AL KAFI – BOOK OF FASTING, VOL. 4 – H1

قُلْتُ لِأَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع إِنَّ السَّمَاءَ تُطْبِقُ عَلَيْنَا بِالْعِرَاقِ الْيَوْمَ وَالْيَوْمَيْنِ وَالثَّلَاثَةَ فَأَيَّ يَوْمٍ نَصُومُ قَالَ انْظُرِ الْيَوْمَ الَّذِي صُمْتَ مِنَ السَّنَةِ الْمَاضِيَةِ وَصُمْ يَوْمَ الْخَامِسِ

I said to the Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq (a.s.): ‘Over with us in Iraq the sky is normally overcast for one or two or three days and so on which day should we observe fast?’ He (a.s.) replied: ‘**Recall the day on which you observed fast last year and then fast on the fifth day**’.

### AL KAFI – BOOK OF FASTING, VOL. 4 – H2

أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ صُمْ فِي الْعَامِ الْمُسْتَقْبَلِ يَوْمَ الْخَامِسِ مِنْ يَوْمٍ صُمْتَ فِيهِ عَامَ أَوَّلَ

The Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq (a.s.) said: ‘**Fast next year on the fifth day from the day you fasted this year**’,

So now it is up to you whether you listen to the Divine Guides or you keep listening to this committee, or that expert or the other.

The Holy Imam Ali (a.s.) said: When scholars say something correct, it is like medicine, and **when they say something incorrect, it is like poison.**

مَنْ يُطِيعِ الرَّسُولَ فَقَدْ أَطَاعَ اللَّهَ وَمَنْ تَوَلَّى فَمَا أَرْسَلْنَاكَ عَلَيْهِمْ حَفِيظًا

[**Shakir 4:80**] **Whoever obeys the Messenger, he indeed obeys Allah, and whoever turns back, so We have not sent you as a keeper over them.**



## CONCLUSION

Quite frankly I don't see how all these 'experts' on moon sighting who have set up committees for the declaration of *Eid* day could have missed out all these statements of the Holy Infallibles (a.s.).

**If they are not aware of these *Hadeeth*, then they are not competent enough to sit in these committees.**

**If they are aware of these *Hadeeth*, then they are guilty of deliberately turning their backs on these statements of the Holy Imam (a.s.).**

Either way, they cannot be followed.

*Bashir Alidina*

*10<sup>th</sup> October 2009*