



Our response to Wahid-u-deen Haider's Leaflet 'Wilayatul-Momineen'

Abstract:

In response to Ghazanfar Abbas's comments on some of the local slogans (Naray) during his recent visit to Hyderabad, India, Wahid-u-Deen Haider, who calls himself Akhbari has written three pages in a 16-page leaflet. In his short write-up, he tries to justify what he and his supports have been saying in those slogans, which are, in fact, completely against the teachings of Ahl al-Bayt^{asws}. But he still goes ahead and tries to take only few words of a Hadith and uses his own 'Qias' (analogy) and 'aql' (intellect) to defend his stance/fabrication/Biddah. In his write-up Wahid-u-Deen attempts to prove that Allah^{azwj} introduces Allah^{azwj}, and one Allah^{azwj} is Allah^{azwj} and the other one is Ali^{asws} or that one is Zahir (apparent) and other is Batin (hidden), in a very convoluted way, whereas the complete Hadith is totally ignored where Prophet^{saww}, and Imam^{asws} are also mentioned. So, if, tomorrow, he becomes a non-believer, he will still be able to defend it by only taking (La ila Ha) out of complete 'La Ila Ha Ila'Allah' and by composing another leaflet with the message: 'See there is no god' (nouzobillah)!

We, below, have presented the whole Hadith of Mola Ali^{asws} along with the comments of its compiler (Yaqub Kulani), as without looking at the complete Hadith, innocent believers may fall into the devious trap of Wahid-u-Deen and run around like a headless chicken into a wonderland of disbelief. Therefore, falling from an elevated position (being a lover of Ahl al-Bayt^{asws}) to troughs of 'Zulmat' (darkness) and 'Kufr' (disbelief).

After only writing three pages, Wahid-u-Deen, surely, runs out of steam and starts wrangling with the Holy Hadith, in an attempt to prove his Ijtihad on another topic, which he himself later criticises Ijtihad, on the very next page (page no 4). He, then, goes on to other topics indiscriminately and after getting fully exhausted and being unable to write further he aimlessly goes wild and touches upon a delicate subject of 'Nikah of Syedani with non-Syed' There, he shows his full agreement with his 'batini' brethren - the Usooli scholars (the Mujtahadeen) and does 'Tahreef' to the Hadith of the holy Imam^{asws} and eventually, he tries to turn Allah^{azwj}'s Haram into Halal by allowing for this forbidden Nikah.

We have only taken two examples of his misinterpretations of Ahadith, although there are more, i.e., Salat-e-Eidain, see for example¹, he uses the word Moulana for himself, which is reserved for Masomeen^{asws}, see our reply elsewhere² but we think, these two examples are more than enough to prove his shameless emphasis on 'Batil' and how he blatantly misinterprets the Holy Hadith of Masomeen^{asws} and is responsible for giving a bad name and repute to the true Akhbaris - The true followers of the teachings of Ahl al-Bayt^{asws}.

¹ http://hubeali.com/images/newimg/Eid_Adil_Imam_asws.pdf

² <http://hubeali.com/articles/Questions-On-Titles.pdf>

اعرفوا الله بالله:

عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ عَمَّنْ ذَكَرَهُ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدَ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ مُحَمَّدَ بْنِ حُمْرَانَ عَنِ الْفَضْلِ بْنِ السَّكَنِ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ قَالَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ع اعرفوا الله بالله و الرسول بالرسالة و اولي الامر بالامر بالمعروف و العدل و الاحسان³

Ali ibn Muhammad has narrated from the people he mentioned from Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn 'Isa from Muhammad ibn Humran from al-Fadl ibn al-Sakan who has narrated the following from (Imam) abu 'Abd Allah^{asws}:

'Imam Ali^{asws} has said: 'Recognise Allah^{azwj} by Allah^{azwj}'s Own Self, recognise the al-Rasool^{saww} through the Risalat (The Divine Message), and the Wali al-Amr (the people with Divine Authority) through their^{asws} commanding others to do what is obligatory, prohibiting evil, the practicing of justice and kindness.⁴

و مَعْنَى قَوْلِهِ ع اعرفوا الله بالله يَعْنِي أَنَّ اللَّهَ خَلَقَ الْأَشْخَاصَ وَ الْأَنْوَارَ وَ الْجَوَاهِرَ وَ الْأَعْيَانَ فَالْأَعْيَانُ الْأَبْدَانُ وَ الْجَوَاهِرُ الْأَرْوَاحُ وَ هُوَ جَلٌّ وَ عَزٌّ لَا يُشْبِهُ جِسْمًا وَ لَا رُوحًا وَ لَيْسَ لِأَحَدٍ فِي خَلْقِ الرُّوحِ الْحَسَّاسِ الدَّرَكِ أَمْرٌ وَ لَا سَبَبٌ هُوَ الْمُتَقَرِّدُ بِخَلْقِ الْأَرْوَاحِ وَ الْأَجْسَامِ فَإِذَا نَفَى عَنْهُ الشَّبَهَيْنِ شَبَهَ الْأَبْدَانِ وَ شَبَهَ الْأَرْوَاحِ فَقَدْ عَرَفَ اللَّهَ بِاللَّهِ وَ إِذَا شَبَّهَهُ بِالرُّوحِ أَوْ الْبَدَنِ أَوْ النُّورِ فَلَمْ يَعْرِفِ اللَّهَ بِاللَّهِ

The following is a comment by al-Kulayni on the above Hadith: 'Recognise Allah^{azwj} by His Own Self,' means that Allah^{azwj} has Created the individuals, the lights, the substance and the objects. The objects are the bodies, the substance stands for the spirits and He^{azwj} is not similar to the bodies or spirit in any of the creatures. No one has any part or effect in the creation of the spirits that comprehend and feel. He^{azwj} is the only One who has Created the spirits and the bodies. When one considers Him^{azwj} dissimilar to both kinds of creatures, spiritual and non-spiritual, then one has recognised Allah^{azwj} by Allah^{azwj}'s Own Self. If one considers Him^{azwj} similar to the spirits, lights or bodies he has not recognised Him^{azwj} by His^{azwj} Own Self.⁵

The Original Hadith on Syedani, which was Falsified by Wahidudeen:

وسائل الشيعة 9 271 30- باب أنه إنما تحرم الزكاة على من
11999- مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَعْقُوبَ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ حَمَّادِ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ بَعْضِ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنِ الْعَبْدِ الصَّالِحِ ع فِي حَدِيثٍ طَوِيلٍ قَالَ وَ مَنْ كَانَتْ أُمُّهُ مِنْ بَنِي هَاشِمٍ وَ أَبُوهُ مِنْ سَائِرِ قُرَيْشٍ فَإِنَّ الصَّدَقَاتِ تَحِلُّ لَهُ وَ لَيْسَ لَهُ مِنَ الْخُمْسِ شَيْءٌ لِأَنَّ اللَّهَ يَقُولُ ادْعُوهُمْ لِآبَائِهِمْ

Mohammed ibn Yaqub, who from Ali ibn Ibrahim who from his father, who from Hammad ibn Isa who from some of their companions who report the following in a long hadith from Abd al-Sahly:

If someone's mother is from Bani Hashim and father is from Qurash, 'Sadaqah'⁶ is halal for him and there is nothing from Khums for him because Allah^{azwj} says: **Call them from the names of their fathers (33:5).**

Also in another book

³ الكافي 1 85 باب أنه لا يعرف إلا به ص : 5

⁴ Al-Kafi, Vol, 1, H 224, Ch. 3, h, 1.

⁵ The tafseer of the haidth by Yaqub Kulayni (ra) الكافي 1 85 باب أنه لا يعرف إلا به ص : 5

⁶ Zikaat, which is defined as a dirt of someone' hand in ahadith

عوالي اللآلي 3 129 باب الخمس ص : 125

13- و روى حماد بن عيسى قال روى لي بعض أصحابنا عن العبد الصالح أبي الحسن الأول ع و من كانت أمه من بني هاشم و أبوه من سائر قريش فإن الصدقة تحل له و ليس له في الخمس شيء لأن الله تعالى يقول ادعوهم لآبائهم

If someone's mother is from Bani Hashim and father is from Qurash, Sadaqah is halal for him and there is nothing from Khums for him because Allah^{azwj} says: **Call them from the names of their fathers (33:5).**

The complete hadith is given in al-Kafi, vol. 1. h.4.

A Hadith which Proves Nikah of Syedani with Non-Syed is Forbidden:

الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ الْحَسَنِ الْهَاشِمِيُّ عَنْ إِبْرَاهِيمَ بْنِ إِسْحَاقَ الْأَحْمَرِ وَعَلِيِّ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ بُنْدَارَ عَنِ السَّيَّارِيِّ عَنْ بَعْضِ الْبُعْدَادِيِّينَ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ بِلَالٍ قَالَ لَقِيَ هِشَامَ بْنَ الْحَكَمِ بَعْضَ الْخَوَارِجِ فَقَالَ يَا هِشَامُ مَا تَقُولُ فِي الْعَجَمِ يَجُوزُ أَنْ يَتَزَوَّجُوا فِي الْعَرَبِ قَالَ نَعَمْ قَالَ فَالْعَرَبُ يَتَزَوَّجُوا مِنْ قُرَيْشٍ قَالَ نَعَمْ قَالَ فَقُرَيْشٌ يَتَزَوَّجُ فِي بَنِي هَاشِمٍ قَالَ نَعَمْ قَالَ عَمَّنْ أَخَذْتَ هَذَا قَالَ عَنْ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ سَمِعْتُهُ يَقُولُ أَتَنكَأَفُ دِمَاؤَكُمْ وَ لَا تَنكَأَفُ فُرُوجَكُمْ قَالَ فَخَرَجَ الْخَارِجِيُّ حَتَّى أَتَى أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع فَقَالَ إِنِّي لَقَيْتُ هِشَامًا فَسَأَلْتُهُ عَنْ كَذَا فَأَخْبَرَنِي بِكَذَا وَ كَذَا وَ ذَكَرَ أَنَّهُ سَمِعَهُ مِنْكَ قَالَ نَعَمْ قَدْ قُلْتُ ذَلِكَ فَقَالَ الْخَارِجِيُّ فَهَذَا أَنَا ذَا قَدْ جِئْتُكَ خَاطِبًا فَقَالَ لَهُ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع إِنَّكَ لَكُفْرٌ فِي دَمِكَ وَ حَسْبُكَ فِي قَوْمِكَ وَ لَكِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ صَانِنًا عَنِ الصَّدَقَةِ وَ هِيَ أَوْسَاخُ أَيْدِي النَّاسِ فَتَكْرَهُ أَنْ تُشْرِكَ فِيهَا فَضَلْنَا اللَّهَ بِهِ مَنْ لَمْ يَجْعَلِ اللَّهَ لَهُ مِثْلَ مَا جَعَلَ اللَّهُ لَنَا فَقَامَ الْخَارِجِيُّ وَ هُوَ يَقُولُ تَاللَّهِ مَا رَأَيْتُ رَجُلًا مِثْلَهُ قَطُّ رَدَّنِي وَ اللَّهُ أَفْبَحَ رَدًّا وَ مَا خَرَجَ مِنْ قَوْلِ صَاحِبِهِ

Al-Husayn ibn al-Hassan al-Hashimiy has narrated from Ibrahim ibn Ishaq al-Ahmar and Ali ibn Muhammad ibn Bandar from al-Sayyariy from certain person of Baghdad from Ali Bilal, who has said the following:

'Hisham ibn al-Hakam once met a man of Khawarij (a certain sect) who said. 'O Hisham, what do you say if al-'Ajam (non-Arab) marries from Arab?' Hisham said, 'Yes, they can marry.' He asked, 'Can Arabs marry from Quraysh?' He replied, 'Yes, they can marry.' He then asked, 'Can Quraysh marry from banu Hashim?'' He replied, 'Yes, they can marry.' He then asked, 'From whom have you taken this?' He replied, 'I have taken this from Ja'far ibn Muhammad^{asws}. I heard him (the Imam) saying, "How can it be (accepted) that your lives match as equals but not your reproductive organs?" He (the narrator) has said that the Kharijiy man left and went to abu 'Abd Allah^{asws} and said, 'I met Hisham and asked him so and so questions and he answered me so and so, saying that he has heard it from you.' He (the Imam) said, 'Yes, I have said so.' He then said, 'Here I have come with a marriage proposal.'

Abu 'Abd Allah^{asws} said: 'You are a match of members of your community in matters of life and social issues. Allah^{azwj} however, has protected us^{asws} from charity which is the dirt of the hands of people and we dislike to share what preference Allah^{azwj} has Given to us^{asws} with those to whom Allah^{azwj} has not given such preference as He^{azwj} has set it for us^{asws}.' The Kharijiy man left saying: 'By Allah^{azwj}, I have never seen any man like him. He repulsed me with a disgracing response and without contradicting his companion.'⁷

⁷ Al-Kafi, vol. 5, Ch. 22, h 5