

Authenticity of a Hadith and its Criteria

Table of Contents

Authenticity of a Hadith and its Criteria	3
Summary:.....	3
Introduction:	3
How does one find Authentic Ahadith?.....	4
First Hadith on Authenticity of Ahadith:.....	5
Second Hadith on authenticity of Ahadith:.....	5
Third Hadith on authenticity of Ahadith:.....	6
What about gradings of Ahadith (Sahih, Dhaeef, Mawdu.....)?.....	6
So, what is the basis of Ahadith grading?	6
Imam Al-Reza^{-asws} Refuted false Ahadith from the Quran as well as from Ahadith	7
'Tafseer Bil Ra'yi' (Interpretation by Opinion) is Absolutely Forbidden:	13
Why leave the 'Grand River' and drink from (muddy) puddles?.....	14
Imam^{-asws} Rebukes those who do not follow Sunnah (Ahadith):	15
What to do when a Hadith opposes a Hadith?	15
Why does one need Ahadith to interpret the Holy Quran?	17
Don't take from Hypocrites pointed out by Masomeen^{-asws}:	17
An example of the deliberately lying ones:	19
11th Imam^{-asws} cursed Ibn Hilal for interfering in (Ahadith):.....	19
APPENDIX I: Infallibility of Prophets^{-as}.....	21
The Debate of Imam Ali^{-asws} ibn Musa Al-Reza^{-asws} with Muslim scholars on the infallibility of the Prophets^{-as}	22
APPENDIX II: Ahadith Summarising the Interpretation of Quran.....	26

Abbreviations:

saww: - Sal la la ho Allay hay Wa Aal lay he Wasallam

azwj: - Az Za Wa Jalla

asws: - Allay hay Salawat Wass Salam

AJFJ: Ajal Allah hey wa Fara Jaak

ra: - Razi Allah^{-azwj}

La: - Laan Allah^{-azwj}

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ، وَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَى سَيِّدِنَا مُحَمَّدٍ وَ آلِهِ الطَّاهِرِينَ، وَ سَلَّمَ تَسْلِيمًا.

In the Name of Allah^{-azwj} the Beneficent, the Merciful. The Praise is for Allah^{-azwj} Lord^{-azwj} of the Worlds, and Blessing be upon our Chief Muhammad^{-saww} and his^{-saww} Purified Progeny^{-asws}, and greetings with abundant greetings.

اللَّهُمَّ صَلِّ عَلَى مُحَمَّدٍ وَ آلِ مُحَمَّدٍ وَ عَجِّلْ فَرَجَهُمْ وَ أَلْعَنُ أَعْدَاءَهُمْ أَجْمَعِينَ

Authenticity of a Hadith and its Criteria

Summary:

Most Muslims, for Ahadith authentication, check if a Hadith is in accordance with the Holy Quran. This is difficult as Quranic Verses have multiple meanings and interpretations, so they have mostly relied upon a man-made principle of the *Ilmul Rejal* (scrutinising the characters of the Hadith narrators, if they are honest).

However, as we will find in this article, that a Hadith needs to be in accordance with the Holy Quran or in accordance with other Ahadith of Rasool Allah^{-saww}, so there is no role of *Ilmul Rejal* in establishing the authenticity of a Hadith. As a general guideline, Masomeen^{-asws} have forbidden us from taking Ahadith from hypocrites who have frequently lied and fabricated Ahadith for worldly gains and due to their animosity against Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws}, these Ahadith fabricators are identified in Ahadith of Masomeen^{-asws}, so therefore, again the criteria of Hadith authentication lies in the Holy Quran or the Ahadith.

Introduction:

It is very important to act on authentic Ahadith, as Rasool-Allah^{-saww} left behind ‘التقلين’ – the Book and the Sunnah (Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws}) for us to follow, for example:

الدليمي، و أبو الحسن محمد بن شاذان، عن زيد بن ثابت، قال: قال رسول الله (صلى الله عليه و آله): «إني تارك فيكم الثقلين: كتاب الله، و علي بن أبي طالب، و علي أفضل لكم من كتاب الله، لأنه مترجم لكم عن كتاب الله.»

Al-Dulaymi, and Abu Al-Hassan Muhammad Bin Shazan, from Zayd Bin Sabit who said,

‘Rasool-Allah^{-saww} said: ‘I^{-saww} am leaving behind among you all, two weighty things – the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and Ali^{-asws} Bin Abu Talib^{-asws}; and Ali^{-asws} is superior for you all than the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, because he^{-asws} is the interpreter for you of the Book of Allah^{-azwj}’.¹

¹ ارشاد القلوب: 378، مائة منقبة: 161 منقبة 86.

We need (authentic) Ahadith for our worship and deeds, as well as for the interpretation of the Holy Quran.

We quote three Ahadith below:

عن هشام بن سالم، عن أبي عبد الله (عليه السلام) ، قال: «من فسر القرآن برأيه فأصاب لم يُؤجر، و إن أخطأ كان إثمه عليه

From Hashim Bin Salim, from;

Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said: ‘The one who interprets the Quran by his opinion, and he is correct, he would (still) not be Recompensed, and if he errs, its sin would be upon him’.²

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَيْسَى بْنِ عُبَيْدٍ عَنْ يُوسُفَ رَفَعَهُ قَالَ قَالَ عَلِيُّ بْنُ الْحُسَيْنِ (عليه السلام) (إِنَّ أَفْضَلَ الْأَعْمَالِ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ مَا عَمِلَ بِالسُّنَّةِ وَإِنْ قَلَّ .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from Muhammad Bin Isa, from Ubeyd, from Yunus, raising it, said,

‘Ali^{-asws} Bin Al-Husayn^{-asws} said: ‘The most superior of the deeds in the Presence of Allah^{-azwj} is what is performed by (following) the Sunnah, and even though it may be little’.³

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ خَالِدٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ أَبِي إِسْمَاعِيلَ بْنِ إِسْحَاقَ الْأَزْدِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عُثْمَانَ الْعَبْدِيِّ عَنْ جَعْفَرٍ عَنْ آبَائِهِ عَنْ أَمِيرِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ (عليه السلام) قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (صلى الله عليه وآله) لَا قَوْلَ إِلَّا بِعَمَلٍ وَ لَا قَوْلَ وَ لَا عَمَلَ إِلَّا بِنِيَّةٍ وَ لَا نِيَّةَ إِلَّا بِإِصَابَةِ السُّنَّةِ .

A number of our companions, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad Bin Khalid, from his father, from Abu Ismail Ibrahim Bin Is'haq Al Azdy, from Abu Usman Al Abady,

(It has been narrated) from Ja'far^{-asws}, from his^{-asws} forefathers^{-asws}, from Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} having said: ‘Rasool-Allah^{-sawww} said: ‘There is no word except with the deed, and there is neither a word nor a deed except with an intention, and there is neither a word nor a deed nor an intention except with attaining the Sunnah’.⁴

How does one find Authentic Ahadith?

The next question that arises; how does one find authentic Ahadith so that one can act according to the Sunnah and interpret Quranic Verses? One criterion is presented from both Shia and non-Shia sources: an authentic Hadith must be in accordance with the Quran.

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ عَنِ الْفَضْلِ بْنِ شَاذَانَ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ الْحَكَمِ وَ غَيْرِهِ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) قَالَ خَطَبَ النَّبِيُّ (صلى الله عليه وآله) مَعِيَ فَقَالَ أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ مَا جَاءَكُمْ عَنِّي يُؤَافِقُ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ فَأَنَا قُلْتُهُ وَ مَا جَاءَكُمْ يُخَالِفُ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ فَلَمْ أَقُلَّهُ.

² تفسير العياشي 1: 17 / 2.

³ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Intellect and Ignorance CH 21 H 7

⁴ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Intellect and Ignorance CH 21 H 9

Muhamad Bin Ismail, from Al Fazl Bin Shazan, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Hisham Bin Al Hakam and someone else, from:

Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said: ‘The prophet^{-saww} addressed (the people) at Mina, so he^{-saww} said: ‘O you people! Whatever comes to you all from me^{-saww} which is in accordance with the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, so I^{-saww} have said it, and whatever comes to you opposing the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, so I^{-saww} did not say it’.⁵

Another criterion to establish the authenticity of Ahadith is presented in the same chapter of Al-Kafi and immediately following the above Hadith; that is to verify a Hadith with other Ahadith (words of Rasool Allah^{-saww}). This Hadith is also found in other Shia Ahadith books⁶ (e.g., Al-Mahasin). These Ahadith are presented below.

First Hadith on the Authenticity of Ahadith:

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحَكَمِ عَنْ أَبِي بَانَ بْنِ عُثْمَانَ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ أَبِي يَعْقُورٍ قَالَ وَ حَدَّثَنِي حُسَيْنُ بْنُ أَبِي الْعَلَاءِ أَنَّهُ حَضَرَ ابْنَ أَبِي يَعْقُورٍ فِي هَذَا الْمَجْلِسِ قَالَ سَأَلْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) عَنِ اخْتِلَافِ الْحَدِيثِ يَرْوِيهِ مَنْ يَتَّقَى بِهِ وَ مِنْهُمْ مَنْ لَا يَتَّقَى بِهِ قَالَ إِذَا وَرَدَ عَلَيْكُمْ حَدِيثٌ فَوَجَدْتُمْ لَهُ شَاهِدًا مِنْ كِتَابِ اللَّهِ أَوْ مِنْ قَوْلِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ) وَ إِلَّا فَالَّذِي جَاءَكُمْ بِهِ أَوْلَى بِهِ .

Muhammad Bin Yahya, from Abdullah Bin Muhammad, from Ali Bin Al Hakam, from Aban Bin Usman, from Abdullah Bin Abu Yafour who said, ‘And it was narrated to me by Husayn Bin Abu Al A’ala that he was present with Ibn Abu Yafour in this gathering where he said,

‘I asked Abu Abdullah^{-asws} about the differing in the Ahadith being reported by the ones we trust with it and the ones we do not trust with it’. He^{-asws} said: ‘Whenever a Hadith arrives to you and you find evidence for it from the **Book of Allah^{-azwj}, or from the words of Rasool-Allah^{-saww} (fine), or else**, the one which came to you which was the closest with it (the Book)’.⁷

Second Hadith on the Authenticity of Ahadith:

عَنْهُ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحَكَمِ عَنْ أَبِي بَانَ بْنِ عُثْمَانَ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ أَبِي يَعْقُورٍ قَالَ عَلِيُّ وَ حَدَّثَنِي الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ أَبِي الْعَلَاءِ أَنَّهُ حَضَرَ ابْنَ أَبِي يَعْقُورٍ فِي هَذَا الْمَجْلِسِ قَالَ: سَأَلْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنِ اخْتِلَافِ الْحَدِيثِ يَرْوِيهِ مَنْ يَتَّقَى بِهِ وَ فِيهِمْ مَنْ لَا يَتَّقَى بِهِ فَقَالَ إِذَا وَرَدَ عَلَيْكُمْ حَدِيثٌ فَوَجَدْتُمُوهُ لَهُ شَاهِدٌ مِنْ كِتَابِ اللَّهِ أَوْ مِنْ قَوْلِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص وَ إِلَّا فَالَّذِي جَاءَكُمْ بِهِ أَوْلَى بِهِ.⁸

⁵ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Intellect and Ignorance CH 21 H 5

وسائل الشيعة ج 27 110 9 – باب وجوه الجمع بين الأحاديث المختلفة و كيفية العمل بها ص : 106

البرهان في تفسير القرآن ج 1 67 14 – باب أن كل حديث لا يوافق القرآن فهو مردود ص : 67

مرآة العقول في شرح أخبار آل الرسول ج 1 228 الحديث 2 ص : 228

بحار الأنوار (ط - بيروت) ج 2 243 باب 29 علل اختلاف الأخبار و كيفية الجمع بينها و العمل بها و وجوه الاستنباط و بيان أنواع ما يجوز الاستدلال به

..... ص : 219

⁷ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Intellect and Ignorance CH 21 H 2

⁸ (1) - ج 1، «باب علل اختلاف الاخبار و كيفية الجمع بينها» (ص 137، س 6).

From him, from Ali Bin Al hakam, from Abaan Bin Usman, from Abdullah Bin Abu Yafour, from Al Husayn Bin Abu Al a’ala who was present with Abu Yafour in this gathering, said,

‘I asked Abu Abdullah^{-asws} about the differing in the Hadith, shall I report it from the one whom I trust it with, and among them were ones whom I do not trust with it?’ So he^{-asws} said: ‘When a Hadith is reported to you, and you find evidence for it **from the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, or from the words of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}**, and whoever, he who brought it to you is more deserving of it (True Hadith)’.⁹

Third Hadith on the Authenticity of Ahadith:

وعن محمد بن يحيى ، عن عبدالله بن محمد ، عن علي ابن الحكم ، عن أبان بن عثمان ، عن عبدالله بن أبي يعفور ، قال :
وحدثني الحسين بن أبي العلاء ، أنه حضر ابن أبي يعفور في هذا المجلس ، قال : سألت أبا عبدالله (عليه السلام) عن اختلاف
الحديث ، يرويه من نثق به ، ومنهم من لا نثق به ، قال : إذا ورد عليكم حديث فوجدتم له شاهداً من كتاب الله أو من قول
رسول الله (صلى الله عليه وآله) ، وإلا فالذي جاءكم به أولى به .

And from Muhammad Bin Yahya, from Abdullah Bin Muhammad, from Ali Ibn Al Hakam, from Aban Bin Usman, from Abdullah Bin Abu Ya’four who said that it was narrated to him from Al Husayn Bin Abu Al A’la, who was present with Ibn Abu Ya’four in this gathering, says:

‘I asked Abu Abd Allah^{-asws} about the differences in Hadith, narrated from one whom we trust and from those whom we do not trust’. He^{-asws} said: ‘**If a Hadith is referred to you and you find a witness for it from the Book of Allah^{-azwj} or from the statements of the Messenger of Allah^{-saww}, then its authentic**, otherwise give it back to the one who brought it’.¹⁰

Hence, one can confirm the authenticity of a Hadith by verifying it either from the Quran (if one has the knowledge of Quran with respect to the earlier Hadith - *نَاسِخًا وَ مَنسُوحًا وَ عَامًّا وَ خَاصًّا وَ مُحْكَمًا وَ مُتَشَابِهًا*) or from the words of Rasool-Allah^{-saww} (other Ahadith).

What about gradings of Ahadith (Sahih, Dhaeef, Mawdu.....)?

First Non-Shia scholars categorised and graded Ahadith, a similar approach was also later embraced by Shia scholars – by borrowing their ‘usool’ (principles) – that is the Biographical evaluation (*ilm ad-diraya, ilm ar-rijal*): i.e., a Hadith is characterised either Sahih, Hasan, Dhaeef,...employing these principles.

So, what is the basis of Ahadith grading?

The criteria of grading Ahadith was based on ‘*Tafseer Bil Ra’yi*’ (interpretation by opinion), of the following Quranic Verse:

⁹ Al Mahaasin – V 1 Bk 5 H 145

¹⁰ Wasail ul Shia, H. 33344

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِن جَاءَكُمْ فَاسِقٌ بِنَبَأٍ فَتَبَيَّنُوا أَن تُصِيبُوا قَوْمًا بِجَهَالَةٍ فَتُصْبِحُوا عَلَىٰ مَا فَعَلْتُمْ نَادِمِينَ {49:6}

O you who believe! If a transgressor comes to you with news, then investigate, lest you harm a people in ignorance, and you would become remorseful upon what you have done [49:6]

In the Holy Verse [49:6], Allah^{-azwj} has already Said that if a transgressor brings a piece of news, then investigate the news - as it could either be correct or false ‘news’. In the event of correct news, one has to accept the news - even if it was originally being reported by a transgressor/unreliable person! This would eradicate the reliance of the above man-made criteria, i.e., *ilm ad-diraya*, *ilm ar-rijal* - but why? Let’s revisit the earlier (Second Hadith above):

When it was asked from Imam^{-asws}:

‘I asked Abu Abdullah^{-asws} about the differing in the Hadith, shall I report it from the one whom I trust it with, and among them were ones whom I do not trust with it?’ So, he^{-asws} said: ‘When a Hadith is reported to you, and you find evidence for it from the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, or from the words of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}, then he who brought it to you is more deserving of it (so believe in him if authentic, or return it to him if it cannot be verified)’.¹¹

Imam Al-Reza^{-asws} Refuted false Ahadith from the Quran as well as from Ahadith

Based on the criteria of the Hadith above (that a Hadith is to be compared with the Book or Words of Rasool Allah^{-saww}), Imam Ali Al-Reza^{-asws} refuted several fabricated Ahadith, in the court of Al- Al-Ma’mum Al-Rashid, when a deliberate attempt was made to praise some unworthy companions of Rasool Allah^{-saww}:

الإحتجاج وَ رُوِيَ أَنَّ الْمَأْمُونَ بَعْدَ مَا رَوَّحَ ابْنَتَهُ أُمَّ الْفَضْلِ أَبَا جَعْفَرٍ ع كَانَ فِي مَجْلِسٍ وَ عِنْدَهُ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ ع وَ يَحْيَىٰ بِنُ أَكْتَمَ وَ جَمَاعَةٌ كَثِيرَةٌ

(The book) ‘Al-Ihtijaj’ –

‘And it is reported that Al-Mamoun, after having got his daughter Umm Al-Fazl married to Abu Ja’far^{-asws}, was in a gathering and in his presence were Abu Ja’far^{-asws}, and Yahya Bin Aksam, and a large group.

فَقَالَ لَهُ يَحْيَىٰ بِنُ أَكْتَمَ مَا تَقُولُ يَا ابْنَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فِي الْحَبْرِ الَّذِي رُوِيَ أَنَّهُ نَزَلَ جِبْرِيلُ ع عَلَىٰ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص وَ قَالَ يَا مُحَمَّدُ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ يُفَرِّتُكَ السَّلَامَ وَ يَقُولُ لَكَ سَلِّ أَبَا بَكْرٍ هَلْ هُوَ عَنِّي رَاضٍ فَإِنِّي عَنْهُ رَاضٍ

Yahya Bin Aksam said to him^{-asws}, ‘O son^{-asws} of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}! What are you^{-asws} saying regarding the Hadith which is being reported that Jibraeel^{-as} had descended unto Rasool-Allah^{-saww}’

¹¹ Al Mahaasin – V 1 Bk 5 H 145

saww and said: 'O Muhammad^{-saww}! Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic Conveys the Greetings to you^{-saww} and Says to you^{-saww}: 'Ask Abu Bakr, is he pleased with Me^{-azwj}, for I^{-azwj} am Pleased with him!''

فَقَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ لَسْتُ بِمُنْكَرٍ فَضَّلَ أَبِي بَكْرٍ وَ لَكِنْ يَجِبُ عَلَيَّ صَاحِبِ هَذَا الْخَبَرِ أَنْ يَأْخُذَ مِثَالَ الْخَبَرِ الَّذِي قَالَهُ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص فِي حَجَّةِ الْوَدَاعِ قَدْ كَثُرَتْ عَلَيَّ الْكُذَّابَةُ وَ سَتَكُنُّ فَمَنْ كَذَبَ عَلَيَّ مُتَعَمِّدًا فَلْيَتَّبِعُوا مَقْعَدَهُ مِنَ النَّارِ فَإِذَا أَنَا كُمْ الْحَدِيثُ فَأَعْرِضُوهُ عَلَيَّ كِتَابِ اللَّهِ وَ سُنَّتِي فَمَا وَافَقَ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ وَ سُنَّتِي فَخُذُوا بِهِ وَ مَا خَالَفَ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ وَ سُنَّتِي فَلَا تَأْخُذُوا بِهِ

Abu Ja'far^{-asws} said: 'I^{-asws} am not a denier of the merit of Abu Bakr, but it obligated upon the owner (reporter) of this Hadith that he takes an example of the Hadith which Rasool-Allah^{-saww} had said during the farewell Hajj: 'The liars upon me^{-saww} have become a lot, and they will be becoming ever more. The one who lies upon me deliberately, so let him assume his seat from the Fire! So, whenever a Hadith comes to you, then present it to the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my Sunnah. Whatever is in accordance with the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my Sunnah, take with it, and whatever opposes the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my^{-saww} Sunnah, do not take with it.

وَ لَيْسَ يُوَافِقُ هَذَا الْخَبَرَ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ قَالَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى وَ لَقَدْ خَلَقْنَا الْإِنْسَانَ وَ نَعْلَمُ مَا تُوسِسُ بِهِ نَفْسُهُ وَ نَحْنُ أَقْرَبُ إِلَيْهِ مِنْ حَبْلِ الْوَرِيدِ فَاللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ خَفِيَ عَلَيْهِ رِضَا أَبِي بَكْرٍ مِنْ سَخَطِهِ حَتَّى سَأَلَ مِنْ مَكُونِ سِرِّهِ هَذَا مُسْتَحِيلًا فِي الْعُقُولِ

And this Hadith is not in accordance with the Book of Allah^{-azwj}. Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted Said: ***And We Created the human being, and We know what his mind suggests to his self, and We are nearer to him than his jugular vein [50:16]***. Would Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic Hide from him the pleasure of Abu Bakr from his anger until He^{-azwj} Asks from His^{-azwj} hidden secrets? This is impossible in the intellects!

ثُمَّ قَالَ يَحْيَى بْنُ أُنْتَمَ وَ قَدْ رُوِيَ أَنَّ مِثْلَ أَبِي بَكْرٍ وَ عُمَرَ فِي الْأَرْضِ كَمِثْلِ جِبْرَائِيلَ وَ مِيكَائِيلَ فِي السَّمَاءِ

Then Yahya Bin Aksam said, 'And it has been reported that an example of Abu Bakr and Umar in the earth is like an example of Jibraeel^{-as} and Mikaeel^{-as} in the sky'.

فَقَالَ وَ هَذَا أَيْضًا يَجِبُ أَنْ يُنْظَرَ فِيهِ لِأَنَّ جِبْرَائِيلَ وَ مِيكَائِيلَ مَلَكَانِ اللَّهِ مُقَرَّبَانِ لَمْ يُعْصِيَا اللَّهَ قَطُّ وَ لَمْ يُفَارِقَا طَاعَتَهُ لِحُظَّةٍ وَاحِدَةٍ وَ هُمَا قَدْ أَشْرَكَا بِاللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ إِنْ أَسْلَمَا بَعْدَ الشِّرْكِ وَ كَانَ أَكْثَرُ أَيَّامِهِمَا فِي الشِّرْكِ بِاللَّهِ فَمُحَالٌ أَنْ يُشَبَّهَهُمَا بِهَمَا

He^{-asws} said: 'And this as well obligates that one looks into it, because Jibraeel^{-as} and Mikaeel^{-as} are ones of proximity to Allah^{-azwj}. They^{-as} do not disobey Allah^{-azwj} at all, nor do they separate from His^{-azwj} obedience for one moment, and these two (Abu Bakr and Umar) had associated with Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic, and they became Muslims after the Shirk, and most of their days (life) were in Shirk with Allah^{-azwj}. It is therefore impossible that these two can be resembled with those two'.

قَالَ يَحْيَى وَ قَدْ رُوِيَ أَيْضًا أَنَّهُمَا سَيِّدَا كُهُولِ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ فَمَا تَقُولُ فِيهِ

Yahya said, 'And it has been reported as well that these two (Abu Bakr and Umar) are two chiefs of the elderly people of the Paradise. So, what you^{-asws} saying regarding it?'

فَقَالَ ع وَ هَذَا الْخَيْرُ مُحَالٌ أَيْضاً لِأَنَّ أَهْلَ الْجَنَّةِ كُلَّهُمْ يَكُونُونَ شَبَاباً وَ لَا يَكُونُ فِيهِمْ كَهْلٌ وَ هَذَا الْخَيْرُ وَضَعَهُ بَنُو أُمَيَّةَ لِمُضَادَّةِ الْخَيْرِ الَّذِي قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص فِي الْحَسَنِ وَ الْحُسَيْنِ بِأَنَّهُمَا سَيِّدَا شَبَابِ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ

He^{-asws} said: ‘And this Hadith is an impossibility as well because the people of Paradise, all of them would be youths, and there will not happen to be any elderly among them. And this Hadith has been placed by the clan of Umayya in order to oppose the Hadith which Rasool-Allah^{-saww} said regarding Al-Hassan^{-asws} and Al-Husayn^{-asws}, that they^{-asws} are two chiefs of the youths of people of Paradise’.

قال الشيخ قدس سره في تلخيص الشافعي: و أما الخبر الذي يتضمن أنهما سيديا كهول أهل الجنة، فمن تأمل أصل هذا الخبر بعين انصاف علم أنه موضوع في أيام بني أمية معارضة لما روى من قوله صلى الله عليه و آله في الحسن و الحسين: أنهما سيديا شباب أهل الجنة و أبوهما خير منهما.

Note: *The Sheykh said in ‘Talkhees Al Shafy’, ‘And as for the Hadith which comprises that these two (Abu Bakr and Umar) are two chiefs of the elderly people of Paradise’, so the one who contemplates on the origin of this Hadith with an eye of fairness would know that it was placed during the days of the clan of Umayya in contradiction to what is reported from his^{-saww} words, may the Salawaat of Allah^{-azwj} be upon him^{-saww}, regarding Al-Hassan^{-asws} and Al-Husayn^{-asws} that they^{-asws} are two chiefs of the youths of people of Paradise, and their^{-asws} father^{-asws} is better than them^{-asws}’.*

و هذا الخبر الذي ادعوه يروونه عن عبيد الله بن عمر، و حال عبيد الله في الانحراف عن أهل البيت معروفة، و هو أيضا كالجار الى نفسه.

And this Hadith, which is claiming it had been reported from Ubeydullah Bin Umar, and the state of Ubeydullah in turning away from People^{-asws} of the Household is well known and is as well like the one pulling to himself.

على أنه لا يخلو من أن يريد بقوله « سيديا كهول أهل الجنة » أنهما سيديا كهول من هو في الجنة، أو يراد أنهما سيديا من يدخل الجنة من كهول الدنيا.

(It is) based upon that it is not vacant from that it is intended by its words, ‘Two chiefs of the elderly people of Paradise’ – they are chiefs of elderly of the ones who are in the Paradise, or it is intended that they are two chiefs of the ones from the elderly of the world who would be entering the Paradise.

فان كان الأول فذلك باطل لان رسول الله قد وقفنا- و أجمعت الأمة- على أن جميع أهل الجنة جرد مرد، و أنه لا يدخلها كهول،

So if it were the first, that is false because Rasool-Allah^{-saww} has made us aware and the community is united upon that entirety of the people of Paradise would be hairless, tall, and an elderly would not enter it.

و ان كان الثاني- فذلك دافع و مناقض للحديث المجمع على روايته من قوله في الحسن و الحسين عليهما السلام «أنهما سيديا شباب أهل الجنة و أبوهما خير منهما».

And if it were the second, so that is a repellent and contradictory to the Hadith, the concurred upon its reporting from his^{-saww} words regarding Al-Hassan^{-asws} and Al-Husayn^{-asws}, may the greetings be upon them^{-asws}, that they^{-asws} are two chiefs of the youths of the people of Paradise and their^{-asws} father^{-asws} is better than them^{-asws}’.

لان هذا الخبر يقتضى أنهما سيديا كل من يدخل الجنة اذ كان لا يدخلها إلا شباب فأبو بكر و عمر و كل كهل في الدنيا داخلون في جملة من يكونان عليهما السلام سيديه

(This is) because this Hadith contradicts, they are two chiefs of every one who enters the Paradise when no one except the youths would be entering it. So Abu Bakr and Umar, and every elderly in the world are included in the totality that they^{-asws} would be their chiefs.

و الخبر الذي رواه يقتضى أن أبا بكر و عمر سيدهما من حيث كانا سيدي الكهول في الدنيا و هما عليهما السلام من جملة من كان كهلا في الدنيا.

And the Hadith, which is reported, contradicts, Abu Bakr and Umar are their^{-asws} chiefs from where they are two chiefs of the elderly in the word, and they^{-asws} are from the totality of the ones who are elderly in the world’.

فَقَالَ يَحْيَىٰ بْنُ أَكْثَمَ وَ رُوِيَ أَنَّ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ سِرَاجُ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ

Yahya Bin Aksan said, ‘And it is reported that Umar Bin Al-Khattab is a lantern of the people of Paradise’.

فَقَالَ ع وَ هَذَا أَيْضاً مُحَالٌ لِأَنَّ فِي الْجَنَّةِ مَلَائِكَةَ اللَّهِ الْمُقَرَّبِينَ وَ آدَمَ وَ مُحَمَّدَ [مُحَمَّدًا] وَ جَمِيعَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ وَ الْمُرْسَلِينَ لَا تُضِيءُ بِأَنْوَارِهِمْ حَتَّىٰ تُضِيءَ بِنُورِ عُمَرَ

He^{-asws} said: ‘And this as well is impossible, because in the Paradise there are Angels of Allah^{-azwj}, the ones of proximity, and Adam^{-as} and Muhammad^{-saww} and entirety of the Prophets and the Messengers^{-as}, can they not be illuminated except the by the Noor of Umar?’

بل الظاهر من قوله تعالى i\« مُتَّكِبِينَ فِيهَا عَلَى الْأَرَائِكِ لَا يَرَوْنَ فِيهَا شَمْسًا وَ لَا زَمْهَرِيرًا» E\ الدهر: 13 و قوله تعالى i\« هُمْ وَ أَزْوَاجُهُمْ فِي ظِلَالٍ عَلَى الْأَرَائِكِ مُتَّكِفُونَ» E\ يس: 57 أن الجنة ليس فيها ظلام حتى يحتاج الى السراج.

Note: But the apparent from the Words of the Exalted: **Reclining therein upon the couches, neither seeing (heat of a) sun therein nor intense cold [76:13], and Words of the Exalted: They and their wives would be in shades, reclining upon the couches [36:56].** The Paradise, there isn’t any darkness in it until one could be needy to the lantern.

فَقَالَ يَحْيَىٰ وَ قَدْ رُوِيَ أَنَّ السَّكِينَةَ تَنْطِقُ عَلَى لِسَانِ عُمَرَ

Yahya said, ‘And it has been reported that the tranquillity speaks upon the tongue of Umar’.

فَقَالَ ع لَسْتُ بِمُنْكَرٍ فَضَائِلِ عُمَرَ وَ لَكِنَّ أَبَا بَكْرٍ أَفْضَلُ مِنْ عُمَرَ فَقَالَ عَلَى رَأْسِ الْمِنْبَرِ إِنَّ لِي شَيْطَانًا يَعْتَرِينِي فَإِذَا مَلْتُ فَسَدِدُونِي -

He^{-asws} said: ‘I^{-asws} am not a denier of the merits of Umar, but Abu Bakr is superior to Umar. He had said on top of the pulpit, ‘There is a Satan^{-la} for me appearing to me. So whenever I deviate, then guide me!’

قد قال ذلك و شبهه غير مرة، فمن ذلك قوله « انى وليت عليكم و لست بخيركم فان رأيتموني على الحق فأعينوني، و ان رأيتموني على الباطل فسددوني»

Note: *He had said that and resembling it, more than once. From that are his words, ‘I am ruling upon you, and I am not the best of you. If you were to see me upon the truth, then assist me, and if you see me upon the falsehood, then guide me’.*

و قوله: «أما و الله ما أنا بخيركم و لقد كنت لمقامى هذا كارها، و لوددت أن فيكم من يكفينى، أفتظنون انى أعمل فيكم بسنة رسول الله؟ اذن لا أقوم بها، ان رسول الله كان يعصم بالوحى، و كان معه ملك، و ان لى شيطانا يعترينى، فإذا غضبت فاجتنبونى أن لا أؤثر فى اشعاركم و ابشاركم الا فراعونى فان استقمتم فأعينونى، و ان زغت فقومونى.

And his words, ‘But, by Allah^{-azwj}! I am not the best of you all, and I had been abhorrent to this position of mine, and I would have loved it if there was someone among you who could suffice me. Are you thinking that I shall be conducting among you all with the Sunnah of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}? Then I shall not be standing by it. Rasool-Allah^{-saww} was protected by the Revelation, and there was an Angel with him^{-saww}, and for me there is a Satan^{-la} appearing to me. Whenever I am angry, then stay away from me. If I don’t prefer regarding your poems and your news then look after me. If I am straight, then assist me, and if I am crooked, then straighten me’.

قال السيد حسين بحر العلوم فى هامش تلخيص الشافى ج 2 ص 9: و بهذه العبارات و شبهها تجد كتب القوم منها ملاءى. راجع مسند أحمد ج 1 ص 14 و الرياض النضرة ج 1 ص 170 و كنز العمال ج 3 ص 126 و طبقات ابن سعد ج 3 ص 139 و الإمامة و السياسة ج 1 ص 16 و تاريخ الطبري ج 3 ص 210 و سيرة ابن هشام ج 4 ص 340

The Seyyid Husayn Bahr Al Uloom said in the notes of ‘Talkhees Al Shafy’ V 2 P 9, ‘And with these expressions and its resembling, you will find books of the people filled with it. Refer to ‘Musnad’ of Ahmad V 1 P 14, and ‘Al Riyaz Al Nazara’ V 1 P 170, and ‘Kanz Al Ammal’ V 3 P 126, and ‘Tabaqaat Ibn Sa’ad’ V 3 P 139, and ‘Al Imamah Wa Al Siyasa’ V 1 P 16, and ‘Tareekh’ of Al Tabari V 3 P 210, and ‘Seerah’ of Ibn Hisham V 4 P 340.

(اقول و فى الطبعة الأخيرة منها ج 2 ص 661) و عيون الأخبار ج 2 ص 234 و العقد الفريد ج 2 ص 158 و تاريخ الخلفاء للسيوطى ص 47 و السيرة الحلبية ج 3 ص 388 و شرح ابن أبي الحديد ج 1 ص 134 و تهذيب الكمال ج 1 ص 6 و المجتنى لابن دريد ص 27 و غيرها كثير من كتب القوم.

I (Majlisi) am saying, 'And in 'Al Tab'at Al Akheera', from it V 2 P 661, and 'Uyoon Al Akhbar' V 2 P 234, and 'Al Iqd' of Al Fareed V 2 P 158, and 'Tareekh Al Khulafa' of Al Suyuti P 47, and 'Al Seerah Al Hakabiya' V 3 P 388, and 'Sharah' of Ibn Al Hadeed V 1 P 134, and 'Tahzeeb Al Kamaal V 1 P 6, and 'Al Majtana' of Ibn Dareyd P 27, and other such, a lot from the books of the people.

فَقَالَ يَحْيَىٰ قَدْ رُوِيَ أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ لَوْ لَمْ أُبْعَثْ لَبُعِثَ عُمَرُ

Yahya said, 'It is being reported that the Prophet^{-sawww} said; 'If I^{-sawww} had not been Sent, Umar would have been Sent (as Prophet^{-as})'.

فَقَالَ ع كِتَابُ اللَّهِ أَصْدَقُ مِنْ هَذَا الْحَدِيثِ يَقُولُ اللَّهُ فِي كِتَابِهِ وَ إِذْ أَخَذْنَا مِنَ النَّبِيِّينَ مِيثَاقَهُمْ وَ مِنْكَ وَ مِنْ نُوحٍ فَقَدْ أَخَذَ اللَّهُ مِيثَاقَ النَّبِيِّينَ فَكَيْفَ يُمَكِّنُ أَنْ يُبَدِّلَ مِيثَاقَهُ وَ كَانَ الْأَنْبِيَاءُ ع لَمْ يُشْرِكُوا طَرْفَةَ عَيْنٍ

He^{-asws} said: 'The Book of Allah^{-azwj} is more truthful than this Hadith. Allah^{-azwj} is Saying in His^{-azwj} Book: **And when We Took from the Prophets, their Covenants, and from you, and from Noah [33:7]**. Allah^{-azwj} had Taken the Covenant of the Prophets^{-as}, so how is it possible that He^{-azwj} would Replace His^{-azwj} Covenant, and the Prophets^{-as} did not commit Shirk even for the blink of an eye?

فَكَيْفَ يُبْعَثُ بِالنَّبُوءَةِ مَنْ أَشْرَكَ وَ كَانَ أَكْثَرَ أَيَّامِهِ مَعَ الشِّرْكِ بِاللَّهِ وَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَ آدَمُ بَيْنَ الرُّوحِ وَ الْجَسَدِ

How can He^{-azwj} Send with the Prophet-hood someone who had committed Shirk, and most of his days were with the Shirk with Allah^{-azwj}? And Rasool-Allah^{-sawww} was a Prophet^{-sawww} while Adam^{-as} was between the spirit and the body!'

فَقَالَ يَحْيَىٰ بِنُ أَكْتَمَ وَ قَدْ رُوِيَ أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ مَا احْتَبَسَ الوَحْيُ عَنِّي قَطُّ إِلَّا طَنَنَتْهُ قَدْ نَزَلَ عَلَى آلِ الْخَطَّابِ

Yahya Bin Aksam said, 'And it is being reported that the Prophet^{-sawww} said: 'The Revelation was not Withheld from me^{-sawww} at all except I^{-sawww} thought it had been Revealed upon the family of Al-Khattab'.

فَقَالَ ع وَ هَذَا مُحَالٌ أَيْضاً لِأَنَّهُ لَا يُجُوزُ أَنْ يَشُكَّ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي نُبُوَّتِهِ قَالَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى اللَّهُ يَصْطَفِي مِنَ الْمَلَائِكَةِ رُسُلًا وَ مِنَ النَّاسِ فَكَيْفَ يُمَكِّنُ أَنْ تُنْتَقَلَ النُّبُوءَةُ بِمَنْ اصْطَفَاهُ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى إِلَى مَنْ أَشْرَكَ بِهِ

He^{-asws} said: 'And this is impossible because it is not allowed that the Prophet^{-sawww} would doubt regarding his^{-sawww} own Prophet-hood. Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted Said: **Allah Chooses messengers from among the Angels and from the people; surely Allah is Hearing, Seeing [22:75]**. How is it possible that the Prophet-hood would be transferred from the one Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted had Chosen to the one who was committing Shirk with Him^{-azwj}?'

قَالَ يَحْيَىٰ بِنُ أَكْتَمَ رُوِيَ أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ لَوْ نَزَلَ الْعَذَابُ لَمَا نَجَا مِنْهُ إِلَّا عُمَرُ

Yahya Bin Aksam said, ‘It is reported that the Prophet^{-saww} said: ‘If the Punishment were to descend, no one would be saved from it except Umar’.

فَقَالَ ع وَ هَذَا مُحَالٌ أَيْضاً إِنَّ اللَّهَ تَعَالَى يَقُولُ وَ مَا كَانَ اللَّهُ لِيُعَذِّبَهُمْ وَ أَنْتَ فِيهِمْ وَ مَا كَانَ اللَّهُ مُعَذِّبَهُمْ وَ هُمْ يَسْتَغْفِرُونَ فَأَخْبَرَ
سُبْحَانَهُ أَنْ لَا يُعَذِّبَ أَحَدًا مَا دَامَ فِيهِمْ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص وَ مَا دَامُوا يَسْتَغْفِرُونَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى.

He^{-asws} said: ‘This is impossible as well. Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted is Saying: **And Allah was not going to Punish them while you were among them, nor would Allah Punish them while they are seeking Forgiveness [8:33]**. The Glorious has Informed that He^{-azwj} will not Punish anyone for as long as Rasool-Allah^{-saww} is among them, and for as long as they (people) are seeking Forgiveness of Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted’.¹²

‘Tafseer Bil Ra'yi’ (Interpretation by Opinion) is Absolutely Forbidden:

There is no leeway for people to interpret the Holy Verses as per their opinion (*Tafseer Bil Ra'yi*):

محمد بن علي بن بابويه، قال: حدثنا محمد بن موسى بن المتوكل، قال: حدثنا علي بن إبراهيم ابن هاشم، عن أبيه، عن الريان بن الصلت، عن علي بن موسى الرضا، عن أبيه، عن آباءه، عن أمير المؤمنين (عليهم السلام): «قال الله جل جلاله: ما آمن بي من فسر برأيه كلامي، و ما عرفني من شبهني بخلق، و ما على ديني من استعمل القياس في ديني».

Muhammad Bin Ali Bin Babuwayh said, ‘It was narrated to us by Muhammad Bin Musa Bin Al Mutawakkal, from Ali Bin Ibrahim Ibn Hashim, from his father, from Al Rayan Bin Al Salt,

(It has been narrated) from Ali^{-asws} Bin Musa Al-Reza^{-asws}, from his^{-asws} forefathers^{-asws}, from Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} having said: ‘Allah^{-azwj}, Majestic is His^{-azwj} Majesty Said: “He has not believed in Me^{-azwj}, the one who interprets My^{-azwj} Speech by his opinion, and he has not recognised Me^{-azwj} the one who resembles Me^{-azwj} with My^{-azwj} creatures, and he is not upon My^{-azwj} Religion, the one who utilises the analogy in My^{-azwj} Religion”’.¹³

There are a large number of Holy Verses, where the apparent meanings derived from Arabic text are completely different when looking up the Tafseer of these Verses from Ahadith, these verses are identified in **‘Tafseer Hub-e-Ali (asws) | (hubeali.com)’**

In particular, one may look at the Holy Verses regarding the ‘Isma’ (Infallibility) of Prophets^{-as}, where the opposite of the superficial meanings of these Verses must be taken - otherwise one would believe that the Prophets^{-as} had erred in the world (Nouzobillah). See for example:

لِيُعْفِرَ لَكَ اللَّهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ذَنْبِكَ وَمَا تَأَخَّرَ وَيُثَبِّتْ نِعْمَتَهُ عَلَيْكَ وَيَهْدِيكَ صِرَاطًا مُسْتَقِيمًا {48:2}

¹² Bihar Al Anwaar – V 50, The book of History – Muhammad Bin Ali^{-asws}, Ch 4 H 6

¹³ عيون أخبار الرضا (عليه السلام) 4/116:1

For Allah to Forgive you what has preceded from your sins and what is delayed, and Complete His Favour upon you and Guide you on a Straight Path [48:2]

فَأَكَلَا مِنْهَا فَبَدَتَ لهُمَا سَوْآتُهُمَا وَطَفِقَا يَخْصِفَانِ عَلَيْهِمَا مِنْ وَرَقِ الْجَنَّةِ ۗ وَعَصَىٰ آدَمُ رَبَّهُ فَغَوَىٰ {121}

....Thus did Adam disobey his Lord, and allow himself to be seduced (20:121)

وَدَا النُّونَ إِذْ ذَهَبَ مُغَاضِبًا فَظَنَّ أَنْ لَنْ نَقْدِرَ عَلَيْهِ فَنَادَىٰ فِي الظُّلُمَاتِ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا أَنْتَ سُبْحَانَكَ إِنِّي كُنْتُ مِنَ الظَّالِمِينَ {21:87}

And remember Thun-nun (Yunus-Jonah), when he departed in wrath: He imagined that We had no power over him! (21:87)

وَلَقَدْ هَمَّتْ بِهِ ۖ وَهَمَّ بِهَا لَوْلَا أَنْ رَأَىٰ بُرْهَانَ رَبِّهِ ۚ كَذَلِكَ لِنَصْرِفَ عَنْهُ السُّوءَ وَالْفَحْشَاءَ ۗ إِنَّهُ مِنْ عِبَادِنَا الْمُخْلَصِينَ {12:24}

And (with passion) did she desire him, and he would have desired her (12:24)

All Prophets^{as} are Infallible (Masoom), hence the real meanings of the above Holy Verses are opposite to their apparent meanings, for further explanation, see Ahadith in *Appendix I*.

Finally, we present a Hadith here, which very well summarises all the above:

Why leave the ‘Grand River’ and drink from (muddy) puddles?

قَالَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع مَصُوعُونَ التَّمَادِ وَ يَدْعُونَ النَّهْرَ الْأَعْظَمَ فَسُئِلَ عَنْ مَعْنَى ذَلِكَ فَقَالَ عَلِمَ النَّبِيِّينَ بِأَسْرِهِ أُوحِيَ اللَّهُ إِلَى مُحَمَّدٍ ص فَجَعَلَ مُحَمَّدٌ ص ذَلِكَ كُؤْلَهُ عِنْدَ عَلِيٍّ ع.

Abu Abdullah^{asws} said: ‘They are licking (from) the (muddy) puddle and are leaving out the grand river!’ He^{asws} was asked about the meaning of that. He^{asws} said: ‘Knowledge of the Prophets^{as} with its secrets. Allah^{azwj} have Revealed it to Muhammad^{saww}, and Muhammad^{saww} made all of that to be with Ali^{asws}’¹⁴.

Also in another Hadith:

وَقَالَ ع تَمَّصُونَ الرِّوَاضِ وَ تَدْعُونَ النَّهْرَ الْعَظِيمَ فَيَقِيلُ مَا تَعْنِي بِذَلِكَ

(And he^{asws} said: ‘You are licking from the (muddy) puddle and are leaving the mighty river!’ It was said, ‘What do you^{asws} mean by that?’

قَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ تَعَالَى أَوْحَىٰ إِلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص عَلِمَ النَّبِيِّينَ بِأَسْرِهِ وَ عَلَّمَهُ اللَّهُ مَا لَمْ يُعَلِّمُهُمْ فَاسَّرَ ذَلِكَ كُؤْلَهُ إِلَى أَمِيرِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ع قُلْتُ فَيَكُونُ عَلِيٌّ ع أَعْلَمَ مِنْ بَعْضِ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ

¹⁴ Bihar Al-Awaar – V 40, The book of History – Amir Al-Momineen^{asws}, Ch 93 H 54 / 22

He^{-asws} said: ‘Allah^{-azwj} Revealed to Rasool-Allah^{-saww} Taught the Prophets^{-as} His^{-azwj} Secrets and Allah^{-azwj} Taught him^{-saww} what they^{-as} did not know. He^{-saww} divulged that, all of it to Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws}. I said, ‘So Ali^{-asws} happened to be more knowledgeable than some of the Prophets^{-as}’.

فَقَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ يَفْتَحُ مَسَامِعَ مَنْ يَشَاءُ أَقُولُ إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ ص حَوَى عِلْمَ جَمِيعِ النَّبِيِّينَ وَ عَلَّمَهُ [اللَّهُ] مَا لَمْ يُعَلِّمَهُمْ وَ إِنَّهُ جَعَلَ ذَلِكَ كُلَّهُ عِنْدَ عَلِيِّ ع فَتَقُولُ عَلِيُّ عَلَّمَ مِنْ بَعْضِ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ

Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic Opens the hearing of the ones He^{-azwj} so Desires to. I^{-asws} am saying that Rasool-Allah^{-saww} contained the knowledge of entirety of the Prophets^{-as} and Allah^{-azwj} Taught him^{-saww} what they did not know, and he^{-saww} made all of that to be with Ali^{-asws}, and you are saying Ali^{-asws} is more knowledgeable than some of the Prophets^{-as}?’

ثُمَّ تَلَا قَوْلَهُ تَعَالَى قَالَ الَّذِي عِنْدَهُ عِلْمٌ مِنَ الْكِتَابِ ثُمَّ فَرَّقَ أَصَابِعَهُ وَ وَضَعَهَا عَلَى صَدْرِهِ ثُمَّ قَالَ وَ عِنْدَنَا وَ اللَّهُ عِلْمُ الْكِتَابِ كُلُّهُ.

Then he^{-asws} recited Words of the Exalted: ***The one with whom was the knowledge from the Book [27:40]***, then separated between his^{-asws} fingers and placed them upon his^{-asws} chest, then said: ‘By Allah^{-azwj}, and with us^{-asws} is knowledge of the Book, all of it!’¹⁵

Imam^{-asws} Rebukes those who do not follow Sunnah (Ahadith):

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ خَالِدٍ عَنْ إِسْمَاعِيلَ بْنِ مِهْرَانَ عَنْ أَبِي سَعِيدٍ الْقَمَّاطِ وَ صَالِحِ بْنِ سَعِيدٍ عَنْ أَبَانَ بْنِ تَغْلِبَ عَنْ أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام) أَنَّهُ سُئِلَ عَنْ مَسْأَلَةٍ فَأَجَابَ فِيهَا قَالَ فَقَالَ الرَّجُلُ إِنَّ الْفُقَهَاءَ لَا يَقُولُونَ هَذَا فَقَالَ يَا وَيْحَكَ وَ هَلْ رَأَيْتَ فِيهَا قَطُّ إِنَّ الْفُقَيْهَةَ حَقَّ الْفُقَيْهِ الرَّاهِدُ فِي الدُّنْيَا الرَّاغِبُ فِي الْآخِرَةِ الْمُتَمَسِّكُ بِسُنَّةِ النَّبِيِّ (صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ) .

A number of our companions, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad Bin Khalid, from Ismail Bin Mihran, from Abu Saeed Al Qammat and Salih Bin Saeed, from Aban Bin Taghlab,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Ja’far^{-asws}, said, ‘He^{-asws} was asked a question, and he^{-asws} answered with regards to it.

So, the man said, ‘The jurists are not saying this!’ So he^{-asws} said: ‘O woe be unto you! And have you ever seen a jurist at all?’ A jurist who is rightfully a jurist is the one ascetic in the world, the desirous regarding the Hereafter, the one attached with the Sunnah (Ahadith) of the Prophet^{-saww}.¹⁶

What to do when a Hadith opposes a Hadith?

- وَ هَذَا الْإِسْنَادِ عَنِ الرَّبِيِّ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ قَالَ: فُلْتُ لِلرِّضَا ع كَيْفَ نَصْنَعُ بِالْخَيْرَيْنِ الْمُخْتَلَفَيْنِ

And by this chain from Al Barqy, form his father, from Muhammad Bin Abdullah who said,

¹⁵ Bihar Al Anwaar – V 40, The book of History – Amir Al Momineen^{-asws}, Ch 95 H 12

¹⁶ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Intellect and Ignorance CH 21 H 8

'I said to Al-Reza^{-asws}, 'What should we do with the two differing Ahadith?'

فَقَالَ إِذَا وَرَدَ عَلَيْكُمْ حَدِيثَانِ مُخْتَلِفَانِ فَأَنْظِرُوا مَا يُخَالِفُ مِنْهُمَا الْعَامَّةَ فَخُذُوهُ وَانظُرُوا مَا يُوَافِقُ أَحْبَابَهُمْ فَدَعُوهُ

He^{-asws} said: 'When two differing Hadith come to you, then look at what the general Muslims are opposing, so take it, and look at what is compatible with their Ahadith, so leave it'.¹⁷

وَعَنْهُ بِإِسْنَادِهِ عَنِ الصَّدُوقِ عَنِ ابْنِ الْمُتَوَكَّلِ عَنِ السَّعْدِآبَادِيِّ عَنِ الرَّهْزِيِّ عَنِ ابْنِ فَضَّالٍ عَنِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ جَهْمٍ قَالَ: قُلْتُ لِلْعَبْدِ الصَّالِحِ ع هَلْ يَسْعُنَا فِيمَا يَرِدُ عَلَيْنَا مِنْكُمْ إِلَّا التَّسْلِيمُ لَكُمْ

And from him, by his chain from Al Sadouq, from Ibn Al Mutawakkal, from Al Sa'ad Abady, from Ibn Fazal, from Al Hassan Bin Jahm who said,

'I said to Al-Abd Al-Salih^{-asws} (7th Imam^{-asws}), 'Is there any leeway for us, regarding what comes to us from you^{-asws}, except for the submission to it?'

فَقَالَ ع لَا وَ اللَّهُ لَا يَسْفَعُكُمْ إِلَّا التَّسْلِيمُ لَنَا

He^{-asws} said: 'No, by Allah^{-azwj}! There is no leeway for you except for the submission to us^{-asws}'.

قُلْتُ فَيُرْوَى عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع شَيْءٌ وَ يُرْوَى عَنْهُ جِلَافُهُ فَبِأَيِّهِمَا نَأْخُذُ

I said, 'But if something is being reported from Abu Abdullah^{-asws}, and its opposite is being reported from you^{-asws}, which of the two should we take?'

قَالَ خُذْ بِمَا خَالَفَ الْقَوْمَ وَ مَا وَافَقَ الْقَوْمَ فَاجْتَنِبْهُ

He^{-asws} said: 'Take with whatever the (general) people oppose, and whatever the people do concur with, shun it'.¹⁸

- وَ بِحَدَاثِ الْإِسْنَادِ عَنِ الرَّهْزِيِّ عَنِ أَبِيهِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ قَالَ: قُلْتُ لِلرِّضَا ع كَيْفَ تَصْنَعُ بِالْمُخْتَلَفَيْنِ

And by this chain from Al Barqy, form his father, from Muhammad Bin Abdullah who said,

'I said to Al-Reza^{-asws}, 'What should we do with the two differing Ahadith?'

فَقَالَ إِذَا وَرَدَ عَلَيْكُمْ حَدِيثَانِ مُخْتَلِفَانِ فَأَنْظِرُوا مَا يُخَالِفُ مِنْهُمَا الْعَامَّةَ فَخُذُوهُ وَ انظُرُوا مَا يُوَافِقُ أَحْبَابَهُمْ فَدَعُوهُ

He^{-asws} said: 'When two differing Hadith come to you, then look at what the general Muslims are opposing, so take it, and look at what is compatible with their Ahadith, so leave it'.¹⁹

¹⁷ Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 29 H 19

¹⁸ Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 29 H 18

¹⁹ Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 29 H 19

وَبِإِسْنَادِهِ عَنِ الصَّدُوقِ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ سَعْدِ بْنِ أَبِي نُوحٍ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ: إِذَا وَرَدَ عَلَيْكُمْ حَدِيثَانِ مُخْتَلِفَانِ فَأَعْرِضُوهُمَا عَلَى كِتَابِ اللَّهِ فَمَا وَافَقَ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ فَخُذُوهُ وَمَا خَالَفَ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ فَذَرُوهُ فَإِنْ لَمْ تَجِدُوهُمَا فِي كِتَابِ اللَّهِ فَأَعْرِضُوهُمَا عَلَى أَجْبَارِ الْعَامَّةِ فَمَا وَافَقَ أَجْبَارَهُمْ فَذَرُوهُ وَمَا خَالَفَ أَجْبَارَهُمْ فَخُذُوهُ

And by this chain from Al Sadouq, from his father, from Sa’ad, from Ayoub Bin Nuh, from Ibn Abu Umeyr,

‘From Abdul Rahman, son of Abu Abdullah^{-asws}, from Abu Abdullah^{-asws}, having said: ‘When two differing Hadeeth are referred to you, then present these upon the Book of Allah^{-azwj}. So, whatever is in accordance with the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, take it, and whatever opposes the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, leave it. But, if you do not find these two in the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, then present these upon the Hadeeth of the general Muslims, and whatever is in accordance with their Hadeeth, leave it, and whatever opposes their Hadeeth, take it’^{.20}

Why does one need Ahadith to interpret the Holy Quran?

و عن عبدالرحمن بن الحجاج، قال: سمعت أبا عبدالله (عليه السلام) يقول: «ما أبعد عقول الرجال من تفسير القرآن».

And from Abdul Rahman Bin Al Hajjaj who said,

‘I heard Abu Abdullah^{-asws} saying: ‘There is nothing more remote from the intellects of the men than the interpretation (Tafseer) of the Quran?’^{.21}

و عن جابر قال: قال أبو عبدالله (عليه السلام): «يا جابر، إن للقرآن بطناً، و للبطن ظهراً». ثم قال: «يا جابر، و ليس شيء أبعد من عقول الرجال منه، إن الآية لينزل أولها في شيء، و أوسطها في شيء، و آخرها في شيء، و هو كلام متصل يتصرف على وجوه».

And from Jabir, who said,

‘Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said: ‘O Jabir! The Quran has an interior, and for the interior there is an exterior’. Then said, ‘O Jabir! And there isn’t anything more remote from the intellects of the men than it. The Verse, its beginning has been Revealed regarding something, and its middle is regarding something, and its ending is regarding something, and it is a Speech which is continuously changing upon its perspectives’^{.22}

Don’t take from Hypocrites pointed out by Masomeen^{-asws}:

There were habitual liars and hypocrites who held animosity against Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws} and frequently fabricated Ahadith, about them we find in Ahadith which tell us not to take Ahadith from them or are cursed by the Mamomeen^{-asws}, e.g., Ibn Hilal who was cursed by

²⁰ Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 29 H 20

²¹ تفسير العياشي 1: 17 / 5.

²² تفسير العياشي 1: 11 / 2، المحاسن: 5 / 300.

the 11th Imam-asws for interfering in the religion, i.e., fabricating Ahadith, see the Hadith below.

وَقَالَ ع وَ قَدْ سِيلَ عَنْ أَحَادِيثِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص مِنْ رِوَايَةِ الشَّعْبِيِّ عَنْ زِيَارِ بْنِ زَمْرَةَ وَ عَبْدِ خَيْرٍ قَالَا قِيلَ لَهُ مَا سَبَبُ اخْتِلَافِ النَّاسِ فِي الْحَدِيثِ

And he^{-asws} said, and he^{-asws} had been asked about Ahadith of Rasool-Allah^{-saww} – from a report by Al-Shaby, from Zirar Bin Zamrah, and Abd Khayr who both said, ‘It was said to him^{-asws}, ‘What is the cause of differing of the people in the Hadith?’

فَقَالَ النَّاسُ أَرْبَعَةٌ مُنَافِقٌ مُظْهِرٌ لِلْإِسْلَامِ وَ قَلْبُهُ يَأْبَى الْإِيمَانَ- لَا يَتَحَرَّجُ عَنِ الْكُذِبِ كَذَبَ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص مُتَعَدِّدًا فَلَوْ عَلِمَ النَّاسُ حَالَهُ مَا أَخَذُوا عَنْهُ وَ لَكِنَّهُمْ قَالُوا صَاحِبُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص فَأَخَذُوا بِقَوْلِهِ

He^{-asws} (Amr Al-Momineen^{-asws}) said: ‘The people are four – a hypocrite manifesting Al-Islam while his heart refuses the Eman. He has no problems with the lying. He lies upon Rasool-Allah^{-saww} deliberately. Had the people known his state, they would not be taking from him (the Ahadith), but they said, ‘A companion of Rasool-Allah^{-azwj}’, so they took his words.

وَ قَدْ أَخْبَرَ اللَّهُ عَنِ الْمُنَافِقِينَ بِمَا أَخْبَرَ وَ وَصَفَهُمْ بِمَا وَصَفَ ثُمَّ إِنَّهُمْ عَاشُوا بَعْدَهُ فَتَقَرَّبُوا إِلَى أَيْمَةِ الضَّلَالِ وَ الدُّعَاةِ إِلَى النَّارِ بِالزُّورِ وَ الْبُهْتَانِ فَوَلَّوهُمْ الْأَعْمَالَ وَ جَعَلُوهُمْ عَلَى رِقَابِ النَّاسِ فَأَكَلُوا دُنْيَاهُمْ الدُّنْيَا وَ إِنَّمَا هُمْ تَبَعٌ لِلْمُلُوكِ إِلَّا مَنْ عَصَمَهُ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى

And Allah^{-azwj} has Informed about the hypocrites with what He^{-azwj} Informed, and Described them with what He^{-azwj} Described. They lived after him and they drew closer to the straying leaders and the callers to the Fire with the falsehood and the slanders. So they made them in charge of the offices and made them upon necks of the people. So they ate the world with them, and rather they are followers of the kings except the one whom Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted Protects.

وَ رَجُلٌ سَمِعَ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ ص يَقُولُ قَوْلًا أَوْ رَأَاهُ يَعْمَلُ عَمَلًا ثُمَّ غَابَ عَنْهُ وَ نُسِخَ ذَلِكَ الْقَوْلُ وَ الْفِعْلُ وَ لَمْ يَعْلَمْ فَلَوْ عَلِمَ أَنَّهُ نُسِخَ مَا حَدَّثَ بِهِ وَ لَوْ عَلِمَ النَّاسُ أَيْضًا أَنَّهُ نُسِخَ لَمَا نَقَلُوهُ عَنْهُ

And a man heard Rasool-Allah^{-saww} saying a word, or saw him^{-saww} doing a deed, then he was absent from him^{-saww}, and that word and deed were abrogated, and he did not know that what he is narrated with had been abrogated, and had the people known as well it is abrogated, they would not have transmitted (Ahadith) from him.

وَ رَجُلٌ سَمِعَ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ ص يَقُولُ قَوْلًا فَوَجِمَ فِيهِ وَ لَوْ عَلِمَ أَنَّهُ وَجِمَ فِيهِ لَمَا حَدَّثَ عَنْهُ وَ- لَا عَمِلَ بِهِ

And a man heard Rasool-Allah^{-saww} saying a word, so he had delusion in it, and had the people known he had delusion in it, they would not have narrated from him nor worked with it.

وَ رَجُلٌ لَمْ يَكْذِبْ وَ لَمْ يَغِبْ حَدَّثَ بِمَا سَمِعَ وَ عَمِلَ بِهِ

And a man who did not lie but was not absent. He narrated with what he heard and acted with it.

فَأَمَّا الْأَوَّلُ فَلَا اِعْتِبَارَ بِرِوَايَتِهِ وَ لَا يَحِلُّ الْأَخْذُ عَنْهُ وَ أَمَّا الْبَاقُونَ فَيَنْزِعُونَ إِلَى غَايَةٍ وَ يَرْجِعُونَ إِلَى غَايَةٍ وَ يُسَمِّوْنَ مِنْ قَلْبِهِ وَاحِدٍ وَ كَلَامُهُمْ أَشْرَقَ بُنُورِ النَّبُوَّةِ ضِيَاؤُهُ وَ مِنَ الشَّجَرَةِ الْمُبَارَكَةِ اِقْتَبَسَتْ نَارُهُ.

As for the first (hypocrites who deliberately lied), there is not reliance with his report nor is it permissible to take from him (Hadith), and as for the rest, they are conflicting to an end and are returning to an end, and (as for the later ones) they are drawing water from one well, and their speech is shining with Noor of the Prophet-hood of its illumination, and from a Blessed tree they are fetching its fire”.²³

An example of the deliberately lying ones:

بإسناده عن ابن عمارة، عن أبيه، قال: سمعت جعفر بن محمد عليهما السلام يقول: ثلاثة كانوا يكذبون على رسول الله صلى الله عليه و آله: أبو هريرة و أنس بن مالك، و امرأة.

(The book) ‘Al-Khisal’ – By his chain from Ibn Amarah, from his father who said, ‘I heard Ja’far^{-asws} Bin Muhammad^{-asws} saying: ‘Three have lied upon Rasool-Allah^{-saww} – Abu Hureyra, and Anas Bin Malik, and a woman (-----)’.²⁴

الطالقاني، عن الجلودي، عن محمد بن زكريا، عن جعفر بن محمد بن عمارة قال: سمعت جعفر بن محمد عليهما السلام يقول: ثلاثة كانوا يكذبون على رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله أبو هريرة، وأنس بن مالك، وامرأة.

Al Talaqany, from Al Jaloudy, from Muhammad Bin Zakariya, from Ja’far Bin Muhammad Bin Amarat who said,

‘I heard Ja’far^{-asws} Bin Muhammad^{-asws} saying: ‘Three have been lying upon Rasool-Allah^{-saww} – Abu Hureira, and Anas Bin Malik, and a woman (-----)’.²⁵

11th Imam^{-asws} cursed Ibn Hilal for interfering in (Ahadith):

علي بن محمد بن قتيبة، عن أحمد بن إبراهيم المراغي قال: ورد على القاسم بن العلاء نسخة ما كان خرج من لعن ابن هلال، وكان ابتداء ذلك أن كتب عليه السلام إلى قومه بالعراق: احذروا الصوفي المتصنع. قال: وكان من شأن أحمد بن هلال أنه قد كان حج أربعاً وخمسين حجة عشرون منها على قدميه، قال: وكان رواية أصحابنا بالعراق لقوه وكتبوا منه. فأنكروا ما ورد في مذمته، فحملوا القاسم بن العلاء على أن يراجع في أمره. فخرج إليه: " قد كان أمرنا نفذ إليك في المتصنع ابن هلال لارحمه الله بما قد علمت لم يزل لا يغفر الله له ذنبه، ولا أقاله عثرته، دخل في أمرنا بلا إذن منا ولا رضى يستبد برأيه فيتحامى من ديوننا، لا يمضي من أمرنا إياه إلا بما يهواه ويريد أرواه الله في نار جهنم، فصرنا عليه حتى يترا الله عمره بدعوتنا. وكنا قد عرفنا خبره قوما من موالينا في أيامه لارحمه الله، أمرنا هم بالقاه ذلك إلى الخلف من موالينا، ونحن نبرء إلى الله من ابن هلال لارحمه الله، ومن لا يبرء منه. وأعلم الاسحاق سلمه الله وأهل بيته مما أعلمناك من حال أمر هذا الفاجر وجميع من كان سألك ويسألك عنه، من أهل بلده، والخارجين، ومن كان يستحق أن يطلع على ذلك، فانه لا عذر لاحد من موالينا في التشكيك فيما يؤدبهنا ثقاتنا، قد عرفوا بأننا نفاوضهم سرنا، ونحمله إياه إليهم، وعرفنا ما يكون من ذلك إنشاء الله ". قال: وقال أبو حامد: ثبت قوم على إنكار ما خرج فيه، فعاودوه فيه، فخرج " لا شكر الله قدره لم يدع المرزئة بأن لا يزيغ قلبه

²³ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 75 - The book ‘Al Rawza’ - Ch 16 b H 49, also in Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Intellect and Ignorance CH 20 H 1

²⁴ Bihar Al Anwaar – V 31, The book of Fitna (Strife) And Ordeals, Completion 155

²⁵ Bihar Al Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 28 H 11

بعد أن هداه، وأن يجعل ما من به عليه مستقرا، ولا يجعله مستودعا، وقد علمتم ما كان من أمر الدهقان عليه لعنة الله وخدمته وطول صحبته، فأبدله الله بالإيمان كفرا حين فعل ما فعل، فعاجله الله بالنقمة ولم يمهل²⁶

Ali bin Mohammed bin Qutaiba narrates from Ahmad bin Ibrahim Al-Maraghy says:

A letter from (Imam) Abu Mohammed Hassan Askari^{-asws} came for Qasim bin Alla (a representative of the Imam^{-asws}) in which ‘لعن’ (curse) on Ibn Hilal was written. The letter was addressed to (all of) the representatives of Imam^{-asws} in Iraq and (Imam^{-asws}) warned them to be aware of the disgusting and astray one (ibn Hilal), calling him the (savaged) ‘Sufi/innovator’

It is narrated that Ahmed bin Hilal a was famous one (among Shias) and had performed 54 Hajj and 20 out of those were on foot and was considered a an important and trustworthy religious personality within the hadith narrators of Iraq who would meet with him and take Ahadith. So they came to know the above Hadith about him and were astonished with the news (did not believe these instructions were really from the Imam^{-asws}) and they pressurised Qasim ibn Alla to consult Imam^{-asws} again and reconfirm if the content of the letter was true.

Imam^{-asws} wrote back after being asked from them: You have already been informed about the corrupt Ahmed bin Hilal, may Allah will not has Mercy on him, Punish him and may never forgive him, as he interferes into our^{-asws} affairs without our permission, he says out of his own desires and judgements (gives religious verdicts) and will surely be thrown into the Fire of Hell. We have remained patient for some time until our^{-asws} prayers against him to Allah^{-azwj} cut his life short.

And May Allah^{-azwj} will not have Mercy on him, I^{-asws} had told to a group of our^{-asws} shias during his lifetime and had instructed them to share this news with our other devout shias. And we^{-asws} ask Allah to send Laan on Ibn Hilal (and also on that) who doesn't send Laan on him.

What I have told to you about that ‘fajir’ (enemy of Allah), inform about him to Ishaqi and his family and also to all those who enquire about ibn Hilal either from the resident of the city or the outsiders as well as to those who you find worthy (shias) of being told.

In addition, our followers should not doubt about those instructions from us^{-asws} which are released from our^{-asws} trustworthy representatives.

Abu Hamed says, even after this letter a group among shias kept on denying the contents of Imam^{-asws}'s letter and they themselves contacted Imam^{-asws} (about the rejection of Ibn Hilal).

Imam^{-asws} replied: The one, who after being shown the righteous path, was protected from being gone astray should thank Allah^{-azwj} all the time, Who Gives the ‘Namah’ (Eman) not for temporarily but permanently. You people know about Dahiqan (may Allah^{-azwj} Curse him), where did he end-up after a long time of serving and being benefiting from closeness (a companion of the Imam^{-asws}) due to his insistence on evil, Allah^{-azwj} replace his Eman with Kufr, and cut short his life and expedited Wrath on him.²⁷

²⁶ Rijal Kashi, Page-535. Bihar Vol-50,Page-318, Mustadrak ul Wasail Vol-12,Page-318

²⁷ Rijal Kashi, Page-535. Bihar Vol-50,Page-318, Mustadrak ul Wasail Vol-12,Page-318

APPENDIX I: Infallibility of Prophets^{-as}

All Prophets^{-as} and their^{-as} successors^{-as} are infallible (Masoom), including the last Prophet Mohammed^{-saww} and his^{-saww} successors^{-asws}. However, some Muslims who superficially read and interpret Holy Quran raise some questions on the infallibilities of the Prophets^{-as}. A centuries old topic, which was discussed in the court of Al-Ma'mum Al-Rashid (an Abbasi Caliph) when he invited some Muslim scholars to question Imam Ali^{-asws} ibn Musa Al-Reza^{-asws} regarding the infallibility of Prophet^{-as}. Prior to presenting the debate we start with a Holy Verse and some Ahadith in its explanation, the Holy Verse is frequently quoted by some Muslims in opposition to the infallibility of the Prophet Mohammed^{-saww}.

لِيُغْفِرَ لَكَ اللَّهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ذَنْبِكَ وَمَا تَأَخَّرَ وَيُمِمْ نِعْمَتَهُ عَلَيْكَ وَيَهْدِيكَ صِرَاطًا مُسْتَقِيمًا {2}

For Allah to Forgive you (your community) what has preceded from your (community's) sins and what is delayed, and Complete His Favour upon you and Guide you on a Straight Path [48:2]

في كتاب الخصال عن الاعمش عن جعفر بن محمد عليهما السلام قال: هذا شرايع الدين إلى ان قال عليه السلام: والانباء واوصياؤهم لا ذنوب لهم، لانهم معصومون مطهرون.

In the book Al-Khisal, from Al-Amsh,

‘Ja’far^{-asws} Bin Muhammad^{-asws} has said: ‘These are the Laws of the Religion’ – until he^{-asws} said: ‘And the Prophets^{-as}, and their^{-as} successors^{-as}, there are no sins to them, because they^{-as} are (all) Infallible, Purified’.²⁸

علي بن إبراهيم: حدثنا محمد بن جعفر، قال: حدثنا محمد بن أحمد، عن محمد بن الحسين، عن علي بن النعمان، عن علي بن أيوب، عن عمر بن يزيد بياع السابري، قال: قلت لأبي عبد الله (عليه السلام): قول الله في كتابه: لِيُغْفِرَ لَكَ اللَّهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ذَنْبِكَ وَمَا تَأَخَّرَ، قال: «ما كان له ذنب، و لا هم بذنب، و لكن الله حملة ذنوب شيعته ثم غفرها له».

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from Muhammad Bin Ja’far, from Muhammad Bin Ahmad, from Muhammad Bin Al-Husayn, from Ali Bin Al-No’mān, from Ali Bin Ayoub, from Umar Bin Yazeed who said,

‘I said to Abu Abdullah^{-asws}, ‘(What about) the Words of Allah^{-azwj} in His^{-azwj} Book ***For Allah to Forgive you what has preceded from your sins and what is delayed [48:2]***. He^{-asws} said: ‘There was no sin on him^{-saww}, nor was he^{-saww} with a sin, but Allah^{-azwj} burdened him^{-saww} with the sins of his^{-saww} Shias, then Forgave them for his^{-saww} sake’.²⁹

²⁸ Tafseer Noor Al Saqalayn – CH 48 H 19

²⁹ تفسير القمي 2: 314.

قال شرف الدين النجفي: و يؤيده ما روي مرفوعاً عن أبي الحسن الثالث (عليه السلام): أنه سئل عن قول الله عز و جل: لِيَغْفِرَ لَكَ اللَّهُ مَا تَقَدَّمَ مِنْ ذَنْبِكَ وَ مَا تَأَخَّرَ، فقال (عليه السلام): و أي ذنب كان لرسول الله (صلى الله عليه و آله) متقدماً أو متأخراً؟ و إنما حمله الله ذنوب شيعته علي (عليه السلام)، من مضى منهم و من بقي، ثم غفرها له».

Sharaf Al-Deen Al-Najafi said,

‘And it is supported by what has been reported from Abu Al-Hassan^{-asws} the Third having said about the Words of Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic: **For Allah to Forgive you what has preceded from your sins and what is delayed [48:2]**, so he^{-asws} said: ‘And which sin was committed by Rasool-Allah^{-saww}, before or after?’ But rather, Allah^{-azwj} Burdened him^{-saww} with the sins of the Shias of Ali^{-asws}, from the past among them and the ones who remain, then Forgave them on his^{-saww} behalf’.³⁰

الطبرسي: روى المفضل بن عمر، عن الصادق (عليه السلام)، قال: سأله رجل، عن هذه الآية، فقال: «و الله ما كان له ذنب، و لكن الله سبحانه ضمن له أن يغفر ذنوب شيعته علي (عليه السلام) ما تقدم من ذنبهم و ما تأخر».

Al-Tabarsy – It has been reported by Al-Mufazzal-Bin Umar,

‘A man asked Al-Sadiq^{-asws} about this Verse, so he^{-asws} said: ‘By Allah^{-azwj}, there was no sin for him^{-saww}, but Allah^{-azwj} the Glorious, Guaranteed him^{-saww} that He^{-azwj} would Forgive the sins of the Shias of Ali^{-asws}, whatever had preceded from their sins and whatever is to follow’.³¹

The Debate of Imam Ali^{-asws} ibn Musa Al-Reza^{-asws} with Muslim scholars on the infallibility of the Prophets^{-as}

حدثنا أحمد بن زياد بن جعفر الهمداني رضي الله عنه و الحسين بن إبراهيم بن أحمد بن هشام المكتب و علي بن عبد الله الوراق رضي الله عنهم قالوا حدثنا علي بن إبراهيم بن هاشم قال حدثنا القاسم بن محمد البرمكي قال حدثنا أبو الصلت الهروي قال لما جمع المأمون لعلي بن موسى الرضا ع أهل المقالات من أهل الإسلام و الديانات من اليهود و النصارى و المجوس و الصابئين و سائر أهل المقالات فلم يبق أحد إلا و قد ألزمه حجته كأنه ألجم حجراً قام إليه علي بن محمد بن الجهم فقال له يا ابن رسول الله أ تقول بعصمة الأنبياء قال نعم قال فما تعمل في قول الله عز و جل وَ عَصَى آدَمُ رَبَّهُ فَغَوَى وَ فِي قَوْلِهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ ذَا النُّونِ إِذْ ذَهَبَ مُغَاضِباً فَظَنَّ أَنْ لَنْ نَقْدِرَ عَلَيْهِ وَ فِي قَوْلِهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ فِي يَوْسُفَ ع وَ لَقَدْ هَمَّتْ بِهِ وَ هَمَّ بِهَا وَ فِي قَوْلِهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ فِي دَاوُدَ إِذْ ظَنَّ دَاوُدُ أَنَّهَا فَتَنَاءُ وَ قَوْلِهِ تَعَالَى فِي نَبِيِّ مُحَمَّدٍ ص وَ نُحْيِي فِي نَفْسِكَ مَا اللَّهُ مُبْدِيهِ فَقَالَ الرضا ع ويحك يا علي اتق الله و لا تنسب إلى أنبياء الله الفواحش و لا تتأول كتاب الله برأيك فإن الله عز و جل قد قال وَ مَا يَعْلَمُ تَأْوِيلَهُ إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَ الرَّاسِخُونَ وَ أما قوله عز و جل فِي آدَمَ وَ عَصَى آدَمُ رَبَّهُ فَغَوَى فَإِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ خَلَقَ آدَمَ حِجَّةً فِي أَرْضِهِ وَ خَلِيفَةً فِي بِلَادِهِ لَمْ يَخْلُقْهُ لِلْجَنَّةِ وَ كَانَتِ الْمَعْصِيَةُ مِنْ آدَمَ فِي الْجَنَّةِ لَا فِي الْأَرْضِ وَ عَصَمْتَهُ تَجِبُ أَنْ يَكُونَ فِي الْأَرْضِ لِيَتِمَّ مَقَادِيرُ أَمْرِ اللَّهِ فَلَمَّا أَهْبَطَ إِلَى الْأَرْضِ وَ جَعَلَ حِجَّةً وَ خَلِيفَةً عَصَمَ بِقَوْلِهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ إِنَّ اللَّهَ اصْطَفَى آدَمَ وَ نُوحاً وَ آلَ إِبْرَاهِيمَ وَ آلَ عِمْرَانَ عَلَى الْعَالَمِينَ وَ أما قوله عز و جل وَ ذَا النُّونِ إِذْ ذَهَبَ مُغَاضِباً فَظَنَّ أَنْ لَنْ نَقْدِرَ عَلَيْهِ إِنَّمَا ظَنَّ بِمَعْنَى اسْتَيْقَنَ أَنَّ اللَّهَ لَنْ يَضِيقَ عَلَيْهِ رِزْقَهُ أَلَا تَسْمَعُ قَوْلَ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ أَنَّمَا إِذَا

³⁰ تأويل الآيات 2: 593 / 4.

³¹ مجمع البيان 9: 168.

مَا ابْتَلَاهُ فَقَدَرَ عَلَيْهِ رِزْقَهُ أَي ضَبِقَ عَلَيْهِ رِزْقَهُ وَ لَوْ ظَنَّ أَنَّ اللَّهَ لَا يَقْدِرُ عَلَيْهِ لَكَانَ قَدْ كَفَرَ وَ أَمَا قَوْلُهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ فِي يُوسُفَ وَ لَقَدْ هَمَّتْ بِهِ وَ هَمَّ بِهَا فَإِنَّمَا هَمَّتْ بِالْمَعْصِيَةِ وَ هُم يُوسُفَ بِقَتْلِهَا إِنْ أَجْرَتْهُ لِعَظَمِ مَا تَدَاخَلَهُ فَصَرَفَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ قَتْلَهَا وَ الْفَاحِشَةَ وَ هُوَ قَوْلُهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ كَذَلِكَ لِنَصْرِفَ عَنْهُ السُّوءَ وَ الْفَحْشَاءَ يَعْنِي الْقَتْلَ وَ الزِّنَاءَ وَ أَمَا دَاوُدُ عَ فَمَا يَقُولُ مِنْ قَبْلِكُمْ فِيهِ فَقَالَ عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ الْجَهْمِ يَقُولُونَ إِنْ دَاوُدُ عَ كَانَ فِي مَحْرَابِهِ يَصَلِّي فَتَصَوَّرَ لَهُ إِبْلِيسُ عَلَى صُورَةِ طَيْرٍ أَحْسَنَ مَا يَكُونُ مِنَ الطَّيْرِ فَقَطَعَ دَاوُدُ صَلَاتَهُ وَ قَامَ لِيَأْخُذَ الطَّيْرَ فَخَرَجَ الطَّيْرُ إِلَى الدَّارِ فَخَرَجَ الطَّيْرُ إِلَى السُّطْحِ فَصَعِدَ فِي طَلْبِهِ فَسَقَطَ الطَّيْرُ فِي دَارِ أَوْرِيَا بْنِ حَنَّانٍ فَاطَّلَعَ دَاوُدُ فِي أَثَرِ الطَّيْرِ فَإِذَا بِامْرَأَةٍ أَوْرِيَا تَغْتَسِلُ فَلَمَّا نَظَرَ إِلَيْهَا هَوَاهَا وَ كَانَ قَدْ أَخْرَجَ أَوْرِيَا فِي بَعْضِ غَزَوَاتِهِ فَكَتَبَ إِلَى صَاحِبِهِ أَنَّ قَدِمَ أَوْرِيَا أَمَامَ التَّابُوتِ فَقَدِمَ فَظَفَرَ أَوْرِيَا بِالْمَشْرُكِينَ فَصَعِبَ ذَلِكَ عَلَى دَاوُدَ فَكَتَبَ إِلَيْهِ ثَانِيَةً أَنَّ قَدِمَهُ أَمَامَ التَّابُوتِ فَقَدِمَ فَكَتَبَ أَوْرِيَا فَيَتَزَوَّجُ دَاوُدَ بِامْرَأَتِهِ قَالَ فَضَرَبَ الرِّضَا عَ يَدَهُ عَلَى جَبْهَتِهِ وَ قَالَ إِنْ لَمْ يَكُنْ اللَّهُ وَ إِنْ لَمْ يَكُنْ رَاجِعُونَ لَقَدْ نَسَبْتُمْ نَبِيًّا مِنْ أَنْبِيَاءِ اللَّهِ إِلَى التَّهَاهُونَ بِصَلَاتِهِ حَتَّى خَرَجَ فِي أَثَرِ الطَّيْرِ ثُمَّ بِالْفَاحِشَةِ ثُمَّ بِالْقَتْلِ فَقَالَ يَا ابْنَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَمَا كَانَ خَطِيئَتُهُ فَقَالَ وَيْحَكَ إِنْ دَاوُدُ إِنْمَا ظَنَّ أَنَّ مَا خَلَقَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ خَلْقًا هُوَ أَعْلَمُ مِنْهُ فَبَعَثَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ إِلَيْهِ الْمَلَكِينَ فَتَسَوَّرَا الْمَحْرَابَ فَقَالَا حَضَمَانِ بَعْنِي بَعْضُنَا عَلَى بَعْضٍ فَاحْكُمْ بَيْنَنَا بِالْحَقِّ وَ لَا تُشْطِطْ وَ اهْدِنَا إِلَى سَوَاءِ الصِّرَاطِ إِنَّ هَذَا أَخِي لَهُ تَسَعُّ وَ تَسْعُونَ نَعْبَجَةً وَ لِي نَعْبَجَةٌ وَاحِدَةٌ فَقَالَ أَكْفَلْنِيهَا وَ عَزَّيْنِي فِي الْخِطَابِ فَعَجَلَ دَاوُدُ عَ عَلَى الْمُدْعَى عَلَيْهِ فَقَالَ لَقَدْ ظَلَمْتَكَ بِسُؤَالِ نَعْبَجَتِكَ إِلَى نِعَاجِهِ وَ لَمْ يَسْأَلِ الْمُدْعَى الْبَيْنَةَ عَلَى ذَلِكَ وَ لَمْ يَقْبَلْ عَلَى الْمُدْعَى عَلَيْهِ فَيَقُولُ لَهُ مَا تَقُولُ فَكَانَ هَذَا خَطِيئَةَ رَسْمِ الْحَكْمِ لَا مَا ذَهَبْتُمْ إِلَيْهِ أَلَا تَسْمَعُ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ يَقُولُ يَا دَاوُدُ إِنْمَا جَعَلْنَاكَ خَلِيفَةً فِي الْأَرْضِ فَاحْكُمْ بَيْنَ النَّاسِ بِالْحَقِّ وَ لَا تَتَّبِعِ الْهَوَىٰ إِلَى آخِرِ الْآيَةِ فَقَالَ يَا ابْنَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَمَا قِصَّتَهُ مَعَ أَوْرِيَا فَقَالَ الرِّضَا عَ إِنْ الْمَرْأَةَ فِي أَيَّامِ دَاوُدَ عَ كَانَتْ إِذَا مَاتَ بَعْلُهَا أَوْ قَتَلَ لَا تَتَزَوَّجُ بَعْدَهُ أَبَدًا وَ أَوَّلُ مَنْ أَبَاحَ اللَّهُ لَهُ أَنْ يَتَزَوَّجَ بِامْرَأَةٍ قَتَلَ بَعْلُهَا كَانَ دَاوُدُ عَ يَتَزَوَّجُ بِامْرَأَةِ أَوْرِيَا لَمَّا قَتَلَ وَ انْقَضَتْ عِدَّتُهَا مِنْهُ فَذَلِكَ الَّذِي شَقَّ عَلَى النَّاسِ مِنْ قَبْلِ أَوْرِيَا وَ أَمَا مُحَمَّدٌ صَ وَ قَوْلُ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ تُخْفِي فِي نَفْسِكَ مَا اللَّهُ مُبْدِيهِ وَ تَخْشَى النَّاسَ وَ اللَّهُ أَحَقُّ أَنْ تَخْشَاهُ فَإِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ عَرَفَ نَبِيَّهُ صَ أَسْمَاءَ أَزْوَاجِهِ فِي دَارِ الدُّنْيَا وَ أَسْمَاءَ أَزْوَاجِهِ فِي دَارِ الْآخِرَةِ وَ إِنَّمَنْ أَمَهَاتِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَ إِحْدَاهُنَّ مِنْ سَمِيِّ لَهْ زَيْنَبُ بِنْتُ جَحْشٍ وَ هِيَ يَوْمئِذٍ تَحْتَ زَيْدِ بْنِ حَارِثَةَ فَأَخْفَى اسْمَهَا فِي نَفْسِهِ وَ لَمْ يَبْدِهِ لِكَيْلَا يَقُولُ أَحَدٌ مِنَ الْمُنَافِقِينَ إِنَّهُ قَالَ فِي امْرَأَةٍ فِي بَيْتِ رَجُلٍ إِذَا إِحْدَى أَزْوَاجِهِ مِنْ أَمَهَاتِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَ خَشِيَ قَوْلَ الْمُنَافِقِينَ فَقَالَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ تَخْشَى النَّاسَ وَ اللَّهُ أَحَقُّ أَنْ تَخْشَاهُ يَعْنِي فِي نَفْسِكَ وَ إِنْ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ مَا تَوَلَّى تَزْوِيجَ أَحَدٍ مِنْ خَلْقِهِ إِلَّا تَزْوِيجَ حَوَاءَ مِنْ آدَمَ عَ وَ زَيْنَبَ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَ بِقَوْلِهِ فَلَمَّا قَضَى زَيْدٌ مِنْهَا وَ طَرَأَ زَوْجَانَا كَمَا الْآيَةُ وَ فَاطِمَةَ مِنْ عَلِيِّ عَ قَالَ فَبِكَى عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ الْجَهْمِ فَقَالَ يَا ابْنَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ أَنَا تَائِبٌ إِلَى اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ مِنْ أَنْ أَنْطِقَ فِي أَنْبِيَاءِ اللَّهِ عَ بَعْدَ يَوْمِي هَذَا إِلَّا بِمَا ذَكَرْتَهُ

Ahmad ibn Ziyad ibn Ja'far al-Hamadani - may Allah^{-azwj} be Pleased with him, Al-Hussein ibn Ibrahim ibn Ahmad ibn Hisham al-Mokattib and Ali ibn Abdullah al-Warraq -may Allah^{-azwj} be Pleased with them, narrated that Ali ibn Ibrahim ibn Hashem quoted on the authority of Al-Qasim ibn Muhammad al-Barmaki on the authority of Abu Salt al-Harawi:

‘When Al-Ma’mun gathered together the rhetoricians and men of religions from the Jews, the Christians, the Magi, the Sabians, and other scholars around Ali^{-asws} ibn Musa Al-Reza^{-asws}, each person stood up to ask a question, got a firm answer, and received such an answer that he got quiet as if they had put a stone in his mouth.

Then Ali ibn Muhammad ibn Al-Jahm stood up and asked, ‘O son of the Prophet of Allah^{-asws}! Do you believe in the Infallibility of the Prophets^{-as}?’ ‘Yes,’ replied the Imam^{-asws}.

He said, ‘Then what do you have to say about the following Verses? what do you have to say about what the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} said, ‘ ... **Thus did Adam disobey his Lord, and allow himself to be seduced (20:121)**; and about what the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} said, ‘**And remember Thun-nun (Yunus-Jonah), when he departed in wrath: He imagined that We had no power over him! (21:87)**, and about what the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} Told Joseph^{-as}, ‘**And (with passion) did she desire him, and he would have desired her .(12:24)**

And about what the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} told David (s), ‘**and David gathered that We had tried him .(38:24)..** , and about what the Sublime (Allah^{-azwj}) told His Prophet Muhammad^{-sawww} ‘ ... **But thou didst hide in thy heart that which Allah was about to make manifest ... (33:37)**

Al-Reza^{-asws} said, ‘Woe be to you! Fear Allah^{-azwj}. Do not ascribe transgressions to the Prophets^{-as}, and do not interpret Allah^{-azwj}’s Book according to your own opinion. Indeed the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} said, ‘ ... **but no one knows its hidden meanings except Allah^{-azwj}. And those who are firmly grounded in knowledge ... ,(3:7)** And regarding His^{-azwj} Words about Adam, ‘ ... **Thus did Adam disobey his Lord, and allow himself to be seduced ,(20:121)** it must be noted that the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} Created Adam^{-as} as His^{-azwj} Proof on Earth, and as His^{-azwj} Successor in the towns.

However, Allah^{-azwj} had not created Adam for Paradise and Adam^{-as}’s act of disobedience occurred in Paradise, not on the Earth. Adam^{-as}’s being Infallible was a must for him^{-as} to fully implement the Decrees of Allah^{-azwj}. Once he^{-as} was sent down to the Earth as Allah^{-azwj}’s Proof and Successor, he^{-as} was Infallible according to what the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} said, ‘**Allah did Choose Adam and Noah, the family of Abraham, and the family of Imran above all people. (3:33)** And regarding the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj}’s Words, ‘**And remember Thun-noon (Jonah), when he departed in wrath: He imagined that We had no power over him! (21:87)**

Here what is meant by ‘imagine’ is ‘to be sure.’ That means ‘We will not restrict his sustenance.’ Have you not heard the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj}’s Words, ‘**But when He tried him, restricting his subsistence for him ... (89:16)**. This means Allah^{-azwj} will Restrict his sustenance. Had Yunus thought that Allah had no power over him, he would certainly have turned into an atheist.

And regarding what the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} said about Joseph^{-as}, ‘**And (with passion) did she desire him, and he would have desired her ...** ‘ This means that he^{-as} got upset and decided that if she tries to force him to commit sin, he would try to kill her. Then Allah^{-azwj} Changed his (Joseph’s) mind and turned him away from killing her and all shameful deeds. This is what is meant by the Honourable the Exalted Allah’s words, • **... thus (did We order) that We might turn away from him (all) evil and shameful deeds ... (12:24)** meaning killing and adultery.

The Imam^{-asws} said, ‘And regarding David^{-as}, what do the people on your side say about him? Ali ibn Muhammad ibn Al-Jahm said, ‘They say that David^{-as} was in his praying niche when Satan appeared in front of him in the form of a very beautiful bird. David^{-as} stopped praying

and stood up to go catch the bird. The bird left the room and went into the courtyard. Then it flew up to the top of the house. David climbed up to the roof looking for it. Then the bird flew into the house of Uryah ibn Hannan. David followed the bird with his eyes, and suddenly saw Uryah’s wife who was making major ritual ablutions. Once he looked at her, he fell in love with her. As for Uryah, he had been sent to a battle. David^{-as} wrote to his commander, ‘Place Uryah in front of the coffin.’ Thus he was placed in front of it. Uryah defeated the pagans. That was hard on David, so he wrote to his commander again and ordered him to place Uryah ahead of the coffin. Then Uryah was placed ahead of it and was killed. Then David^{-as} married his wife.’

The narrator added, ‘Al-Reza^{-asws} hit himself on the forehead and said, ‘From Allah^{-azwj} we are, and unto Him^{-azwj} is our return! You have ascribed neglecting prayers and going out and looking for the bird’s tracks, fornication and killing to one of the Prophets of Allah^{-azwj}.’” Ali ibn Al-Jahm said, ‘O son of the Prophet of Allah^{-asws}! Then what was his sin?’

The Imam^{-asws} said, ‘Woe be to you! David thought that the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} had not Created anyone more learned than himself. Therefore, the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} sent two angels towards him^{-as} who climbed up the walls of the prayer niche and said, ‘... **Fear not: we are two disputants, one of whom has wronged the other: Decide now between us with truth, and treat us not with injustice, but guide us to the even Path. This man is my brother: He has nine and ninety ewes, and I have (but) one: Yet he says, ‘commit her to my care,’ and is (moreover) harsh to me in speech. (38:22-23)**

Then David turned to the one against whom a claim was made and said, ‘**He (Dawood) said: ‘He has wronged you by asking for your ewe to (be added) to his ewes, ... (38:24)** He did not turn to the claimant to ask him for any evidence. Thus, this was just a fault in the way he judged, not a fault in the way you think about it. Have you ever heard that the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} said, “**O Dawood! Surely, We Made you a Caliph in the earth, therefore judge between the people with the Truth and do not follow the vain desires, for you will stray from the Way of Allah. Surely, those who stray from the way of Allah, for them is a severe Punishment due to their forgetting the Day of Reckoning!” (38:26)**

He then asked: ‘O son of the Prophet of Allah^{-asws}! What was behind the story of Uryah?’

Al-Reza^{-asws} said, ‘When a woman’s husband died or got killed during the time of David^{-as}, she never married again. The first man who was permitted to marry a widow whose husband was killed was David^{-as}. He married Uryah’s wife when after Uryah’s husband got killed and after her waiting period was over. This was what was hard on the people regarding Uryah.’

And regarding Muhammad^{-saww} and the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj}’s Words, ‘**and you concealed within yourself what Allah would be Manifesting, and you feared the people while Allah is more deserving that you fear Him. (33:37)**

The Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} had already informed His Prophet^{-saww} about the names of his wives in this world, and the names of his wives in the Hereafter, and that they will be the mothers of the believers. One of them was called Zaynab - the daughter of Jahsh who was married to Zayd ibn Haritha at that time. The Prophet^{-saww} kept her name a secret to himself

and did not say anything fearing that the hypocrites might say that Muhammad^{-saww} considers a married woman to be his own wife and one of the mothers of the believers.

He^{-saww} feared what the hypocrites might say. The Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} said, **‘and you concealed within yourself what Allah would be Manifesting, and you feared the people while Allah is more deserving that you fear Him (33:37)** meaning in himself. And the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} has not Taken charge of marrying off any of His^{-azwj} creatures Himself except for the marriage of Eve with Adam, and Zaynab with Allah’s Prophet^{-saww} as He^{-azwj} said, **‘... Then when Zayd had dissolved (his marriage) with her, with the necessary (formality), We joined her in marriage to you (33:37).’ So did We^{-azwj} Join (the Blessed Lady) Fatima^{-asws} in marriage to Ali^{-asws}.**

The narrator added, ‘Then Ali ibn Muhammad ibn Al-Jahm cried and said, ‘O son of the Prophet of Allah^{-asws}! I turn to the Honourable the Exalted Allah^{-azwj} in repentance and from now on will never say anything about the Prophets^{-as} of Allah^{-azwj} other than what you have mentioned.’³²

APPENDIX II: Ahadith Summarising the Interpretation of Quran

و قال علي بن إبراهيم: الآيات: أمير المؤمنين و الائمة (عليهم السلام)، و الدليل على ذلك قول أمير المؤمنين (عليه السلام): «ما لله آية أكبر مني».

And Ali Bin Ibrahim said,

‘The ‘آيات’ Signs are Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} and the Imams^{-asws}, and the evidence upon that are the words of Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws}: ‘There is no ‘Sign’ of Allah^{-azwj} greater than I^{-asws}!’³³

محمد بن علي بن بابويه في (الغيبة)، قال: حدثنا محمد بن علي ماجيلويه (رضي الله عنه)، قال: حدثني عمي محمد بن أبي القاسم (رحمه الله)، عن محمد بن علي الصيرفي الكوفي، عن محمد بن سنان، عن المفضل بن عمر، عن جابر بن يزيد الجعفي، عن سعيد بن المسيب، عن عبد الرحمن بن سمرة، قال:

Muhammad Bin Ali Bin Babuwayh in ‘Al Ghaybat’, said: ‘Narrated to us Muhammad Bin Ali Majaylawiya, from his uncle Muhammad Abu Al Qasim, from Muhammad Bin Ali Al Sayrafi Al Kufy, from Muhammad Bin Sinan, from Al Mufazzal Bin Umar, from Jabir Bin Yazeed Al Ju’fy, from Saeed Bin Al Musayyab, from Abdul Rahman Bin Samrat who said,

قال رسول الله (صلى الله عليه و آله): «لعن الله المجادلين في دين الله على لسان سبعين نبيا، و من جادل في آيات الله فقد كفر، قال الله عز و جل: ما يُجادل في آياتِ الله إلا الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا فَلَا يَغْرُوكَ تَقَلُّبُهُمْ فِي الْبِلَادِ

‘Rasool-Allah^{-saww} said: ‘The Curse of Allah^{-azwj} is upon the disputers in the Religion of Allah^{-azwj} upon the tongues of seventy Prophets^{-as}. And the one who disputes regarding a Verse of Allah^{-azwj}, so he has disbelieved. Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic has Said: **None dispute the Signs of**

³² 192 : ص 1 : ج (ع) عيون أخبار الرضا، Vol. 1. Chapter 14, H. 1

³³ تفسير القمي 1: 309.

Allah except those who commit Kufr, therefore do not let their movement in the cities deceive you [40:4].

و من فسر القرآن برأيه فقد افترى على الله الكذب، و من أفتى بغير علم لعنته ملائكة السماء و الأرض، كل بدعة ضلالة، و كل ضلالة سبيلها إلى النار».

And the one who interprets the Quran by his opinion, so he has forged a lie against Allah^{-azwj}, and the one who issues *Fatwas* without knowledge is Cursed by the Angels of the sky and the earth. Every innovation is a straying, and every straying, its path is to the Fire’.

قال عبدالرحمن بن سمرة: فقلت: يا رسول الله، أرشدني إلى النجاة، فقال: «يا بن سمرة، إذا اختلفت الأهواء، و تفرقت الآراء، فعليك بعلي بن أبي طالب، فإنه إمام أمتي، و خليفتي عليهم من بعدي، و هو الفاروق الذي يتميز به بين الحق و الباطل،

Abdul Rahman Bin Samrat said, ‘I said, ‘O Rasool-Allah^{-saww}, guide me to the salvation’. So he^{-saww} said: ‘O Bin Samrat! If the desires differ and the opinions are split, so it is upon you to be with Ali^{-asws} Bin Abu Talib^{-asws}, for he^{-asws} is the Imam^{-asws} of my^{-saww} community, and my^{-saww} Caliph over them from after me^{-saww}, and he^{-asws} is the Differentiator (Al-Farouq) who differentiates between the Truth and the falsehood.

من سأله أجابه، و من استرشده أرشده، و من طلب الحق عنده وجدته، و من التمس الهدى لديه صادفه، و من لجأ إليه أمنه، و من استمسك به أنجاه، و من اقتدى به هداه.

The one who asks him^{-asws}, he^{-asws} answers him, and the one who will seek guidance from him^{-asws}, he^{-asws} will guide him, and the one who looks for the truth in his^{-asws} presence would find it, and the one who sought guidance from him^{-asws} came across it, and one who resorted to him^{-asws} found security, and the one who attached himself to him^{-asws} was Saved, and the one who followed him^{-asws} was guided by him^{-asws}.

يا بن سمرة، سلم منكم من سلم له و والاه، و هلك من رد عليه و عاداه-

O Bin Samrat! The safe one among you is the one who submitted to him^{-asws} and befriended him^{-asws}, and the destroyed is the one who rejected him^{-asws} and was inimical to him^{-asws}.

يا بن سمرة- إن عليا مني روحه من روحي، و طينته من طينتي، و هو أخي و أنا أخوه، و هو زوج ابنتي- فاطمة سيدة نساء العالمين من الأولين و الآخرين- و إن منه إمامي أمتي و ابني و سيدي شباب أهل الجنة الحسن و الحسين و تسعة من ولد الحسين، تاسعهم قائم أممي يملأ الأرض قسطا و عدلا كما ملئت جورا و ظلما».

O Bin Samrat! Ali^{-asws} is from me^{-saww}. His^{-asws} soul is from my^{-saww} soul, and his^{-asws} clay (essence) is from my clay, and he^{-asws} is my^{-saww} brother, and I^{-saww} am his^{-asws} brother, and he^{-asws} is the husband of my^{-saww} daughter^{-asws} (Syeda) Fatima^{-asws}, the Chieftess of the women of the worlds from the former ones and the later ones. And from him^{-asws} are the Imams^{-asws} of my^{-saww} community, and the Chiefs of the youths of Paradise Al-Hassan^{-asws}, and Al-Husayn^{-asws}, and nine from the sons^{-asws} of Al-Husayn^{-asws}. The ninth one of them is Al-Qaim^{-asws}

of my^{-saww} community who will fill the earth with equity and justice just as it had been filled with tyranny and injustice.³⁴

³⁴ كمال الدين و تمام النعمة: 1 / 256