



## **Defence of 12 Imami Shias against Bohra Allegations**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Defence of 12 Imami Shias against Bohra Allegations .....	1
Bohra scholar allegation: 1 .....	3
Defence of 12 Imami Shias against allegation: 1 .....	3
Further Ahadith on Ali <sup>-asws</sup> Ibn Abi Talib <sup>-asws</sup> as the First Imam <sup>-asws</sup> : .....	6
Bohra scholar allegation: 2 .....	8
Defence of 12 Imami Shias against allegation: 2.....	8
Imam Sadiq <sup>-asws</sup> encouraged his <sup>-asws</sup> companions to perform Hajj on behalf of deceased Ismail.....	10
Imam Sadiq <sup>-asws</sup> showed the deceased Ismail to his <sup>-asws</sup> companions .....	11
Imam Jafar <sup>-asws</sup> 's reactions upon receiving the news of the death of Ismail:.....	12
6th Imam <sup>-asws</sup> reveals who will be the next Imam:.....	13
Bohra scholar allegation: 3 .....	14
Defence of 12 Imami Shias against allegation: 3.....	14
Bohra scholar allegation: 4 .....	14
Defence of 12 Imami Shias against allegation: 4.....	15
The Concept of Badā' .....	16
When 10 Days were added during the Time of Prophet Musa <sup>-as</sup> .....	16
During the life of Rasool Allah <sup>-saww</sup> .....	17
Badā' with respect to Imāmate.....	18
Appendix I: The original text of the Allegation of a Bohra Scholar .....	19
Appendix II: Keeping the promises.....	21
Appendix III: Additional Ahadith on Badā' (الْبَدَاءُ).....	23

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ، وَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَى سَيِّدِنَا مُحَمَّدٍ وَ آلِهِ الطَّاهِرِينَ، وَ سَلَّمَ تَسْلِيمًا.

In the Name of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> the Beneficent, the Merciful. The Praise is for Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Lord<sup>-azwj</sup> of the Worlds, and Blessing be upon our Chief Muhammad<sup>-saww</sup> and his<sup>-saww</sup> Purified Progeny<sup>-asws</sup>, and greetings with abundant greetings.

اللَّهُمَّ صَلِّ عَلَى مُحَمَّدٍ وَآلِ مُحَمَّدٍ وَعَجَلْ فَرَجَهُمْ وَالْعَنُ أَعْدَائَهُمْ أَجْمَعِينَ

## Defence of 12 Imami Shias against Bohra Allegations

A short document against the 12 Imami Shia (Asna e Ashari) has been circulated, as written by a Bohri scholar – its text without editing is reproduced in Appendix I. Below, we answer to each of the four allegations raised against the beliefs of 12 Imami Shias.

### Bohra scholar allegation: 1

(Referring to a Hadith of Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup>, the first allegation is:)

*“Hazrat Imam Hassan (A.S.) and Hazrat Imam Hussain (A.S.) are the chief of all youths in paradise and their father (Hazrat Ali Maula-e-Kaenat A.S.) is better than both of them.’ - So Ithna Asharee Firqa can not include Hazrat Ali (A.S.) in the list of 12 Imams, as his (A.S.) position is better than that of an Imam (A.S.).*

*“In other words, Hazrat Ali (A.S.) is the ‘Managing Director’ and can not be included in the list of Imams (A.S.). His position can not be lowered, to complete the 12 Imams. Therefore, if we exclude Hazrat Ali (A.S.) from the list of 12 Imams, the total is only 11 Imams.”*

### Defence of 12 Imami Shias against allegation: 1

This is very strange logic – Prophet Mohammed<sup>-saww</sup> is better than the previous Prophets<sup>-as</sup>, so will our Bohra brother exclude Prophet Mohammed<sup>-saww</sup> from the list of Prophets<sup>-as</sup> too?

There are so many Ahadith, however for the sake of brevity in this article, we present three Ahadith below: in the first Hadith, the Prophet<sup>-saww</sup> says he<sup>-saww</sup> is the chief of the Prophets<sup>-as</sup> and Ali<sup>-asws</sup> is the chief of the Waseen (Imams); in the second Hadith, the Prophet<sup>-saww</sup> says their (Imam Hassan<sup>-asws</sup>’s and Imam Hussain<sup>-asws</sup>’s) father (Imam Ali<sup>-asws</sup>) is better than them<sup>-asws</sup> and counts Ali<sup>-asws</sup> Ibn Abi Talib<sup>-asws</sup> in the list of twelve Imams<sup>-asws</sup>; and in the third Hadith, the Prophet gives the names of the twelve Imams<sup>-asws</sup> after him<sup>-saww</sup>.

Also, in the fourth Hadith (footnote number 4, under Defence of 12 Imami Shias against allegation 2), Imam Jafar e Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> says that Imam Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> is of higher rank than Imam Hussain<sup>-asws</sup>.

Additional Ahadith on ‘Imam Ali<sup>-asws</sup>’ being declared as the first Imam, among twelve Imams are included at the end of allegation 1.

**First Hadith:** 'I<sup>-saww</sup> am the chief of the Prophets<sup>-as</sup> and Ali<sup>-asws</sup> is the chief of Imams<sup>-asws</sup>.'

يا بنية، إنا أهل بيت أعطانا الله سبع خصال لم يعطها أحدا من الأولين ولا أحدا من الآخرين غيرنا: أنا سيد الأنبياء والمرسلين وخيرهم، ووصيي خير الوصيين، ووزير بعدي خير الوزراء، وشهيدنا خير الشهداء أعني حمزة عمي. قالت: يا رسول الله، سيد الشهداء الذين قتلوا معك؟ قال: لا، بل سيد الشهداء من الأولين والآخرين ما خلا الأنبياء والأوصياء.

*(Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup> said)* "O daughter, we<sup>-asws</sup>, the People<sup>-asws</sup> of the Household have been Given by Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> seven qualities, which no one from the former ones nor from the later ones have been Given apart from us<sup>-asws</sup>. I<sup>-saww</sup> am the chief of the Prophets<sup>-as</sup> and the Messengers<sup>-as</sup> and the best of them<sup>-as</sup>, and my<sup>-saww</sup> successor<sup>-asws</sup> is the best of the successors<sup>-as</sup>, and my<sup>-saww</sup> vizier after me<sup>-saww</sup> is the best of the viziers<sup>-as</sup>, and our<sup>-asws</sup> martyrs are the best of the martyrs, meaning my<sup>-saww</sup> uncle Hamza." (an extract)<sup>1</sup>

**Second Hadith:** 'Their<sup>-asws</sup> (Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> and Hussain<sup>-asws</sup>) father<sup>-asws</sup> is better than both of them<sup>-asws</sup>.'

قال: ونظر رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله إليهما يوما وقد أقبلأ، فقال: هذان والله سيدا شباب أهل الجنة وأبوهما خير منهما. إن خير الناس عندي وأحبهم إلي وأكرمهم علي أبوكما ثم أمكما، وليس عند الله أحد أفضل مني وأخي ووزير وخليفتي في أمتي وولي كل مؤمن بعدي علي بن أبي طالب.

*(Sulaym said)* And the Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup> looked at them<sup>-asws</sup> both, one day when they<sup>-asws</sup> had come, so he<sup>-saww</sup> said: "By Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, these two<sup>-asws</sup> are the Chiefs of the youths of the Paradise, and their<sup>-asws</sup> father<sup>-asws</sup> is better than both of them<sup>-asws</sup>. They<sup>-asws</sup> are the best of the people to me<sup>-saww</sup>, and the most beloved to me<sup>-saww</sup>, and the most prestigious is their<sup>-asws</sup> father<sup>-asws</sup>, then the mother<sup>-asws</sup> of the both of them, and there isn't anyone with Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> who is more preferable than myself<sup>-saww</sup>, and my<sup>-saww</sup> brother, and my<sup>-saww</sup> Vizier, and my<sup>-saww</sup> Caliph in my<sup>-saww</sup> community, and the guardian of every believer after me<sup>-saww</sup>, Ali<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Abu Talib<sup>-asws</sup>.

ألا إن أخي وخليلي ووزير وصفي وخليفتي من بعدي وولي كل مؤمن ومؤمنة بعدي علي بن أبي طالب، فإذا هلك فابني الحسن من بعده، فإذا هلك فابني الحسين من بعده ثم الأئمة التسعة من عقب الحسين.

"Nay! My<sup>-saww</sup> brother, and my<sup>-saww</sup> friend, and my<sup>-saww</sup> Vizier, and one<sup>-asws</sup> who has my<sup>-saww</sup> Qualities, and my<sup>-saww</sup> Caliph from after me<sup>-saww</sup>, and the guardian of every 'Momin' (believing man) and 'Momina' (believing woman) after me<sup>-saww</sup>, is Ali<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Abu Talib<sup>-asws</sup>. So, he has perished, the one who does not accept Al-Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> from after him<sup>-asws</sup>. So, he has perished, the one who does not accept Al-Husayn<sup>-asws</sup> from after him<sup>-asws</sup>, then the nine Imams<sup>-asws</sup> from the descendants of Al-Husayn<sup>-asws</sup> (total 12 Imams, including Ali<sup>-asws</sup>)

هم الهداة المهتدون، هم مع الحق والحق معهم، لا يفارقونه ولا يفارقهم إلى يوم القيامة. هم زر الأرض الذين تسكن إليهم الأرض، وهم جبل الله المتين، وهم عروة الله الوثقى التي لا انفصام لها، وهم حجج الله في أرضه وشهداءه على خلقه وخزنة علمه ومعادن حكمته. وهم بمنزلة سفينة نوح، من ركبها نجا ومن تركها غرق، وهم بمنزلة باب حطة في بني إسرائيل، من دخله كان مؤمنا ومن خرج منه كان كافرا. فرض الله في الكتاب طاعتهم وأمر فيه بولايتهم، من أطاعهم أطاع الله ومن عصاهم عصى الله.

<sup>1</sup> The Book Of Sulaym Bin Qays Al-Hilali, H. 1, see the complete Hadiht along with the list of narrators: <https://hubeali.com/kitab-e-sulaym/>

“They<sup>-asws</sup> are the guides of those who want to be rightly guided, they<sup>-asws</sup> are with the ‘Haq’ (truth) and the ‘Haq’ (truth) is with them<sup>-asws</sup>; neither will it separate from them<sup>-asws</sup> nor will they separate from it, up to the Day of Judgement. They<sup>-asws</sup> are the (Divine) Axis of the earth due to which the earth is in a tranquil state, and they<sup>-asws</sup> are the strong Rope of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, and they<sup>-asws</sup> are the firmest Handle of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> which will never break, and they<sup>-asws</sup> are the Proofs of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> in His<sup>-azwj</sup> earth, and His<sup>-azwj</sup> witnesses over His<sup>-azwj</sup> creatures, and the treasurers of His<sup>-azwj</sup> Knowledge, and the mines of His<sup>-azwj</sup> Wisdom. And they<sup>-asws</sup> are of the status of the Ark of Noah<sup>-as</sup>, the one who sails in it will be saved, and the one who leaves it will drown. And they<sup>-asws</sup> are of the status of the Door of Servitude (Hitta) of the Children of Israel, the one who enters it is a believer, and the one who exits from it is an infidel. Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> has Obligated the obedience to them<sup>-asws</sup> in His<sup>-azwj</sup> Book, and Ordered for their<sup>-asws</sup> ‘Wilayah’ (mastership) in it. The one who obeys them<sup>-asws</sup> has obeyed Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, and the one who disobeys them<sup>-asws</sup> has disobeyed Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>.”<sup>2</sup>

### **Third Hadith: Prophet<sup>-saww</sup> reveals the names of twelve Imams<sup>-asws</sup> after him<sup>-saww</sup>**

قال علي عليه السلام: أنشدكم الله، أتعلمون أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله قام خطيباً - ولم يخطب بعدها - وقال: (يا أيها الناس، إني قد تركت فيكم أمرين لن تضلوا ما تمسكتم بهما: كتاب الله وعترتي أهل بيتي، فإنه قد عهد إلي اللطيف الخبير أنهما لن يفترقا حتى يردا علي الحوض)؟ فقالوا: اللهم نعم، قد شهدنا ذلك كله من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله.

*Imam Ali<sup>-asws</sup> said: "I<sup>-asws</sup> adjure you all to Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, do you know that the Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup> stood up to preach – and he<sup>-saww</sup> never preached after it – and said: ‘O you people! I<sup>-asws</sup> am leaving among you all two commands, you will not stray if you attach yourselves to these two – the Book of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> and my<sup>-saww</sup> Family, the People<sup>-asws</sup> of my<sup>-saww</sup> Household, for it has been Promised to me<sup>-saww</sup> by the Kind<sup>-azwj</sup>, the Aware<sup>-azwj</sup>, that these two will never separate until they return to me<sup>-saww</sup> at the Fountain.”* They said, “Our Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, yes, we have heard all of that from the Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup>.”

فقال عليه السلام: حسبي الله. فقام الاثنا عشر من الجماعة البدرين فقالوا: نشهد أن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله حين خطب في اليوم الذي قبض فيه قام عمر بن الخطاب شبه المغضب فقال: يا رسول الله، أكل أهل بيتك؟ فقال: لا ولكن أوصيائي، أخي منهم ووزيري ووارثي وخليفتي في أمتي وولي كل مؤمن بعدي وأحد عشر من ولده،

Imam Ali<sup>-asws</sup> said: “Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> is Sufficient for me<sup>-asws</sup>.” Twelve from the group of the people of Badr stood up and said, “We testify that when the Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup> preached on the day in which he<sup>-saww</sup> passed away, Umar Bin Al-Khattab stood up angrily and said, ‘O Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup>, all the People<sup>-asws</sup> of your<sup>-saww</sup> Household?’ He<sup>-saww</sup> said: ‘No, but my<sup>-saww</sup> successors<sup>-asws</sup>. My<sup>-saww</sup> brother among them<sup>-asws</sup>, who is my<sup>-saww</sup> Vizier, and my<sup>-saww</sup> inheritor, and my<sup>-saww</sup> Caliph in my<sup>-saww</sup> community, and the Guardian of every believer after me<sup>-asws</sup>, and eleven from his<sup>-asws</sup> sons<sup>-asws</sup>.”

هذا أولهم وخيرهم ثم ابناي هذان - وأشار بيده إلى الحسن والحسين - ثم وصي ابني يسمى باسم أخي علي وهو ابن الحسين، ثم وصي علي وهو ولده واسمه محمد، ثم جعفر بن محمد، ثم موسى بن جعفر، ثم علي بن موسى، ثم محمد بن علي، ثم علي بن محمد، ثم الحسن بن علي، ثم محمد بن الحسن

<sup>2</sup> The Book Of Sulaym Bin Qays Al-Hilali, H. 21, see the complete Hadiht along with the list of narrators: <https://hubeali.com/kitab-e-sulaym/>

مهدي الأمة. اسمه كاسمي وطينته كطينتي، يأمر بأمرى وينهى وينهى، يملأ الأرض قسطاً وعدلاً كما ملئت ظلماً وجوراً. يتلو بعضهم بعضاً، واحداً بعد واحد حتى يردوا علي الحوض، شهداء الله في أرضه وحججه على خلقه. من أطاعهم أطاع الله ومن عصاهم عصى الله.

“This (Ali<sup>-asws</sup>) is the first of them<sup>-asws</sup> and the best of them<sup>-asws</sup>, then two of my<sup>-sawww</sup> sons<sup>-asws</sup>, these two’ – and indicated by his<sup>-sawww</sup> hand to Al-Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> and Al-Husayn<sup>-asws</sup> – ‘then the successor<sup>-asws</sup> of my<sup>-sawww</sup> son<sup>-asws</sup> who will be named with the name of my<sup>-sawww</sup> brother Ali<sup>-asws</sup>, and he<sup>-asws</sup> will be the son<sup>-asws</sup> of Al-Husayn<sup>-asws</sup>, then the successor<sup>-asws</sup> of Ali<sup>-asws</sup> and he<sup>-asws</sup> is his<sup>-asws</sup> son<sup>-asws</sup> and his<sup>-asws</sup> name is Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup>, then Ja’far<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup>, then Musa<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Ja’far<sup>-asws</sup>, then Ali<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Musa<sup>-asws</sup>, then Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Ali<sup>-asws</sup>, then Ali<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup>, then Al-Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Ali<sup>-asws</sup>, then Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Al-Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> Mahdi of the community. His<sup>-asws</sup> name is like my<sup>-sawww</sup> name and his<sup>-asws</sup> clay (Teenat) is like my<sup>-sawww</sup> Teenat. He<sup>-asws</sup> will order what I<sup>-sawww</sup> ordered, and prevent what I<sup>-sawww</sup> prevented. He<sup>-asws</sup> will fill the earth with fairness and justice just as it had been filled with inequity and injustice. One of them<sup>-asws</sup> will rise after the other, one after another until they<sup>-asws</sup> return to me<sup>-sawww</sup> at the Fountain. They are the witnesses of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> in His<sup>-azwj</sup> earth, and His<sup>-azwj</sup> Proofs over His<sup>-azwj</sup> creatures. The one who obeys them has obeyed Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, and the one who disobeys them<sup>-asws</sup> has disobeyed Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>.”<sup>3</sup>

### Further Ahadith on Ali<sup>-asws</sup> Ibn Abi Talib<sup>-asws</sup> as the First Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:

Below we present Ahadith, which clearly identify Ali<sup>-asws</sup> ibn Abi Talib<sup>-asws</sup> as the first Imam after Rasool Allah<sup>-sawww</sup>:

In a length sermon of Amir ul Momineen<sup>-asws</sup>, when asked for witness, about him<sup>-asws</sup> being declared by Rasool Allah<sup>-sawww</sup> ‘an Imam’, four companions of Rasool Allah<sup>-sawww</sup>, who were present in the battle of Badr, stood up and verified as:

فقام من الاثني عشر أربعة: أبو الهيثم بن التيهان وأبو أيوب الأنصاري وعمار بن ياسر وخزيمة بن ثابت ذو الشهادتين رحمهم الله، فقالوا: نشهد أنا قد سمعنا قول رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وحفظناه أنه قال يومئذ وهو قائم وعلي قائم إلى جنبه. ثم قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله: (يا أيها الناس، إن الله أمرني أن أنصب لكم إماماً ووصياً يكون وصي نبيكم فيكم وخليفتي في أمتي وفي أهل بيتي من بعدي والذي فرض الله على المؤمنين في كتابه طاعته وأمرهم فيه بولايته. فراجعت ربي خشية طعن أهل النفاق وتكذيبهم، فأوعدي لأبلغها أو لبعذبني).

Four out of the twelve stood up – Abu Al-Haysam Bin Al-Tayham, and Abu Ayyub Al-Ansary, and Amaar Bin Yaaser, and Khuzayma Bin Sabit, the one with the two testimonies, may Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> have Mercy of them – so they said, ‘We testify that we have heard the words of the Rasool Allah<sup>-sawww</sup> and we have preserved it that he<sup>-sawww</sup> said, one day, and he<sup>-sawww</sup> was standing, and Ali<sup>-asws</sup> was standing beside him<sup>-sawww</sup>.’

Then the Rasool Allah<sup>-sawww</sup> said: ‘O you people! Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> has Ordered me<sup>-sawww</sup> that I<sup>-sawww</sup> should nominate for you an Imam<sup>-asws</sup> and a successor<sup>-asws</sup> who will be the successor<sup>-asws</sup> of your Prophet<sup>-sawww</sup> among you, and my<sup>-sawww</sup> Caliph in my<sup>-sawww</sup> community, and among the People<sup>-asws</sup> of my<sup>-sawww</sup> Household after me<sup>-sawww</sup>, and the one<sup>-asws</sup> for whom Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> has Obligated upon the believers, in His<sup>-azwj</sup> book, obedience to him<sup>-asws</sup>, and has Ordered to you all in it for his<sup>-asws</sup>’

<sup>3</sup> The Book Of Sulaym Bin Qays Al-Hilali, H. 25, see the complete Hadiht along with the list of narrators:

<https://hubeali.com/kitab-e-sulaym/>

كتاب سليم بن قيس الهلالي، ج2، ص: 763

'Wilayah'. So, I<sup>-saww</sup> referred it back to my<sup>-saww</sup> Lord out of fear of the hypocrites and their belying it, so He<sup>-azwj</sup> Promised me<sup>-saww</sup> that (He<sup>-azwj</sup> will Protect me<sup>-saww</sup>) but if I<sup>-saww</sup> do not preach it, he<sup>-azwj</sup> would Punish me<sup>-saww</sup>' (an extract).<sup>4</sup>

حَدَّثَنَا الشَّيْخُ الْجَلِيلُ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحُسَيْنِ بْنِ مُوسَى بْنِ بَابُوَيْهِ الْقُمِّيُّ رَحِمَهُ اللَّهُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ مَاجِيلَوَيْهِ رَحِمَهُ اللَّهُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عَمِّي مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ أَبِي الْقَاسِمِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ الْكُوفِيِّ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ سِنَانَ عَنِ الْمُفَضَّلِ بْنِ عُمَرَ عَنْ جَابِرِ بْنِ زَيْدٍ عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ الْمُسَيَّبِ عَنْ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ بْنِ سَمُرَةَ قَالَ: قُلْتُ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ أُرْسِدُنِي إِلَى النَّجَاةِ فَقَالَ يَا ابْنَ سَمُرَةَ إِذَا اخْتَلَفَتِ الْأَهْوَاءُ وَ تَفَرَّقَتِ الْأَرَءَاءُ فَعَلَيْكَ بِعَلِيِّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ فَإِنَّهُ إِمَامٌ أُمَّتِي وَ خَلِيفَتِي عَلَيْهِمْ مِنْ بَعْدِي

The great Sheikh Abu Jaafar Muhammad bin Ali bin Al-Hussein bin Musa bin Babawayh Al-Qummi, may Allah have mercy on him, narrated to us. He said: Muhammad bin Ali Majilawayh, may Allah have mercy on him, narrated to us. He said: My uncle Muhammad bin Abi Al-Qasim narrated to us, on the authority of Muhammad bin Ali Al-Kufi, on the authority of Muhammad bin Sinan, on the authority of Al-Mufaddal bin Omar, on the authority of Jabir Ibn Yazid, on the authority of Saeed bin Al-Musayyab, on the authority of Abd Al-Rahman bin Samurah, who said:

I asked, O Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup>, guide me to salvation. He<sup>-saww</sup> said, O Ibn Samurah, when desires differ and opinions are divided, then you should go to Ali<sup>-asws</sup> bin Abi Talib<sup>-asws</sup>, for he<sup>-asws</sup> is the Imam of my<sup>-saww</sup> nation and my<sup>-saww</sup> successor over them after me<sup>-saww</sup> (an extract).<sup>5</sup>

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ ابْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ حَمَّادِ بْنِ عُمَرَ عَنْ جَابِرِ الْعَبْدِيِّ قَالَ قَالَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ( عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام ) إِنَّ اللَّهَ جَعَلَنِي إِمَامًا لِحَلْفِهِ فَفَرَضَ عَلَيَّ التَّقْدِيرَ فِي نَفْسِي وَ مَطْعَمِي وَ مَشْرَبِي وَ مَلْبَسِي كَضَعْفَاءِ النَّاسِ كَيْ يَفْتَدِيَ الْفَقِيرَ بِفَقْرِي وَ لَا يُطْعِيَ الْعَبِيَّ غِنَاهُ .

Muhammad In Yahya, from Ahmad bin Muhammad Bin Isa, from Ibn Mahboub, from Hammad, from Humeiyd and Jabir Al Baghdady who said,

'Amir Al-Momineen<sup>-asws</sup> (Ali<sup>-asws</sup> Ibn Abi Talib<sup>-asws</sup>) said: 'Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Made me<sup>-asws</sup> as an Imam<sup>-asws</sup> for His<sup>-azwj</sup> creatures, so He<sup>-azwj</sup> Necessitated the management upon me<sup>-asws</sup> with regards to myself<sup>-asws</sup> and my<sup>-asws</sup> meals, and my<sup>-asws</sup> drinks, and my<sup>-asws</sup> clothing (to be) like the weak people so that the poor one can follow the example of my<sup>-asws</sup> poverty and the rich one does not transgress by his riches'.<sup>6</sup>

الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ مُعَلَّى بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ جُمهُورٍ عَنْ فَضَالَةَ بْنِ أَيُّوبَ عَنْ مُعَاوِيَةَ بْنِ وَهَبٍ عَنْ ذَرِيحٍ قَالَ سَأَلْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ( عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام ) عَنْ الْأَيْمَةِ بَعْدَ النَّبِيِّ ( صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ ) فَقَالَ كَانَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ( عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام ) إِمَامًا ثُمَّ كَانَ الْحَسَنُ ( عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام ) إِمَامًا ثُمَّ كَانَ الْحُسَيْنُ ( عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام ) إِمَامًا ثُمَّ كَانَ عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ إِمَامًا

Al-Husayn Bin Muhammad, from Muhammad Bin Jamhour, from Fazalat Bin Ayoub, from Muawiya Bin Wahab, from Zareeh who said,

'I asked Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> (Imam Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup>) about the Imams<sup>-asws</sup> after the Prophet<sup>-saww</sup>. So, he<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'Amir Al-Momineen<sup>-asws</sup> was an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, then Al-Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> was an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>,

<sup>4</sup> The Book Of Sulaym Bin Qays Al-Hilali, H. 25, see the complete Hadiht along with the list of narrators: <https://hubeali.com/kitab-e-sulaym/>

<sup>5</sup> Al-Amali (by Al-Saduq), text, p. 26, H. 3, 26: النص، ص:

<sup>6</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Divine Authority CH 106 H 1

and Al-Husayn<sup>-asws</sup> was an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, and Ali<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Al-Husayn<sup>-asws</sup> was an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, and Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Ali<sup>-asws</sup> was an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>.

مَنْ أَنْكَرَ ذَلِكَ كَانَ كَمَنْ أَنْكَرَ مَعْرِفَةَ اللَّهِ تَبَارَكَ وَتَعَالَى وَ مَعْرِفَةَ رَسُولِهِ ( صلى الله عليه وآله )

The one who denies that, he would be like the one who denies the recognition of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Blessed and High, and recognition of His<sup>-azwj</sup> Rasool<sup>-saww</sup>.

ثُمَّ قَالَ قُلْتُ ثُمَّ أَنْتَ جُعِلْتُ فِدَاكَ فَأَعَدُّهَا عَلَيْهِ ثَلَاثَ مَرَّاتٍ فَقَالَ لِي إِنِّي إِذَا حَدَّثْتُكَ لِيَكُونَ مِنْ شُهَدَاءِ اللَّهِ تَبَارَكَ وَتَعَالَى فِي أَرْضِهِ .

Then he (the narrator) said, 'I said, 'Then you<sup>-asws</sup>, may I be sacrificed for you<sup>-asws</sup>!' So I reiterated it upon him<sup>-asws</sup> three times. So he<sup>-asws</sup> said to me: 'I<sup>-asws</sup> rather, narrated to you in order for you to become from the witnesses of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Blessed and High in His<sup>-azwj</sup> earth'.<sup>7</sup>

الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ الْأَشْعَرِيُّ عَنْ مُعَلَّى بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ الْوَشَائِءِ عَنْ أَبِي بَانَ بْنِ عُثْمَانَ عَنْ أَبِي الصَّبَّاحِ قَالَ أَشْهَدُ أَيُّ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ( عليه السلام ) يَقُولُ أَشْهَدُ أَنَّ عَلِيًّا إِمَامًا فَرَضَ اللَّهُ طَاعَتَهُ وَأَنَّ الْحُسَيْنَ إِمَامًا فَرَضَ اللَّهُ طَاعَتَهُ وَأَنَّ عَلِيَّ بْنَ الْحُسَيْنِ إِمَامًا فَرَضَ اللَّهُ طَاعَتَهُ وَأَنَّ مُحَمَّدَ بْنَ عَلِيٍّ إِمَامًا فَرَضَ اللَّهُ طَاعَتَهُ .

Al Husayn Bin Muhammad Al Ashary, from Moalla Bin Muhammad, from Al Hassan Bin Ali Al Washa, from Aban Bin Usman, from Abu Al Sabah who said,

'I bear witness that I heard Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> (Imam Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup>) saying: 'I<sup>-asws</sup> testify that Ali<sup>-asws</sup> is an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Imposed obedience to him<sup>-asws</sup>; and that Al-Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> is an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Imposed obedience to him<sup>-asws</sup>; and that Al-Husayn<sup>-asws</sup> is an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Imposed obedience to him<sup>-asws</sup>; and that Ali<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Al-Husayn<sup>-asws</sup> is an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Imposed obedience to him<sup>-asws</sup>; and that Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Ali<sup>-asws</sup> is an Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Imposed obedience to him<sup>-asws</sup>'.<sup>8</sup>

## Bohra scholar allegation: 2

*"There is no Imamat among 2 brothers after Hazrat Imam Hassan (A.S.) and Hazrat Imam Hussain (A.S.), so Imamat can never go from Hazrat Maulana Ismail (A.S.) to Janabe Musa e Kazim (A.S.) and Kitab As-Safee confirms that Hazrat Imam Jafar as-Sadiq (A.S.) has declared Hazrat Ismail (A.S.) as the next Imam and his successor after him. And Hazrat Imam Ismail (A.S.) and Janabe Musa e Kazim (A.S.) were step brothers."*

## Defence of 12 Imami Shias against allegation: 2

We present the aforementioned Hadith, which not only answers allegation no. 2 but also the first allegation.

حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ بْنِ إِسْحَاقَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ قَالَ أَخْبَرَنَا أَحْمَدُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ الْهُمْدَانِيُّ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ الْحُسَيْنِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ فَضَّالٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ سَالِمٍ قَالَ: قُلْتُ لِلصَّادِقِ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عِ الْحُسَيْنِ أَفْضَلُ أَمْ الْحُسَيْنِ فَقَالَ الْحُسَيْنُ أَفْضَلُ مِنَ الْحُسَيْنِ قَالَ قُلْتُ فَكَيْفَ صَارَتِ الْإِمَامَةُ مِنْ بَعْدِ

<sup>7</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Divine Authority CH 7 H 5

<sup>8</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Divine Authority CH 8 H 2

الْحُسَيْنِ فِي عَقِبِهِ دُونَ وَوُلْدِ الْحَسَنِ فَقَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ تَبَارَكَ وَتَعَالَى أَحَبُّ أَنْ يَجْعَلَ سُنَّةَ مُوسَى وَ هَارُونَ جَارِيَةً فِي الْحَسَنِ وَ الْحُسَيْنِ عَ لَا تَرَى أَنَّهُمَا كَانَا شَرِيكَيْنِ فِي النَّبُوَّةِ كَمَا كَانَ الْحَسَنُ وَ الْحُسَيْنُ شَرِيكَيْنِ فِي الْإِمَامَةِ وَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ جَعَلَ النَّبُوَّةَ فِي وَوُلْدِ هَارُونَ وَ لَمْ يَجْعَلْهَا فِي وَوُلْدِ مُوسَى وَ إِنْ كَانَ مُوسَى أَفْضَلَ مِنْ هَارُونَ عَ فُلْتُ فَهَلْ يَكُونُ إِمَامَانِ فِي وَقْتٍ وَاحِدٍ قَالَ لَا إِلَّا أَنْ يَكُونَ أَحَدُهُمَا صَامِتاً مَأْمُوماً لِصَاحِبِهِ وَ الْآخَرُ نَاطِقاً إِمَاماً لِصَاحِبِهِ فَأَمَّا أَنْ يَكُونَا إِمَامَيْنِ نَاطِقَيْنِ فِي وَقْتٍ وَاحِدٍ فَلَا فُلْتُ فَهَلْ تَكُونُ الْإِمَامَةُ فِي أَخَوَيْنِ بَعْدَ الْحَسَنِ وَ الْحُسَيْنِ عَ قَالَ لَا إِنَّمَا هِيَ جَارِيَةٌ فِي عَقِبِ الْحُسَيْنِ عَ كَمَا قَالَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ جَعَلَهَا كَلِمَةً بَاقِيَةً فِي عَقِبِهِ

Narrated to us Muhammad bin Ibrahim bin Ishaq<sup>ra</sup>: Informed us Ahmad bin Muhammad Hamadani: Narrated to us Ali bin Hassan bin Ali bin Faddal from his father from Hisham bin Saalim that:

*I asked As-Sadiq Ja'far<sup>asws</sup> bin Muhammad<sup>asws</sup>: "Who is superior, Hassan<sup>asws</sup> or Hussain<sup>asws</sup>?" He<sup>asws</sup> replied: "Hassan<sup>asws</sup> is superior to Hussain<sup>asws</sup>." I said: "Then how come the Imam has come in the generations of Hussain<sup>asws</sup> after him<sup>asws</sup>? And not in the generations of Hassan<sup>asws</sup>?"*

The Imam<sup>asws</sup> said: "Allah<sup>azwj</sup>, the Mighty and Sublime Wanted to show the Sunnah of Musa<sup>as</sup> and Harun<sup>as</sup> in Hassan<sup>asws</sup> and Hussain<sup>asws</sup>. Have you not seen that they shared prophethood like Hassan<sup>asws</sup> and Hussain<sup>asws</sup> shared Imam, and Allah<sup>azwj</sup>, the Mighty and Sublime Placed prophethood in the progeny of Harun<sup>as</sup> and not in the progeny of Musa<sup>as</sup>, even though Musa<sup>as</sup> was superior to Harun<sup>as</sup>?"

*I asked: "Would there be two Imams at the same time?" He<sup>asws</sup> replied: "No, except that one of them may be silent and under the command of the other. And the other will be the speaking Imam<sup>asws</sup> for his counterpart. But as to whether there can be two speaking Imams at the same time? No."*

*I asked: "Would Imam be inherited between two brothers after Hassan<sup>asws</sup> and Hussain<sup>asws</sup>?" He<sup>asws</sup> said: "No, it will continue in the progeny of Hussain<sup>asws</sup> like Allah<sup>azwj</sup>, the Mighty and Sublime has said:*

وَ جَعَلَهَا كَلِمَةً بَاقِيَةً فِي عَقِبِهِ

***"And he made it a word to continue in his posterity (43:28)."***

تَمَّ هِيَ جَارِيَةٌ فِي الْأَعْقَابِ وَ أَعْقَابِ الْأَعْقَابِ إِلَى يَوْمِ الْقِيَامَةِ.

"Thus, Imam will continue in his<sup>asws</sup> progeny generation after generation till the Judgment Day."<sup>9</sup>

Here, the Hadith clearly says there will not be two Imams<sup>asws</sup> in command at the same time; if there were then one of them would be a silent one. Hence, Ismail Ibn Jafar<sup>asws</sup> died during the lifetime of Imam Sadiq<sup>asws</sup>, just as Prophet Musa<sup>as</sup>'s successor Harun<sup>as</sup> died during the lifetime of Prophet Musa<sup>as</sup>, so the prophethood was transferred to the children of Harun<sup>as</sup>, but after the death of Prophet Musa<sup>as</sup>.

<sup>9</sup> Kamaaluddin wa Tamaamun Ni'ma, Vol. 2, Chapter 40, Hadith no. 9

Then, several Ahadith and historical accounts confirm that the eldest son of Imam Jafar-e-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> had passed away during the lifetime of the Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, so was never nominated as an Imam and the 6<sup>th</sup> Imam<sup>-asws</sup> continued with his Divine responsibilities, after his death, as an Imam for several years and finally left behind his<sup>-asws</sup> legatee, Musa<sup>-asws</sup> Ibn Jafar<sup>-asws</sup>, as the 7<sup>th</sup> Imam.

So, Ismail Ibn Jafar<sup>-asws</sup> passed away during the life time and Imam of Imam Jafar e Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup>, but some people got confused and followed Iblis, e.g.:

Ismail was the elder son of the 6<sup>th</sup> Imam and it was expected that Ismail would be the next Imam being the elder son but Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Recalled him:

كِتَابُ زَيْدِ النَّرْسِيِّ، عَنْ عُيَيْدِ بْنِ زُرَّارَةَ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ: مَا بَدَأَ لِلَّهِ بَدَأَ أَعْظَمَ مِنْ بَدَأِ لَهُ فِي إِسْمَاعِيلِ ابْنِي.

The book of Zayd Al Narsy – From Ubeyd Bin Zurara,

*From Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> having said: "There has not been any change of Decision for Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> greater than the change of Decision for Him<sup>-azwj</sup> regarding my<sup>-asws</sup> son Ismail."*<sup>10</sup>

أَبُو كَهْمَسٍ فِي حَدِيثِهِ حَضَرْتُ مَوْتَ إِسْمَاعِيلَ وَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع جَالِسٌ عِنْدَهُ ثُمَّ قَالَ بَعْدَ كَلَامٍ كُتِبَ عَلَى حَاشِيَةِ الْكُفَنِ -

إِسْمَاعِيلُ يَشْهَدُ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ.

Abu Kahmas in his Hadeeth,

*Death presented to Ismail, and Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> was seated in his presence. Then he<sup>-asws</sup> said after a speech: "Write upon an edge of the shroud: 'Ismail testifies that there is no god except Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>.'" <sup>11</sup>*

## Imam Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> encouraged his<sup>-asws</sup> companions to perform Hajj on behalf of deceased Ismail

وَ كَانَ الصَّادِقُ ع أَخْبَرَ بَعْدَهُ الْفِتْنَةَ بَعْدَهُ وَ أَظْهَرَ مَوْتَ إِسْمَاعِيلَ وَ غُسْلَهُ وَ تَجْهِيزَهُ وَ دَفْنَهُ وَ تَشَمُّعَ فِي جِنَازَتِهِ بِأَلَا جَدَاءٍ وَ أَمَرَ بِالْحَجِّ عَنْهُ بَعْدَ وَفَاتِهِ.

"And Al-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> informed of this Fitna (to occur) after him<sup>-asws</sup>, and revealed the death of Ismail, and his washing, and his preparation, and his burial, and he<sup>-asws</sup> escorted in his funeral without shoes, and he<sup>-asws</sup> instructed with (performance of) the Hajj on his behalf after his death."<sup>12</sup>

<sup>10</sup> Bihar Al Awaar – V 47, The book of History – Ja'far Al Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup>, Ch 8 H 41

<sup>11</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 47, The book of History – Ja'far Al-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup>, Ch 8 H 24 e

<sup>12</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 47, The book of History – Ja'far Al-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup>, Ch 8 H 24 a

## Imam Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> showed the deceased Ismail to his<sup>-asws</sup> companions

زُرَّارَةُ بْنُ أَعْيَنَ قَالَ: دَعَا الصَّادِقُ ع دَاوُدَ بْنَ كَثِيرِ الرَّحْبِيِّ وَ حُمْرَانَ بْنَ أَعْيَنَ وَ أَبَا بَصِيرٍ وَ دَخَلَ عَلَيْهِ الْمُفَضَّلُ بْنُ عُمَرَ وَ أَتَى بِجَمَاعَةٍ حَتَّى صَارُوا ثَلَاثِينَ رَجُلًا فَقَالَ يَا دَاوُدُ اكشِفْ عَن وَجْهِ إِسْمَاعِيلَ فَكشَفَ عَن وَجْهِهِ فَقَالَ تَأْتَلُهُ يَا دَاوُدُ فَأَنْظُرْهُ أَمْ حَيٌّ هُوَ أَمْ مَيِّتٌ فَقَالَ بَلْ هُوَ مَيِّتٌ

Zurara Bin Ayn who said,

Al-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> called Dawood Bin Kaseer, and Humran Bin Ayn, and Abu Baseer, and Al-Mufazzal Bin Umar entered to see him<sup>-asws</sup>, and he came with a group until they became thirty (30) men. He<sup>-asws</sup> said: “O Dawood! Uncover from the face of (the deceased) Ismail!” So, he uncovered his face. He<sup>-asws</sup> said: “Consider him, O Dawood, and look at him, is he alive or is he dead?” He replied, “But, he is dead.”

فَجَعَلَ يَعْزِضُهُ عَلَى رَجُلٍ رَجُلٍ حَتَّى أَتَى عَلَى آخِرِهِمْ فَقَالَ ع اللَّهُمَّ اشْهَدْ

He<sup>-asws</sup> went on displaying him to man after man until he<sup>-asws</sup> came to their last one. He<sup>-asws</sup> said: “O Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! Be Witness.”

ثُمَّ أَمَرَ بِعُنُقِهِ وَ تَجْهِيزِهِ ثُمَّ قَالَ يَا مُفَضَّلُ احْسِرْ عَن وَجْهِهِ فَحَسَرَ عَن وَجْهِهِ فَقَالَ حَيٌّ هُوَ أَمْ مَيِّتٌ أَنْظُرُوهُ أَجْمَعُكُمْ فَقَالَ بَلْ هُوَ يَا سَيِّدَنَا مَيِّتٌ فَقَالَ شَهِدْتُمْ بِذَلِكَ وَ تَحَقَّقْتُمُوهُ قَالُوا نَعَمْ وَ قَدْ نَعَجَّيْنَا مِنْ فِعْلِهِ فَقَالَ اللَّهُمَّ اشْهَدْ عَلَيْهِمْ

Then he<sup>-asws</sup> instructed with washing him and preparing him. Then he<sup>-asws</sup> said: “O Mufazzal! Uncover from his face!” He uncovered from his face. The Imam<sup>-asws</sup> said: “Is he alive or dead? Look at him, all of you!” He said, “But, he is dead, O our Chief!” He<sup>-asws</sup> said: “Do you testify with that and have verified it?” They said, “Yes!” And they were surprised from his<sup>-asws</sup> deed. He<sup>-asws</sup> said: “O Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! Be Witness upon them.”

ثُمَّ حُمِلَ إِلَى قَبْرِهِ فَلَمَّا وُضِعَ فِي لَحْدِهِ قَالَ يَا مُفَضَّلُ اكشِفْ عَن وَجْهِهِ فَكشَفَ فَقَالَ لِلْجَمَاعَةِ انظُرُوا أَمْ حَيٌّ هُوَ أَمْ مَيِّتٌ فَقَالُوا بَلَى مَيِّتٌ يَا وَلِيَّ اللَّهِ فَقَالَ اللَّهُمَّ اشْهَدْ فَإِنَّهُ سَيَرْتَابُ الْمُبْطُلُونَ يُرِيدُونَ إِطْفَاءَ نُورِ اللَّهِ

Then he was carried to his grave. When he was placed in his sepulchre, the Imam<sup>-asws</sup> said: “O Mufazzal! Uncover from his face!” He uncovered. He<sup>-asws</sup> said to the gathering: “Look! Is he alive or dead?” They said, “But, he is dead, O friend of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>!” He<sup>-asws</sup> said; “O Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! Be Witness, for they will soon be suspicious, nullifying, intending to extinguish the Noor of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>!”

ثُمَّ أَوْمَأَ إِلَى مُوسَى ع وَ قَالَ- وَ اللَّهُ مُبِينٌ نُورِهِ وَ لَوْ كَرِهَ الْكَافِرُونَ ثُمَّ حَنَوْا عَلَيْهِ الرَّابَّ ثُمَّ أَعَادَ عَلَيْنَا الْقَوْلَ فَقَالَ الْمَيِّتُ الْمُكَنَّسُ الْمُحْتَضُّ الْمَدْفُونُ فِي هَذَا اللَّحْدِ مَنْ هُوَ قُلْنَا إِسْمَاعِيلُ وَ لَدُّكَ

Then he<sup>-asws</sup> gestured to Musa<sup>-asws</sup> and said: **“and Allah will Complete His Light, and even if the Kafirs abhor it [61:8].”** Then they poured the soil upon him. Then he<sup>-asws</sup> repeated the words to us. He (Al-Mufazzal) said: “The deceased, the enshrouded, the embalmed, the buried in this sepulchre is one whom we say ‘Ismail’, your<sup>-asws</sup> son.”

فَقَالَ اللَّهُمَّ اشْهَدْ ثُمَّ أَحَدَ يَبِيدَ مُوسَى فَقَالَ هُوَ حَقٌّ وَ الْحَقُّ مَعَهُ وَ مِنْهُ إِلَى أَنْ يَرِثَ اللَّهُ الْأَرْضَ وَ مَنْ عَلَيْهَا.

He<sup>-asws</sup> said: “O Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! Be Witness.” Then he<sup>-asws</sup> held a hand of Musa<sup>-asws</sup> and said: “He<sup>-asws</sup> is truth and the truth is with him<sup>-asws</sup>, and from him<sup>-asws</sup>, until Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Causes the earth to be inherited and the ones upon it.”<sup>13</sup>

### Imam Jafar<sup>-asws</sup>'s reactions upon receiving the news of the death of Ismail:

عيون أخبار الرضا عليه السلام المُفَسِّرُ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ الْحَسَنِ الْحُسَيْنِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ مُوسَى بْنِ جَعْفَرٍ ع قَالَ: نَعِيَ إِلَى الصَّادِقِ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ ع ابْنُهُ إِسْمَاعِيلُ بْنُ جَعْفَرٍ وَهُوَ أَكْبَرُ أَوْلَادِهِ وَهُوَ يُرِيدُ أَنْ يَأْكُلَ وَ قَدْ اجْتَمَعَ ثُدْمَاؤُهُ فَتَبَسَّمَ ثُمَّ دَعَا بِطَعَامِهِ وَ قَعَدَ مَعَ ثُدْمَائِهِ وَ جَعَلَ يَأْكُلُ أَحْسَنَ مِنْ أَكْلِهِ سَائِرِ الْأَيَّامِ وَ يَحْتُ ثُدْمَاءَهُ وَ يَضَعُ بَيْنَ أَيْدِيهِمْ وَ يَعْجَبُونَ مِنْهُ أَنْ لَا يَرَوْا لِلْحُزْنِ أَثَرًا

(The book) ‘Uyoon Akhbar Al-Reza<sup>-asws</sup>) – Al Mufasssir, from Ahmad Bin Al-Hassan Al-Husayni, from Abu Muhammad, from his forefathers,

Musa<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Ja’far<sup>-asws</sup> having said: The news of death was given to Al-Sadiq Ja’far<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup>, of his<sup>-asws</sup> son Ismail son of Ja’far<sup>-asws</sup>, and he was eldest of his<sup>-asws</sup> children. (The Imam<sup>-asws</sup>) wanted to eat, and his<sup>-asws</sup> regretting ones had gathered. He<sup>-asws</sup> smiled and called for his<sup>-asws</sup> meal and sat with his<sup>-asws</sup> regretting ones, and went on to eat, better than his<sup>-asws</sup> eating in the rest of his<sup>-asws</sup> days, and he<sup>-asws</sup> went on to urge his<sup>-asws</sup> regretting ones and place (the food) in front of them, and they were astounded from him<sup>-asws</sup> that they could not see any traces of grief.

فَلَمَّا فَرَعُوا قَالُوا يَا ابْنَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ لَقَدْ رَأَيْنَا عَجَبًا أَصِيبَتْ بِمِثْلِ هَذَا الْإِنْسَانِ وَأَنْتَ كَمَا نَرَى

When he<sup>-asws</sup> was free, they said, “O son<sup>-asws</sup> of Rasool-Allah<sup>-saww</sup>! We have seen (something) strange. You<sup>-asws</sup> are afflicted by the like of this, with the son, and you<sup>-asws</sup> are like what we see?”

قَالَ وَمَا لِي لَا أَكُونُ كَمَا تَرَوْنَ وَ قَدْ جَاءَنِي خَيْرُ أَصْدَقِي الصَّادِقِينَ أَبِي مَيْثٍ وَ إِيَّاكُمْ-

He<sup>-asws</sup> said; “And what is it to me<sup>-asws</sup> that I<sup>-asws</sup> should not be like what you are seeing, and news has come to me<sup>-asws</sup> from the most Truthful of the truthful ones that I<sup>-asws</sup> and you all would be dying?

إِنَّ قَوْمًا عَرَفُوا الْمَوْتَ فَجَعَلُوهُ نُصَبَ أَعْيُنِهِمْ وَ لَمْ يُنْكِرُوا مَنْ تَخَطَّفَهُ الْمَوْتُ مِنْهُمْ- وَ سَلَّمُوا لِأَمْرِ خَالِقِهِمْ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ.

“(Those) who recognise the death, they make it to be installed in their eyes, and they do not dislike the one from them whom the death takes away, and they submit to the Command of their Creator Mighty and Majestic.”<sup>14</sup>

<sup>13</sup> Bihar Al Awaar – V 46, The book of History – Ja’far Al Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup>, Ch 8 H 24 c

<sup>14</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 47, The book of History – Ja’far Al-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup>, Ch 4 H 7

**6th Imam<sup>-asws</sup> reveals who will be the next Imam:**

الإختصاص ير، بصائر الدرجات مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ الْجُبَّارِ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْبَرْقِيِّ عَنْ فَضَالَةَ عَنْ مَسْمَعٍ كَزَيْدِينَ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ: دَخَلْتُ عَلَيْهِ وَعِنْدَهُ إِسْمَاعِيلُ قَالَ وَنَحْنُ إِذْ ذَاكَ نَأْتُمُّ بِهِ بَعْدَ أَبِيهِ

(The books) ‘Al Ikhtisaas’, (and) ‘Basaair Al Darajaat’ – Muhammad Bin Abdul Jabbar, from Abu Abdullah al Barqy, from Fazalat, from Misma’a Kirdeyn, from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup>:

“I (the narrator) entered to see him<sup>-asws</sup> (Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup>) and in his<sup>-asws</sup> presence was Ismail, and whenever it was that, we used to follow him after his<sup>-asws</sup> father.”

فَدَكَرَ فِي حَدِيثِ طَوِيلٍ أَنَّهُ سَمِعَ رَجُلًا أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع خِلَافَ مَا ظَنَّ فِيهِ قَالَ فَاتَيْتُ رَجُلَيْنِ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْكُوفَةِ كَانَا يُقُولَانِ بِهِ فَأَخْبَرْتُهُمَا فَقَالَ وَاحِدٌ مِنْهُمَا سَمِعْتُ وَأَطَعْتُ وَرَضِيْتُ وَسَلَّمْتُ وَقَالَ الْآخَرُ وَ أَهْوَى يَبْدُو إِلَى جَنِبِهِ فَشَفَّهْتُ ثُمَّ قَالَ لَا وَاللَّهِ لَا سَمِعْتُ وَلَا أَطَعْتُ وَلَا رَضِيْتُ حَتَّى أَسْمَعَهُ مِنْهُ

He (the narrator) mentioned in a lengthy Hadeeth: “I came to two men from the people of Al-Kufa who were saying with it and informed them. One of them said, ‘I hear and I obey, and am pleased and submit.’ And the other on— and he gestured by his hand towards his pocket and tore it – then said, ‘No, by Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! I will not listen, nor obey, nor am pleased until I hear it from him<sup>-asws</sup> (directly).’

ثُمَّ قَالَ حَرَجَ مُتَوَجِّهًا إِلَى أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ وَ تَبِعْتُهُ فَلَمَّا كُنَّا بِالْبَابِ فَاسْتَأْذَنَّا فَأُذِنَ لِي فَدَخَلْتُ قَبْلَهُ ثُمَّ أُذِنَ لَهُ فَدَخَلَ فَلَمَّا دَخَلَ قَالَ لَهُ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع يَا فُلَانُ أ تَرِيدُ كُلُّ امْرِئٍ مِنْكُمْ أَنْ يُؤْتِيَ صُحُفًا مُنَشَّرَةً إِنَّ الَّذِي أَخْبَرَكَ بِهِ فُلَانٌ الْحَقُّ

“Then he went out heading to Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup>, and I followed him. When we were at the door, we sought permission. He<sup>-asws</sup> permitted for me and I entered before he did. Then he<sup>-asws</sup> permitted for him, so he entered. When he entered, Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> said to him: ‘O so and so! Does every person from you **wants to be Given pages spread out [74:52]**? That which I<sup>-asws</sup> informed so and so with is the truth.’

قَالَ جُعِلْتُ فِدَاكَ إِنِّي أَشْتَهِي أَنْ أَسْمَعَهُ مِنْكَ قَالَ إِنَّ فُلَانًا إِيمَانُكَ وَ صَاحِبُكَ مِنْ بَعْدِي يَعْنِي أَبَا الْحُسَيْنِ ع فَلَا يَدَّعِيهَا فِيمَا بَيْنِي وَ بَيْنَهُ إِلَّا كَاذِبٌ مُفْتَرٍ

“He said, ‘May I be sacrificed for you<sup>-asws</sup>! I desired to hear it from you<sup>-asws</sup> (directly).’ He<sup>-asws</sup> said: ‘So and so is your Imam<sup>-asws</sup> and your Master<sup>-asws</sup> from after me<sup>-asws</sup> – meaning Abu Al-Hassan<sup>-asws</sup>. Nobody (else) would claim it between me<sup>-asws</sup> and him<sup>-asws</sup> except a liar.’

فَأَلْتَقَتْ إِلَيَّ الْكُوفِيُّ وَ كَانَ يُحْسِنُ كَلَامَ النَّبَطِيَّةِ وَ كَانَ صَاحِبَ قَبَالَاتٍ فَقَالَ لِي دَرَفَهُ فَقَالَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع إِنَّ دَرَفَهُ بِالنَّبَطِيَّةِ خُذْهَا أَجَلْ فَخُذْهَا فَخَرَجْنَا مِنْ عِنْدِهِ.

“Al-Kufy turned to me, and he was good in the Nabatean speech, and he was a chief of the tribes. He said to me, ‘Darfah’ (in Nabatean). Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> said: ‘In the Nabatean (language) ‘Darfah’ (means) ‘Take it.’ Yes, so take it.’ We went out from his<sup>-asws</sup> presence.”<sup>15</sup>

Finally, as Muslims refused to obey Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup> regarding Imam Ali<sup>-asws</sup>, so similarly, some Shias refused to listen to the 6<sup>th</sup> Imam<sup>-asws</sup> regarding the death of Ismail Ibn Jafar<sup>-asws</sup>

<sup>15</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 47, The book of History – Ja’far Al-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup>, Ch 5 H 72

and the succession of Musa<sup>-asws</sup> Ibn Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> as the 7<sup>th</sup> Imam. In addition, all Imams, in particular from Imam Musa<sup>-asws</sup> to the 11<sup>th</sup> Imam, showed their knowledge, miracles, numerous debates against scholars of various religions in the courts of Abbasid caliphs as well as in public - even performing perfect skills of archery upon demand of a caliph. Sadly, all of them<sup>-asws</sup> were deviously poisoned, by the Abbasid rulers upon becoming afraid of their<sup>-asws</sup> popularity due to their charismatic personalities and Divine Virtues.

### Bohra scholar allegation: 3

*“There is a famous Hadees of the Holy Prophet Hazrat Mohammed (S.A.W.W) about Hazrat Imam Mehdi (A.S.) that ‘his name is my name and his father’s name is my father’s name.’ It clearly guides that the last Imam, Hazrat Maulana Mehdi (A.S.)’s name would be the Prophet’s name and his father’s name would be the Prophet’s father’s name. So, it is as clear as crystal that Hazrat Mehdi (A.S.)’s name would be Mohammed Bin Abdullah (A.S.)*

*“However it is quite strange that the 12th Imam of Ithna Asharee Firqa, who is being waited for as the Mehdi, is Janabe Mohammed Bin Hasan Askari.”*

### Defence of 12 Imami Shias against allegation: 3

There is no such Hadith in 12 Imami Ahadith books which says, “his father’s name is my father’s name,” – the Hadith is as below (we reproduce this Hadith from Hadith number 3, in the first reply):

اسمه كاسمي وطنيته كطينتي

“His<sup>-asws</sup> name is like my<sup>-saww</sup> name and his<sup>-asws</sup> clay (Teenat) is like my<sup>-saww</sup> Teenat.”<sup>16</sup>

### Bohra scholar allegation: 4

*In this allegation, it is basically said (see Appendix I) that Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> does not change His Decision, quoting the Holy Quran:*

فَلَنْ تَجِدَ لِسُنَّةِ اللَّهِ تَبْدِيلًا وَلَنْ تَجِدَ لِسُنَّةِ اللَّهِ تَحْوِيلًا {35:43}

***“You will never find a replacement in the Sunnah of Allah, and you will never find an alteration in the Sunnah of Allah [35:43]”***

<sup>16</sup> The Book Of Sulaym Bin Qays Al-Hilali, H. 25, see the complete Hadiht along with the list of narrators: <https://hubeali.com/kitab-e-sulaym/>

## Defence of 12 Imami Shias against allegation: 4

### **Badā' – Moving Forward or delaying**

Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> is Wise and Does whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> Likes - without being unjust. Here, we review the concept of 'Badā'' in the light of Holy Verses of Quran and Ahadith of Masomeen<sup>-asws</sup>.

يَمْخُو اللَّهُ مَا يَشَاءُ وَيُثَبِّتُ ۖ وَعِنْدَهُ أُمُّ الْكِتَابِ {39}

***“Allah Deletes and Affirms whatever He so Desires to, and with Him is the Mother of the Book [13:39]”***

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِسْمَاعِيلَ عَنِ الْفَضْلِ بْنِ شَاذَانَ عَنْ حَمَّادِ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ رَبِيعِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنِ الْفَضْلِ بْنِ يَسَارٍ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا جَعْفَرٍ ( عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام ) يَقُولُ الْعِلْمُ عِلْمَانِ فَعِلْمٌ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ مَخْزُونٌ لَمْ يُطْلِعْ عَلَيْهِ أَحَدًا مِنْ خَلْقِهِ وَ عِلْمٌ عِلْمُهُ مَلَائِكَتُهُ وَ رُسُلُهُ

Mohammed Bin Ismail, from Al Fazl Bin Shazaqn, from Hammad Bin Isa, from Rabie Bin Abdullah, from Al Fuzayl Bin Yasaar who said,

*I heard Abu Ja'far<sup>-asws</sup> saying: “The Knowledge is of (two types of) knowledge – A Knowledge Treasured with Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, not having Notified to anyone from His<sup>-azwj</sup> creatures, and a Knowledge He<sup>-azwj</sup> Taught His<sup>-azwj</sup> Angels, and His<sup>-azwj</sup> Rasools<sup>-as</sup>.*

فَمَا عِلْمُهُ مَلَائِكَتُهُ وَ رُسُلُهُ فَإِنَّهُ سَيَكُونُ لَا يُكْدِبُ نَفْسَهُ وَ لَا مَلَائِكَتَهُ وَ لَا رُسُلَهُ وَ عِلْمٌ عِنْدَهُ مَخْزُونٌ يُعَدِّمُ مِنْهُ مَا يَشَاءُ وَ يُؤَخِّرُ مِنْهُ مَا يَشَاءُ وَ يُثَبِّتُ مَا يَشَاءُ .

*“So, as for what He<sup>-azwj</sup> Taught His<sup>-azwj</sup> Angels and His<sup>-azwj</sup> Rasools<sup>-as</sup>, so it is going to happen. Neither did He<sup>-azwj</sup> Lie Himself<sup>-azwj</sup>, nor did His<sup>-azwj</sup> Angels, nor did His<sup>-azwj</sup> Rasools<sup>-as</sup>.*

**“And the Knowledge which is Treasured with Him<sup>-azwj</sup>, He<sup>-azwj</sup> Brings forwards from it whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Desires to, and Delays from it whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Desires to, and He<sup>-azwj</sup> Affirms whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Desires to.”<sup>17</sup>**

عَلِيِّ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ سَالِمٍ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ مُسْلِمٍ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ( عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام ) قَالَ مَا بَعَثَ اللَّهُ نَبِيًّا حَتَّى يَأْخُذَ عَلَيْهِ ثَلَاثَ خِصَالٍ الْإِقْرَارَ لَهُ بِالْعُبُودِيَّةِ وَ خَلْعَ الْأَنْدَادِ وَ أَنَّ اللَّهَ يُعَدِّمُ مَا يَشَاءُ وَ يُؤَخِّرُ مَا يَشَاءُ .

Ali, from his father, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Hisham Bin Salim, from Mohammed Bin Muslim,

*Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> has said: “Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> did not Send a Prophet<sup>-as</sup> until He<sup>-azwj</sup> Took three characteristics to be upon him<sup>-as</sup> – The acknowledgement to Him<sup>-azwj</sup> of His<sup>-azwj</sup> Lordship, and Keeping away from the idols, and that Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Brings forwards whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Desires to, and Delays whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Desires to.”<sup>18</sup>*

<sup>17</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 6

<sup>18</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 3

## The Concept of *Badā'*

Hence, the concept of *Badā'*, which is moving forward or delaying matters as per change of decision (*Badā'*) by Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>. It is important to understand that Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> never breaks promises (see Appendix II) but applies *Badā'*.

But why would Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Apply *Badā'*? Its basic purpose is to test the state of the hearts of people – so that believers are separated from non-believers.

## When 10 Days were added during the Time of Prophet Musa<sup>-as</sup>

وَوَاعَدْنَا مُوسَىٰ ثَلَاثِينَ لَيْلَةً وَأَتَمَمْنَاهَا بِعَشْرِ فِتْمٍ مِّمَّاتٍ رَبِّهِ أَرْبَعِينَ لَيْلَةً ۚ وَقَالَ مُوسَىٰ لِأَخِيهِ هَارُونَ اخْلُفْنِي فِي قَوْمِي وَأَصْلِحْ وَلَا تَتَّبِعْ سَبِيلَ الْمُفْسِدِينَ  
{142}

**“And We Appointed thirty nights for Musa and Completed it with ten (more), so the complete time with his Lord was of forty nights. And Musa said to his brother Haroun: ‘Be my Caliph among my people and be righteous, and do not follow the way of the mischief makers. [7:142]’”**

There was a trial for the followers of Prophet Musa<sup>-as</sup>, whether they will remain patient or disbelieve! So, most of them disbelieved; see for example, the following Hadith:

عن الفضيل بن يسار، عن أبي جعفر (عليه السلام)، قال: «إن موسى لما خرج وافدا إلى ربه واعد لهم ثلاثين يوما، فلما زاد الله على الثلاثين عشرا قال قومه: أخلفنا موسى. فصنعوا ما صنعوا».

From Al Fazeyl Bin Yasaar, from,

*Abu Ja'far<sup>-asws</sup> having said: “Musa<sup>-as</sup>, when he<sup>-as</sup> went out to his<sup>-as</sup> Lord<sup>-azwj</sup>, promised them (his people) thirty days. So when Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Increased thirty by ten, his<sup>-as</sup> people said, ‘Musa<sup>-as</sup> has left us behind (abandoned us)!’ So they made what they made.”<sup>19</sup>*

Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Wisdom behind the change in the length of appointment was only known afterwards, meanwhile the people took to disbelief:

وَإِذْ وَاَعَدْنَا مُوسَىٰ أَرْبَعِينَ لَيْلَةً ثُمَّ اتَّخَذْتُمُ الْعِجْلَ مِنْ بَعْدِهِ وَأَنْتُمْ ظَالِمُونَ {51}

**“And when We Promised Musa forty nights, then you took the calf from after it and you were unjust. [2:51]”**

The change, from thirty nights to forty nights, does not reflect a change in Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Knowledge, but rather a change in the knowledge that Moses possessed. See, for example a Hadith:

<sup>19</sup> تفسير العياشي 2: 71 / 26.

قَالَ الْإِمَامُ ع: كَانَ مُوسَى بْنُ عِمْرَانَ ع يَقُولُ لِبَنِي إِسْرَائِيلَ: إِذَا فَرَّجَ اللَّهُ عَنْكُمْ وَأَهْلَكَ أَعْدَاءَكُمْ - آتَيْكُمْ بِكِتَابٍ مِنْ رَبِّكُمْ، يَشْتَمِلُ عَلَى أَوْامِرِهِ وَنَوَاهِيهِ وَمَوَاعِظِهِ وَعِبْرِهِ وَأَمْثَالِهِ.

*The Imam (Hassan Al-Askari<sup>asws</sup>) said: "It was so that Musa<sup>as</sup> Bin Imran<sup>as</sup> was saying to the Children of Israel: 'When Allah<sup>azwj</sup> has Relieved you and Destroyed your enemies, I<sup>as</sup> shall come to you with a Book from your Lord<sup>azwj</sup> including His<sup>azwj</sup> Commands and His<sup>azwj</sup> Prohibition, and His<sup>azwj</sup> Exhortations, and His<sup>azwj</sup> Lessons, and His<sup>azwj</sup> Examples.'*

فَلَمَّا فَرَّجَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى عَنْهُمْ، أَمَرَهُ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ أَنْ يَأْتِيَ لِلْمِيعَادِ، وَ يَصُومَ ثَلَاثِينَ يَوْمًا عِنْدَ أَصْلِ الْجَبَلِ، وَ ظَنَّ مُوسَى أَنَّهُ بَعْدَ ذَلِكَ يُعْطِيهِ الْكِتَابَ.

"So when Allah<sup>azwj</sup> had relieved from them, Allah<sup>azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic Commanded him<sup>as</sup> that he<sup>as</sup> should come to the appointed (time and place), and he<sup>as</sup> should Fast for thirty days at the base of the mountain, and Musa<sup>as</sup> thought that after that, He<sup>azwj</sup> would Give him<sup>as</sup> the Book.

فَصَامَ مُوسَى ثَلَاثِينَ يَوْمًا [عِنْدَ أَصْلِ الْجَبَلِ] فَلَمَّا كَانَ فِي آخِرِ الْأَيَّامِ اسْتَأْذَنَ قَبْلَ الْفِطْرِ فَأَوْحَى اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ [إِلَيْهِ] يَا مُوسَى أَمَا عَلِمْتَ أَنَّ خُلُوفَ فَمِ الصَّائِمِ أَطْيَبُ عِنْدِي مِنْ رِيحِ الْمِسْكِ صُمَّ عَشْرًا أُخَرَ وَ لَا تَسْتَنَّكَ عِنْدَ الْإِفْطَارِ. فَفَعَلَ ذَلِكَ مُوسَى ع.

"So Musa<sup>as</sup> Fasted for thirty days, at the base of the mountain. So, when it was during the last of the days, he<sup>as</sup> brushed his<sup>as</sup> teeth before the breaking of the Fast. So Allah<sup>azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic Revealed unto him<sup>as</sup>: 'O Musa<sup>as</sup>! But, do you<sup>as</sup> not know that the breath of the mouth of a fasting one is more aromatic in My<sup>azwj</sup> Presence than the smell of musk? Fast for another ten days, and do not brush your<sup>as</sup> teeth during the breaking of the Fast.' So, Musa<sup>as</sup> did that.

وَ كَانَ وَعَدَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ أَنْ يُعْطِيَهُ الْكِتَابَ بَعْدَ أَنْ يَصُومَ ثَلَاثِينَ يَوْمًا، فَأَعْطَاهُ إِيَّاهُ. فَجَاءَ السَّامِرِيُّ فَشَبَّهَ عَلَى مُسْتَضْعَفِي بَنِي إِسْرَائِيلَ.

"And Allah<sup>azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic has Promised that He<sup>azwj</sup> would Give him<sup>as</sup> the Book after forty nights, so He<sup>azwj</sup> Gave it to him<sup>as</sup>." (an extract).<sup>20</sup>

### During the life of Rasool Allah<sup>saww</sup>

The Muslims initially faced Jerusalem during their prayers, up until 17 months after the Hijra. Thereafter, Rasool Allah<sup>saww</sup> was commanded to change the direction of prayers (Qiblah) towards the Ka'bah (in Makka). The wisdom behind the change was also mentioned in the Quran:

سَيَقُولُ السُّفَهَاءُ مِنَ النَّاسِ مَا وَلَّاهُمْ عَنْ قِبَلَتِهِمُ الَّتِي كَانُوا عَلَيْهَا ؕ قُلْ لِلَّهِ الْمَشْرِقُ وَالْمَغْرِبُ ؕ يَهْدِي مَنْ يَشَاءُ إِلَى صِرَاطٍ مُسْتَقِيمٍ  
 {142}

<sup>20</sup> Tafseer Imam Hassan Al Askari<sup>asws</sup> – S 122

***“The fools among the people will be saying: ‘What has turned them away from their Qiblah which they were upon?’ Say: ‘For Allah is the East and the West; He Guides the one He so Desires to, to the Straight Path. [2:142]”***

وَمَا جَعَلْنَا الْقِبْلَةَ الَّتِي كُنْتَ عَلَيْهَا إِلَّا لِنَعْلَمَ مَنْ يَتَّبِعُ الرَّسُولَ مِمَّنْ يَنْقَلِبُ عَلَيَّ عَقْبَيْهِ... {143}

***“And We did not Make the Qiblah which you were upon except for Us to Know who follows the Rasool from the one turns upon his heels (from Eman). [2:143]”***

The change once again reflects only a difference in the knowledge of Human beings.

### **Badā’ with respect to Imāmate**

Here, the Eman of the followers of the Ahl Al-Bayt<sup>asws</sup> was tested by the death of Ismail Ibn Jafar<sup>asws</sup> (the elder son of 6<sup>th</sup> Imam).

عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ إِسْحَاقَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ أَبِي هَاشِمٍ الْجَعْفَرِيِّ قَالَ كُنْتُ عِنْدَ أَبِي الْحَسَنِ (عليه السلام) بَعْدَ مَا مَضَى ابْنُهُ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ وَإِنِّي لَأُفَكِّرُ فِي نَفْسِي أُرِيدُ أَنْ أَقُولَ كَأَمَّهْمَا أَعْنِي أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ وَأَبَا مُحَمَّدٍ فِي هَذَا الْوَقْتِ كَأَبِي الْحَسَنِ مُوسَى وَ إِسْمَاعِيلَ ابْنِي جَعْفَرٍ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ (عليه السلام) وَإِنَّ قِصَّتَهُمَا كَقِصَّتِهِمَا إِذْ كَانَ أَبُو مُحَمَّدٍ الْمُرَجَى بَعْدَ أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ (عليه السلام)

Ali Bin Mohammed, from Is’haq Bin Mohammed, from Abu Hashim Al Ja’fary who said,

*The narrator says: “I was in the presence of Abu Al-Hassan<sup>asws</sup> (the 10<sup>th</sup> Imam) after the passing away of his<sup>asws</sup> son Abu Ja’far (Al-Syed Mohammed)<sup>21</sup>, and I was thinking within myself intending that I should be saying, ‘It is as if these two, meaning Abu Ja’far and Abu Muhammad<sup>asws</sup> (11<sup>th</sup> Imam), at this time, are like Abu Al-Hassan Musa<sup>asws</sup> (7<sup>th</sup> Imam) and Ismail, the two sons of Ja’far<sup>asws</sup> Bin Muhammad<sup>asws</sup> and that both their stories are like both their stories, whether it would be Abu Muhammad<sup>asws</sup> as the appointee after Abu Ja’far<sup>asws</sup>.’*

فَأَقْبَلَ عَلَيَّ أَبُو الْحَسَنِ قَبْلَ أَنْ أَنْطِقَ فَقَالَ نَعَمْ يَا أَبَا هَاشِمٍ بَدَأَ اللَّهُ فِي أَبِي مُحَمَّدٍ بَعْدَ أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ (عليه السلام) مَا لَمْ يَكُنْ يُعْرَفُ لَهُ كَمَا بَدَأَ لَهُ فِي مُوسَى بَعْدَ مُضِيِّ إِسْمَاعِيلَ مَا كَشَفَ بِهِ عَنْ خَالِهِ وَ هُوَ كَمَا حَدَّثْتَنِي نَفْسُكَ وَ إِنَّ كَرَهُ الْمُطْبُوعُونَ وَ أَبُو مُحَمَّدٍ ابْنِي الْخَلْفِ مِنْ بَعْدِي عِنْدَهُ عِلْمٌ مَا يُخْتَانُجُ إِلَيْهِ وَ مَعَهُ آلَةُ الْإِمَامَةِ .

***“So Abu Al-Hassan<sup>asws</sup> turned towards me before I could speak, and he<sup>asws</sup> said: ‘Yes, O Abu Hashim! There is a Change in Allah<sup>azwj</sup>’s Decision regarding Abu Mohammed being after Abu Ja’far<sup>asws</sup> what did not happen to be a recognition for him, just as there was a Change in Allah<sup>azwj</sup>’s Decision for Him<sup>azwj</sup> regarding Musa<sup>as</sup> after the passing away of Ismail, what was uncovered with it from his state, and it is just as you narrated to yourself, and even though the falsifiers may dislike it. And it would be Abu Muhammad<sup>asws</sup>, my<sup>asws</sup> son<sup>asws</sup>, as the Caliph after me<sup>asws</sup>. With him<sup>asws</sup> is the knowledge of whatever is needed to, and with him<sup>asws</sup> are the Signs of the Imamate.”<sup>22</sup>***

<sup>21</sup> Abu Ja’far Muhammad<sup>asws</sup> ibn Abu Al-Hassan<sup>asws</sup> (10<sup>th</sup> Imam), is the eldest son of the Abu Al-Hassan<sup>asws</sup> (10<sup>th</sup> Imam). He died before his father (230/845 - 252/866). His shrine is near Balad (near Baghdad) and the place is now known as Al-Syed Muhammad<sup>as</sup>.

<sup>22</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Divine Authority CH 75 H 10

Here, in the above Hadith, the Badā' seems to be in recall of the elder sons of the 6<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, however, the Ismailis<sup>23</sup> did not agree with it and insisted that Ismail-as was their 6<sup>th</sup> Imam (as they don't count Imam Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> as a permanent Imam). We have compiled separate replies on their beliefs, see below:

[https://hubeali.com/articles/Ismailis Allegations against 12ImamiShias OurReply.pdf](https://hubeali.com/articles/Ismailis%20Allegations%20against%2012ImamiShias%20OurReply.pdf)

[https://hubeali.com/articles/Ismailis Allegations against 12ImamiShias OurReply-II.pdf](https://hubeali.com/articles/Ismailis%20Allegations%20against%2012ImamiShias%20OurReply-II.pdf)

Further Ahadith on Badā' from Al-Kafi, are presented in Appendix III.

## Appendix I: The original text of the Allegation of a Bohra Scholar

MARIA BAHEN

*Assalamo Alaikoom*

*Tell those BOHRAS who have crossed to ITHANA ASHAREE FIRQA the following 2 HADEES from the BOOK OF ITHNA ASHAREES*

*"Assafee"*

*(1) AL HASSNO (A.S.) WAL HUSENO ( A.S.) SAYYEDA SHABABE AHLIL JANNA WA ABUHOMA AFZALO MIN HUMA*

*Translation*

*HAZRAT IMAM HASSAN (A.S.) And HAZRAT IMAM HUSEN (A.S.) are the chief of all youths in paradise and their father (Hazrat ALI MAULAE KAENAT A.S. is BETTER than both of them*

*So ITHNA ASHAREE FIRQA can not include HAZRAT ALI A.S. IN LIST OF 12 IMAM*

*Hazrat ALI A.S. are better than both IMAM A .S. because Hazrat Ali a.s. Is WASI ( vicegerent)*

*Of HUZUR Hazrat MOHAMMED SAWWW and foundation of IMAMAT.*

*So His (a.s.) position is better than that OF IMAM ( A S.)*

*In ither words HAZRAT ALI A .S. is MANGING DIRECTOR and AAP S.A. Can not be included in list of other IMAM A .S.*

*His position can not be be lowered to complete 12 IMAMS .*

*Therefore if we exclude*

*Hazrat ALI A .S From the list of 12 IMAMS, the total is only 11 IMAMS*

*(2) THE OTHET HADEES OF HUZUR HAZRAT MOHAMMED SAWWW says as under ( it is narrated*

---

<sup>23</sup> A Muslim sect which believe in Imam Jafar Sadiq<sup>asws</sup> and then his son Ismail<sup>as</sup> as the next imam.

*In ITHNA ASHAREE book AS SAFEER*

*“ LA IMAMATA LIL*

*AKHAWAIN BADA HASSAN ( a.s. )WAL*

*HUSEN ( a.s.)*

*Translation*

*There is no IMAMAT among 2 brothers. After Hazrat IMAM*

*HASSAN ( a.s.) and Hazrat IMAM*

*HUSEN ( A.S.) So IMAMAT can never go from Hazrat MAULANA ISMAIL ( A S) to j Janab no MUSA KAZIM*

*AND kitab AS SAFEER confirms that HAZRAT IMAM JAFARUS SADIQ ( A.S.) Has declared HAZRAT ISMAIL ( A.S) as next IMAM and his successor after him*

*And Hazrat IMAM ISMAIL ( A.S.) And JANAB MUSAKAZIM were step brothers*

*(3) There is a famous HADEES of HUZUR THE HOLY PROPHET HAZRAT MOHAMMED SAWWW abou Hazrat IMAM MEHDEE (A S) that his name is my name and his father's name is my father's name*

*It clearly guides that*

*The last IMAM Hazrat MAULANA MHDEE A.S.*

*name would be my name and his father's name would be my father's name*

*So it is as clear as crystal that HAZRAT MEHDEE(A.S.) name would be MOHAMMED BIN ABDULLAH A.S.*

*However it is the quite strange that 12th IMAM of ITHNA ASHAREE FIRQA Who is being waited as LAST MEHDEE is JANAB MOHAMMED BIN HASSAN ASKAREE*

*Even ALLAMA MAJLISI who is a great scholar of ITHNA ASHAREE FIRQA accepts and confirms in his BOOK MAJMAUL BAHRAIN that HAZRAT IMAM*

*JAFARUS SADIQ (A.S) had declared through the instrument of NUS (NUS means “an explicit and decisive dictum ) Hazrat MAULANA ISMAIL ( a .s) as Next IMAM(a.s) after him*

*However MAJLISI has alleged ( quite wrongly only to prove his faith in IMAMAT of JANAB MUSA KAZIM) that Hazrat IMAM MAULANA ISMAIL ( a .s) once upon acted against Islamic sharia ( I can not even write here in words allegation of MAJLISI. ASTAGHFERULLAH)*

*Therefore Hazrat IMAM JAFARUS SADIQ ( a s) changed NUS from HAZRAT MAULANA IMAM ISMAIL*

*( a s) to JANAB MUSA KAZIM*

*The above argument is totally ridiculous and false and shameful. As it it contradicts the HOLY AAYATof Holy Quran*

*أَلَمْ يَأْتِ الْبَنَاتِ وَالْبَنَاتِ وَأَنْتُمْ تَطْفُرُونَ*

*Allah only desires to keep away the uncleanness from you, O people of the House! and to purify you a (thorough) purifying.*

*So it is a great sin which would never be forgiven if this type of allegation is levelled or EVEN thought against AHLUL BAIT ( a.s.).*

*And it also generates doubt about the purity and Imamatus of HAZRAT IMAM JAFARUS SADIQ ( a.s) since he has committed blunder In declaring a person who has acted against sharia and HAZRAT IMAM JAFARUS SADIQ ( a.s) had to change his decision*

*(ASTAGFERULLAH 1000 times per second from this type of absurd ideas and statement)*

*Please note that IMAM of THE TIME is BORN from the PIOUS backbone of his respected HOLY father who is also IMAM and pious womb of his HOLYmother and his HOLY father has to declare him in general public through the instrument of NUS as his successor and next IMAM after him and thus chain of IMAMAT will continue from the HOLY FATHER to HOLY SON till the day of QIYAMAT and it would never ever change*

*Therefore CHAIN OF IMAMAT was transferred from HAZRAT MAULANA IMAM ISMAIL TO his HOLY son HAZRAT IMAM MOHAMMED ( a.s.) IBNE HAZRAT MAULANA ISMAIL(a.s.) and this would continue till the day of QIYAMAT and would never ever change and those who think any other way have lost SIRATAL MUSTAQEEM as Allah swt says holy*

Quran

**! قَلَنْ تَجِدَ لِسُنَّتِ اللَّهِ تَبْدِيلًا**

(34) وَلَنْ تَجِدَ لِسُنَّتِ اللَّهِ تَحْوِيلًا

*any alteration in the course of Allah; and you shall not find any change in the course of Allah.*

## Appendix II: Keeping the promises

إِنَّ اللَّهَ اشْتَرَى مِنَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ أَنْفُسَهُمْ وَأَمْوَالَهُمْ بِأَنْ لَهُمُ الْجَنَّةَ ۚ يُقَاتِلُونَ فِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ فَيَقْتُلُونَ وَيُقْتَلُونَ ۚ وَعَدَّا عَلَيْهِمْ حَقًّا فِي التَّوْرَةِ وَالْإِنْجِيلِ وَالْقُرْآنِ ۚ وَمَنْ أَوْفَى بِعَهْدِهِ مِنَ اللَّهِ ۚ فَاسْتَبَشِرُوا بَبَيْعِكُمُ الَّذِي بَايَعْتُمْ بِهِ ۚ وَذَلِكَ هُوَ الْفَوْزُ الْعَظِيمُ { 111 }

***Surely Allah has Bought from the Momineen their own selves and their wealth that for them would be the Paradise, fighting in the Way of Allah, so they are killing and being killed, being a binding Promise upon Him in the Torah, and the Evangel and the Quran; and who would be more loyal with his promise than Allah? Therefore receive glad tidings with your sale, which you have sold for, and that, it is the mighty achievement [9:111]***

خَالِدِينَ فِيهَا ۚ وَعَدَّ اللَّهُ حَقًّا ۚ وَهُوَ الْعَزِيزُ الْحَكِيمُ { 9 }

***Abiding eternally therein, being a True Promise of Allah, and He is the Mighty, the Wise [31:9]***

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ سَالِمٍ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) يَقُولُ عِنْدَهُ الْمُؤْمِنُ أَحَاهُ نَذْرٌ لَا كَفَّارَةَ لَهُ فَمَنْ أَحْلَفَ فَبِخْلَفِ اللَّهِ بَدَأَ وَ لِمَقْتَبِهِ تَعَرَّضَ وَ ذَلِكَ قَوْلُهُ يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا لِمَ تَقُولُونَ مَا لَا تَفْعَلُونَ كَبِرَ مَقْتَباً عِنْدَ اللَّهِ أَنْ تَقُولُوا مَا لَا تَفْعَلُونَ .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Hisham Bin Salim who said,

'I heard Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> saying: 'A promise of the *Momin* to his brother is a vow with no expiation for it. So the one who breaks, so he has opposed Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Initiating to His<sup>-azwj</sup> Detestation he has been exposed, and these are His<sup>-azwj</sup> Words **[61:2] O you who believe! Why do you say that which you do not do? [61:3] It is most Hateful to Allah that you should say that which you do not do'**.<sup>24</sup>

عَلِيٌّ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ شُعَيْبِ الْعَمْرُوفِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ (صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ) مَنْ كَانَ يُؤْمِنُ بِاللَّهِ وَ  
الْيَوْمِ الْآخِرِ فَلْيَبِ إِذَا وَعَدَ .

Ali, from his father, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Shuayb Al Aqarquqy,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> having said: 'Rasool-Allah<sup>-saww</sup> said: 'The one who was a believer in Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> and the Last Day, so let him fulfil when he promises'.<sup>25</sup>

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ أَحْمَدَ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ الْمُؤْمِنِ عَنْ إِسْحَاقَ بْنِ عَمَّارٍ قَالَ سَمِعْتُهُ يَقُولُ وَ نَاسٌ يَسْأَلُونَهُ يَقُولُونَ الْأَنْزَاقُ  
تُقَسَّمُ لَيْلَةُ التَّصْنُفِ مِنْ شَعْبَانَ قَالَ فَقَالَ لَا وَاللَّهِ مَا ذَاكَ إِلَّا فِي لَيْلَةِ تِسْعِ عَشْرَةَ مِنْ شَهْرِ رَمَضَانَ وَ إِحْدَى وَ عَشْرِينَ وَ ثَلَاثٍ وَ عَشْرِينَ فَإِنَّ فِي لَيْلَةِ  
تِسْعِ عَشْرَةَ يَلْتَقِي الْجَمْعَانِ وَ فِي لَيْلَةِ إِحْدَى وَ عَشْرِينَ يُفْرَقُ كُلُّ أَمْرٍ حَكِيمٍ وَ فِي لَيْلَةِ ثَلَاثٍ وَ عَشْرِينَ يَمْضَى مَا أَرَادَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ مِنْ ذَلِكَ وَ هِيَ لَيْلَةُ  
الْقَدْرِ الَّتِي قَالَ اللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ خَيْرٌ مِنْ أَلْفِ شَهْرٍ

Mohammed Bin Yahya, from Mohammed Bin Ahmad, from Mohammed Bin Isa, from Abu Abdullah Al Momin, from Is'haq Bin Ammar who said,

'I heard him<sup>-asws</sup> saying, and the people were saying that the livelihoods are distributed during the night of the middle of Shaban, so he<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'No, by Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! That is not except during the night of the 19<sup>th</sup> of a Month of Ramazan, and 21<sup>st</sup>, and 23<sup>rd</sup>. So, during the night of the 19<sup>th</sup> the two parties meet; and during the night of the 21<sup>st</sup>, every wise affair is Made to be distinct; and during the night of the 23<sup>rd</sup> whatever Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> has Intended, gets accomplished, and it is the Night of Pre-destination of which Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic has Said it is better than a thousand months'.

قَالَ قُلْتُ مَا مَعْنَى قَوْلِهِ يَلْتَقِي الْجَمْعَانِ قَالَ يَجْمَعُ اللَّهُ فِيهَا مَا أَرَادَ مِنْ تَقْدِيمِهِ وَ تَأْخِيرِهِ وَ إِزَادَتِهِ وَ قَصَائِهِ

He (the narrator) said, 'I said, 'What is the Meaning of His<sup>-azwj</sup> Worlds **[8:41] the day on which the two parties meet?**' He<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Gathers therein whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Intends from its Bringing forward, and its Delaying, and His<sup>-azwj</sup> intention, and His<sup>-azwj</sup> Judgement'.

قَالَ قُلْتُ فَمَا مَعْنَى يَمْضِيهِ فِي ثَلَاثٍ وَ عَشْرِينَ قَالَ إِنَّهُ يُفْرَقُهُ فِي لَيْلَةِ إِحْدَى وَ عَشْرِينَ وَ يَكُونُ لَهُ فِيهِ الْبَدَاءُ فَإِذَا كَانَتْ لَيْلَةُ ثَلَاثٍ وَ عَشْرِينَ أَمْضَاهُ  
فَيَكُونُ مِنَ الْمُخْتَوَمِ الَّذِي لَا يُبْدُو لَهُ فِيهِ تَبَارَكَ وَ تَعَالَى .

He (the narrator) said, 'I said, 'So what is the meaning of 'It gets accomplished during the night of the 23<sup>rd</sup>?' He<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'It is Made to be distinct during the night of the 21<sup>st</sup>, and there happens to

<sup>24</sup> Al Kafi V 2 – The Book Of Belief and Disbelief CH 154 H 1

<sup>25</sup> Al Kafi V 2 – The Book Of Belief and Disbelief CH 154 H 2

be the Change with regards to it. So when it is the night of the 23<sup>rd</sup>, it gets accomplished, so it happens to be from the inevitable, there be no change for it from the Blessed and High'.<sup>26</sup>

وَ بِحَدِّ إِسْنَادٍ عَنْ أَبَانَ عَنْ أَبِي بَصِيرٍ عَنْ أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ وَ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) أَنَّهُمَا قَالَا إِنَّ النَّاسَ لَمَّا كَذَّبُوا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ (صلى الله عليه وآله) هَمَّ اللَّهُ تَبَارَكَ وَ تَعَالَى بِحَلَاكِ أَهْلِ الْأَرْضِ إِلَّا عَلِيًّا فَمَا سِوَاهُ بِقَوْلِهِ فَتَوَلَّى عَنْهُمْ فَمَا أَنْتَ بِمَلُومٌ ثُمَّ بَدَأَ لَهُ فَرَحَمَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ثُمَّ قَالَ لِنَبِيِّهِ (صلى الله عليه وآله) وَ دَكَّرَ فَإِنَّ الدِّكْرَى تَنْفَعُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ.

And by this chain, from Abaan, from Abu Baseer, who has said:

Abu Ja'far<sup>-asws</sup> and Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup>, that the two of them<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'When the people belied the Rasool<sup>-saww</sup> Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Blessed and High Decided to Destroy the people of the earth except for Ali<sup>-asws</sup> and no one else by His<sup>-azwj</sup> Statement: "[51:54] **Then turn your back upon them for you are not to blame**". Then Changed it for them so He<sup>-azwj</sup> was Merciful to the Believers. Then He<sup>-azwj</sup> Said to His<sup>-azwj</sup> Prophet<sup>-saww</sup>: "[51:55] **And continue to remind, for surely the reminder profits the believers**".<sup>27</sup>

### Appendix III: Additional Ahadith on Badā' (الْبَدَاءُ)

كِتَابُ زَيْدِ النَّرْسِيِّ، عَنْ عُيَيْدِ بْنِ زُرَّارَةَ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قَالَ: مَا بَدَأَ لِلَّهِ بَدَاءٌ أَعْظَمَ مِنْ بَدَاءِ لَهُ فِي إِسْمَاعِيلَ ابْنِي.

The book of Zayd Al Narsy – From Ubeyd Bin Zurara,

'From Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> having said: 'There has not been any change of Decision for Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> greater than the change of Decision for Him<sup>-azwj</sup> regarding my<sup>-asws</sup> son Ismail"<sup>28</sup>

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنِ الْحُجَّالِ عَنْ أَبِي إِسْحَاقَ ثَعْلَبَةَ عَنْ زُرَّارَةَ بْنِ أَعْيَنَ عَنْ أَحَدِهِمَا (عليهما السلام) قَالَ مَا عُيِدَ اللَّهُ بِشَيْءٍ مِثْلَ الْبَدَاءِ

Mohammed Bin Yahya, from Ahmad Bin Ahmad Mohammed Bin Isa, from Al Hajjal, from Abu Is'haq Sa'alba, from Zurara Bin Ayn,

(It has been narrated) from one of the two (5<sup>th</sup> or 6<sup>th</sup> Imam<sup>-asws</sup>) having said: 'Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> has not been worshipped by anything like The Changing of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Decision (الْبَدَاءُ).'

وَ فِي رِوَايَةِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ سَالِمٍ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) مَا عَظَّمَ اللَّهُ بِمِثْلِ الْبَدَاءِ .

And in another report of Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Hisham Bin Salim,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> (having said): 'Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> has not been revered with the likes of The Changing of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Decision (الْبَدَاءُ).'<sup>29</sup>

<sup>26</sup> Al Kafi – V 4 – The Book of Fasts Ch 69 H 8

<sup>27</sup> Al Kafi V 8, H. 14526

<sup>28</sup> Bihar Al Awaar – V 46, The book of History – Ja'far Al Sadiq<sup>asws</sup>, Ch 8 H 41

<sup>29</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 1

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ سَالِمٍ وَ حُفْصِ بْنِ الْبَحْتَرِيِّ وَ غَيْرِهِمَا عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) قَالَ فِي هَذِهِ الْآيَةِ يَمْحُوا اللَّهُ مَا يَشَاءُ وَ يُثَبِّتُ قَالَ فَعَالَ وَ هَلْ يَمْحَى إِلَّا مَا كَانَ ثَابِتًا وَ هَلْ يُثَبِّتُ إِلَّا مَا لَمْ يَكُنْ .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Hisham Bin Salim and Hafs Bin Al Bakhtary and someone else,

Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> has said regarding this Verse **[13:39] Allah Obliterates whatever He so Desires to and Establishes:** 'And does He<sup>-azwj</sup> Obliterate except what was (previously) Established, and does He<sup>-azwj</sup> Establish except what had not occurred?'<sup>30</sup>

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنِ ابْنِ فَضَّالٍ عَنِ ابْنِ بُكَيْرٍ عَنْ زُرَّارَةَ عَنْ حُمْرَانَ عَنْ أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ (عليه السلام) قَالَ سَأَلْتُهُ عَنْ قَوْلِ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ قَضَى أَجَلًا وَ أَجَلًا مُسَمًّى عِنْدَهُ قَالَ هُمَا أَجَلَانِ أَجَلٌ مُتَّوَمٌ وَ أَجَلٌ مُؤَقَّوَفٌ .

Mohammed Bin Yahya, from Ahmad Bin Mohammed, from Ibn Fazzal, from Ibn Bukeyr, from Zurara, from Humran,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Ja'far<sup>-asws</sup>, said, 'I asked him<sup>-asws</sup> about the Words of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic **[6:2] then He Decreed a term; and there is a term Named with Him.'** He<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'These are two terms – A Determined term and a suspended term.'<sup>31</sup>

وَ بَهَذَا الْإِسْنَادِ عَنْ حَمَّادٍ عَنْ رَبِيعٍ عَنِ الْفُضَيْلِ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا جَعْفَرٍ (عليه السلام) يَقُولُ مِنَ الْأُمُورِ أُمُورٌ مُؤَقَّوَفَةٌ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ يُقَدِّمُ مِنْهَا مَا يَشَاءُ وَ يُؤَخِّرُ مِنْهَا مَا يَشَاءُ .

And, by this chain, from Hammad, from Rabie, from Al Fuzayl who said,

'I heard Abu Ja'far<sup>-asws</sup> saying: 'From the matters is a matter suspended in the Presence of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>. He<sup>-azwj</sup> Brings forward from these whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Desires to, and Delays from these whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Desires to.'<sup>32</sup>

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ عَمِيرَةَ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ عَثْمَانَ عَنْ سَمَاعَةَ عَنْ أَبِي بَصِيرٍ وَ وَهَيْبِ بْنِ حُفْصٍ عَنْ أَبِي بَصِيرٍ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) قَالَ إِنَّ لِلَّهِ عِلْمَيْنِ عِلْمٌ مَكْنُونٌ مَخْرُومٌ لَا يَعْلَمُهُ إِلَّا هُوَ مِنْ ذَلِكَ يَكُونُ الْبَدَاءُ وَ عِلْمٌ عَلَّمَهُ مَلَائِكَتُهُ وَ رُسُلُهُ وَ أَنْبِيَآءُهُ فَنَحْنُ نَعْلَمُهُ .

A number of our companions, from Ahmad Bin Mohammed Bin Isa, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Ja'far Bin Usman, from Sama'at, from Abu Baseer, and Wuheyb Bin Hafs, from Abu Baseer,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> having said: 'For Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> there are two (types of) Knowledge – a Knowledge Concealed, Treasured, none know it except for Him<sup>-azwj</sup>. From that is the occurrence of the Changing of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Decision; and a Knowledge Taught to His<sup>-azwj</sup> Angels and His<sup>-azwj</sup> Rasools<sup>-as</sup>, and His<sup>-azwj</sup> Prophets. So, we<sup>-asws</sup> know it.'<sup>33</sup>

<sup>30</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 2

<sup>31</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 4

<sup>32</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 7

<sup>33</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 8

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنِ الْحُسَيْنِ بْنِ سَعِيدٍ عَنِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ مَحْبُوبٍ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ سِنَانَ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) قَالَ مَا بَدَأَ اللَّهُ فِي شَيْءٍ إِلَّا كَانَ فِي عِلْمِهِ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَبْدُوَ لَهُ .

Mohammed Bin Yahya, from Ahmad Bin Mohammed, from Al Husayn Bin Saeed, from Al Hassan Bin Mahboub, from Abdullah Bin Sinan,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> having said: 'Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> did not Change (His<sup>-azwj</sup> Decision) regarding anything except that it was always in His<sup>-azwj</sup> Knowledge before that He<sup>-azwj</sup> would be Changing it.'<sup>34</sup>

عَنْهُ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ عَنِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ فَضَّالٍ عَنْ دَاوُدَ بْنِ فَرْقَدٍ عَنْ عَمْرٍو بْنِ عُثْمَانَ الْجُهَنِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) قَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ لَمْ يَبْدَأْ لَهُ مِنْ جَهْلٍ .

From him, from Ahmad, from Al Hassan Bin Ali Bin Fazzal, from Dawood Bin Farqad, from Amro Bin Usman Al Juhnny,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> having said: 'Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, (His<sup>-azwj</sup> Decision) does not change for Him<sup>-azwj</sup> due to ignorance.'<sup>35</sup>

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ يُونُسَ عَنْ مَنْصُورِ بْنِ حَازِمٍ قَالَ سَأَلْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) هَلْ يَكُونُ الْيَوْمَ شَيْءٌ لَمْ يَكُنْ فِي عِلْمِ اللَّهِ بِالْأَمْسِ قَالَ لَا مَنْ قَالَ هَذَا فَأَخْرَاهُ اللَّهُ فَلْتَأْ رَأَيْتَ مَا كَانَ وَ مَا هُوَ كَائِنٌ إِلَى يَوْمِ الْقِيَامَةِ أَلَيْسَ فِي عِلْمِ اللَّهِ قَالَ بَلَى قَبْلَ أَنْ يَخْلُقَ الْخَلْقَ .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from Mohammed Bin Isa, from Yunus, from Mansour Bin Hazim who said,

'I asked Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup>, 'Would something happen today which did not happen to be in the Knowledge of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> yesterday?' He<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'No. The one who says this, so Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> would Disgrace him.' I said, 'What is your<sup>-asws</sup> view of what has happened, and what is going to happen up to the Day of Judgment. Isn't it in the Knowledge of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>?' He<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'But, (even) before He<sup>-azwj</sup> Created the creatures.'<sup>36</sup>

عَلِيٌّ عَنْ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ يُونُسَ عَنْ مَالِكِ الْجُهَنِيِّ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) يَقُولُ لَوْ عَلِمَ النَّاسُ مَا فِي الْقَوْلِ بِالْبَدَاءِ مِنَ الْأَجْرِ مَا فَتَرُوا عَنِ الْكَلَامِ فِيهِ .

Ali Bin Mohammed, from Yunus, from Malik Al Juhnny who said,

'I heard Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> saying: 'If the people knew what Recompense would be in the speech with The Changing of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Decision (الْبَدَاءِ), they would not languish from the speaking with regards to it.'<sup>37</sup>

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ خَالِدٍ عَنْ بَعْضِ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَمْرٍو الْكُوفِيِّ أَحْيَى يَحْيَى عَنْ مُرَازِمِ بْنِ حَكِيمٍ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) يَقُولُ مَا تَنْبَأُ نَبِيٌّ قَطُّ حَتَّى يُقَرَّ لِلَّهِ بِخَمْسِ خِصَالٍ بِالْبَدَاءِ وَ الْمَشِيئَةِ وَ السُّجُودِ وَ الْعُبُودِيَّةِ وَ الطَّاعَةِ .

<sup>34</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 9

<sup>35</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 10

<sup>36</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 11

<sup>37</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 12

A number of our companions, from Ahmad Bin Mohammed Bin Khalid, from one of our companions, from Mohammed Bin Amro Al Kufy, a brother of Yahya, from Murazim Bin Hakeym who said,

'I heard Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> saying: 'No Prophet<sup>-saww</sup> was Granted Prophet-hood at all until he<sup>-as</sup> acknowledged to Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> with five characteristics – The Changing of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Decision (الْبَدَاءِ), and the Desire, and the Prostrations, and the servitude, and the obedience.'<sup>38</sup>

وَ يَحْدَا الْإِسْنَادَ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ يُوسُفَ بْنِ جَهْمٍ بْنِ أَبِي جَهْمَةَ عَمَّنْ حَدَّثَهُ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) قَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ أَحَبَّ مُحَمَّدًا (صلى الله عليه وآله) بِمَا كَانَ مُنْذُ كَانَتْ الدُّنْيَا وَ بِمَا يَكُونُ إِلَى انْقِضَاءِ الدُّنْيَا وَ أَحَبَّهُ بِالْمَحْتَوَمِ مِنْ ذَلِكَ وَ اسْتَنْتَى عَلَيْهِ فِيمَا سِوَاهُ .  
.And by this chain, from Ahmad Bin Mohammed, from Ja'far Bin Mohammed, from Yunus, from Jahm Bin Abu Jahma, from the one who narrated it,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> having said: 'Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic Informed Muhammad<sup>-saww</sup> with whatever had happened since the coming into being of the world, and with whatever was going to happen up to the expiry of the world, and Informed him<sup>-saww</sup> with the Ordained (matters) from that, and Excluded upon him<sup>-saww</sup> with regards to what was besides it.'<sup>39</sup>

عَلَيْ بْنِ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ الرَّيَّانِ بْنِ الصَّلْتِ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ الرَّضَا (عليه السلام) يَقُولُ مَا بَعَثَ اللَّهُ نَبِيًّا قَطُّ إِلَّا بِتَحْرِيمِ الْخَمْرِ وَ أَنْ يُعَيَّرَ لِلَّهِ بِالْبَدَاءِ .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, from al Rayyan Bin Al Salt who said,

'I heard Al-Reza<sup>-asws</sup> saying: 'Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> did not Send a Prophet<sup>-as</sup> at all except with the Prohibition of the wine and that he<sup>-as</sup> acknowledges to Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> with the Changing of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Decision (الْبَدَاءِ)'.<sup>40</sup>

الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ مُعَلَّى بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ قَالَ سُئِلَ الْعَالِمُ (عليه السلام) كَيْفَ عَلِمَ اللَّهُ قَالَ عَلِمَ وَ شَاءَ وَ أَرَادَ وَ قَدَّرَ وَ قَضَى وَ أَمَضَى فَأَمَضَى مَا قَضَى وَ قَضَى مَا قَدَّرَ وَ قَدَّرَ مَا أَرَادَ فَبِعِلْمِهِ كَانَتْ الْمَشِيئَةُ وَ بِمَشِيئَتِهِ كَانَتْ الْإِرَادَةُ وَ بِإِرَادَتِهِ كَانَتْ التَّقْدِيرُ وَ بِتَقْدِيرِهِ كَانَتْ الْقَضَاءُ وَ بِقَضَائِهِ كَانَتْ الْإِمْضَاءُ

Al Husayn Bin Mohammed, from Moalla Bin Mohammed who said,

The Knowledgeable one<sup>-asws</sup> was asked, 'How does Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Know?' He<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'He<sup>-azwj</sup> Knows, and Desires, and Intends, and Determines, and Ordains, and Accomplishes. So He<sup>-azwj</sup> Accomplishes what He<sup>-azwj</sup> Ordains, and Ordains what He<sup>-azwj</sup> Determines, and Determines what He<sup>-azwj</sup> Intends. So, in His<sup>-azwj</sup> Knowledge was the Desire, and in His<sup>-azwj</sup> Desire was the Intention, and in His<sup>-azwj</sup> Intention was the Pre-Determination, and in His<sup>-azwj</sup> Pre-determination was the Ordainment, and in His<sup>-azwj</sup> Ordainment was the Accomplishment.

وَ الْعِلْمُ مُتَقَدِّمٌ عَلَى الْمَشِيئَةِ وَ الْمَشِيئَةُ ثَانِيَةٌ وَ الْإِرَادَةُ ثَالِثَةٌ وَ التَّقْدِيرُ وَاقِعٌ عَلَى الْقَضَاءِ بِالْإِمْضَاءِ

<sup>38</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 13

<sup>39</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 14

<sup>40</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 15

'And the Knowledge was precedent upon the Desire, and the Desire is second, and the Intention is third, and the Pre-determination occurs upon the Ordainment by the Accomplishment.

فَلِلَّهِ تَبَارَكَ وَ تَعَالَى الْبَدَاءُ فِيمَا عَلِمَ مَتَى شَاءَ وَ فِيمَا أَرَادَ لِتَقْدِيرِ الْأَشْيَاءِ فَإِذَا وَقَعَ الْقَضَاءُ بِالْإِمْتِضَاءِ فَلَا بَدَاءَ فَالْعِلْمُ فِي الْمَعْلُومِ قَبْلَ كَوْنِهِ وَ الْمَشِيئَةُ فِي الْمُنْتَهَى قَبْلَ عَيْنِهِ وَ الْإِرَادَةُ فِي الْمُرَادِ قَبْلَ قِيَامِهِ وَ التَّقْدِيرُ لِهَذِهِ الْمَعْلُومَاتِ قَبْلَ تَفْصِيلِهَا وَ تَوْصِيلِهَا عَيْنَاناً وَ وَثِقاً

'Thus, for Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Blessed and High is the Change of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Decision (الْبَدَاءُ) with regards to what He<sup>-azwj</sup> Knows when He<sup>-azwj</sup> Desires. Regarding what He<sup>-azwj</sup> Intends for the Pre-determination of the things, so there is no Change in the Decision. Thus, the knowledge regarding the known is before its coming into being, and the Desire regarding the desired is before its reality, and the Intention regarding the intended is before its establishment, and the Determination of these information is before it detail and it's arriving into visibility and time.

وَ الْقَضَاءُ بِالْإِمْتِضَاءِ هُوَ الْمُبْرَمُ مِنَ الْمَفْعُولَاتِ ذَوَاتِ الْأَجْسَامِ الْمُدْرَكَاتِ بِالْحَوَاسِّ مِنْ ذَوِي لَوْنٍ وَ رِيحٍ وَ وَزْنٍ وَ كَيْلٍ وَ مَا دَبَّ وَ دَرَجَ مِنْ إِنْسٍ وَ جِنِّ وَ طَيْرٍ وَ سِبَاعٍ وَ غَيْرِ ذَلِكَ بِمَا يُدْرِكُ بِالْحَوَاسِّ

'And the Ordainment is by the Accomplishment, the conclusion from the deeds with the embodiments which can be felt by the sensory perception from the ones with the colours, and smell, and weight, and measurement, and what creeps and crawls from the humans, and Jinn, and birds, and wild animals and other than that from what can be felt by the sensory perceptions.

فَلِلَّهِ تَبَارَكَ وَ تَعَالَى فِيهِ الْبَدَاءُ بِمَا لَا عَيْنَ لَهُ فَإِذَا وَقَعَ الْعَيْنُ الْمَفْهُومِ الْمُدْرَكَ فَلَا بَدَاءَ وَ اللَّهُ يَفْعَلُ مَا يَشَاءُ

'So, for the Blessed and High there is the Change of Decision (الْبَدَاءُ) in it from what there is no physical reality to it. Therefore, when the physical reality occurs, the concept of the sensed, so there is no Change of Decision (الْبَدَاءُ), and Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Does whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Desires to.

فَبِالْعِلْمِ عَلِمَ الْأَشْيَاءَ قَبْلَ كَوْنِهَا وَ بِالْمَشِيئَةِ عَرَفَتْ صِفَاتِهَا وَ حُدُودَهَا وَ أَنْشَأَهَا قَبْلَ إِظْهَارِهَا وَ بِالْإِرَادَةِ مَيَّرَ أَنْفُسَهَا فِي أَلْوَانِهَا وَ صِفَاتِهَا وَ بِالْتَّقْدِيرِ قَدَّرَ أَقْوَامَهَا وَ عَرَفَتْ أَوْهَامَهَا وَ آخِرَهَا وَ بِالْقَضَاءِ أَبَانَ لِلنَّاسِ أَمَاكِنَهَا وَ دَهَمَ عَلَيْهَا وَ بِالْإِمْتِضَاءِ شَرَحَ عِلَلَهَا وَ أَبَانَ أَمْرَهَا

'Therefore, by the Knowledge, the things are known before their coming into being; and by the Desire are recognised their qualities, and their limits, and He<sup>-azwj</sup> Established these before their manifestations; and by the Intention He<sup>-azwj</sup> Distinguished their selves with regards to their colours and their qualities; and by the Determination Measured out their strengths, and Recognised their beginnings, and their endings; and by the Ordainment, He<sup>-azwj</sup> Clarified to the people of their places and Indicated upon these; and by the Accomplishment, Explained their reasons, and Clarified their matters.

وَ ذَلِكَ تَقْدِيرُ الْعَزِيزِ الْعَلِيمِ .

'And that is the Determination of the Mighty, the Wise.'<sup>41</sup>

عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ خَالِدٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنِي مُنْزِرُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ قَابُوسَ عَنْ مَنْصُورِ بْنِ السِّنْدِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي دَاوُدَ الْمُسْتَرِيقِ عَنْ تَعْلَبَةَ بْنِ مَيْمُونٍ عَنْ مَالِكِ الْجُهَنِيِّ عَنِ الْحَارِثِ بْنِ الْمُغِيرَةِ عَنِ الْأَصْبَغِ بْنِ نُبَاتَةَ قَالَ أَتَيْتُ أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ( عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام ) فَوَجَدْتُهُ مُتَفَكِّرًا بِنُكْتٍ فِي الْأَرْضِ فَقُلْتُ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ مَا لِي أَرَاكَ مُتَفَكِّرًا تَنْكُثُ فِي الْأَرْضِ أَرْغَبُهُ مِنْكَ فِيهَا

Ali Bin Mohammed, from Abdullah Bin Mohammed Bin Khalid who said, 'Munzir Bin Mohammed Bin Qabous narrated to me, from Mansour Bin Al Sindy, from Abu Dawood Al Mustariq, from Sa'alba Bin Maymoun, from Malik Al Juhny, from Al Haris Bin Al Mugheira, from Al Asbagh Bin Nubata who said,

'I went over to Amir Al-Momineen<sup>-asws</sup>, and I found him<sup>-asws</sup> pondering, making markings in the ground. So I said, 'O Amir Al-Momineen<sup>-asws</sup>! What is the matter I see you<sup>-asws</sup> pondering, making markings in the ground? Is there a desire from you<sup>-asws</sup> with regards to it?'

فَقَالَ لَا وَاللَّهِ مَا رَغِبْتُ فِيهَا وَلَا فِي الدُّنْيَا يَوْمًا قَطُّ وَ لَكِنِّي فَكَّرْتُ فِي مَوْلُودِ يَكُونُ مِنْ ظَهْرِي الْحَادِي عَشَرَ مِنْ وُلْدِي هُوَ الْمَهْدِيُّ الَّذِي يَمَلَأُ الْأَرْضَ عَدْلًا وَ قِسْطًا كَمَا مَلَأَتْ جَوْرًا وَ ظُلْمًا تَكُونُ لَهُ غَيْبَةٌ وَ حَيْرَةٌ يَصِلُ فِيهَا أَقْوَامٌ وَ يَهْتَدِي فِيهَا آخَرُونَ

'So, he<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'No, by Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! I<sup>-asws</sup> have not desired with regards to it nor regarding the world even for a day, at all! But, I<sup>-asws</sup> am thinking regarding the birth, which would occur from my<sup>-asws</sup> back, the eleventh from my<sup>-asws</sup> sons<sup>-asws</sup>. He<sup>-asws</sup> is the Mahdi who would fill the earth with justice and equity just as it was filled with tyranny and injustice. An absence (Occultation) would occur for him<sup>-asws</sup> and confusion wherein groups of people would stray, and others would be Guided during it.'

فَقُلْتُ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَ كَمْ تَكُونُ الْحَيْرَةُ وَالْغَيْبَةُ قَالَ سِتَّةَ أَيَّامٍ أَوْ سِتَّةَ أَشْهُرٍ أَوْ سِتَّ سِنِينَ

'I said, 'O Amir Al-Momineen<sup>-asws</sup>! And how much would the confusion and the Occultation happen to be?' He<sup>-asws</sup> said: '(It could be) six days, or six months, or six years.'

فَقُلْتُ وَ إِنَّ هَذَا لَكَائِنٌ فَقَالَ نَعَمْ كَمَا أَنَّهُ مَخْلُوقٌ وَ أَنَّى لَكَ بِهَذَا الْأَمْرِ يَا أَصْبَغُ أَوْلَيْكَ جِبَارُ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةِ مَعَ خِيَارِ أُنْبَرَارِ هَذِهِ الْعَيْتَةِ

'I said, 'And this would be happening?' So he<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'Yes, just as he<sup>-asws</sup> would be Created, and in what way is for you with this matter? O Asbagh! They (The Momineen of that time) would be the best of this community along with the best of the righteous ones of this family<sup>-asws</sup>.'

فَقُلْتُ ثُمَّ مَا يَكُونُ بَعْدَ ذَلِكَ فَقَالَ ثُمَّ يَفْعَلُ اللَّهُ مَا يَشَاءُ فَإِنَّ لَهُ بَدَائِعَ وَ إِزَادَاتٍ وَ غَايَاتٍ وَ نَحَائِاتٍ .

'So I said, 'Then what would happen after that?' So he<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'Then Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> would do whatever He<sup>-azwj</sup> so Desires, for there are Changes of Decisions for Him<sup>-azwj</sup>, and the Intentions, and purposes and end results.'<sup>42</sup>

<sup>41</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Tawheed (Oneness of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>) CH 24 H 16

<sup>42</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Divine Authority CH 80 H 7

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ الْأَصَمِّ عَنِ الْهَيْثَمِ بْنِ وَاقِدٍ عَنْ مُقَرِّنٍ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) قَالَ إِنَّ عَبْدَ الْمُطَّلِبِ أَوَّلُ مَنْ قَالَ بِالْبَدَاءِ يُبْعَثُ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ أُمَّةً وَحْدَهُ عَلَيْهِ بَهَاءُ الْمُلُوكِ وَ سِيْمَاءُ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, from Abdullah Bin Abdul Rahman Al Asamma, from Al Haysam Bin Waqid, from Muqarran,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> having said: 'Abdul Muttalib<sup>-asws</sup> was the first one who said (believed) in *Al-Badā*' (Change of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>'s Decision). He<sup>-asws</sup> would be Resurrected on the Day of Judgment as one community. Upon him<sup>-saww</sup> would be the majesty of the kings and a mark of the Prophets<sup>-as</sup>.<sup>43</sup>

<sup>43</sup> Al Kafi V 1 – The Book Of Divine Authority CH 111 H 23