

'Ilmul Rijal - An Un-Islamic Tool'

Table of Contents

.....	3
Summary:.....	3
Hadith of Imam Ja'far Al-Sadiq ^{-asws} on kitab Sulaym ibn Qays	5
Conclusions of the Summary:.....	8
The origin of the Ilmul Rijal:.....	8
How did the Holy Imams ^{-asws} Refute the False Ahadith?	9
A Hadith can be taken from a liar if its words are true:.....	15
Amir Al-Momineen ^{-asws} Ratified that Usman spoke the truth.....	15
Appendix I: Ahadith on some of the well-known liars	17
Ahadith on the character of Ibn Abbas:.....	17
Appendix II: Examples of 'Marfu' Ahadith (unbroken chain leading to Rasool Allah ^{-saww}) .	27

Abbreviations:

saww: - Sal lal la ho Allay hay Wa Aal lay he Wasallam

azwj: - Az Za Wa Jalla

asws: - Allay hay Salawat Wass Salam

AJFJ: Ajal Allah hey wa Fara Jaak

ra: - Razi Allah^{-azwj}

La: - Laan Allah^{-azwj}

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ الْحَمْدُ لِلَّهِ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ، وَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَى سَيِّدِنَا مُحَمَّدٍ وَ آلِهِ الطَّاهِرِينَ، وَ سَلَّمَ تَسْلِيمًا.

In the Name of Allah^{-azwj} the Beneficent, the Merciful. The Praise is for Allah^{-azwj} Lord^{-azwj} of the Worlds, and Blessing be upon our Chief Muhammad^{-saww} and his^{-saww} Purified Progeny^{-asws}, and greetings with abundant greetings.

اللَّهُمَّ صَلِّ عَلَى مُحَمَّدٍ وَآلِ مُحَمَّدٍ وَعَجِّلْ فَرَجَهُمْ وَأَعِنِ أَعْدَاءَهُمْ أَجْمَعِينَ

‘Ilmul Rijal – An Un-Islamic Tool’

Summary:

‘*Ilmul Rijal*’ means the ‘Knowledge of Men.’ It has been extensively developed by the evaluators of Ahadith (traditions) as they apply biographical evaluation through character scrutiny of the Hadith transmitters (narrators). ‘*Ilmul Rijal*’ is also known as the Science of Narrators, and was cultivated many years after the demise of the Holy Prophet^{-saww} by those who opted to run a parallel religion – based on their ‘logic’ (*qias*) – to that of the Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws}. It is a completely man-made ‘tool’ extensively being applied to weigh and characterise the Ahadith (traditions of Rasool Allah^{-saww}), into over fifty categories (from weak to strong), in which the transmitters of hadith are evaluated as per people’s opinion about their truthfulness, religious beliefs and character.

According to Ibn Al-Salah, quoting an early religious authority, the first person to specialize in the study of hadith narrators was Shu‘ba Ibn Al-Ḥajjāj, followed by Yahya Ibn Sa‘id Al-Qattan and then Ahmad ibn Hanbal and Yahya Ibn Ma‘in.¹ As many Companions narrated hadith, according to Ahmad Ibn Hanbal, there were six who were the most trustworthy narrators among them, who lived longer and reported many Ahadith. They are:

Abu Huraira, Abdullah ibn Umar, Aisha (Prophet’s wife), Jabir Ibn Abdullah (Al-Ansari), Ibn Abbas and Anas Ibn Malik with Abu Huraira.² According to Ibn Al-Salah the most prolific narrators from the Companions was Abu Huraira followed by Ibn Abbas.³

Apart from Jabir Ibn Abdullah (Al-Ansari), all the above mentioned narrators had not only shown their inclinations and support for the enemies of Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws}, but also on several occasions deliberately lied against them^{-asws}. For example:

قَالَ وَ قَدْ رُوِيَ عَنِّي ع أَنَّهُ قَالَ: أَخَذْتُ النَّاسَ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص أَبُو هُرَيْرَةَ الدَّوْسِيُّ.

¹ Muqadimah Ibn al-Salah, by Ibn al-Salah, published with Muhasin al-Istilah by al-Bulqini, edited by 'Aishah bint 'Abd al-Rahman, p. 654, Dar al-Ma'arif, Cairo.

² Muqadimah Ibn al-Salah, by Ibn al-Salah, edited by 'Aishah bint 'Abd al-Rahman, p. 492, Dar al-Ma'arif, Cairo.

³ Muqadimah Ibn al-Salah, by Ibn al-Salah, edited by 'Aishah bint 'Abd al-Rahman, p. 492, Dar al-Ma'arif, Cairo.

He (the narrator) said, ‘And it has been reported from (Imam) Ali^{-asws} having said: ‘The most lying of the people upon Rasool-Allah^{sawww} is Abu Hureyra Al-Dowsy.’⁴

الحِصَالُ عَنْ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ ع قَالَ: ثَلَاثَةٌ كَانُوا يَكْذِبُونَ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص أَبُو هُرَيْرَةَ وَ أَنَسُ بْنُ مَالِكٍ وَ امْرَأَةٌ.

(The book) ‘Al-Khisaal’ – ‘From Ja’far^{-asws} Bin Muhammad^{-asws} having said; ‘Three have lied upon Rasool-Allah^{sawww} – Abu Hureyra, and Anas Bin Malik, and a woman (named above).’⁵

About Ibn Abbas, in Ahadith we find:

رجال الكشي علي بن زياد الصائغ [الصائغ] عن عبد العزيز بن محمد عن خلف المحزومي عن سفيان بن سعيد عن الزهري قال سمعت الحارث يقول استعمل علي ع على البصرة عبد الله بن عباس فحمل كل مال في بيت المال بالبصرة و لحق بمكة و ترك علياً و كان مبلغه ألفي ألف درهم

(The book) ‘Rijal’ of Al Kashy – Ali Bin Ziyad Al Saig, from Abdul Aziz Bin Muhammad, from Khalaf Al Makhzumi, from Sufyan Bin Saeed, from Al Zuhry who said, ‘I heard Al Haris saying,

‘(Imam) Ali^{-asws} utilised Abdullah Bin Abbas upon Al-Basra (as governor). He carried away all the wealth which was in the public treasure at Al-Basra and joined with Makkah and left (Imam) Ali^{-asws}, and it (the embezzled wealth) reached two million Dirhams.

فصعد علي ع المنبر حين بلغه ذلك فبكي فقال هذا ابن عم رسول الله ص في عمله و قدره يفعل مثل هذا فكيف يؤمن من كان دونه اللهم إني قد مللتهم فأرخني منهم و افضني إليك غير عاجز و لا ملول.

‘(Imam) Ali^{-asws} ascended the pulpit when that reached him^{-asws}. He^{-asws} cried. He^{-asws} said: ‘This is a son of an uncle of Rasool-Allah^{sawww}. In his deed and being in his worth, he has done the like of this? So, how will the ones who are besides him, believe? O Allah^{-azwj}! I^{asws} am fed up with them, so Give me^{-asws} rest from them and Take me^{-asws} to You^{-azwj}, without frustration nor weariness.’⁶

When Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} rebuked Ibn Abbas on embezzlement, and when he could not defend his crimes, he wrote to Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws}:

قالوا فكتب إليه عبد الله بن عباس أما بعد فإنك قد أخترت علي و و الله لأن ألقى الله قد احتوت على كنوز الأرض كلها من ذهبها و عيناها و جنيها أحب إلي من أن ألقاه بدم امرئ مسلم و السلام.

They said, ‘Abdullah Bin Al-Abbas wrote to him^{-asws}: ‘You^{-asws} have frequented upon me (with the accusation of embezzlement), and by Allah^{-azwj}! If I were to meet Allah^{-azwj} containing upon the treasures of the earth, all of them, from its gold and its hoards, and its silver, it would be

⁴ Bihar Al Anwaar – V 32, The book of Fitna (Strife) And Ordeals, Ch 17 H 499

⁵ Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 22, The book of our Prophet^{-sawww}, P 3 Ch 37 H 60

⁶ Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 42, The book of History – Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws}, Ch 124 H 21

more beloved to me than if I were to meet Him^{-azwj} with the blood of a Muslim person (like you^{-asws} will – accusing Ali^{-asws} of unjustifiably killing Muslims in the wars).’’⁷

Ibn Abbas along with some other Ahadith transmitters who deliberately lied regarding narrations, are mentioned in the Appendix I:

The ‘Ilmul Rijal’ was neither practised during the lifetime of Rasool Allah^{-saww} nor during the 12 Imams^{-asws}, rather it was being developed in opposition to them^{-asws} by the general Muslims who did not take religion from the progeny of Rasool Allah^{-saww} and opened the field of *Ijtihad* (opinion) using ‘Ilmul Rijal’ to characterise Ahadith of Rasool Allah^{-saww} into various categories.

‘Ilmul Rijal’ was borrowed by a group of the followers of the Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws} from the general Muslims after the commencement of the Grand Occultation of the 12th Imam^{-ajfj} (329 A.H.)⁸ and integrated it into the principles of Fiqh, (i.e., Quran, Ahadith, Ilmul rijal, Istambat (logic/reasoning) and Ijmah of Ulema (consensus)⁹. This opened the door of ‘*Ijtihad and Taqeed*’ (use of logic and emulation of scholars) which was completely forbidden by the Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws}, but it gradually propagated after the Grand Occultation and today it is widely practised. A heresy, which general Muslims devised to justify the mistakes and swaying away from teachings of the Holy Prophet^{-saww}, it thrives today – but will be terminated when the 12th Imam^{-ajfj} reappears, and he^{-ajfj} will eliminate these principles as well as the advocates of these un-Islamic tools.

Another large group from the followers of Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws}, doubts the authenticity of the ‘THE BOOK OF SULAYM BIN QAYS AL-HILALI’ based on ‘Ilmul Rijal’ by saying that Abaan (who was custodian of the book of Sulaym during the time of Taqeeya) was not a trustworthy narrator. However, we have Ahadith which say the opposite that Abaan has transmitted from Sulaym the true Ahadith (as compiled by Sulaym Bin Qays Al-Hilali): for example:

Hadith of Imam Ja’far Al-Sadiq^{-asws} on kitab Sulaym ibn Qays

الشيخ عبد النبي الكاظمي في تكملة الرجال: نقلا عن خط المجلسي رحمه الله، قال: اقول: وجدت نسخة قديمة من كتاب سليم بروايتين بينهما اختلاف يسير، وكتب في آخر احدهما: تم كتاب سليم بن قيس الهلالي - إلى أن قال - روي عن الصادق (عليه السلام)، أنه قال: " من لم يكن عنده من شيعتنا ومحبيننا كتاب سليم بن قيس الهلالي، فليس عنده من أمرنا شيء، ولا يعلم من أسبابنا شيئا، وهو أبجد الشيعة، وسر من اسرار آل محمد (عليهم السلام) "

⁷ Bihar Al Awaar – V 40, The book of History – Amir Al Momineen^{-asws}, Ch 124 H 40 b

⁸ Shaykh Tusi (995–1067 CE) from the Rijāl al-Kashshī ("al-Kashshī's Men") by Muhammad ibn Umar al-Kashshī (c. 854–941/951)

Rijāl al-Najāshī ("al-Najāshī's Men"), by Ahmad ibn ‘Alī al-Najāshī (c. 982–1058)

⁹ See for example: <https://www.al-islam.org/jurisprudence-and-its-principles-murtadha-mutahhari/principles-jurisprudence-usul-al-fiqh#:~:text=The%20Principles%20of%20Jurisprudence,%20bearing%20in%20mind%20that%20its%20concern>

The Sheykh Abdul Naby Al Kazmy in *Takmalat Al Rijaal* said, ‘I copied from the writing of Al Majlisi, may Allah^{-azwj} have Mercy upon him, who said, ‘I say that I found an old copy of Kitab Sulaym by two reports between which were simple differences, and written at the end of one of them was, “This completes Kitab Sulaym Bin Qays Al Hilali” – until it said – A report from Al-Sadiq^{-asws}, that he^{-asws} said: **‘The ones from our^{-asws} Shiites and those that loves us^{-asws}, who does not have Kitab Sulaym Bin Qays Al-Hilali, then there is nothing with him from our^{-asws} matters, nor does he know anything from our^{-asws} reasons, and it is the Alphabet (Abjad) of the Shiites, and a secret from the secrets of the Progeny^{-saww} of Mohammed^{-saww}.’**¹⁰

وَعَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ الْحُسَيْنِ الرَّبَازِيِّ عَنِ الْحُسَيْنِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ كَيْسَانَ عَنْ إِبْرَاهِيمَ بْنِ عُمَرَ الْيَمَانِيِّ عَنِ ابْنِ أُدَيْبَةَ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ قَالَ: هَذِهِ نُسخةُ كِتَابِ سُلَيْمِ بْنِ قَيْسِ الْعَامِرِيِّ ثُمَّ الْهَلَالِيِّ دَفَعَهُ إِلَى أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ وَفَرَأَهُ وَزَعَمَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ أَنَّهُ قَرَأَهُ عَلَى عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحُسَيْنِ ع - فَقَالَ صَدَقَ سُلَيْمٌ هَذَا حَدِيثٌ نَعَرْتُهُ.

And on the authority of Muhammad ibn Al-Hasan Al-Barathi on the authority of Al-Hasan ibn Ali ibn Kaysan on the authority of Ibrahim ibn Umar al-Yamani on the authority of Ibn Udaynah on the authority of Aban ibn Abi Ayyash who said: ‘This is a copy of the book of Sulaym ibn Qays al-Amiri, then al-Hilali gave it to Aban ibn Abi Ayyash and he read it and Aban claimed that he read it to Ali^{-asws} Ibn Al-Hussain^{-asws} said: ‘Sulaym is right. This is a hadith that we know.’¹¹

One may ask here, can one sieve through the thousands of Ahadith in order to find authentic ones? Yes, there are several Ahadith which guide and assist us in finding true and authentic words of Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws}, for example:

عن أبي جعفر الثاني عليه السلام في مناظرته مع يحيى بن أكنم - وسيجيئ بتمامه في موضعه - أنه قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله في حجة الوداع: قد كثرت علي الكذابة وستكثر فمن كذب علي متعمدا فليتبوأ مقعده من النار فإذا أتاكم الحديث فاعرضوه على كتاب الله وسنتي فما وافق كتاب الله وسنتي فخذوا به وما خالف كتاب الله وسنتي فلا تأخذوا به.

Abu Ja’far^{-asws} said: ‘Rasool-Allah^{-saww} said during the Farewell Hajj: ‘The lies are frequented upon me^{-asws} and will be even more frequent, so one who lies upon me^{-saww} deliberately, let him take his seat from the Fire. So, whenever the Hadeeth comes to you, then present it to the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my^{-saww} Sunnah, and whatever is in accordance with the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my^{-saww} Sunnah, take with it, and whatever differs with the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my^{-saww} Sunnah, do not take with it.’¹²

أحمد بن علي بن إبراهيم بن هاشم، عن أبيه علي، عن أبيه، عن النوفلي، عن السكوني، عن الصادق جعفر بن محمد، عن أبيه، عن جده عليهم السلام قال: قال علي عليه السلام: إن على كل حق حقيقة، وعلى كل صواب نورا، فما وافق كتاب الله فخذوه وما خالف كتاب الله فدعوه.

Ahmad Bin Ali Bin Ibrahim Bin Hashim, from his father Ali, from his father, from Al Nowfali, from Al Sakuni,

¹⁰ AL MUSTADRAK AL WASAAIL – H 21397

¹¹ وسائل الشيعة، ج 27، ص: 101

¹² Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 29 H 2

‘From Imam Al-Sadiq Ja’far^{-asws} Bin Muhammad^{-asws}, from his^{-asws} father^{-asws}, from his^{-asws} grandfather^{-asws} having said: ‘(Imam) Ali^{-asws} said: ‘Upon every true (matter) there is a reality, and upon every correctness there is a light. So, whatever is in accordance with the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, take it, and whatever opposes the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, leave it!’¹³

In a lengthy Hadith, the 10th Imam^{-asws} says:

ثُمَّ قَالَ عَ إِذَا شَهِدَ الْكِتَابُ بِتَصَدِيقِ خَيْرٍ وَ تَحْقِيقِهِ فَأَنْكَرْتَهُ طَائِفَةٌ مِنَ الْأُمَّةِ وَ عَارَضْتَهُ بِحَدِيثٍ مِنْ هَذِهِ الْأَحَادِيثِ الْمُرَوَّرَةِ صَارَتْ بِإِنْكَارِهَا وَ دَفْعِهَا الْكِتَابُ كُفَّارًا ضَلَالًا

Then he^{-asws} said: ‘If the Book testifies to the truthfulness and verification of a Hadith (regardless of its narrators), and a group of the nation denies it and opposes it with one of these forged hadiths, then by denying and rejecting the Book they become misguided infidels.

وَ أَصَحُّ خَيْرٍ مَا عُرِفَ تَحْقِيقُهُ مِنَ الْكِتَابِ مِثْلُ الْحَبْرِ الْمُجْمَعِ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَ حَيْثُ قَالَ إِنِّي مُسْتَخْلِفٌ فِيكُمْ خَلِيفَتَيْنِ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ وَ عَثْرَتِي مَا إِن تَمَسَّكْتُمْ بِهِمَا لَنْ تَضِلُّوا بَعْدِي وَ إِهْمَا لَنْ يَفْتَرَقَا حَتَّى يَرِدَا عَلَيَّ الْحَوْضَ

‘And the most correct of what is recognised by its investigation from the Book is like the Hadeeth, the united upon, from Rasool-Allah^{-saww} where he^{-saww} said: “I^{-saww} am leaving behind among you all, two Caliphs – the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my^{-saww} family^{-asws}. Whoever attaches with these two will never stray after me^{-asws}, and these two will never separate from each other until they return to me^{-saww} at the Fountain” (an extract).¹⁴

For more details on establishing the authenticity of a Hadith from Quran and Sunnah of Prophet^{-saww}, see for example: Authenticity of a Hadith and its Criteria | Hubeali.com

Finally, one may ask why is there a need for mentioning the names of the narrators in a chain of Ahadith? This is as per Ahadith, Masomeen^{-asws} who have instructed us to mention the narrators so if it is a lie from them (or one of them) then he would be hold responsible for ascribing lies. Also, Masomeen^{-asws} have narrated and encouraged that the Ahadith, where possible, to be reported in a ‘Marfu’ manner, where the chain of narrators ends up to Rasool Allah^{-saww}, below we quote two Ahadith related to why there is a need to mention the names of the narrators, additional Ahadith examples are included in the Appendix II.

عَلَيْ بِنِ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ وَ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ خَالِدٍ عَنِ النَّوْفَلِيِّ عَنِ السَّكُونِيِّ عَنِ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) قَالَ قَالَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) (إِذَا حَدَّثْتُمْ بِحَدِيثٍ فَأَسْبِدُوهُ إِلَى الَّذِي حَدَّثَكُمْ فَإِنْ كَانَ حَقًّا فَلَكُمْ وَ إِنْ كَانَ كَذِبًا فَعَلَيْهِ .

Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, and from Ahmad Bin Muhammad Bin Khalid, from Al Nowfaly, from Al Sakuny,

¹³ Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 29 H 4

¹⁴ Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 29 H 3

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah^{-asws} having said: ‘Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} said: ‘Whenever you narrate a Hadeeth, so link it to the one who narrated it to you. So if it was true, it would be for you, and if it was a lie, so it would be upon him.’¹⁵

وَبِهَذَا الْإِسْنَادِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ رَفَعَهُ قَالَ قَالَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ) إِذَا كَذِبَ الْمُفْتَرِعُ قِيلَ لَهُ وَ مَا الْكُذِبُ الْمُفْتَرِعُ قَالَ أَنْ تُحَدِّثَكَ الرَّجُلُ بِالْحَدِيثِ فَتَنْزِعَهُ وَ تَرْوِيهِ عَنِ الَّذِي حَدَّثَكَ عَنْهُ .

And by this chain, from Muhammad Bin Ali, raising it, said,

Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said: ‘Beware of the branched out lie!’ It was said to him^{-asws}, ‘And what is the branched out lie?’ He^{-asws} said: ‘A man narrates to you a Hadeeth, so you neglect him and report it from the person from whom he had narrated the Hadeeth.’¹⁶

Before we look at the origin of Ilmul Rijal and practices of the Ahl Al-Bayt-asws on refuting the fabricated Ahadith, we can sum up the above discussion:

Conclusions of the Summary:

Since Ilmul Rijal is a man-made tool, without having any Islamic basis, its application has severe consequences, e.g., instead of understanding Ahadith from Quran and other Ahadith, Ahadith are characterised into various forms (i.e., over 50 types) thereby creating doubts and conviction in the religion. The Holy Quran we have in our hands today, was compiled by Usman Ibn Affan (i.e., known as Sahifa e Usmaniya), can one characterise its Verses like the way Ahadith are characterised? However, we disregard Ilmul Rijal here and turn to Ahadith in the interpretation of Quranic Verses, which is a correct approach as per Ahadith. So why would one not adhere to the criteria given in Ahadith for establishing the authenticity of Ahadith? From the above cited Ahadith, if one applies Ilmul Rijal on Ahadith, Ibn Abbas – who was declared corrupt by Amir Al-Momineen Imam Ali^{-asws} – is treated as a trustworthy Ahadith narrator, whereas two Imams^{-asws} (the 4th and 6th) had accepted the Kitab Sulym bin Qais Hilali; but when the flawed tool of Ilmul Rijal is applied, ‘Abaan’ (the main transmitter of the book) is considered unreliable and hence doubts are casted regarding the authenticity of the first Shia book.

The origin of the Ilmul Rijal:

The origin of Ilmul Rijal can be traced from the ‘*Tafseer Bil Ra'yi*’ (interpretation by opinion), of the following Quranic Verse:

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِن جَاءَكُمْ فَاسِقٌ بِنَبَأٍ فَتَبَيَّنُوا أَنْ تُصِيبُوا قَوْمًا بِجَهَالَةٍ فَتُصْحَبُوا عَلَيَّ مَا فَعَلْتُمْ نَادِمِينَ {49:6}

¹⁵ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book of Intellect and Ignorance CH 17 H 7

¹⁶ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book of Intellect and Ignorance CH 17 H 12

O you who believe! If a transgressor comes to you with news, then investigate, lest you harm a people in ignorance, and you would become remorseful upon what you have done [49:6]

In the Holy Verse [49:6], Allah^{-azwj} has already Said that if a transgressor brings a piece of news, then investigate the news - as it could either be correct or false ‘news’. In the event of correct news, one has to accept the news - even if it was originally transmitted by a wicked person! This would eradicate the reliance of the above man-made criteria, i.e., ‘Ilmul Rijal - but why? For example, in a Hadith:

عَنْهُ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحَكَمِ عَنْ أَبِي بِنِ عُثْمَانَ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ أَبِي يَعْفُورٍ قَالَ عَلِيُّ وَ حَدَّثَنِي الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ أَبِي الْعَلَاءِ أَنَّهُ حَضَرَ ابْنَ أَبِي يَعْفُورٍ فِي هَذَا الْمَجْلِسِ قَالَ: سَأَلْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنِ الْخْتِلَافِ الْحَدِيثِ يَرَوِيهِ مَنْ يَتَّقُ بِهِ وَ فِيهِمْ مَنْ لَا يَتَّقُ بِهِ فَقَالَ إِذَا وَرَدَ عَلَيْكُمْ حَدِيثٌ فَوَجَدْتُمُوهُ لَهُ شَاهِدٌ مِنْ كِتَابِ اللَّهِ أَوْ مِنْ قَوْلِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص وَ إِلَّا فَالَّذِي جَاءَكُمْ بِهِ أَوْلَى بِهِ¹⁷.

From him, from Ali Bin Al hakam, from Abaan Bin Usman, from Abdullah Bin Abu Yafour, from Al Husayn Bin Abu Al a’ala who was present with Abu Yafour in this gathering, said,

‘I asked Abu Abdullah^{-asws} about the differing in the Hadeeth, shall I report it from the one whom I trust it with, and among them were ones whom I do not trust with it?’ So he^{-asws} said: ‘When a Hadeeth is reported to you, and you find evidence for it **from the Book of Allah^{-azwj}, or from the words of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}**, and whoever, he who brought it to you is more deserving of it (True Hadeeth).’¹⁸

How did the Holy Imams^{-asws} Refute the False Ahadith?

Based on the criteria of the Hadith above (that a Hadith is to be compared with the Book or Words of Rasool Allah^{-saww}), Imam Ali Al-Reza^{-asws} refuted several fabricated Ahadith, in the court of Al-Ma’mum Al-Rashid, when a deliberate attempt was made to praise some unworthy companions of Rasool Allah^{-saww}:

الإحتجاج وَ رُوِيَ أَنَّ الْمَأْمُونُ بَعْدَ مَا زَوَّجَ ابْنَتَهُ أُمَّ الْفَضْلِ أَبَا جَعْفَرٍ ع كَانَ فِي مَجْلِسٍ وَ عِنْدَهُ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ ع وَ يَحْيَى بْنُ أَسْبَغٍ وَ جَمَاعَةٌ كَثِيرَةٌ

(The book) ‘Al-Ihtijaj’ –

‘And it is reported that Al-Mamoun, after having got his daughter Umm Al-Fazl married to Abu Ja’far^{-asws}, was in a gathering and in his presence were Abu Ja’far^{-asws}, and Yahya Bin Aksam, and a large group.

فَقَالَ لَهُ يَحْيَى بْنُ أَسْبَغٍ مَا تَقُولُ يَا ابْنَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فِي الْخَبْرِ الَّذِي رُوِيَ أَنَّهُ نَزَلَ جِبْرَائِيلُ عَ عَلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص وَ قَالَ يَا مُحَمَّدُ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ يُقْرَأُكَ السَّلَامَ وَ يَقُولُ لَكَ سَلِّ أَبَا بَكْرٍ هَلْ هُوَ عَنِّي رَاضٍ فَإِنِّي عَنْهُ رَاضٍ

Yahya Bin Aksam said to him^{-asws}, ‘O son^{-asws} of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}! What are you^{-asws} saying regarding the Hadeeth which is being reported that Jibraeel^{-as} had descended unto Rasool-Allah^{-saww} and said: ‘O Muhammad^{-saww}! Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic Conveys the Greetings

¹⁷ (1) – ج 1، «باب علل اختلاف الاخبار و كيفية الجمع بينها» (ص 137، س 6).

¹⁸ Al Mahaasin – V 1 Bk 5 H 145

to you^{-saww} and Says to you^{-saww}: ‘Ask Abu Bakr, is he pleased with Me^{-azwj}, for I^{-azwj} am Pleased with him!’”

فَقَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ لَسْتُ بِمُنْكَرٍ فَضَّلَ أَبِي بَكْرٍ وَ لَكِنْ يَجِبُ عَلَيَّ صَاحِبِ هَذَا الْحَبْرِ أَنْ يَأْخُذَ مِثَالَ الْحَبْرِ الَّذِي قَالَهُ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص فِي حَبْجَةِ الْوَدَاعِ قَدْ كَثُرَتْ عَلَيَّ الْكُذَابَةُ وَ سَتَكُثُرُ فَمَنْ كَذَبَ عَلَيَّ مُتَعَمِّدًا فَلْيَسْتَبِرْهُ مَقْعَدُهُ مِنَ النَّارِ فَإِذَا أَتَاكُمْ الْحَدِيثُ فَاعْرِضُوهُ عَلَيَّ كِتَابِ اللَّهِ وَ سُنَّتِي فَمَا وَافَقَ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ وَ سُنَّتِي فَخُذُوا بِهِ وَ مَا خَالَفَ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ وَ سُنَّتِي فَلَا تَأْخُذُوا بِهِ

Abu Ja’far^{-asws} said: ‘I^{-asws} am not a denier of the merit of Abu Bakr, but it obligated upon the owner (reporter) of this Hadeeth that he takes an example of the Hadeeth which Rasool-Allah^{-saww} had said during the farewell Hajj: ‘The liars upon me^{-saww} have become a lot, and they will be becoming ever more. The one who lies upon me deliberately, so let him assume his seat from the Fire! So, whenever a Hadeeth comes to you, then present it to the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my Sunnah. Whatever is in accordance with the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my Sunnah, take with it, and whatever opposes the Book of Allah^{-azwj} and my^{-saww} Sunnah, do not take with it.

وَ لَيْسَ يُوَافِقُ هَذَا الْحَبْرُ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ قَالَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى وَ لَقَدْ خَلَقْنَا الْإِنْسَانَ وَ نَعْلَمُ مَا تُسْوِسُ بِهِ نَفْسُهُ وَ نَحْنُ أَقْرَبُ إِلَيْهِ مِنْ حَبْلِ الْوَرِيدِ فَاللَّهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ خَفِيَ عَلَيْهِ رِضَا أَبِي بَكْرٍ مِنْ سَخَطِهِ حَتَّى سَأَلَ مِنْ مَكُونٍ سِرَّهُ هَذَا مُسْتَجِيبًا فِي الْعُمُولِ

And this Hadeeth is not in accordance with the Book of Allah^{-azwj}. Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted Said: ***And We Created the human being, and We know what his mind suggests to his self, and We are nearer to him than his jugular vein [50:16]***. Would Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic Hide from him the pleasure of Abu Bakr from his anger until He^{-azwj} Asks from His^{-azwj} hidden secrets? This is impossible in the intellects!’

ثُمَّ قَالَ يَحْيَى بْنُ أَكْثَمٍ وَ قَدْ رُوِيَ أَنَّ مِثْلَ أَبِي بَكْرٍ وَ عُمَرَ فِي الْأَرْضِ كَمِثْلِ جِبْرَائِيلَ وَ مِيكَائِيلَ فِي السَّمَاءِ

Then Yahya Bin Aksam said, ‘And it has been reported that an example of Abu Bakr and Umar in the earth is like an example of Jibraeel^{-as} and Mikaeel^{-as} in the sky’.

فَقَالَ وَ هَذَا أَيْضًا يَجِبُ أَنْ يُنْظَرَ فِيهِ لِأَنَّ جِبْرَائِيلَ وَ مِيكَائِيلَ مَلَكَانِ اللَّهِ مُقَرَّبَانِ لَمْ يَعْصِيَا اللَّهَ قَطُّ وَ لَمْ يُفَارِقَا طَاعَتَهُ لِحُظَّةٍ وَاحِدَةٍ وَ هُمَا قَدْ أَشْرَكَا بِاللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ وَ إِنْ أَسْلَمَا بَعْدَ الشِّرْكِ وَ كَانَ أَكْثَرُ أَيَّامِهِمَا فِي الشِّرْكِ بِاللَّهِ فَمُحَالٌ أَنْ يُشَبَّهَهُمَا بِحَيٍّ

He^{-asws} said: ‘And this as well obligates that one looks into it, because Jibraeel^{-as} and Mikaeel^{-as} are ones of proximity to Allah^{-azwj}. They^{-as} do not disobey Allah^{-azwj} at all, nor do they separate from His^{-azwj} obedience for one moment, and these two (Abu Bakr and Umar) had associated with Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic, and they became Muslims after the Shirk, and most of their days (life) were in Shirk with Allah^{-azwj}. It is therefore impossible that these two can be resembled with those two.’

قَالَ يَحْيَى وَ قَدْ رُوِيَ أَيْضًا أَنَّهُمَا سَيِّدَا كُهُولِ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ فَمَا تَقُولُ فِيهِ

Yahya said, ‘And it has been reported as well that these two (Abu Bakr and Umar) are two chiefs of the elderly people of the Paradise. So, what (are) you^{-asws} saying regarding it?’

فَقَالَ ع وَ هَذَا الْحَبْرُ مُحَالٌ أَيْضاً لِأَنَّ أَهْلَ الْجَنَّةِ كُلَّهُمْ يَكُونُونَ شَبَاباً وَ لَا يَكُونُ فِيهِمْ كَهْلٌ وَ هَذَا الْحَبْرُ وَضَعَهُ بَنُو أُمِّيَّةٍ لِمُضَادَّةِ الْحَبْرِ الَّذِي قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ
ص فِي الْحُسَيْنِ وَ الْحُسَيْنِ بِأَتَمِّمَا سَيِّدَا شَبَابِ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ

He^{-asws} said: ‘And this Hadeeth is an impossibility as well because the people of Paradise, all of them would be youths, and there will not happen to be any elderly among them. And this Hadeeth has been placed by the clan of Umayya in order to oppose the Hadeeth which Rasool-Allah^{-saww} said regarding Al-Hassan^{-asws} and Al-Husayn^{-asws}, that they^{-asws} are two chiefs of the youths of people of Paradise.’

قال الشيخ قنّس سرّه في تلخيص الشافعي: و أما الخبر الذي يتضمن أنّهما سيّدا كهول أهل الجنة، فمن تأمل أصل هذا الخبر بعين انصاف علم أنّه موضوع في أيام بني أميّة معارضة لما روى من قوله صلّى الله عليه و آله في الحسن و الحسين: أنّهما سيّدا شباب أهل الجنة و أبوهما خير منهما.

Note: *The Sheykh said in ‘Talkhees Al Shafy’, ‘And as for the Hadeeth which comprises that these two (Abu Bakr and Umar) are two chiefs of the elderly people of Paradise’, so the one who contemplates on the origin of this Hadeeth with an eye of fairness would know that it was placed during the days of the clan of Umayya in contradiction to what is reported from his^{-saww} words, may the Salawaat of Allah^{-azwj} be upon him^{-saww}, regarding Al-Hassan^{-asws} and Al-Husayn^{-asws} that they^{-asws} are two chiefs of the youths of people of Paradise, and their^{-asws} father^{-asws} is better than them^{-asws}.’*

و هذا الخبر الذي ادعوه يروونه عن عبيد الله بن عمر، و حال عبيد الله في الانحراف عن أهل البيت معروفة، و هو أيضا كالجار الى نفسه.

And this Hadeeth, which is claiming it had been reported from Ubeydullah Bin Umar, and the state of Ubeydullah in turning away from People^{-asws} of the Household is well known and is as well like the one pulling to himself.

على أنّه لا يخلو من أن يريد بقوله «سيّدا كهول أهل الجنة» أنّهما سيّدا كهول من هو في الجنة، أو يراد أنّهما سيّدا من يدخل الجنة من كهول الدنيا.

(It is) based upon that it is not vacant from that it is intended by its words, ‘Two chiefs of the elderly people of Paradise’ – they are chiefs of elderly of the ones who are in the Paradise, or it is intended that they are two chiefs of the ones from the elderly of the world who would be entering the Paradise.

فان كان الأول فذلك باطل لان رسول الله قد وقفنا- و أجمعت الأمة- على أن جميع أهل الجنة جرد مرد، و أنّه لا يدخلها كهول،

So if it were the first, that is false because Rasool-Allah^{-saww} has made us aware and the community is united upon that entirety of the people of Paradise would be hairless, tall, and an elderly would not enter it.

و ان كان الثاني- فذلك دافع و مناقض للحديث المجمع على روايته من قوله في الحسن و الحسين عليهما السلام «انّهما سيّدا شباب أهل الجنة و أبوهما خير منهما».

And if it were the second, so that is a repellent and contradictory to the Hadeeth, the concurred upon its reporting from his^{-saww} words regarding Al-Hassan^{-asws} and Al-Husayn^{-asws}, may the greetings be upon them^{-asws}, that they^{-asws} are two chiefs of the youths of the people of Paradise and their^{-asws} father^{-asws} is better than them^{-asws}.’

لان هذا الخبر يقتضى أنهما سيدا كل من يدخل الجنة اذ كان لا يدخلها إلا شباب فأبو بكر و عمر و كل كهل في الدنيا داخلون في جملة من يكونان عليهما السلام سيديه

(This is) because this Hadeeth contradicts, they are two chiefs of every one who enters the Paradise when no one except the youths would be entering it. So Abu Bakr and Umar, and every elderly in the world are included in the totality that they^{asws} would be their chiefs.

و الخبر الذي رووه يقتضى أن أبا بكر و عمر سيدهما من حيث كانا سيدي الكهول في الدنيا و هما عليهما السلام من جملة من كان كهلا في الدنيا.

And the Hadeeth, which is reported, contradicts, Abu Bakr and Umar are their^{asws} chiefs from where they are two chiefs of the elderly in the word, and they^{asws} are from the totality of the ones who are elderly in the world.'

فَقَالَ بَحْيَى بْنُ أَكْثَمَ وَ رُوِيَ أَنَّ عُمَرَ بْنَ الْخَطَّابِ سِرَاجُ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ

Yahya Bin Aksan said, 'And it is reported that Umar Bin Al-Khattab is a lantern of the people of Paradise.'

فَقَالَ ع وَ هَذَا أَيْضاً مُحَالٌ لِأَنَّ فِي الْجَنَّةِ مَلَائِكَةَ اللَّهِ الْمُقَرَّبِينَ وَ آدَمَ وَ مُحَمَّدَ [مُحَمَّدًا] وَ جَمِيعَ الْأَنْبِيَاءِ وَ الْمُرْسَلِينَ لَا تُضِيءُ بِأَنْوَارِهِمْ حَتَّى تُضِيءَ بِنُورِ عُمَرَ

He^{asws} said: 'And this as well is impossible, because in the Paradise there are Angels of Allah^{azwj}, the ones of proximity, and Adam^{as} and Muhammad^{saww} and entirety of the Prophets and the Messengers^{as}, can they not be illuminated except the by the Noor of Umar?'

بل الظاهر من قوله تعالى i« مُتَّكِبِينَ فِيهَا عَلَى الْأَرَائِكِ لَا يَرَوْنَ فِيهَا شَمْسًا وَ لَا زَمْهَرِيرًا» E\ الدهر: 13 و قوله تعالى i« هُمْ وَ أَزْوَاجُهُمْ فِي ظِلَالٍ عَلَى الْأَرَائِكِ مُتَّكِبُونَ» E\ يس: 57 أن الجنة ليس فيها ظلام حتى يحتاج الى السراج.

Note: But the apparent from the Words of the Exalted: **Reclining therein upon the couches, neither seeing (heat of a) sun therein nor intense cold [76:13], and Words of the Exalted: They and their wives would be in shades, reclining upon the couches [36:56]. The Paradise, there isn't any darkness in it until one could be needy to the lantern.**

فَقَالَ بَحْيَى وَ قَدْ رُوِيَ أَنَّ السَّكِينَةَ تَنْطِقُ عَلَى لِسَانِ عُمَرَ

Yahya said, 'And it has been reported that the tranquillity speaks upon the tongue of Umar.'

فَقَالَ ع لَسْتُ بِمَنْكِرٍ فَضَائِلِ عُمَرَ وَ لَكِنَّ أَبَا بَكْرٍ أَفْضَلُ مِنْ عُمَرَ فَقَالَ عَلَى رَأْسِ الْمِنْبَرِ إِنَّ لِي شَيْطَانًا يَغْتَرِبُنِي فَإِذَا مَلْتُ فَسَدْتُوِي -

He^{asws} said: 'I^{asws} am not a denier of the merits of Umar, but Abu Bakr is superior to Umar. He had said on top of the pulpit, 'There is a Satan^{la} for me appearing to me. So whenever I deviate, then guide me!''

قد قال ذلك و شبهه غير مرة، فمن ذلك قوله « انى وليت عليكم و لست بخيركم فان رأيتموني على الحق فأعينوني، و ان رأيتموني على الباطل فسدوني»

Note: *He had said that and resembling it, more than once. From that are his words, ‘I am ruling upon you, and I am not the best of you. If you were to see me upon the truth, then assist me, and if you see me upon the falsehood, then guide me’.*

و قوله: «أما والله ما أنا بخيركم ولقد كنت لمقامي هذا كارها، ولوددت أن فيكم من يكفيني، أفتظنون أني أعمل فيكم بسنة رسول الله؟ اذن لا أقوم بها، ان رسول الله كان يعصم بالوحي، وكان معه ملك، وان لي شيطانا يعتريني، فإذا غضبت فاجتنبوني أن لا أؤثر في اشعاركم و ابشاركم الا فراعوني فان استقمتم فأعبنوني، وان زغت فقوموني.

And his words, ‘But, by Allah^{-azwj}! I am not the best of you all, and I had been abhorrent to this position of mine, and I would have loved it if there was someone among you who could suffice me. Are you thinking that I shall be conducting among you all with the Sunnah of Rasool-Allah^{-sawww}? Then I shall not be standing by it. Rasool-Allah^{-sawww} was protected by the Revelation, and there was an Angel with him^{-sawww}, and for me there is a Satan^{-la} appearing to me. Whenever I am angry, then stay away from me. If I don’t prefer regarding your poems and your news then look after me. If I am straight, then assist me, and if I am crooked, then straighten me.’

قال السيد حسين بحر العلوم في هامش تلخيص الشافي ج 2 ص 9: وهذه العبارات و شبهها تجد كتب القوم منها ملأى. راجع مسند أحمد ج 1 ص 14 و الرياض النضرة ج 1 ص 170 و كنز العمال ج 3 ص 126 و طبقات ابن سعد ج 3 ص 139 و الإمامة و السياسة ج 1 ص 16 و تاريخ الطبري ج 3 ص 210 و سيرة ابن هشام ج 4 ص 340

The Seyyid Husayn Bahr Al Uloom said in the notes of ‘Talkhees Al Shafy’ V 2 P 9, ‘And with these expressions and its resembling, you will find books of the people filled with it. Refer to ‘Musnad’ of Ahmad V 1 P 14, and ‘Al Riyaz Al Nazara’ V 1 P 170, and ‘Kanz Al Ammal’ V 3 P 126, and ‘Tabaqaat Ibn Sa’ad’ V 3 P 139, and ‘Al Imamah Wa Al Siyasa’ V 1 P 16, and ‘Tareekh’ of Al Tabari V 3 P 210, and ‘Seerah’ of Ibn Hisham V 4 P 340.

(اقول و في الطبعة الأخيرة منها ج 2 ص 661) و عيون الأخبار ج 2 ص 234 و العقد الفريد ج 2 ص 158 و تاريخ الخلفاء للسيوطي ص 47 و السيرة الحلبية ج 3 ص 388 و شرح ابن أبي الحديد ج 1 ص 134 و تهذيب الكمال ج 1 ص 6 و المجتني لابن دريد ص 27 و غيرها كثير من كتب القوم.

I (Majlisi) am saying, ‘And in ‘Al Tab’at Al Akheera’, from it V 2 P 661, and ‘Uyoon Al Akhbar’ V 2 P 234, and ‘Al Iqd’ of Al Fareed V 2 P 158, and ‘Tareekh Al Khulafa’ of Al Suyuti P 47, and ‘Al Seerah Al Hakabiya’ V 3 P 388, and ‘Sharah’ of Ibn Al Hadeed V 1 P 134, and ‘Tahzeeb Al Kamaal V 1 P 6, and ‘Al Majtana’ of Ibn Dareyd P 27, and other such, a lot from the books of the people.

فَقَالَ بَحْيَى قَدْ رَوَى أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ لَوْ لَمْ أُبْعَثْ لَبِعِثَ عُمَرُ

Yahya said, ‘It is being reported that the Prophet^{-sawww} said; ‘If I^{-sawww} had not been Sent, Umar would have been Sent (as Prophet^{-as}).’

فَقَالَ ع كِتَابُ اللَّهِ أَصْدَقُ مِنْ هَذَا الْحَدِيثِ يَقُولُ اللَّهُ فِي كِتَابِهِ وَ إِذْ أَخَذْنَا مِنَ النَّبِيِّينَ مِيثَاقَهُمْ وَ مِنْكَ وَ مِنْ نُوحٍ فَقَدْ أَخَذَ اللَّهُ مِيثَاقَ النَّبِيِّينَ فَكَيْفَ يُكْفَرُ أَنْ يُبَدَلَ مِيثَاقُهُ وَ كَانَ الْأَنْبِيَاءُ ع لَمْ يُشْرِكُوا طَرْفَةَ عَيْنٍ

He^{-asws} said: ‘The Book of Allah^{-azwj} is more truthful than this Hadeeth. Allah^{-azwj} is Saying in His^{-azwj} Book: **And when We Took from the Prophets, their Covenants, and from you, and from Noah [33:7]**. Allah^{-azwj} had Taken the Covenant of the Prophets^{-as}, so how is it possible that He^{-azwj} would Replace His^{-azwj} Covenant, and the Prophets^{-as} did not commit Shirk even for the blink of an eye?

فَكَيْفَ يُبْعَثُ بِالنَّبِيِّ مَنْ أَشْرَكَ وَ كَانَ أَكْثَرَ أَيَّامِهِ مَعَ الشِّرْكِ بِاللَّهِ وَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص نُبِئْتُ وَ آدَمُ بَيْنَ الرُّوحِ وَ الْجَسَدِ

‘How can He^{-azwj} Send with the Prophet-hood someone who had committed Shirk, and most of his days were with the Shirk with Allah^{-azwj}? And Rasool-Allah^{-saww} was a Prophet^{-saww} while Adam^{-as} was between the spirit and the body!’

فَقَالَ يَحْيَى بْنُ أَكْثَمٍ وَ قَدْ رُوِيَ أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ ص قَالَ مَا احْتَسَبَ الْوَحْيِي عَنِّي قَطُّ إِلَّا ظَنَنْتُهُ قَدْ نَزَلَ عَلَيَّ آلِ الْخَطَّابِ

Yahya Bin Aksam said, ‘And it is being reported that the Prophet^{-saww} said: ‘The Revelation was not Withheld from me^{-saww} at all except I^{-saww} thought it had been Revealed upon the family of Al-Khattab.’

فَقَالَ ع وَ هَذَا مُحَالٌ أَيْضاً لِأَنَّهُ لَا يَجُوزُ أَنْ يَشْرَكَ النَّبِيُّ ص فِي نُبُوَّتِهِ قَالَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى اللَّهُ يَصْطَفِي مِنَ الْمَلَائِكَةِ رُسُلًا وَ مِنَ النَّاسِ فَكَيْفَ يُمَكِّنُ أَنْ تَنْتَقِلَ النُّبُوَّةُ مِمَّنْ اصْطَفَاهُ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى إِلَى مَنْ أَشْرَكَ بِهِ

He^{-asws} said: ‘And this is impossible because it is not allowed that the Prophet^{-saww} would doubt regarding his^{-saww} own Prophet-hood. Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted Said: **Allah Chooses messengers from among the Angels and from the people; surely Allah is Hearing, Seeing [22:75]**. How is it possible that the Prophet-hood would be transferred from the one Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted had Chosen to the one who was committing Shirk with Him^{-azwj}?’

قَالَ يَحْيَى بْنُ أَكْثَمٍ رُوِيَ أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ ص قَالَ لَوْ نَزَلَ الْعَذَابُ لَمَا نَجَا مِنْهُ إِلَّا عُمَرُ

Yahya Bin Aksam said, ‘It is reported that the Prophet^{-saww} said: ‘If the Punishment were to descend, no one would be saved from it except Umar.’

فَقَالَ ع وَ هَذَا مُحَالٌ أَيْضاً إِنَّ اللَّهَ تَعَالَى يَقُولُ وَ مَا كَانَ اللَّهُ لِيُعَذِّبَهُمْ وَ أَنْتَ فِيهِمْ وَ مَا كَانَ اللَّهُ مُعَذِّبَهُمْ وَ هُمْ يَسْتَغْفِرُونَ فَأَحْبَبَ سُبْحَانَهُ أَنْ لَا يُعَذِّبَ أَحَدًا مَا دَامَ فِيهِمْ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص وَ مَا دَامُوا يَسْتَغْفِرُونَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى.

He^{-asws} said: ‘This is impossible as well. Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted is Saying: **And Allah was not going to Punish them while you were among them, nor would Allah Punish them while they are seeking Forgiveness [8:33]**. The Glorious has Informed that He^{-azwj} will not Punish anyone for as long as Rasool-Allah^{-saww} is among them, and for as long as they (people) are seeking Forgiveness of Allah^{-azwj} the Exalted.’¹⁹

¹⁹ Bihar Al Anwaar – V 50, The book of History – Muhammad Bin Ali^{asws}, Ch 4 H 6

A Hadith can be taken from a liar if its words are true:

تَفْسِيرُ فُرَاتِ بْنِ إِبْرَاهِيمَ، عَنْ يَحْيَى بْنِ زِيَادٍ رَفَعَهُ عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ شَيْمِرٍ قَالَ: سَأَلْتُ جَعْفَرَ بْنَ مُحَمَّدٍ عِزِّي أَوْمُ قَوْمِي فَأَجْهَرُ بِ بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

Tafseer Furaat Bin Ibrahim – from Yahya Bin Ziyad, raising it, from Amro Bin Shimr who said,

‘I asked Ja’far^{-asws} Bin Muhammad^{-asws}, ‘I tend to lead my people (in Salat), and I am loud with: ***In the Name of Allah the Beneficent, the Merciful [1:1].***’

قَالَ نَعَمْ حَقٌّ فَأَجْهَرُ بِهَا قَدْ جَهَرَ بِهَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص

He^{-asws} said: ‘Yes, true, be loud with it, for Rasool-Allah^{-saww} had been loud with it.’

ثُمَّ قَالَ إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ ص كَانَ مِنْ أَحْسَنِ النَّاسِ صَوْتًا بِالْقُرْآنِ فَإِذَا قَامَ مِنَ اللَّيْلِ يُصَلِّي جَاءَ أَبُو جَهْلٍ وَ الْمُشْرِكُونَ يَسْتَمِعُونَ قِرَاءَتَهُ فَإِذَا قَالَ بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ - وَضَعُوا أَصَابِعَهُمْ فِي آذَانِهِمْ وَ هَرَبُوا فَإِذَا فَرَغَ مِنْ ذَلِكَ جَاءُوا فَاسْتَمَعُوا

Then he^{-asws} said: ‘Rasool-Allah^{-saww} was from most excellent of people in voice with the Quran. When he^{-saww} stood from the night and prayed Salat, Abu Jahl^{-la} and the Polytheists came listening to his^{-saww} recitation. When he^{-saww} said: ***In the Name of Allah the Beneficent, the Merciful [1:1]***, they placed their fingers in their ears and they fled. When he^{-saww} was free from that, they came (back) and listened.’

وَ كَانَ أَبُو جَهْلٍ يَقُولُ إِنَّ ابْنَ أَبِي كَبْشَةَ لَيُرِدُّ اسْمَ رَبِّهِ إِنَّهُ لَيُجِبُهُ

And Abu Jahl^{-la} had said, ‘Ibn Abu Kabasha (i.e. Rasool-Allah^{-saww}) tends to repeat the Name of his^{-saww} Lord^{-azwj}. He^{-saww} loves Him^{-azwj}.’

فَقَالَ جَعْفَرٌ صَدَقَ وَ إِنْ كَانَ كَذُوبًا

Ja’far Sadiq^{-asws} said: ‘He^{-la} (Abu Jahl) spoke truth and even though he^{-la} was a liar.’

قَالَ فَأَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ وَ إِذَا ذَكَرْتَ رَبَّكَ فِي الْقُرْآنِ وَحْدَهُ وَلَوْ عَلَىٰ أَدْبَارِهِمْ نُفُورًا وَ هُوَ بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ - .

He^{-asws} said: ‘Allah^{-azwj} Revealed: ***And whenever you mention your Lord in the Quran as being One, they turn around upon their backs in aversion [17:46]***, and it is: ***In the Name of Allah the Beneficent, the Merciful [1:1].***’²⁰

In another Hadith:

Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} Ratified that Usman spoke the truth

فعثمان على ما كان عليه خير منهما. ولقد قال منذ أيام قولنا رققت له وأعجبتني مقالته. بينما أنا قاعد عنده في بيته إذ أتته عائشة وحفصة تطلبان ميراثهما من ضياع رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وأمواله التي بيده، فقال: (لا والله ولا كرامة لكما ولا نعمت عنه ولكن أجزيت شهادتكما على أنفسكما.

²⁰ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 81 – The Book Salat – Ch 46 H 29

فإنكما شهدتما عند أبيكما أنكما سمعتما من رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله يقول: (النبى لا يورث، ما ترك فهو صدقة). ثم لقتما أعرابيا جلفا يبول على عقبه ويتطهر ببوله (مالك بن أوس بن الحدثان) فشهد معكما، ولم يكن في أصحاب رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله من المهاجرين ولا من الأنصار أحد شهد بذلك غيركما وغير أعرابي.

As for Usman, he was better than the two of them. He said some words, days ago, that I^{-asws} sympathised with and his speech pleased me^{-asws}. I^{-asws} was seated in his presence at his house when Aisha and Hafsa came over seeking their inheritance from the loss of the Messenger of Allah^{-saww}, and their wealth which was in his hands. He said, ‘No, by Allah^{-azwj}, there is no honour for the two of you, nor any enjoyment from it, but I have been permitted by the very testimonies that you two bore against yourselves. The two of you testified to your own two fathers that you two had heard the Messenger of Allah^{-saww} saying: ‘The Prophet^{-saww} does not bequeath, whatsoever that he^{-saww} leaves behind is charity’. Then the two of you teamed-up an uncouth Bedouin who was urinating like an animal and cleaning himself with his own urine (Malik Bin Aws Bin Al-Hadsaan), so he testified with the two of you. And there was none among the companions of the Messenger of Allah^{-saww} neither from the Emigrants nor from the Helpers who testified to that apart from the two of you and that Bedouin.

أما والله، ما أشك أنه قد كذب على رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وكذبتما عليه معه. ولكني أجزى شهادتكما على أنفسكما فاذهبا فلا حق لكما. فانصرفنا من عنده تلعنانه وتشتمانه. فقال: ارجعا، أليس قد شهدتما بذلك عند أبي بكر؟ قالتا: نعم. قال: فإن شهدتما بحق فلا حق لكما، وإن كنتما شهدتما بباطل فعليكما وعلى من أجاز شهادتكما على أهل هذا البيت لعنة الله والملائكة والناس أجمعين.

‘But, by Allah^{-azwj}, there is no doubt that he lied against the Messenger of Allah^{-saww}, and the two of you lied with him. But for me, I am permitted by the very testimonies of the two of you against your own selves, so go away, for there is no right for the two of you.’ So, the two of them left from his presence cursing and insulting him.

So he said, ‘Come back, did not the two of you testify that in the presence of Abu Bakr?’ They said, ‘Yes’. He said, ‘So if the two of you have testified by the truth, there is no right now for the two of you, and if the two of you have testified falsely, then upon the two of you, and the one who permitted your testimonies, are the Curses of Allah^{-azwj} and His^{-azwj} Angels, and all of the people.’

قال عليه السلام: ثم نظر إلي فتبسّم ثم قال: يا أبا الحسن، أشفتيك منهما؟ قلت: نعم، والله وأبلغت وقلت حقا، فلا يرغم الله إلا أنا فهما. فرقت لعثمان وعلمت أنه إنما أراد بذلك رضاي وأنه أقرب منهما رحما وأكف عنا منهما، ح وإن كان لا عذر له ولا حجة بتأميره علينا وادعائه حقا.

He^{-asws} said: ‘Then he (Usman) looked at me^{-asws}, smiled, then said, ‘O Abu Al-Hassan^{-asws}, was I just with two of them?’ I said, ‘Yes, by Allah^{-azwj}, you have conveyed and spoken the truth. Allah^{-azwj} will not but humiliate the two of them.’ I^{-asws} sympathised with Usman, and I^{-asws} knew that he only intended to please me^{-asws} by that, and he was similar to the two of them (Abu Bakr and Umar) in unjust, and held back from us^{-asws} (our rights) more than the two of

them, and it was not an excuse for him, nor an argument that he could construct against us^{-asws} and his claim over our^{-asws} rights.’²¹

Appendix I: Ahadith on some of the well-known liars

كش: سعد، عن محمد بن خالد الطيالسي، عن ابن أبي نجران، عن ابن سنان قال: قال أبو عبد الله عليه السلام: إنا أهل بيت صادقون لا نخلو من كذاب يكذب علينا ويسقط صدقنا بكذبه علينا عند الناس، كان رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله أصدق البرية لهجة وكان مسيلمة يكذب عليه،

Sa’ad, from Muhammad Bin Khalid Al Tayalisi, from Ibn Abu Najran, from Ibn Sinan who said,

‘Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said: ‘We^{-asws} the People^{-asws} of the Household are truthful. We^{-asws} are not devoid of the lying one lying upon us^{-asws}, and he drops our^{-asws} truthfulness in the presence of the people by his lies. Rasool-Allah^{-saww} is the most truthful of the people in tone, and Musaylam^{-la} lied upon him^{-saww}.

وكان أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام أصدق من برأ الله من بعد رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله وكان الذي يكذب عليه ويعمل في تكذيب صدقه بما يفترى عليه من الكذب عبد الله ابن سبا لعنه الله،

‘And Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} was the most truthful person of Allah^{-azwj} from after Rasool-Allah^{-saww}, and the one who lied upon him^{-asws} and worked in belying his^{-asws} truthfulness with what he fabricated upon him^{-asws} from the lies was Abdullah Ibn Saba, may Allah^{-azwj} Curse him.

وكان أبو عبد الله الحسين بن علي عليه السلام قد ابتلى بالمختار، ثم ذكر أبو عبد الله عليه السلام الحارث الشامي وبنان فقال: كانا يكذبان على علي بن الحسين عليهما السلام، ثم ذكر المغيرة بن سعيد ويزعوا والسري وأبا الخطاب ومعمرا وبشارا الأشعري وحمزة البربري وصائد النهدي فقال: لعنهم الله إنا لا نخلو من كذاب يكذب علينا أو عاجز الرأي، كفانا الله مؤونة كل كذاب وأذاقهم حر الحديد.

‘And Abu Abdullah Al-Husayn Bin Ali^{-asws} had been tempted by Al-Mukhtar.’ Then Abu Abdullah^{-asws} mentioned Al-Haris Al-Shamy, and Banan, and he^{-asws} said: ‘Both of them had lied upon Ali^{-asws} Bin Al-Husayn^{-asws}’. Then he^{-asws} mentioned Al-Mugheira Bin Saeed, and Bazia, and Al-Sary, and Abu Al-Khattab, and Ma’mara, and Bashara Al-Ash’ary, and Hamza Al-Barbary, and Sa’id Al-Nahdy, and he^{-asws} said: ‘May Allah^{-azwj} Curse them. We^{-asws} are not devoid from a liar lying upon us^{-asws}, or a frustrated one of the opinions. Allah^{-azwj} Suffices us^{-asws} as a Supporter against every liar and would Make them taste the heat of the iron.’²²

Ahadith on the character of Ibn Abbas:

Abd Allāh ibn ‘Abbās (c. 619 – 687 CE – 1-87 A.H.), also known as Ibn ‘Abbās, is known to be one of the cousins of the prophet Muhammad^{-saww}. Ibn ‘Abbās has transmitted many Ahadith and is considered to be the greatest mufassir of the Qur’an by most Muslims. Below we present some Ahadith which highlight his character.

²¹ The Book of Sulaym Bin Qays Al-Hilali, H. 14, see for example: <https://hubeali.com/kitab-e-sulaym/>

²² Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 28 H 12

كش، رجال الكشي عليُّ بنُ زيادِ الصائغِ [الصائغ] عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ خَلْفِ الْمَخْزُومِيِّ عَنْ سُفْيَانَ بْنِ سَعِيدٍ عَنِ الرَّهْرِيِّ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ الْحَارِثَ يَقُولُ اسْتَعْمَلَ عَلِيٌّ عَ عَلَى الْبَصْرَةَ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ عَبَّاسٍ فَحَمَلَ كُلَّ مَالٍ فِي بَيْتِ الْمَالِ بِالْبَصْرَةَ وَ لِحَقِّ مَكَّةَ وَ تَرَكَ عَلِيًّا وَ كَانَ مَبْلَعُهُ أَلْفِ أَلْفِ دِرْهَمٍ

(The book) ‘Rijal’ of Al Kashy – Ali Bin Ziyad Al Saig, from Abdul Aziz Bin Muhammad, from Khalaf Al Makhzumi, from Sufyan Bin Saeed, from Al Zuhry who said, ‘I heard Al Haris saying,

‘(Imam) Ali^{-asws} utilised Abdullah Bin Abbas upon Al-Basra (as governor). He carried away all the wealth which was in the public treasure at Al-Basra and joined with Makkah and left (Imam) Ali^{-asws}, and it (the embezzled wealth) reached two million Dirhams.

فَصَعِدَ عَلِيٌّ عَ الْمِنْبَرَ حِينَ بَلَغَهُ ذَلِكَ فَبَكَى فَقَالَ هَذَا ابْنُ عَمِّ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص فِي عَمَلِهِ وَ قَدْرِهِ يَفْعَلُ مِثْلَ هَذَا فَكَيْفَ يُؤْمَرُ مَنْ كَانَ دُونَهُ اللَّهُمَّ إِنِّي قَدْ مَلَأْتُهُمْ فَأَرْخِي مِنْهُمْ وَ أَقْبِضِي إِلَيْكَ عَيْرَ عَاجِرٍ وَ لَا مَلُولٍ.

Imam Ali^{-asws} ascended the pulpit when that reached him. He^{-asws} cried. He^{-asws} said: ‘This is a son of an uncle of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}. In his deed and being in his worth, he has done the like of this? So, how will the ones who are besides him, believe? O Allah^{-azwj}! I^{-asws} am fed up with them, so Give me^{-asws} rest from them and Take me^{-asws} to You^{-azwj}, without frustration nor weariness.’²³

In another report:

قَالَ الْكَشِّيُّ شَيْخٌ مِنَ الْيَمَامَةِ يَذْكُرُ عَنْ مُعَلَّى بْنِ هِلَالٍ عَنِ الشَّعْبِيِّ قَالَ: لَمَّا اخْتَمَلَ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ عَبَّاسٍ بَيْتَ مَالِ الْبَصْرَةَ وَ ذَهَبَ بِهِ إِلَى الْحِجَازِ كَتَبَ إِلَيْهِ عَلِيٌّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ ع- مِنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ إِلَى عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ عَبَّاسٍ- أَمَا بَعْدُ فَلْيَبَيِّنْ قَدْ كُنْتُ أَشْرَكْتُكَ فِي أَمَانِي وَ لَمْ يَكُنْ أَحَدٌ مِنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي فِي نَفْسِي أَوْثَقَ مِنْكَ لِمُؤَامَسَاتِي وَ مُؤَاوَزَتِي وَ آدَاءِ الْأَمَانَةِ إِلَيَّ

Al-Kashy said, ‘A sheykh from Al Yamama mentioned from Moalla Bin Hilal, from Al-Shaby who said,

‘When Abdullah Bin Abbas carried away (embezzled) the public treasury of Al-Basra and went with it to Al-Hijaz, Imam Ali^{-asws} Bin Abu Talib^{-asws} wrote to him: ‘From a servant of Allah^{-azwj} Ali^{-asws} Bin Abu Talib^{-asws} to Abdullah Bin Abbas. As for after, I^{-asws} used to participate you in my^{-asws} entrustments and there did not happen to be anyone from my^{-asws} family members more trustworthy than you regarding myself, for consoling me^{-asws} and supporting me^{-asws} and fulfilling the entrustments to me^{-asws}.

فَلَمَّا رَأَيْتَ الزَّمَانَ عَلَى ابْنِ عَمِّكَ قَدْ كَلِبَ وَ الْعَدُوُّ عَلَيْهِ قَدْ حَرَبَ وَ أَمَانَةَ النَّاسِ قَدْ عَزَّتْ- وَ هَذِهِ الْأُمُورَ قَدْ فَشَّتْ قَلْبَتْ لِابْنِ عَمِّكَ ظَهَرَ الْمَجْرَنَ وَ فَارَقْتَهُ مَعَ الْمُفَارِقِينَ وَ خَدَلْتَهُ أَسْوَأَ خَدَلَانِ الْحَادِلِينَ

‘But when you saw the times have overturned upon the son^{-asws} of your uncle^{-as}, and the enemies had waged war upon him^{-asws}, and the entrustments of the people had been betrayed, and these matters had become widespread, you turned your back to the son^{-asws} of your uncle^{-as} (like the) madman and separated from him^{-asws} with the separating ones and abandoned him^{-asws} with evil abandoning of the abandoning ones.

²³ Bihar Al Awaar – V 40, The book of History – Amir Al Momineen^{asws}, Ch 124 H 21 a

فَكَأَنَّكَ لَمْ تَكُنْ تُرِيدُ اللَّهَ بِجِهَادِكَ وَكَأَنَّكَ لَمْ تَكُنْ عَلَى بَيِّنَةٍ مِنْ رَبِّكَ وَكَأَنَّكَ إِذَا كُنْتَ تَكِيدُ أُمَّةَ مُحَمَّدٍ ص عَلَى دُنْيَاهُمْ وَ تَنْوِي عِرْضَهُمْ فَلَمَّا أُمَكَّنْتَهُ الشَّدَّةُ فِي خِيَانَةِ أُمَّةِ مُحَمَّدٍ ص أَسْرَعْتَ الْوُثْبَةَ وَ عَجَلْتَ الْعُدُوَّةَ فَاحْتَطَطْتَ مَا قَدَرْتَ عَلَيْهِ احْتِطَافَ الذَّنْبِ الْأَزَلِ دَائِمِيَةِ الْمِعْرَى الْكَسِيرَةِ-

‘It is as if you did not intend Allah^{-azwj} with your Jihad, and it is as if you did not happen to be upon a Proof from your Lord^{-azwj}, and it is as if you were rather plotting against the community of Muhammad^{-saww} upon their religion and intended to deceive them. So, when the difficulty enabled you (an opportunity) in betraying the community of Muhammad^{-saww}, you were quick with the pouncing and hastened the enmity, so you snatched upon whatever you were able upon like the snatching by the wolf of the still, injured, helpless goat.

كَأَنَّكَ لَا أَبَا لَكَ إِذَا جَرَزْتَ إِلَى أَهْلِكَ ثُرَاتِكَ مِنْ أَبِيكَ وَ أُمَّكَ سُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ أ مَا تُؤْمِنُ بِالْمَعَادِ أ وَ مَا تَخَافُ مِنْ سُوءِ الْحِسَابِ أ وَ مَا يَكْبُرُ عَلَيْكَ أَنْ تَشْرِي الْإِمَاءَ وَ تَنْكِحَ النِّسَاءَ بِأَمْوَالِ الْأَرَامِلِ وَ الْمُهَاجِرِينَ الَّذِينَ آفَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِمْ هَذِهِ الْبِلَادَ

‘May there be no father for you! It is as if you were taking it to your family, the inheritance from your father and your mother. Glory be to Allah^{-azwj}! Do you not believe in the Hereafter? Or do you not fear from the evil Reckoning? Or is it not grievous upon you that you have bought the slave girls, and married the women with the wealth of the widows and the emigrants, those Allah^{-azwj} had Legalised this city upon them?’

أَزِدُّ إِلَى الْقَوْمِ أَمْوَالَهُمْ فَوَ اللَّهُ لَئِنْ لَمْ تَفْعَلْ ثُمَّ أَمَكَّنَنِي اللَّهُ مِنْكَ لِأَعْدِرَنَّ اللَّهُ فِيكَ وَ اللَّهُ فَوَ اللَّهُ لَوْ أَنَّ حَسَنًا وَ حُسَيْنًا فَعَلَا مِثْلَ الَّذِي فَعَلْتَ لَمَا كَانَ هُنْمَا عِنْدِي فِي ذَلِكَ هَوَادَةً- وَ لَا لِوَاحِدٍ مِنْهُمَا عِنْدِي فِيهِ رُحْصَةٌ حَتَّى آخِذَ الْحَقِّ وَ أَرْبِحَ الْجُورَ عَنْ مَظْلُومِهَا وَ السَّلَامُ-

‘Return to the people their wealth! By Allah^{-azwj}! If you do not do so, then Allah^{-azwj} Enables me^{-asws} from you, I^{-asws} shall excuse (myself^{-asws}) regarding you. By Allah^{-azwj}! By Allah^{-azwj}! Even if Hassan^{-asws} and Husayn^{-asws} had done like that which you have done, there would have been no leniency with me^{-asws} for them^{-asws} regarding that, nor for one of them^{-asws} there is any allowance with me^{-asws}, until I^{-asws} take back the right and obliterate the tyranny from its injustices. And the greetings!’

قَالَ فَكَتَبَ إِلَيْهِ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ عَبَّاسٍ أَنَا بَعْدُ فَقَدْ أَنَانِي كِتَابُكَ تُعْظِمُ عَلَيَّ إِصَابَةَ الْمَالِ الَّذِي أَخَذْتَهُ مِنْ بَيْتِ مَالِ الْبَصْرَةِ وَ لَعْمَرِي إِنَّ لِي فِي بَيْتِ مَالِ اللَّهِ أَكْثَرَ بِمَا أَخَذْتُ وَ السَّلَامُ

He (the narrator) said, ‘Abdullah Bin Abbas wrote to him^{-asws}, ‘As for after your^{-asws} letter came to me making a big thing upon me having taken the wealth which I have taken from the public treasury of Al-Basra. And, by my life! For me, in the public treasure, is more than what I have taken. And the greetings!’

قَالَ فَكَتَبَ إِلَيْهِ عَلِيُّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ ع أَنَا بَعْدُ فَالْعَجَبُ كُلُّ الْعَجَبِ مِنْ تَزْيِينِ نَفْسِكَ أَنَّ لَكَ فِي بَيْتِ مَالِ اللَّهِ أَكْثَرَ مِنْ مَالِ رَجُلٍ مِنَ الْمُسْلِمِينَ فَقَدْ أَفْلَحْتَ إِنْ كَانَ تَمَنِّيكَ الْبَاطِلَ وَ ادِّعَاؤُكَ مَا لَا يَكُونُ يُنْجِيكَ مِنَ الْإِثْمِ وَ يُجِلُّ لَكَ مَا حَرَّمَ اللَّهُ عَلَيْكَ عَمَرَكَ اللَّهُ إِنَّكَ لَأَنْتَ الْعَبْدُ الْمُهْتَدِي إِذَنْ

He (the narrator) said, ‘(Imam) Ali^{-asws} Bin Abu Talib^{-asws} wrote to him: ‘As for after, so the surprise of all surprises is your adorning yourself that in the public treasury of Allah^{-azwj}, there is for you more than (the share of) wealth of one man from the Muslims, so you have succeeded. If your wish and your claim is false, it would not happen to rescue you from the

sin and permit for you what Allah^{-azwj} has Prohibited unto you. May Allah^{-azwj} Give you long life, for you are the guided servant, then.

فَقَدْ بَلَغَنِي أَنَّكَ اتَّخَذْتَ مَكَّةَ وَطَنًا وَ صَرَّيْتَ بِهَا عَطْنَا تَشْتَرِي مَوْلِدَاتِ مَكَّةَ وَ الطَّائِفِ تَخْتَارُهُنَّ عَلَى عَيْنَيْكَ وَ تُعْطِي فِيهِنَّ مَالَ غَيْرِكَ وَ إِنِّي لَأُقْسِمُ بِاللَّهِ رَبِّي وَ رَبِّكَ رَبِّ الْعِزَّةِ مَا يَسُرُّنِي أَنَّ مَا أَخَذْتُ مِنْ أَمْوَالِهِمْ لِي حَلَالٌ أَدْعُهُ لِعَقْبِي مِيرَاثًا

‘It has reached me^{-asws} that you have taken Makkah as a homeland and have struck a tannery at it, buying slave girls of Makkah and Al-Taif, choosing them before your eyes, and giving regarding them the wealth of others. And I^{-asws} swear by Allah^{-azwj}, my^{-asws} Lord^{-azwj} and your Lord^{-azwj}, Lord^{-azwj} of Might! What makes me^{-asws} happy is that whatever I^{-asws} have taken from their wealth for me^{-asws}, is Permissible. I^{-asws} shall leave it for my^{-asws} posterity as an inheritance.

فَلَا غُرُورَ أَشَدُّ بِاِغْتِيَابِكَ تَأْكُلُهُ رُوَيْدًا رُوَيْدًا فَكَأَنَّ قَدْ بَلَغْتَ الْمَدَى- وَ عُرِضْتَ عَلَى رَبِّكَ الْمَحَلَّ الَّذِي يَنْمَى الرَّجْعَةَ الْمُضْبِعُ لِلتَّوْبَةِ لِدَلِّكَ- وَ مَا ذَلِكَ وَ لَاتِ حِينَ مَنَاصٍ وَ السَّلَامُ

‘So, do not be intensely proud with happiness, consuming it slowly, slowly. It is as if you have reached the end, and you are presented to your Lord^{-azwj} in the place of the one who wishes the return (to the world) the wastage of the repentance of that: **so they called out for escape when it was too late? [38:3]**. And the greeting.’

قَالَ فَكَتَبَ إِلَيْهِ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ عَبَّاسٍ أَمَّا بَعْدُ فَقَدْ أَكْثَرْتَ عَلَيَّ فَوَ اللَّهُ لَأَنَّ أَلْفَى اللَّهُ بِجَمِيعِ مَا فِي الْأَرْضِ مِنْ ذَهَبِهَا وَ عَفْيَاهَا أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ أَنْ أَلْفَى اللَّهُ بِدَمِ رَجُلٍ مُسْلِمٍ.

He (the narrator) said, ‘Abdullah Bin Abbas wrote to him^{-asws}, ‘As for after, you^{-asws} have (spoken) a lot upon me. By Allah^{-azwj}! If I meet Allah^{-azwj} with the entirety of what is in the earth, from its gold and its treasures, it would be more beloved to me than if I were to meet Allah^{-azwj} with the blood of a Muslim man (like you^{-asws} will – God Forbid Nouzo Billah).’²⁴

A similar account is also reported by Syed Razi in Nahj Al-Balagah:

نَحْج، نَحْجِ الْبَلَاغَةِ وَ مِنْ كِتَابٍ لَهُ عَ إِلَى عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ الْعَبَّاسِ أَمَّا بَعْدُ فَإِنِّي كُنْتُ أَشْرِكْتُكَ فِي أَمَانَتِي وَ جَعَلْتُكَ شِعَارِي وَ بَطَانَتِي وَ لَمْ يَكُنْ فِي أَهْلِي رَجُلٌ أَوْثَقَ مِنْكَ فِي نَفْسِي لِمُؤَاسَاتِي وَ مُوَارَظَتِي وَ أَدَاءِ الْأَمَانَةِ إِلَيَّ

(The book) ‘Nahj Al Balagah’ –

From a letter of his^{-asws} to Abdullah Bin Al-Abbas: ‘As for after, I^{-asws} used to participate you in my^{-asws} entrustments and made you my^{-asws} consultant and my^{-asws} confidant, and there does not happen to be any man among my^{-asws} family members more trustworthy than you are regarding myself^{-asws}, to sympathise with me^{-asws}, and as my^{-asws} back-up, and fulfilling the entrustments to^{-asws}.

²⁴ Bihar Al Awaar – V 40, The book of History – Amir Al Momineen^{asws}, Ch 124 H 21 b

فَلَمَّا رَأَيْتَ الزَّمَانَ عَلَى ابْنِ عَمِّكَ قَدْ كَلِبَ وَ الْعَدُوُّ قَدْ حَرِبَ وَ أَمَانَةَ النَّاسِ قَدْ خَرِبَتْ وَ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةُ قَدْ فَتَكَتْ وَ شَعَرَتْ فَلَبَّتْ لِابْنِ عَمِّكَ ظَهْرَ الْمِجْرِنِ فَفَارَقْتَهُ مَعَ الْمُفَارِقِينَ وَ خَدَلْتَهُ مَعَ الْخَادِلِينَ وَ حُنْتَهُ مَعَ الْحَائِزِينَ

‘When you (Ibn Abbas) saw the times to have overturned upon the son^{-asws} of your uncle^{-as}, and the enemies to have declared war, and entrustments of the people to have been sold-out, and this community had assaulted and vacated, you (Ibn Abbas) overturned to the son^{-asws} of your uncle^{-as}, exposing the shield, so you separated along with the separating ones, and forsook along with the forsaking ones, and betrayed him^{-asws} along with the betraying ones.

فَلَا ابْنَ عَمِّكَ آسَيْتَ وَ لَا الْأَمَانَةَ أَدَيْتَ وَ كَأَنَّكَ لَمْ تُكُنْ اللَّهُ تُرِيدُ بِجِهَادِكَ وَ كَأَنَّكَ لَمْ تُكُنْ عَلَى بَيْتِهِ مِنْ رَبِّكَ وَ كَأَنَّكَ إِذَا كُنْتَ تَكِيدُ هَذِهِ الْأُمَّةَ عَنْ دُنْيَاهُمْ وَ تَنْوِي غَرْهَهُمْ عَنْ قَبِيهِمْ

‘Thus, you neither comforted the son^{-asws} of your uncle^{-as} nor did you fulfil the entrustments, and it is as if you do not happen to intend Allah^{-azwj} in your Jihad, and it is as if you do not happen to be any proof from your Lord^{-azwj}, and it is as if you were rather plotting with this community about their world and intending to deceive them of their war booty.

فَلَمَّا أَمَكَّنْتِكَ الشَّدَّةَ فِي حَيَاتِهِ الْأُمَّةِ أَسْرَعْتَ الْكُرَّةَ وَ عَاجَلْتَ الْوَيْبَةَ فَاحْتَطَفْتَ مَا قَدَّرْتَ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ أَمْوَالِهِمُ الْمَصُونَةَ لِأَرْوَاحِهِمْ وَ أَيْتَامِهِمُ الْخِطَافَ اللَّذِيبِ الْأَزَلَّ دَامِيَةَ الْمِعْرَى الْكَسِيرَةَ فَحَمَلْتَهُ إِلَى الْحِجَازِ رَجِيبَ الصَّدْرِ بِحَمْلِهِ غَيْرَ مُتَأَمِّمٍ مِنْ أَخِيهِ

‘When the difficulties enabled you in betraying the community, you were quick of the turning and hastened the pouncing and you snatched from their wealth whatever you were able upon which had been protected for their widows and their orphans (like) the snatching by the wolf a wounded goat, helpless. Then you carried it to Al-Hijaz, broadening the chest, carrying it without any guilt of having taken it.

كَأَنَّكَ لَا أَبَا لِعَبْرِكَ حَدَرْتَ عَلَى أَهْلِ تُرَائِكَ مِنْ أَبِيكَ وَ أُمَّتِكَ فَسُبْحَانَ اللَّهِ أَمَا تَوْمُنُ بِالْمَعَادِ أَوْ مَا تَخَافُ مِنْ نِقَاشِ الْحِسَابِ أَيُّهَا الْمَغْدُودُ كَانَ عِنْدَنَا مِنْ دَوِي الْأَلْبَابِ

‘It is as if there was no father for others, you rolled down upon the people as being your inheritance from your father and your mother. Glory be to Allah^{-azwj}! Are you not believing in the Hereafter? Are you not fearing from the argument of the Reckoning? O you, the one who was counted with us as being with the understanding!

كَيْفَ تُسَبِّحُ شَرَاباً وَ طَعَاماً وَ أَنْتَ تَعْلَمُ أَنَّكَ تَأْكُلُ حَرَاماً وَ تَشْرَبُ حَرَاماً وَ تَتَّبَعُ الْإِمَاءَ وَ تَنْكِحُ الْبَسَاءَ مِنْ مَالِ الْيَتَامَى وَ الْمَسَاكِينِ وَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَ الْمُجَاهِدِينَ الَّذِينَ آفَاءَ اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِمْ هَذِهِ الْأَمْوَالُ وَ أَحْرَزَ بِهِنَّ هَذِهِ الْبِلَادَ

‘How can you partake drink and food and you know that you are eating unlawfully and drinking unlawfully, and you are buying the maids and marrying the women from the wealth of the orphans and the poor and the Momineen and the fighters, the ones Allah^{-azwj} had Legalised this wealth upon them and Protects this city by them?

فَاتَّقِ اللَّهَ وَ ارْزُدْ إِلَى هَؤُلَاءِ الْقَوْمِ أَمْوَالَهُمْ فَإِنَّكَ إِنْ لَمْ تَفْعَلْ ثُمَّ أَمَكَّنِي اللَّهُ مِنْكَ لِأَعُذِرَنَّ إِلَى اللَّهِ فِيكَ وَ لِأَضْرِبَنَّكَ بِسَيْفِي الَّذِي مَا صَرَبْتُ بِهِ أَحَداً إِلَّا دَخَلَ النَّارَ

‘Fear Allah^{-azwj}, and return to these people their wealth, for you, if you do not do so, then Allah^{-azwj} Enables me^{-asws} from you, I^{-asws} shall excuse myself^{-asws} to Allah^{-azwj} regarding you and strike you with my^{-asws} sword which no one has been struck by it except he entered the Fire.

وَ اللَّهُ لَوْ أَنَّ الْحَسَنَ وَ الْحُسَيْنَ فَعَلَا مِثْلَ فِعْلِكَ الَّذِي فَعَلْتَ مَا كَانَتْ لهُمَا عِنْدِي هَوَادَّةٌ وَ لَا ظَفِيرًا مِثِّي بِإِرَادَةٍ حَتَّى أَخَذَ الْحَقُّ مِنْهُمَا وَ أُزِيحَ الْبَاطِلَ عَنْ مَظْلَمَتَيْهِمَا

‘And, by Allah^{-azwj}, even if Al-Hassan^{-asws} and Al-Hassan^{-asws} were to do similar to your deed which you have done, there would not have been any clemency for them^{-asws} with me^{-asws} nor any success from me^{-asws} until I^{-asws} would have taken it back from them^{-asws} and removed the falsehood from their^{-asws} injustices.

وَ أَقْسِمُ بِاللَّهِ رَبِّ الْعَالَمِينَ مَا يَسُرُّنِي أَنَّ مَا أَخَذْتَهُ مِنْ أَمْوَالِهِمْ خَلَالَ لِي أَنْزُكُهُ مِيرَاثًا لِمَنْ بَعْدِي

‘And I^{-asws} swear by Allah^{-azwj}, Lord^{-azwj} of the worlds! It would not make me^{-asws} happy if I^{-asws} were to take it from their wealth as being permissible for me^{-asws} and leave it as an inheritance for the ones after me^{-asws}.

فَصَحَّحَ رُوَيْدًا فَكَأَنَّكَ قَدْ بَلَغْتَ الْمَدَى وَ دُفِنْتَ تَحْتَ التُّرَى وَ عَرِضَتْ عَلَيْكَ أَعْمَالُكَ بِالْمَحَلِّ الَّذِي يُنَادِي الظَّالِمُ فِيهِ بِالْحُسْرَةِ وَ يَتَمَتَّى الْمُضْتَبِعِ الرَّجْعَةَ فِيهِ وَ لَا تَحِينَ مَنَاصِي.

‘Have a little shame! It is as if you have reached the limit (of your life), and have already been buried under the soil, and your deeds are being presented to you at the place which the unjust one would be calling out in with the regret and he who wasted would wish for the return during it: **so they called out for escape when it was too late? [38:3].**”²⁵

وَ قَدْ رَوَى أَرْبَابُ هَذَا الْقَوْلِ أَنَّ عَبْدَ اللَّهِ بْنَ عَبَّاسٍ كَتَبَ إِلَى عَلِيٍّ عَ جَوَابًا عَنْ هَذَا الْكِتَابِ قَالُوا وَ كَانَ جَوَابُهُ أَمَا بَعْدُ فَقَدْ أَنَانِي كِتَابُكَ تُعْظِمُ عَلَيَّ مَا أَصَبْتُ مِنْ بَيْتِ مَالِ الْبَصْرَةِ وَ لَعَنِي إِنْ حَقِّي فِي بَيْتِ الْمَالِ لِأَكْثَرِ مِمَّا أَخَذْتُ وَ السَّلَامُ

And it has been reported by the reporters of these words, ‘Abdullah Bin Abbas wrote an answer to Ali^{-asws} of this letter. And his answer was, ‘As for after, your^{-asws} letter has come to me magnifying upon me what I had attained from the public treasury of Al-Basra, and by my life, my right in the public treasury is more than what I have taken. And the greetings.’

قَالُوا فَكَتَبَ إِلَيْهِ عَلِيٌّ عَ أَمَا بَعْدُ فَإِنَّ مِنَ الْعَجَبِ أَنْ تُزَيِّنَ لَكَ نَفْسُكَ أَنَّ لَكَ فِي بَيْتِ مَالِ الْمُسْلِمِينَ مِنَ الْحَقِّ أَكْثَرُ مِمَّا لِرَجُلٍ مِنَ الْمُسْلِمِينَ فَقَدْ أَفْلَحْتَ إِنْ كَانَ تَمَنِيكَ الْبَاطِلَ وَ إِدْعَاؤُكَ مَا لَا يَكُونُ يُنْجِيكَ مِنَ الْمَأْتَمِ وَ مُجْلُكَ لَكَ الْمُحَرَّمَ إِنَّكَ لَأَنْتَ الْمُهْتَدِي السَّعِيدُ إِذَنْ

They said, Imam Ali^{-asws} wrote to him: ‘As for after, surely from the wonders is that your soul is adorning for you that there is a right for you in the public treasury more than what is for a man from the Muslims, so you have succeeded. If your false wishes and your claiming what cannot save you from the sins, and permits for you the prohibited, then you are the guided, the fortunate.

²⁵ Bihar Al Anwaar – V 32, The book of Fitna (Strife) And Ordeals, Ch 29 H 705 a

وَقَدْ بَلَغَنِي أَنَّكَ اتَّخَذْتَ مَكَّةَ وَطَنًا وَ صَرَيْتَ بِهَا عَطْنًا تَشْتَرِي بِهَا مُوَلَّدَاتِ مَكَّةَ وَ الْمَدِينَةَ وَ الطَّائِفِ تَخْتَارُهُنَّ عَلَى عَيْنِكَ وَ تُعْطِي فِيهِنَّ مَالَ غَيْرِكَ

‘And it has reached me^{-asws} that you had taken Makkah as a homeland and have struck watering places at it, buying women of Makkah, and Al-Medina, and Al-Taif, choosing them to be upon your spies, and giving them wealth of others.

فَارْجِعْ هَذَاكَ اللَّهُ إِلَى رُشْدِكَ وَ نُبِّ إِلَى اللَّهِ رَبِّكَ وَ اخْرِجْ إِلَى الْمُسْلِمِينَ مِنْ أَمْوَالِهِمْ فَعَمَّا قَلِيلٍ تُفَارِقُ مَنْ أَلْفَتْ وَ تَتْرُكُ مَا جَمَعْتَ وَ تَغِيْبُ فِي صَدْعٍ مِنَ الْأَرْضِ غَيْرِ مُوسِدٍ وَ لَا مُهَيِّدٍ قَدْ فَارَقْتَ الْأَخْيَابَ وَ سَكَنْتَ التُّرَابَ وَ وَاجَهْتَ الْحِسَابَ غَنِيًّا عَمَّا خَلَّفْتَ فَعَبْرًا إِلَى مَا قَدَّمْتَ وَ السَّلَامُ

‘Return, may Allah^{-azwj} Guide you to your rightful guidance, and repent to Allah^{-azwj}, your Lord^{-azwj} and bring out to the Muslims their wealth, for after a little while you will separate from the one you love and you will leave whatever you have amassed, and you will disappear into a crack of the earth, neither cushioned nor paved. You would separate from the loved ones and settle in the soil, and facing the Reckoning, needless from what you had left behind to what you have sent ahead. And the greetings.’

قَالُوا فَكَتَبَ إِلَيْهِ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ الْعَبَّاسِ أَمَّا بَعْدُ فَإِنَّكَ قَدْ أَكْثَرْتَ عَلَيَّ وَ وَ اللَّهِ لَأَنَّ أَلْقَى اللَّهُ قَدْ احْتَوَيْتُ عَلَى كُنُوزِ الْأَرْضِ كُلِّهَا مِنْ ذَهَبِهَا وَ عِقْبَانِهَا وَ لُجَيْنِهَا أَحَبُّ إِلَيَّ مِنْ أَنْ أَلْقَاهُ بِدَمِ امْرِئٍ مُسْلِمٍ وَ السَّلَامُ.

They said, Abdullah Bin Al-Abbas wrote to him, ‘As for after, you^{-asws} have frequented upon me, and by Allah^{-azwj}, if I were to meet Allah^{-azwj} having encompassed upon the treasures of the earth, all of them, from its gold and its minerals, and its silver, it would be more beloved to me than if I were to meet Him^{-azwj} with the blood of a Muslim person (like you^{-asws} have). And the greetings.’²⁶

الكَافِي مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ وَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْحُسَيْنِ عَنْ سَهْلٍ وَ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ جَمِيعًا عَنِ الْحُسَيْنِ بْنِ الْعَبَّاسِ عَنْ أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ الثَّانِي ع قَالَ قَالَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع بَيْنَا أَبِي جَالِسٍ ع وَ عِنْدَهُ نَفَرٌ إِذَا اسْتَضْحَكَ حَتَّى اغْرُورَقَتْ عَيْنَاهُ دُمُوعًا ثُمَّ قَالَ هَلْ تَدْرُونَ مَا أَضْحَكُنِي قَالَ فَقَالُوا لَا قَالَ رَعِمَ ابْنُ عَبَّاسٍ أَنَّهُ مِنَ الَّذِينَ قَالُوا رَبُّنَا اللَّهُ ثُمَّ اسْتَقَامُوا

(The book) ‘Al Kafi’ – Muhammad Bin Abu Abdullah, and Muhammad Bin Al Hassan, from Sahl, and Muhammad Bin Yahya, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad, altogether from Al Hassan Bin Al Abbas,

From Abu Ja’far^{-asws} the 2nd having said: Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said: ‘While my^{-asws} father^{-asws} was seated, and in his^{-asws} presence were a number (of people), when (suddenly) he^{-asws} laughed until his^{-asws} eyes filled up with tears. Then he^{-asws} said: ‘Do you know what made me^{-asws} laugh?’ So they said, ‘No.’

He^{-asws} said: ‘Ibn Abbas is alleging that he is from the ones who said: **Surely those who say, ‘Our Lord is Allah!’**, then they are steadfast [41:30].’

فَقُلْتُ هَلْ رَأَيْتَ الْمَلَائِكَةَ يَا ابْنَ عَبَّاسٍ تُحَرِّكُ بِوَلَايَتِهَا لَكَ فِي الدُّنْيَا وَ الْآخِرَةِ مَعَ الْأَمْنِ مِنَ الْخَوْفِ وَ الْحُزْنِ قَالَ فَقَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ تَبَارَكَ وَ تَعَالَى يُعْمَلُ إِيمَانًا الْمُؤْمِنُونَ إِخْوَةٌ وَ قَدْ دَخَلَ فِي هَذَا جَمِيعُ الْأُمَّةِ فَاسْتَضْحَكْتُ ثُمَّ قُلْتُ صَدَقْتَ يَا ابْنَ عَبَّاسٍ أَنْشُدُكَ اللَّهُ هَلْ فِي حُكْمِ اللَّهِ جَلَّ ذِكْرُهُ اخْتِلَافٌ قَالَ فَقَالَ لَا

²⁶ Bihar Al Anwaar – V 32, The book of Fitna (Strife) And Ordeals, Ch 29 H 705 b

I^{-asws} said to him: ‘Have you (ever) seen the Angels, O Ibn Abbas, informing you of their Wilayah for you in the world and the Hereafter, along with the security from the fear and the grief?’ So he said, ‘Allah^{-azwj} Blessed and Exalted is Saying: **But rather, the Momeeneen are brothers, [49:10]**, and the entirety of the community is included in this.’ So I^{-asws} smiled, then I^{-asws} said, ‘You speak the truth, O Ibn Abbas! I^{-asws} hereby adjure you to Allah^{-azwj}, is there any differing in the Judgments of Allah^{-azwj}, Majestic is His^{-azwj} Mention?’ So he said, ‘No.’

فَقُلْتُ مَا تَرَى فِي رَجُلٍ ضَرَبَ رَجُلًا أَصَابِعَهُ بِالسَّيْفِ حَتَّى سَقَطَتْ ثُمَّ دَهَبَ وَ أَتَى رَجُلًا آخَرَ فَأَطَارَ كَفَّهُ فَأُتِيَ بِهِ إِلَيْكَ وَ أَنْتَ قَاضٍ كَيْفَ أَنْتَ صَانِعٌ بِهِ قَالَ أَقُولُ لِهَذَا الْقَاطِعِ أَعْطِهِ دِيَّةَ كَفِّهِ وَ أَقُولُ لِهَذَا الْمَقْطُوعِ صَالِحُهُ عَلَى مَا شِئْتَ وَ أْبْعَثْ بِهِ إِلَى دَوْنِي عَدْلٍ

I^{-asws} said: ‘What is your view regarding a man who strikes a man’s fingers with the sword until they drop off, then he goes, and another man comes over, so he cuts off his palm, so he comes with it to you, and you are a judge, how would you deal with it?’ He said, ‘I would say to this cutter to give him the wergild of his palm, and I would be saying to this cut one to reconcile with him upon whatever he so desires to and send him to a just one (for arbitration).’

قُلْتُ جَاءَ الْإِحْتِلَافُ فِي حُكْمِ اللَّهِ عَزَّ ذِكْرُهُ وَ نَقَضْتَ الْقَوْلَ الْأَوَّلَ أَبِي اللَّهِ عَزَّ ذِكْرُهُ أَنْ يُحْدِثَ فِي خَلْقِهِ شَيْئًا مِنَ الْحُدُودِ فَلَيْسَ تَفْسِيرُهُ فِي الْأَرْضِ أَفْطَعُ قَاطِعِ الْكَفِّ أَصْلًا ثُمَّ أَعْطِهِ دِيَّةَ الْأَصَابِعِ

I^{-asws} said, ‘(Then) there would have come a differing in the Judgments of Allah^{-azwj}, Mighty is His^{-azwj} Mentioned, and you have broken the first words (of yours). Allah^{-azwj}, Mighty is His^{-azwj} Mention, Refuses, that something should occur among His^{-azwj} creatures, from the Legal Penalties and there isn’t its interpretation in the earth. Cut the palm of the cutter from its roots, then give him the wergild of the fingers.’

هَكَذَا حُكْمُ اللَّهِ لَيْلَةَ يُنَزَّلُ فِيهَا أَمْرُهُ إِنْ جَحَدْتَهَا بَعْدَ مَا سَمِعْتَ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص فَأَذْخَلَكَ اللَّهُ النَّارَ كَمَا أَعْمَى بَصْرَكَ يَوْمَ جَحَدْتَهَا عَلَيَّ بِنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ ع

‘This is how Allah^{-azwj} Judged, the night in which His^{-azwj} Command descended. If you were to reject it after what you heard from Rasool-Allah^{-saww}, so Allah^{-azwj} would Enter you into the Fires just as He^{-azwj} Blinded your vision on the day you denied upon Ali^{-asws} Bin Abu Talib^{-asws}.’

قَالَ فَلَيْدَلِكِ عَمِي بَصْرِي؟ قَالَ وَ مَا عَلِمْتُكَ بِذَلِكَ فَوَ اللَّهُ إِنْ عَمِيَ بَصْرِي إِلَّا مِنْ صَفْقَةِ جَنَاحِ الْمَلِكِ قَالَ فَاسْتَضْحَكْتُ ثُمَّ تَرَكْتُهُ يَوْمَهُ ذَلِكَ لِسَخَافَةِ عَقْلِهِ

He said, ‘So was my vision blinded due to that? And what made you^{-asws} know that, for by Allah^{-azwj}, my vision was not blinded except from a flap of a wing of an Angel.’ He^{-asws} said: ‘I^{-asws} smiled, then left him on that day due to the absurdity of his intellect.’

ثُمَّ لَقِيْتُهُ فَقُلْتُ يَا ابْنَ عَبَّاسٍ مَا تَكَلَّمْتَ بِصِدْقٍ مِثْلَ أَمْسٍ قَالَ لَكَ عَلَيُّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ ع إِنَّ لَيْلَةَ الْقَدْرِ فِي كُلِّ سَنَةٍ وَ إِنَّهُ يُنَزَّلُ فِي تِلْكَ اللَّيْلَةِ أَمْرٌ تَلِكِ السَّنَةِ وَ إِنَّ لِدَلِيكَ الْأَمْرَ وَلَا عَدَّ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص فَقُلْتُ مَنْ هُمْ فَقَالَ أَنَا وَ أَحَدَ عَشَرَ مِنْ صُلَيْبِي أَيْمَةً مُحَدَّثُونَ

‘Then I^{-asws} met him, so I^{-asws} said: ‘O Ibn Abbas! You did not speak with truthfulness like what you did yesterday. Ali^{-asws} Bin Abu Talib^{-asws} said to you: ‘The Night of Pre-determination (Laylat Al-Qadr) is in every year, and it descends during that night with the Commands of the

year, and for that Command are Master (Wali Al-Amr) after Rasool-Allah^{-saww}.’ You said: ‘Who are they?’ He^{-asws} said: ‘I^{-asws} and eleven from my^{-asws} descendants, Imams^{-asws}, *Muhaddisun*.’

فَقُلْتُ لَا أَرَاهَا كَانَتْ إِلَّا مَعَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَتَبَدَّى لَكَ الْمَلَكُ الَّذِي يُحَدِّثُهُ فَقَالَ كَذَبْتَ يَا عَبْدَ اللَّهِ رَأَيْتَ عَيْنَايَ الَّذِي حَدَّثَكَ بِهِ عَلِيٌّ وَ لَمْ تَرَهُ عَيْنَاهُ وَ لَكِنَّ وَعَى قَلْبُهُ وَ وَقَرَّ فِي سَمْعِهِ ثُمَّ صَفَّقَكَ بِجَنَاحَيْهِ فَعَمِيَتْ

‘You said, ‘I have not seen it as such except with Rasool-Allah^{-saww}.’ The Angel who used to narrate to him^{-saww}, appeared to you, and he (angel) said: ‘You lie, O Ibn Abbas! I (angel) saw with my eyes that which Ali^{-asws} narrated to you with,’ and his (Ibn Abbas’s eyes) did not see him, but his heart felt it, and it occurred in his hearing. Then he (angel) flapped you with his wing, so you were blinded.’

قَالَ فَقَالَ ابْنُ عَبَّاسٍ مَا اخْتَلَفْنَا فِي شَيْءٍ فَحُكِّمُهُ إِلَى اللَّهِ فَقُلْتُ لَهُ فَهَلْ حَكَمَ اللَّهُ فِي حُكْمٍ مِنْ حُكْمِهِ بِأَمْرَيْنِ قَالَ لَا فَقُلْتُ هَاهُنَا هَلَكْتَ وَ أَهْلُكَتَ.

He^{-asws} said: ‘Ibn Abbas said, ‘We are differing with regards to something, so its Judgment is to Allah^{-azwj}.’ I^{-asws} said to him: ‘So would Allah^{-azwj} Judge regarding a Judgment from His^{-azwj} Judgments with two Commands?’ He said, ‘No.’ I^{-asws} said: ‘Over here you perish and cause others to perish.’²⁷

عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام) قَالَ بَيْنَمَا أَبِي جَالِسٌ وَ عِنْدَهُ نَفَرٌ إِذَا اسْتَضْحَكَ حَتَّى اغْرُورَقَتْ عَيْنَاهُ دُمُوعاً ثُمَّ قَالَ هَلْ تَدْرُونَ مَا أَضْحَكُنِي قَالَ فَقَالُوا لَا قَالَ رَعِمَ ابْنُ عَبَّاسٍ أَنَّهُ مِنَ الَّذِينَ قَالُوا رَبُّنَا اللَّهُ ثُمَّ اسْتَقَامُوا

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah^{-asws} having said: ‘While my^{-asws} father^{-asws} was seated, and in his^{-asws} presence were a number (of people), when (suddenly) he^{-asws} laughed until his^{-asws} eyes filled up with tears. Then he^{-asws} said: ‘Do you know what made me^{-asws} laugh?’ So they said, ‘No.’ He^{-asws} said: ‘Ibn Abbas is alleging that he is from **[41:30] (As for) those who say: Our Lord is Allah, then are steadfast.**

فَقُلْتُ لَهُ هَلْ رَأَيْتَ الْمَلَائِكَةَ يَا ابْنَ عَبَّاسٍ تُخْبِرُكَ بِوَلَايَتِهَا لَكَ فِي الدُّنْيَا وَ الْآخِرَةِ مَعَ الْأَمْنِ مِنَ الْخَوْفِ وَ الْحُزْنِ قَالَ فَقَالَ إِنَّ اللَّهَ تَبَارَكَ وَ تَعَالَى يَقُولُ إِنَّمَا الْمُؤْمِنُونَ إِخْوَةٌ وَ قَدْ دَخَلَ فِي هَذَا جَمِيعُ الْأُمَّةِ فَاسْتَضْحَكْتُ ثُمَّ قُلْتُ صَدَقْتَ يَا ابْنَ عَبَّاسٍ أَنْشُدَكَ اللَّهُ هَلْ فِي حُكْمِ اللَّهِ جَلَّ ذِكْرُهُ اخْتِلَافٌ قَالَ فَقَالَ لَا

‘So I^{-asws} said to him: ‘Have you (ever) seen the Angels, O Ibn Abbas, informing you of their Wilayah for you in the world and the Hereafter, along with the security from the fear and the grief?’ So he said, ‘Allah^{-azwj} Blessed and High is Saying **[49:10] But rather, the Believers are brothers**, and the entirety of the community is included in this.’ So I smiled, then I said, ‘You speak the truth, O Ibn Abbas! I^{-asws} hereby adjure you to Allah^{-azwj}, is there any differing in the Judgments of Allah^{-azwj}, Majestic is His^{-azwj} Mention?’ So he said, ‘No.’

فَقُلْتُ مَا تَرَى فِي رَجُلٍ ضَرَبَ رَجُلًا أَصَابِعَهُ بِالسِّيفِ حَتَّى سَقَطَتْ ثُمَّ ذَهَبَ وَ أَنَّى رَجُلًا آخَرَ فَأَطَارَ كَفَّهُ فَأُتِيَ بِهِ إِلَيْكَ وَ أَنْتَ قَاضٍ كَيْفَ أَنْتَ صَانِعٌ قَالَ أَقُولُ لِهَذَا الْقَاطِعِ أَعْطَاهُ دَبَّةَ كَفِّهِ وَ أَقُولُ لِهَذَا الْمَقْطُوعِ صَالِحُهُ عَلَى مَا شِئْتَ وَ ابْعَثْ بِهِ إِلَى دَوِي عَدْلٍ

‘So I^{-asws} said: ‘What is your view regarding a man who strikes a man’s fingers with the sword until they drop off, then he goes and another man comes over, so he cuts off his palm, so he comes with it to you, and you are a judge, how would you deal with it?’ He said, ‘I would say

²⁷ Bihar Al Awaar – V 40, The book of History – Amir Al Momineen^{asws}, Ch 124 H 27

to this cutter to give him the wergild of his palm, and I would be saying to this cut one to reconcile with him upon whatever he so desires to, and send him to a just one (for arbitration).’

فُلْتُ جَاءَ الْإِخْتِلَافُ فِي حُكْمِ اللَّهِ عَزَّ ذِكْرُهُ وَ نَقَضْتَ الْقَوْلَ الْأَوَّلَ أَيُّ اللَّهِ عَزَّ ذِكْرُهُ أَنْ يُجْدِثَ فِي خَلْقِهِ شَيْئاً مِنَ الْحُدُودِ وَ لَيْسَ تَفْسِيرُهُ فِي الْأَرْضِ أَقْطَعُ قَاطِعِ الْكَفِّ أَصْلاً ثُمَّ أَعْطَاهُ دِيَةَ الْأَصَابِعِ هَكَذَا حُكْمَ اللَّهِ لَيْلَةَ يَنْزِلُ فِيهَا أَمْرُهُ إِنْ جَحَدْتَهَا بَعْدَ مَا سَمِعْتَ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (صلى الله عليه وآله) فَأَدْخَلَكَ اللَّهُ النَّارَ كَمَا أَعْمَى بَصْرَكَ يَوْمَ جَحَدْتَهَا عَلَى ابْنِ أَبِي طَالِبٍ

‘I^{asws} said, ‘(Then) there would have come a differing in the Judgments of Allah^{azwj}, Mighty is His^{azwj} Mentioned, and you have broken the first words (of yours). Allah^{azwj}, Mighty is His^{azwj} Mention, Refuses that something should occur among His^{azwj} creatures, from the Legal Penalties and there isn’t its interpretation in the earth. Cut the palm of the cutter from its roots, then give him the wergild of the fingers. This is how Allah^{azwj} Judged, the night in which His^{azwj} Command descended. If you were to reject it after what you heard from Rasool-Allah^{saww}, so Allah^{azwj} would Enter you into the Fires just as He^{azwj} Blinded your vision on the day you denied upon Ali^{asws} Bin Abu Talib^{asws}.’

قَالَ فَلَيْدِكَ عَمِي بَصْرِي قَالَ وَ مَا عَلِمْتُكَ بِذَلِكَ فَوَ اللَّهُ إِنْ عَمِيَ بَصْرِي إِلَّا مِنْ صَفْقَةِ جَنَاحِ الْمَلِكِ قَالَ فَاسْتَضَحَّكَتُ ثُمَّ تَرَكْتُهُ يَوْمَهُ ذَلِكَ لِسَخَافَةٍ عَقِلِهِ

‘He said, ‘So it was due to that my vision was blinded? And what made you^{asws} know that, for by Allah^{azwj}, my vision was not blinded except from a flap of a wing of an Angel.’ So I^{asws} smiled, then left him on that day of his due to the absurdity of his intellect.

ثُمَّ لَقِيْتُهُ فَقُلْتُ يَا ابْنَ عَبَّاسٍ مَا تَكَلَّمْتَ بِصِدْقٍ مِثْلِ أَمْسٍ قَالَ لَكَ عَلَيُّ بْنُ أَبِي طَالِبٍ (عليه السلام) إِنَّ لَيْلَةَ الْقَدْرِ فِي كُلِّ سَنَةٍ وَ إِنَّهُ يَنْزِلُ فِي تِلْكَ اللَّيْلَةِ أَمْرُ السَّنَةِ وَ إِنَّ لَذَلِكَ الْأَمْرَ وُلَاةً بَعْدَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (صلى الله عليه وآله) فَقُلْتُ مَنْ هُمْ فَقَالَ أَنَا وَ أَحَدَ عَشَرَ مِنْ صُلْبِي أَيْمَةً مُحَدَّثُونَ

‘Then I^{asws} met him, so I^{asws} said: ‘O Ibn Abbas! You did not speak with truthfulness like what you did yesterday. Ali^{asws} Bin Abu Talib^{asws} said to you: ‘The Night of Pre-determination (*Laylat Al-Qadr*) is in every year, and it descends during that night with the Commands of the year, and for that Command are Master (Wali Al-Amr) after Rasool-Allah^{saww}.’ So you said: ‘Who are they?’ So he^{asws} said: ‘I^{asws} and eleven from my^{asws} descendants, Imams^{asws}, Muhaddisun.’

فَقُلْتُ لَا أَرَاهَا كَانَتْ إِلَّا مَعَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ فَتَبَدَّى لَكَ الْمَلِكُ الَّذِي يُحَدِّثُهُ فَقَالَ كَذَبْتَ يَا عَبْدَ اللَّهِ رَأَتْ عَيْنَايَ الَّذِي حَدَّثَكَ بِهِ عَلِيُّ وَ لَمْ تَرَهُ عَيْنَاهُ وَ لَكِنْ وَعَى قَلْبُهُ وَ وَقِرَّ فِي سَمْعِهِ ثُمَّ صَفَّقَكَ بِجَنَاحِهِ فَعَمِيَتْ

‘So you said, ‘I have not seen it as such except with Rasool-Allah^{saww}.’ So the Angel who used to narrate to him^{asws}, appeared to you, and he said: ‘You lie, O Ibn Abbas! I saw with my eyes that which Ali^{asws} narrated to you with’, and his (Ibn Abbas’s) eyes did not see him, but his heart felt it, and it occurred in his hearing. Then he flapped you with his wing, so you were blinded.’

قَالَ فَقَالَ ابْنُ عَبَّاسٍ مَا اخْتَلَفْنَا فِي شَيْءٍ فَحُكْمُهُ إِلَى اللَّهِ فَقُلْتُ لَهُ فَهَلْ حَكَمَ اللَّهُ فِي حُكْمٍ مِنْ حُكْمِهِ بِأَمْرَيْنِ قَالَ لَا فَقُلْتُ هَاهُنَا هَلَكْتَ وَ أَهْلَكْتَ .

‘So Ibn Abbas said, ‘We are differing with regards to something, so its Judgment is to Allah^{azwj}.’ So I^{asws} said to him: ‘So would Allah^{azwj} Judge regarding a Judgment from His^{azwj}

Judgments with two Commands?’ He said, ‘No.’ So I^{asws} said: ‘Over here you perish and cause others to perish.’²⁸

وَقَدْ رُوِيَ أَنَّهُ قَالَ: لَمَّا وَتَى عَلِيٌّ عَ بَنِي الْعَبَّاسِ عَلَى الْحِجَازِ وَالْيَمَنِ وَالْعِرَاقِ فَلَمَّا ذَا قَتَلْنَا الشَّيْخَ بِالْأَمْسِ وَإِنَّ عَلِيًّا عَ لَمَّا بَلَغْتُهُ هَذِهِ الْكَلِمَةَ أَحْضَرَهُ
وَلَا طَفَهُ وَاعْتَدَرَ إِلَيْهِ وَقَالَ لَهُ فَهَلْ وَوَلَيْتُ حَسَنًا أَوْ حُسَيْنًا أَوْ أَحَدًا مِنْ وُلْدِ جَعْفَرٍ أَخِي أَوْ عَقِيلًا أَوْ أَحَدًا مِنْ وُلْدِهِ

And it has been reported,

(Al-Ashtar) said, when Imam Ali^{asws} made the sons of Al-Abbas to be governors upon Al-Hijaz and Al-Yemen and Al-Iraq, ‘So, why did we fight the sheykh (Usman) yesterday?’ And Imam Ali^{asws}, when these words reached him^{asws} presented him and was kind to him and excused to him, and said to him: ‘Have I^{asws} made a governor of Hassan^{asws}, or Husayn^{asws}, or anyone from the sons of Ja’far^{as} my^{asws} brother^{as}, or Aqeel, or anyone from his sons?’

وَإِنَّمَا وَوَلَيْتُ وُلْدَ عَمِّي الْعَبَّاسِ لِأَنِّي سَمِعْتُ الْعَبَّاسَ يَطْلُبُ مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَ الْإِمَارَةَ مِرَارًا فَقَالَ لَهُ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَ يَا عَمَّ إِنَّ الْإِمَارَةَ إِنِّي طَلَبْتُهَا وَكَلْتُ إِلَيْهَا
وَإِنِّي طَلَبْتُكَ أَعْنَتْ عَلَيْهَا

‘And rather, I^{asws} have made the sons of my^{asws} uncle Al-Abbas to be governors because I^{asws} had heard Al-Abbas seeking the governance from Rasool-Allah^{saww} repeatedly. So, Rasool-Allah^{saww} said to him: ‘O uncle! The governance, if you were to seek it, you will be allocated to it, and if it seeks you, you will be fatigued upon it.’

وَرَأَيْتُ بَنِيهِ فِي أَيَّامِ عُمَرَ وَ عَثْمَانَ يَجِدُونَ فِي أَنْفُسِهِمْ إِنْ وُلِّيَ غَيْرُهُمْ مِنْ أَبْنَاءِ الطُّلُقَاءِ وَ لَمْ يُؤَلَّ أَحَدٌ مِنْهُمْ فَأَحْبَبْتُ أَنْ أَصِلَ رَحِمَهُمْ وَ أُزِيلَ مَا كَانَ فِي
أَنْفُسِهِمْ وَ بَعْدَ فَإِنَّ عَلِمْتُ أَحَدًا هُوَ خَيْرٌ مِنْهُمْ فَأَتَيْتُ بِهِ فَخَرَجَ الْأَشْتَرُ وَ قَدْ زَالَ مَا فِي نَفْسِهِ

‘And I^{asws} saw his sons during the days of Umar and Usman feeling within themselves that others from the sons of the freed ones (of Makkah) are being made governors and not one of them is made a governor, so I^{asws} loved to connect their relationship and remove what was in their selves. And afterwards if you come to know of anyone who is better than them, then come to me^{asws} with him.’ So, Al-Ashtar went out and that which was in his self, was removed.

وَ قَدْ رَوَى الْمُحَدِّثُونَ حَدِيثًا يَدُلُّ عَلَى فَضِيلَةِ عَظِيمَةِ لِالْأَشْتَرِ وَ هِيَ شَهَادَةٌ قَاطِعَةٌ مِنَ النَّبِيِّ صَ بِأَنَّهُ مُؤْتَمَنٌ.

And it has been reported by the narrators of Ahadeeth, pointing upon the great merit of Al-Ashtar, and it is the conclusive testimony from the Prophet^{saww} that he is trustworthy.’²⁹

Appendix II: Examples of ‘Marfu’ Ahadith (unbroken chain leading to Rasool Allah^{saww})

الأمامي للشيخ الطوسي جماعة عن أبي المفضل عن النبي بن محمد العنبري عن أحمد بن عبد الصمد بن مزاحم عن خاله أبي الصلت الهروي قال: كنت مع الرضا ع لما دخل نيسابور وهو راكب بغلة شهباء وقد خرج علماء نيسابور في استقباله فلما صار إلى المرتبة تعلفوا بلجامه بغلته وقالوا يا ابن رسول الله حدثنا بحق آياتك الطاهرين حديثاً عن آياتك صلوات الله عليهم أجمعين

²⁸ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book of Divine Authority CH 41 H 2

²⁹ Bihar Al Awaar – V 40, The book of History – Amir Al Momineen^{asws}, Ch 124 H 35 b

(The book) ‘Al Amaali’ of the sheykh Al Tusi – A group, from Abu Al Mufazzal, from Al Lays Bin Muhammad Al Anbary, from Ahmad Bin Abdul Samad Bin Muzahim, from his maternal uncle Abu Al Salt Al Harwy who said,

(The Imam^{-asws}) entered Neshapour, and he^{-asws} was riding a grey mule, and the scholars of Neshapour had come out in receiving him^{-asws}. When he^{-asws} came to the crossroad, they hung on with the rein of his^{-asws} mule and said, ‘O son^{-asws} of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}! Narrate to us, by the right of your^{-asws} forefathers^{-asws}, the pure, a Hadeeth from your^{-asws} forefathers^{-asws}, may the Salawaat of Allah^{-azwj} be upon them^{-asws} all.’

فَأَخْرَجَ رَأْسَهُ مِنَ الْهُودَجِ وَعَلَيْهِ مِطْرَفٌ حَزَقٌ فَقَالَ حَدَّثَنِي أَبِي مُوسَى بْنُ جَعْفَرٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحُسَيْنِ عَنْ أَبِيهِ الْحُسَيْنِ سَيِّدِ شَبَابِ أَهْلِ الْجَنَّةِ عَنْ أَمِيرِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ عَ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ص

He^{-asws} brought out his^{-asws} head from the carriage, and upon him^{-asws} was a woollen cloak. He^{-asws} said: ‘It is narrated to me^{-asws} by my^{-asws} father Musa^{-asws} Bin Ja’far^{-asws}, from his^{-asws} father Ja’far^{-asws} Bin Muhammad^{-asws}, from his^{-asws} father Muhammad^{-asws} Bin Ali^{-asws}, from his^{-asws} father Ali^{-asws} Bin Al-Husayn^{-asws} from his^{-asws} father^{-asws} Al-Husayn^{-asws} chief of the youths of the people of Paradise, from Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws}, from Rasool-Allah^{-saww} having said:

قَالَ أَحْبَبْتِي جِبْرَائِيلُ الرُّوحِ الْأَمِينُ عَنِ اللَّهِ تَقَدَّسَتْ أَسْمَاؤُهُ وَجَلَّ وَجْهُهُ إِلَيَّ يَا أَنَا اللَّهُ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا أَنَا وَحْدِي عِبَادِي فَاعْبُدُونِي وَ لِيَعْلَمَنَّ مَنْ لَقِيَني مِنْكُمْ بِشَهَادَةِ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ مُخْلِصًا بِمَا أَنَّهُ قَدْ دَخَلَ حِصْنِي وَمَنْ دَخَلَ حِصْنِي أَمِنَ مِنْ عَذَابِي

“The trustworthy Spirit Jibraeel^{-as} informed me^{-saww} from Allah^{-azwj}, Holy are His^{-azwj} Names, and Majestic is His^{-azwj} Face: “Me^{-azwj}, I^{-azwj} am Allah^{-azwj}. There is no god except I^{-azwj} Alone. My^{-azwj} servants! Worship Me^{-azwj}, and let him know, the one from you who meets Me^{-azwj} with the testimony that there is no god except Allah^{-azwj}, being sincere with it, he would have entered into My^{-azwj} Fortress. He would be safe from My^{-azwj} Punishment!”

قَالُوا يَا ابْنَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ وَ مَا إِخْلَاصُ الشَّهَادَةِ لِلَّهِ قَالَ ع طَاعَةُ اللَّهِ وَ طَاعَةُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ وَ وِلَايَةُ أَهْلِ بَيْتِهِ ع.

They said, ‘O son^{-asws} of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}! And what is the sincere testimony?’ He^{-asws} said: ‘Obedience to Allah^{-azwj} and obedience to Rasool-Allah^{-saww}, and Wilayah of People^{-asws} of his^{-saww} Household.’³⁰

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ سَهْلِ بْنِ زِيَادٍ عَنِ ابْنِ مَحْبُوبٍ عَنْ أَبِي خَالِدِ الْكُوفِيِّ رَفَعَهُ إِلَى أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ ع قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص الْعِبَادَةُ سَبْعُونَ جُزْءًا أَفْضَلُهَا طَلَبُ الْحَالِلِ

A number of our people have narrated from Sahl ibn Ziyad from Ibn Mahbub from abu Khalid al-Kufiy in a marfu' manner from Abu Ja 'far who has said the following:

Abu Jafar^{-asws} (in an unbroken chain going to Rasool Allah^{-saww}) has said that the Messenger of Allah^{-saww} has said: 'Worship has seventy parts. The most significant one is to work in order to make lawful living.'³¹

³⁰ Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 49, The book of History – Ali Al-Reza^{-asws}, Ch 11 H 1

³¹ Al-Kafi, vol. 5, H. 8348, Ch. 5, h, 6

ابن قولويه، عن ابن عيسى، عن هارون بن مسلم، عن ابن أسباط، عن ابن عميرة، عن عمرو بن شمر، عن جابر قال: قلت لأبي جعفر عليه السلام: إذا حدثني بحديث فأسنده لي، فقال: حدثني أبي، عن جده، عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله، عن جبرئيل عليه السلام، عن الله عز وجل. وكل ما حدثك بهذا الإسناد،

Ibn Qawlawayi, from Ibn Isa, from Haroun Bin Muslim, from Ibn Asbaat, from Ibn Umeyra, from Amro Bin Shmr, from Jabir who said,

‘I said to Abu Ja’far^{-asws}, ‘Whenever you^{-asws} narrate a Hadeeth to me, then attribute its source for me.’ So he^{-asws} said: ‘My^{-asws} father^{-asws} narrated to me^{-asws}, from his^{-asws} grandfather^{-asws}, from Rasool-Allah^{-saww}, from Jibraeel^{-as}, from Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic. And all what I^{-asws} narrate to you is by this source.’

وقال: يا جابر لحديث واحد تأخذه عن صادق خير لك من الدنيا وما فيها.

‘And he^{-asws} said: ‘O Jabir! One Hadeeth you take from a truthful one is better for you than the world and whatever is in it.’³²

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنْ أَبِيهِ رَفَعَهُ إِلَى أَبِي جَعْفَرٍ ع قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص يَا أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ إِنَّمَا هُوَ اللَّهُ وَ الشَّيْطَانُ وَ الْحَقُّ وَ الْبَاطِلُ وَ الْهُدَى وَ الضَّلَالَةُ وَ الرُّشْدُ وَ الْعَيْ وَ الْعَاجِلَةُ وَ الْأَجَلَةُ وَ الْعَاقِبَةُ وَ الْحُسْنَاتُ وَ السَّيِّئَاتُ فَمَا كَانَ مِنْ حَسَنَاتٍ فَلِلَّهِ وَ مَا كَانَ مِنْ سَيِّئَاتٍ فَلِلشَّيْطَانِ لَعَنَهُ اللَّهُ

A number of our people have narrated from Ahmad Ibn Abu Abd Allah from his father in a Marfu manner has narrated the following from Abu Jafar^{-asws}:

The Rasool Allah^{-saww} has said, ‘O people! there is always (the group of people who have to choose between) Allah^{-azwj} or the Satan^{-la}, Truth and falsehood, guidance and straying, wisdom and error, present and future, the consequences, the good deeds and evil deeds. Good deeds are for Allah^{-azwj} and evil deeds are for Satan^{-la}, may Allah^{-azwj} condemn him^{-la}.’³³

عَنْهُ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ إِسْمَاعِيلَ بْنِ بَرِيعٍ وَ غَيْرِهِ رَفَعُوهُ قَالَ قَالَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع مَلْعُونٌ مَنْ تَرَأَسَ مَلْعُونٌ مِنْ هَمٍّ بِهَا مَلْعُونٌ مَنْ حَدَّثَ بِهَا نَفْسَهُ

It is narrated from him (narrator of the Hadith above) from Muhammad ibn Isma’il ibn Bazi’ and others in a marfu’ manner who said:

‘Abu Abd Allah^{-asws} has said: ‘Condemned is one who seeks leadership, condemned is one who intends to become a leader and condemned is one who speaks to himself of leadership.’³⁴

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنْ عِدَّةٍ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ أَسْبَاطٍ عَنْ عَمِّهِ يَعْقُوبَ بْنِ سَالِمٍ رَفَعَهُ قَالَ قَالَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ع قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص لَا تُؤْوُوا مِنْدِيلَ الْعَمْرِ فِي الْبَيْتِ فَإِنَّهُ مَرِيضٌ لِلشَّيْطَانِ

³² Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 19 H 21

³³ Al-Kafi, vol. 2, H 1471. 16 : ص 2 : ج 2

³⁴ Al-Kafi, Vol. 2, H. 2496 298 : ص 2 : ج 2

A number of our people have narrated from Ahmad ibn Abu Abd Allah from a number of our people have narrated from Ali ibn Asbat from Yaqub ibn Salim in a marfu manner (unbroken chain going to Rasool Allah ^{saww}) has said:

‘Amir-ul-Momineen^{-asws} has said that the Rasool Allah^{-saww} has said, ‘Do not leave food-stained towel at home without its being washed; it becomes plaything for Satan.’³⁵

عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ سَهْلِ بْنِ زِيَادٍ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ عُمَرَ بْنِ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ عَنْ هِشَامِ بْنِ سَالِمٍ وَ حَمَّادِ بْنِ عُمَانَ وَ غَيْرِهِ قَالُوا سَمِعْنَا أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام) يَقُولُ حَدِيثِي حَدِيثِي أَبِي وَ حَدِيثُ أَبِي حَدِيثُ جَدِّي وَ حَدِيثُ جَدِّي حَدِيثُ الْحُسَيْنِ وَ حَدِيثُ الْحُسَيْنِ حَدِيثُ الْحَسَنِ وَ حَدِيثُ الْحَسَنِ حَدِيثُ أَمِيرِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام) وَ حَدِيثُ أَمِيرِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ حَدِيثُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ (صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ) وَ حَدِيثُ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ قَوْلُ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ .

Ali Bin Muhammad, from Sahl Bin Ziyad, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad, from Umar Bin Abdul Aziz, from Hisham Bin Salim and Hammad Bin Usman and someone else who said,

‘We heard Abu Abdullah^{-asws} saying: ‘My^{-asws} Hadeeth is a Hadeeth of my^{-asws} father^{-asws}, and a Hadeeth of my^{-asws} father^{-asws} is a Hadeeth of my^{-asws} grandfather^{-asws}, and a Hadeeth of my^{-asws} grandfather^{-asws} is a Hadeeth of Al-Husayn^{-asws}, and a Hadeeth of Al-Husayn^{-asws} is a Hadeeth of Al-Hassan^{-asws}, and a Hadeeth of Al-Hassan^{-asws} is a Hadeeth of Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws}, and a Hadeeth of Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} is a Hadeeth of Rasool-Allah^{-saww}, and a Hadeeth of Rasool-Allah^{-saww} are the Words of Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic.’³⁶

عَلِيُّ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ أَبِي أَيُّوبَ الْمَدَنِيِّ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ عَنْ حُسَيْنِ الْأَحْمَسِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام) قَالَ الْقَلْبُ يَتَكَلَّمُ عَلَى الْكِتَابَةِ .

Ali Bin Muhammad Bin Abdullah, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad, from Abu Ayoub Al Madany, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Husayn Al Ahmasy,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah^{-asws} having said: ‘The heart relies upon the written (words).’³⁷

الْحُسَيْنُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ مُعَلَّى بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ الْوَشَّاءِ عَنْ عَاصِمِ بْنِ حُمَيْدٍ عَنْ أَبِي بَصِيرٍ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عَلَيْهِ السَّلَام) يَقُولُ أَكْتُبُوا فَإِنَّكُمْ لَا تَحْفَظُونَ حَتَّى تَكْتُبُوا .

Al Husayn Bin Muhammad, from Moalla Bin Muhammad, from Al Hassan Bin Ali Al Washha, from Aasim Bin Humeyd, from Abu Baseer who said,

‘I heard Abu Abdullah^{-asws} saying: ‘ You must write down (our Ahadith), for you would not be preserving (Ahadith) until you are writing it down.’³⁸

³⁵ Ibid, H.18.

³⁶ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book of Intellect and Ignorance CH 17 H 14

³⁷ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book of Intellect and Ignorance CH 17 H 8

³⁸ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book of Intellect and Ignorance CH 17 H 9

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنِ الْحَسَنِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ فَضَّالٍ عَنِ ابْنِ بُكَيْرٍ عَنْ عُبَيْدِ بْنِ زُرَّارَةَ قَالَ قَالَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) اخْتَفِظُوا بِكُتُبِكُمْ فَإِنَّكُمْ سَوْفَ تَحْتَاجُونَ إِلَيْهَا .

Muhammad Bin Yahya, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad Bin Isa, from Al Hassan Bin Ali Bin Fazzal, from Ibn Bukeyr, from Ubeyd Bin Zurara who said,

Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said: 'Be preserving with your books, for very soon you would need those.'³⁹

عِدَّةٌ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ خَالِدِ بْنِ الرَّبِيعِ عَنْ بَعْضِ أَصْحَابِهِ عَنْ أَبِي سَعِيدٍ الْخَيْبَرِيِّ عَنِ الْمُفَضَّلِ بْنِ عُمَرَ قَالَ قَالَ لِي أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ (عليه السلام) اَكْتُبْ وَ بُتَّ عِلْمَكَ فِي إِخْوَانِكَ فَإِنْ مِتَّ فَأُورِثْ كُتُبَكَ بَيْتِكَ فَإِنَّهُ يَأْتِي عَلَى النَّاسِ زَمَانٌ هَرَجَ لَا يَأْتُسُونَ فِيهِ إِلَّا بِكُتُبِهِمْ .

A number of our companions, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad Bin Khalid Al Barqy, from one of his companions, from Abu Saeed Al Khaybari, from Al Mufazzal Bin Umar who said,

'Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said to me: 'Write and transmit your knowledge among your brethren. So if you were to die, so leave your books as an inheritance, for there would be coming a time of commotion upon the people, they would not be finding comfort (during) in it but except with your books.'⁴⁰

³⁹ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book of Intellect and Ignorance CH 17 H 10

⁴⁰ Al Kafi V 1 – The Book of Intellect and Ignorance CH 17 H 11