

## **Religious Debating on Social Media**

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

## Religious Debating on Social Media

Summary: .....	3
Introduction: .....	5
The debating, should never turn ugly .....	6
One must focus on one's own submission (to adopt solitude): .....	7
One must Avoid Fame and the love of being praised:.....	8
Rewards for defending against attacks and adopting the best debate:.....	9
Imam <sup>-asws</sup> would Rebuke people arguing:.....	9
Amir Al-Momineen <sup>-asws</sup> Stops Ammr from Debating: .....	10
Debating from the books of others is Discouraged: .....	11
Appendix I: Imam Al-Sadiq <sup>-asws</sup> Giving Leeway to Ummro.....	11
Appendix II: Imam Ali Amir Al-Momineen <sup>-asws</sup> 's Advice to believers.....	16

## Summary:

Religion, like every other activity, has become an industry; it is sold and bought, copied and copy-protected. The religion of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> has reached us through the sacrifices of the Prophets<sup>-as</sup> and the Imams<sup>-asws</sup>, who offered to Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> whatever they<sup>-asws</sup> had, including their<sup>-asws</sup> lives and the lives of their<sup>-asws</sup> family and children<sup>-asws</sup>. See, for example:

وَأَزْوِي عَنِ الْعَالِمِ عَ أَنَّ اللَّهَ قَالَ وَإِلَّ لِلَّذِينَ يَحْتَلِبُونَ الدُّنْيَا بِالْأَدِينِ وَ وَإِلَّ لِلَّذِينَ يَقْتُلُونَ الَّذِينَ يَأْمُرُونَ بِالْقِسْطِ مِنَ النَّاسِ وَ وَإِلَّ لِلَّذِينَ إِذَا  
الْمُؤْمِنُ فِيهِمْ يَسِيرُ بِالْعَدْلِ يَعْتَدُونَ وَ عَلَيْهِ يَجْتَرُونَ وَ لَا يَهْتَدُونَ لَأَن يُحَيِّحَنَّ لَهُمْ فِتْنَةً يُفْرَكُ الْحَكِيمُ فِيهِمْ حَيْرَانًا [حَيْرَانًا].

And it is reported by the Scholar (Imam<sup>-asws</sup>):

‘Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Said: “Woe be for those who are pulling (earning) the world with the religion, and woe be to those who are killing those who are instructing with the fairness from the people, and woe be to those when the believing walks among them with the justice, they attack upon him and are audacious and they are not being guided! I<sup>-azwj</sup> shall Bring about a Fitna (discord) to them, the wise ones among them will be left confused!”<sup>1</sup>

Like other commercial items, religion has also been discussed on social media. Rather than learning and practising aspects of worship, its controversial points are debated to attract a larger number of viewers and generate revenue. In the Ahadith, however, we are advised not to base our beliefs from the talk of others but to take the religion from the Book and Sunnah through our own efforts, for example:

الغيبية للنعماني رُوِيَ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَ أَنَّهُ قَالَ: مَنْ دَخَلَ فِي هَذَا الدِّينِ بِالرِّجَالِ أَخْرَجَهُ مِنْهُ الرِّجَالُ كَمَا أَدْخَلُوهُ فِيهِ وَ مَنْ دَخَلَ فِيهِ  
بِالْكِتَابِ وَ السُّنَّةِ زَالَتِ الْجِبَالُ قَبْلَ أَنْ يَزُولَ.

It is reported from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup> having said: ‘One who enters into this Religion by the men, the (other) men (preacher) would exit him from it just as he had entered into it (by the earlier one), but one who enters into it by the Book and the Sunnah, the mountain would move before he moves (from his Religion).<sup>2</sup>

When it comes to debating religion on social media, we find the observed practices are quite opposite to what Ahadith advise us regarding dealing with discussing and defending Islam, e.g.,

أَقُولُ قَالَ السَّيِّدُ بُنُ طَاوُسٍ رَحِمَهُ اللَّهُ فِي كَشْفِ الْمَحْجَةِ رُوِيَ مِنْ كِتَابِ أَبِي مُحَمَّدٍ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ حَمَّادِ الْأَنْصَارِيِّ وَ نَقَلْتُهُ مِنْ أَصْلِ قُرَيْ عَلَى  
السَّيِّحِ هَارُونَ بْنِ مُوسَى التَّلَعُكْبَرِيِّ رَوَاهُ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ سِنَانٍ قَالَ:

<sup>1</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar V 97 – The Book of Jihaad – Ch 85 H 48

<sup>2</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 14 H 67

Al Seyyid Ibn Tawoos said in (the book) Kash Al Muhajjat: It has been reported from the book of Abu Muhammad Abdullah Bin Hamad Al Asnary, and I copied it from the original read upon the sheykh Haroun Bin Musa al Tal'akbary, reporting from Abdullah Bin Sinan who said:

أَرَدْتُ الدُّحُولَ عَلَى أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع فَقَالَ لِي مُؤَمِّنُ الطَّاقِ اسْتَأْذِنْ لِي عَلَى أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع فَقُلْتُ لَهُ نَعَمْ فَدَخَلْتُ عَلَيْهِ فَأَعْلَمْتُهُ مَكَانَهُ فَقَالَ لَا تَأْذُنْ لَهُ عَلَيَّ فَقُلْتُ جُعِلْتُ فِدَاكَ انْقِطَاعُهُ إِلَيْكُمْ وَلَاؤُهُ لَكُمْ وَجِدَالُهُ فِيكُمْ وَلَا يَقْدِرُ أَحَدٌ مِنْ خَلْقِ اللَّهِ أَنْ يَخْصِمَهُ

'I wanted to see Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup>, so Momin Al-Taaq said to me, 'Seek permission for me to see Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup>.' So, I said to him, 'Yes,' and I went to him<sup>-asws</sup> and let him<sup>-asws</sup> know of his place. But he<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'There is no permission for him to see me<sup>-asws</sup>. I said, 'May I be sacrificed for you<sup>-asws</sup>! He has cut himself off (from others) to you<sup>-asws</sup>, and he is friendly to you<sup>-asws</sup> and he argues regarding you<sup>-asws</sup>, and there is no ability for anyone from the creatures of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> that he debates him.'

فَقَالَ بَلْ يَخْصِمُهُ صَبِيٌّ مِنْ صَبِيَّانِ الْكُتَّابِ فَقُلْتُ جُعِلْتُ فِدَاكَ هُوَ أَجْدَلُ مِنْ ذَلِكَ وَ قَدْ خَاصَمَ جَمِيعَ أَهْلِ الْأَذْيَانِ فَخَاصَمَهُمْ فَكَيْفَ يَخْصِمُهُ عَلَامٌ مِنَ الْعُلَمَانِ وَ صَبِيٌّ مِنَ الصَّبِيَّانِ

'The Imam<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'But a young child from the children of the Book can debate him. I said, 'May I be sacrificed for you<sup>-asws</sup>! He is more debating than that, and debated the entirety of the people of (other) religions had debated him, and he has debated them, so how can a young boy from the boys debate him, a child from the children?'

فَقَالَ يَقُولُ لَهُ الصَّبِيُّ أَحْبَبْتَنِي عَنْ إِمَامِكَ أَمَرَكَ أَنْ تُخَاصِمَ النَّاسَ فَلَا يَقْدِرُ أَنْ يَكْذِبَ عَلَيَّ قَيْمُولٌ لَا يَقُولُ لَهُ فَأَنْتَ تُخَاصِمُ النَّاسَ مِنْ غَيْرِ أَنْ يَأْمُرَكَ إِمَامُكَ فَأَنْتَ عَاصٍ لَهُ قَيْمُولٌ

So, he<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'The child would say to him, 'Inform me about your Imam<sup>-asws</sup>. Did he<sup>-asws</sup> instruct you that you should debate the people?' So, he would not be able to lie upon me<sup>-asws</sup>, and he would be saying, 'No.' Then he would be saying to him, 'Then you are debating the people from without your Imam<sup>-asws</sup> having instructed you, therefore you are disobedient to him<sup>-asws</sup>.'

يَا ابْنَ سِنَانٍ لَا تَأْذُنْ لَهُ عَلَيَّ فَإِنَّ الْكَلَامَ وَ الْخُصُومَاتِ تُفْسِدُ النِّيَّةَ وَ تَحْقُقُ الدَّرِينَ

'O Ibn Sinan! There is no permission for him to see me<sup>-asws</sup>, for the speech and the debating spoil the intention and obliterate the Religion.'<sup>3</sup>

Also, we are not supposed to be challenging others, as it is forbidden by the Masomeen<sup>-asws</sup>, Ali Amir Al-Momineen<sup>-asws</sup> in his<sup>-asws</sup> will to Imam Hassan<sup>-asws</sup> said:

وَ قَالَ ع لِابْنِهِ الْحَسَنِ ع لَا تَدْعُونَ إِلَى مُبَارَاةٍ وَ إِنَّ [فِي] دُعَيْتِ إِلَيْهَا فَأَجِبْ فَإِنَّ الدَّاعِيَ إِلَيْهَا بَاغٍ وَ الْبَاغِي مَصْرُوعٌ

<sup>3</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 17 H 46

And Imam Ali<sup>-asws</sup> said to his<sup>-aswsasws</sup> son<sup>-asws</sup> Al-Hassan<sup>-asws</sup>: ‘Do not call (anyone) to a duel (never call out for a challenge), and if you<sup>asws</sup> are called to it, then answer, for the caller is a rebel and the rebel would be stricken down’.<sup>4</sup>

Also, Imam Ali<sup>-asws</sup> when describing the noble qualities of a believer says:

يُخَالِطُ النَّاسَ لِيَعْلَمَ وَ يَصْمُتُ لِيَسْلَمَ وَ يَسْأَلُ لِيَفْهَمَ وَ يَسْجُرُ لِيَعْنَمَ لَا يُنْصِتُ لِلْخَبَرِ لِيَتَجَرَّبَ بِهِ وَ لَا يَتَكَلَّمُ لِيَتَجَرَّبَ بِهِ عَلَى مَنْ سِوَاهُ نَفْسُهُ مِنْهُ فِي عَنَاءٍ وَ النَّاسُ مِنْهُ فِي رَاحَةٍ أَنْعَبَ نَفْسَهُ لِأَخْرَجَتْهُ فَأَرَاخَ النَّاسَ مِنْ نَفْسِهِ إِنْ بُعِيَ عَلَيْهِ صَبَرَ حَتَّى يَكُونَ اللَّهُ الَّذِي يَنْتَصِرُ لَهُ بَعْدَهُ بِمَنْ تَبَاعَدَ مِنْهُ بُغْضٌ وَ نَزَاهَةٌ وَ دُنُوهُ بِمَنْ دَنَا مِنْهُ لِيُنَّ وَ رَحْمَةٌ لَيْسَ تَبَاعُدُهُ تَكْبَرًا وَ لَا عَظَمَةٌ وَ لَا دُنُوهُ حُدُوبَةٌ وَ لَا حِلَابَةٌ بَلْ يَقْتَدِي بِمَنْ كَانَ قَبْلَهُ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْحَيْرِ فَهُوَ إِمَامٌ لِمَنْ بَعْدَهُ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْبِرِّ

He (a believer) mixes with the people to learn, and he is silent for safety, and he asks to understand, and he trades (discusses) to earn. He does not listen to the ‘Khabar’ (news – the Ahadeeth) in order to do mischief with, nor does he speak in order to impress those who are in front of him.<sup>5</sup>

Finally, the perfect and beautiful debates of Rasool Allah<sup>-saww</sup>, the daughter of Rasool Allah<sup>-asws</sup> and the Holy Imams<sup>-asws</sup>, on all important topics of religion, provide us examples, where a leeway was made for the debators, i.e., if they could not answer a question, another question was put forward, without humiliating the questioner(s) and without slamming all the escape doors for him, and the Imam<sup>-asws</sup> would continue with their speech. However, debaters of today, in particular on social media, argue to win a point, fearing they will lose their followers, without adhering to the Divine Guidelines on good debates.

The debates from Ahl Al-Bayt<sup>-asws</sup> are recorded in almost all Ahadith Books, e.g., Sulym Ibn Qais Hilali, Tafseer Imam Hassan Al-Askari, Bihar Al-Anwaar, Uyon Akhbar Al-Reza.<sup>6</sup>

See Appendix I, where in a Hadith, Imam Al-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> gives leeway to Ummro, many times, whenever he is unable to reply to a question from the Imam<sup>-asws</sup> and remains silent.

## Introduction:

Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Commands the believers not to scold deities which other people worship (praise) lest they may scold the True one without knowing (6:108):

<sup>4</sup> Nahj Al Balagah – Saying 233

<sup>5</sup> H. 1, الكافي (ط - الإسلامية)، ج2، ص: 230

<sup>6</sup> E.g., Sulym Ibn Qais Hilali, Tafseer Imam Hassan Askari, h, 322, Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 9, Ahtijaj Al-Tabrisi.

وَلَا تَسُبُّوا الَّذِينَ يَدْعُونَ مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ فَيَسُبُّوا اللَّهَ عَدْوًا بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ كَذَلِكَ زَيْنًا لِكُلِّ أُمَّةٍ عَمَلُهُمْ ثُمَّ إِلَىٰ رَبِّهِمْ مَرْجِعُهُمْ فَيُنَبِّئُهُمْ بِمَا كَانُوا يَعْمَلُونَ  
{6:108}

***And do not insult those who are supplicating to the ones besides Allah so they would (in retaliation) be insulting Allah in enmity, without knowledge. Like that We Adorn for every community, their deeds, then to their Lord would be their return, and We would Inform them with what they had been doing [6:108]***

In the interpretation of the above Verse (6:108), Imam<sup>-asws</sup> says, they will be abusing your Imam<sup>-asws</sup> (if you attack their false imams) as the one who abuses the Guardian (Imams<sup>-asws</sup>) of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, so he has abused Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, e.g.,

العياشي: عن عمر الطيالسي، عن أبي عبد الله (عليه السلام)، قال: سألته عن قول الله: وَ لَا تَسُبُّوا الَّذِينَ يَدْعُونَ مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ فَيَسُبُّوا اللَّهَ عَدْوًا بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ. فقال: «يا عمر، هل رأيت أحدا يسب الله؟» قال: فقلت: جعلني الله فداك، فكيف؟ قال: «من سب ولي الله فقد سب الله».

Al-Ayashi, from Umar Al Tayalisiy,

(It has been narrated) from Abu Abdullah<sup>-asws</sup>, said, 'I asked him<sup>-asws</sup> about the Words of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>: ***And do not insult those who are supplicating to the ones besides Allah so they would (in retaliation) be insulting Allah in enmity, without knowledge [6:108]***, so the Imam<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'O Umar! Have you ever seen anyone abuse Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>?' I said, 'May I be sacrificed for you<sup>-asws</sup>, then how?' He<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'The one who abuses the Guardian (Imams<sup>-asws</sup>) of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> so he has abused Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>.'<sup>7</sup>

Also, Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Says:

وَلَا تُجَادِلُوا أَهْلَ الْكِتَابِ إِلَّا بِالَّتِي هِيَ أَحْسَنُ إِلَّا الَّذِينَ ظَلَمُوا مِنْهُمْ وَ قُولُوا آمَنَّا بِالَّذِي أُنزِلَ إِلَيْنَا وَأَنْزَلَ إِلَيْكُمْ وَإِلَهُكُمْ وَاحِدٌ وَنَحْنُ لَهُ مُسْلِمُونَ {29:46}

***And do not debate with the People of the Book except by that which is best, except those of them who are unjust; and say: 'We believe in that which is Revealed to us and Revealed to you, and our God and your God is One, and we submit to Him [29:46].***

**The debating, should never turn ugly**

وَ قَالَ الصَّادِقُ ع وَ قَدْ ذَكَرْنَا عِنْدَهُ الْجِدَالَ فِي الدِّينِ، وَ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ وَ الْأَيَّمَةَ ع قَدْ هَوَّأَ عَنْهُ- فَقَالَ الصَّادِقُ ع: لَمْ يُنْهَ عَنْهُ مُطْلَقًا، وَ لَكِنَّهُ نُهِِيَ عَنِ الْجِدَالِ بِغَيْرِ التِّي هِيَ أَحْسَنُ- أَمَا تَسْمَعُونَ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ يَقُولُ: «وَ لَا تُجَادِلُوا أَهْلَ الْكِتَابِ إِلَّا بِالَّتِي هِيَ أَحْسَنُ» وَ قَوْلُهُ تَعَالَى: «ادْعُ إِلَى سَبِيلِ رَبِّكَ بِالْحُكْمَةِ وَ الْمَوْعِظَةِ الْحَسَنَةِ- وَ جَادِلْهُمْ بِالَّتِي هِيَ أَحْسَنُ».

(Imam Hassan Al-Askari<sup>-asws</sup> said): 'And Al-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> said, and there had been mentioned in his<sup>-asws</sup> presence, the debating in the Religion, and that Rasool-Allah<sup>-saww</sup>

<sup>7</sup> تفسير العياشي 1: 80 / 373

and the Imams<sup>-asws</sup> had forbidden from it. So-Al Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'It has not been forbidden from, absolutely. But, there is forbiddance from the debating with other than which is good. Are you not listening to Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic Saying: **And do not debate with the People of the Book except by that which is best [29:46]**? And the Words of the Exalted: **Call to the Way of your Lord with the wisdom and goodly exhortation, and have disputations with them by that which is best [16:125]**.

فَالْجِدَالَ بِالَّتِي هِيَ أَحْسَنُ قَدْ فَرَنَهُ الْعُلَمَاءُ بِالَّذِينَ، وَ الْجِدَالَ بِغَيْرِ اللَّي هِيَ أَحْسَنُ مُحَرَّمٌ حَرَمَهُ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى عَلَى شِيعَتِنَا، وَ كَيْفَ يُحَرِّمُ اللَّهُ الْجِدَالَ جُمْلَةً وَ هُوَ يَقُولُ: «وَ قَالُوا لَنْ يَدْخُلَ الْجَنَّةَ إِلَّا مَنْ كَانَ هُودًا أَوْ نَصَارَى»

“The debating by that which is best had been the conduct of the scholars in the Religion, and the debating with other than that which is not best is prohibited. Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> the Exalted Prohibited it upon our<sup>-asws</sup> Shias. And how can Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Prohibit the debating as a whole, and He<sup>-azwj</sup> is Saying: **And they (non-Muslims), are saying ‘He will never enter the Paradise except one who would be a Jew or a Christian [2:111]**.

وَ قَالَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى: «تِلْكَ أَمَانِيُّهُمْ- قُلْ هَاتُوا بُرْهَانَكُمْ إِنْ كُنْتُمْ صَادِقِينَ» فَجَعَلَ عِلْمَ الصِّدْقِ وَ الْإِيمَانَ بِالْبُرْهَانِ، وَ هَلْ يُؤْتَى بِالْبُرْهَانِ إِلَّا فِي الْجِدَالَ بِالَّتِي هِيَ أَحْسَنُ

“And Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> the Exalted Said: **These are their aspirations. Say, ‘Give your proof if you are truthful.’ [2:111]**. Thus, He<sup>-azwj</sup> Made the knowledge as truthful and the *Eman* with the proof. And can the proof be come with except in the dispute with that which is good (an extract).<sup>8</sup>

### One must focus on one's own submission (to adopt solitude):

لي، الأما لي للصدوق أبي عن الحميري عن ابن عيسى عن أبيه عن ابن أبي عمير عن محمد بن حمران عن أبي عبيدة الخدّاء قال قال أبو جعفر ع يا زياد إياك و الحُصُومَاتِ فَإِنَّمَا ثَوْرُ الشُّكِّ وَ تُحْبِطُ الْعَمَلَ وَ تُزْجِي صَاحِبَهَا وَ عَسَى أَنْ يَتَكَلَّمَ الرَّجُلُ بِالشَّيْءِ لَا يُغْفَرُ لَهُ

My father, from Al Humeyri, from Ibn Isa, from his father, from Ibn Abu Umeyr, from Muhammad Ibn Humran, from Abu Ubeyda Al Haza'a who said,

Abu Ja'far<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'O Ziyad! Beware of the deductions, for these inherit the doubt and confiscate the deeds, and reneges its owner, and perhaps the man would speak of a thing, he would not be forgiven for it.

يَا زِيَادُ إِنَّهُ كَانَ فِيمَا مَضَى قَوْمٌ تَرَكَوا عِلْمَ مَا وَجَلُّوا بِهِ وَ طَلَبُوا عِلْمَ مَا كُفُّوا حَتَّى انْتَهَى بِهِمُ الْكَلَامُ إِلَى اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ فَتَحَرَّجُوا فَإِنْ كَانَ الرَّجُلُ لِيُدْعَى مِنْ بَيْنِ يَدَيْهِ فَيُجِيبُ مِنْ خَلْفِهِ أَوْ يُدْعَى مِنْ خَلْفِهِ فَيُجِيبُ مِنْ بَيْنِ يَدَيْهِ

'O Ziyad! In the past, there have been people who had left the knowledge of what they had been allocated with, and sought the knowledge of what they had been stopped from, to the extent that the speech ended with them to Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic, and they were confused. The man would be called from his front, and he would answer

<sup>8</sup> Tafseer Imam Hassan Al-Askari<sup>asws</sup> – S 322

from behind him, and he would be called from behind him, and he would answer from his front.<sup>9</sup>

الحِصَالُ الْأَرْبَعَاءِ قَالَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ع مَنْ أَحَبَّنَا فَلْيَعْمَلْ بِعَمَلِنَا وَ لِيَسْتَعِينِ بِالْوَجْهِ فَإِنَّهُ أَفْضَلُ مَا يُسْتَعَانُ بِهِ فِي أَمْرِ الدُّنْيَا وَ الْآخِرَةِ

(The book) 'Al Khisaal' – (The Hadeeth) 'Al Arbami'a' –

Amir Al-Momineen<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'One who loves us<sup>-asws</sup>, let him work with our<sup>-asws</sup> work, and let him be strive with the devoutness for it is the best of what one can be assisted with in the matters of the world and the Hereafter.

وَ لَا تَجَالِسُوا لَنَا عَائِيًّا وَ لَا تَتَدَخُّوا بِنَا عِنْدَ عَدُوِّنَا مُعْلِنِينَ بِإِظْهَارِ حُبِّنَا فَتُدَلِّلُوا أَنْفُسَكُمْ عِنْدَ سُلْطَانِكُمْ

'And do not be sitting with ones faulting us<sup>-asws</sup>, and do not be praising us<sup>-asws</sup> in the presence of our<sup>-asws</sup> enemies by manifesting our<sup>-asws</sup> love for you will be humiliating yourselves in the presence of your ruling authorities' (an extract, see the Hadith in Appendix II).<sup>10</sup>

In another Hadith;

فَقُلْتُ لَهُ يَا سَيِّدِي لَمْ أَعْلَمْ مَا فِي رِجْلِ الْبَابِ فَقَالَ وَ لَمْ أَحْتَجِ أَنْ تَعْمَلَ عَمَلًا تَحْتَاجُ أَنْ تَعْتَذِرَ مِنْهُ إِلَيَّ بَعْدَهَا أَنْ تَعُودَ إِلَيَّ مِثْلَهَا وَ إِذَا سَمِعْتَ لَنَا شَاتِمًا فَاَمْضِ لِسَبِيلِكَ الَّتِي أَمَرْتُ بِهَا وَ إِلَيَّ أَنْ تُجَاوِبَ مَنْ يَشْتُمُنَا أَوْ تُعْرِفَهُ مَنْ أَنْتَ فَإِنَّا بِنَدِ سَوْءٍ وَ مِصْرَ سَوْءٍ وَ اَمْضِ فِي طَرِيقِكَ فَإِنَّ أَحْبَابَكَ وَ أحوَالَكَ تُرَدُّ إِلَيْنَا فَاعْلَمْ ذَلِكَ.

'I said (in a lengthy Hadith) to him<sup>-asws</sup> (Imam Al-Sadiq): 'O my Master<sup>-asws</sup>! I did not know what was at the base of the door.' He<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'And why did you have to do a deed being needy to apologise from it? Beware after it from repeating similar to it, and whenever you hear insults to us<sup>-asws</sup>, then continue on your way which I<sup>-asws</sup> instruct you with and beware of replying to the one who insults us<sup>-asws</sup>, or introducing to him who you are, for we are in an evil country, and an evil city. And continue on your road, for your news and your situations are being referred to us<sup>-asws</sup>, so know that!'<sup>11</sup>

**One must Avoid Fame and the love of being praised:**

ثُمَّ قَالَ الصَّادِقُ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ إِنَّ قَدْرَكُمْ أَنْ لَا تُعْرَفُوا فَافْعَلُوا وَ مَا عَلَيْكَ إِنْ لَمْ يَثْنِ عَلَيْكَ النَّاسُ وَ مَا عَلَيْكَ أَنْ تَكُونَ مَذْمُومًا عِنْدَ النَّاسِ إِذَا كُنْتَ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ مَحْمُودًا

Then Al-Sadiq<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'If you are upon not being recognise (be anonymous), then do so, and what would be against you if the people do not heap praises upon you, and

<sup>9</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 3, The book of Tawheed, Ch 9 H 3

<sup>10</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar V 68 - The book of Eman and Kufr - Ch 64 H 8

<sup>11</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 50, The book of History – Al-Hassan Bin Ali<sup>asws</sup>, Ch 2 H 60 a

what would be against you if you become condemned in the presence of the people when you were Praised in the Presence of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>?

إِنَّ عَلِيًّا عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ كَانَ يَقُولُ لَا خَيْرَ فِي الدُّنْيَا إِلَّا لِأَحَدٍ رَجُلَيْنِ رَجُلٍ يَزِدُّ كُلَّ يَوْمٍ إِحْسَانًا وَ رَجُلٍ يَتَذَكَّرُ سَيِّئَتَهُ بِالتَّوْبَةِ وَ أَنَّى لَهُ بِالتَّوْبَةِ وَ اللَّهُ لَوْ سَجَدَ حَتَّى يَنْقَطِعَ عُنُقُهُ مَا قَبِلَ اللَّهُ مِنْهُ إِلَّا بِوَلَايَتِنَا أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ

Ali<sup>-asws</sup> was saying: ‘There is no good in the world except for one of the two people – a man who increases in good deeds every day, and a man who realises his evil deeds by repenting; and from where will there be repentance for him? By Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! If he were to do Sajdah until his neck breaks, Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> will not Accept from him except by our<sup>-asws</sup> Wilayah of the People<sup>-asws</sup> of the Household’ (an extract).<sup>12</sup>

### Rewards for defending against attacks and adopting the best debate:

وَ قَالَ جَعْفَرُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ ع مَنْ كَانَ هُمًّا فِي كَثْرِ النَّوَاصِبِ عَنِ الْمَسَاكِينِ الْمُؤَلَّيْنِ لَنَا أَهْلَ الْبَيْتِ يَكْسِرُهُمْ عَنْهُمْ، وَ يَكْشِفُ عَنْ مَخَازِبِهِمْ وَ يُبَيِّنُ عَوْرَاتِهِمْ وَ يُفْجِمُ أَمْرَ مُحَمَّدٍ وَ آلِهِ ص، جَعَلَ اللَّهُ هَمَّهُ أَمْلَاكِ الْجِنَانِ فِي بِنَاءِ قُصُورِهِ وَ دُورِهِ، يَسْتَنْعِمُ بِكُلِّ حَرْفٍ مِنْ حُرُوفِ حُجَجِهِ عَلَى أَعْدَاءِ اللَّهِ – أَكْثَرَ مِنْ [عَدَدِ] أَهْلِ الدُّنْيَا أَمْلَاكًا، قُوَّةَ كُلِّ وَاحِدٍ تَفْضُلُ عَنْ حَمْلِ السَّمَاوَاتِ وَ الْأَرْضِينَ، فَكَمْ مِنْ بِنَاءٍ

And Ja’far<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup> said: ‘The one whose main concern was to break (the hold of) the *Nasibis* (Hostile ones) from the poor Momineen of ours<sup>-asws</sup>, the People<sup>-asws</sup> of the Household, breaking them away from them, and uncovering their filth and manifesting their flaws, and make them admire the matter of Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup> and his<sup>-saww</sup> Progeny<sup>-asws</sup>, Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> would Make the main concern of the Angels of the Garden to be the construction of his castles and his houses, for every letter he utilised from the letters of his arguments against the enemies of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> – Angels of a number more than the people of the world - the strength of each one being better (more) than carrying the skies and the earths.

وَ كَمْ مِنْ [نِعْمَةٍ، وَ كَمْ مِنْ] قُصُورٍ لَا يَعْرِفُ قَدْرَهَا إِلَّا رَبُّ الْعَالَمِينَ.

‘And how many from the Bounties, and how many from the castles – no one knows its measurement except for the Lord<sup>-azwj</sup> of the worlds.<sup>13</sup>

### Imam<sup>-asws</sup> would Rebuke people arguing:

رُوي أَنَّ رَجُلًا قَالَ لِلْحُسَيْنِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ ع اجْلِسْ حَتَّى نَتَنَاطَرَ فِي الدِّينِ فَقَالَ يَا هَذَا أَنَا بَصِيرٌ بِدِينِي مَكْشُوفٌ عَلَيَّ هُدَايَ فَإِنْ كُنْتَ جَاهِلًا بِدِينِكَ فَأَذْهَبْ وَ اطْلُبْهُ مَا لِي وَ لِمُمَارَاةٍ

It is reported that a man said to Al-Husayn<sup>-asws</sup> Bin Ali<sup>-asws</sup>, ‘Remain seated until we argue regarding the Religion’. So he<sup>-asws</sup> said: ‘O you! I<sup>-asws</sup> am insightful with my<sup>-asws</sup> Religion, open upon my<sup>-asws</sup> Guidance. So, if you are ignorant with your Religion, then go and seek it. What is it to me<sup>-asws</sup> and the quarrelling?’

<sup>12</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 13, The book of Prophet-hood, Ch 11 H 14

<sup>13</sup> Tafseer Imam Hassan Askari-asws, H. 234

وَ إِنَّ الشَّيْطَانَ لَيُوسِسُ لِلرَّجُلِ وَ يُنَاجِيهِ وَ يَقُولُ نَاطِرِ النَّاسِ فِي الدِّينِ كَيْلًا يَطْنُو بِكَ الْعَجْزَ وَ الْجَهْلَ

And the Satan<sup>la</sup> casts uncertainty to the man and whispers to him and is saying, 'Quarrel with the people regarding the Religion', perhaps he<sup>la</sup> is thinking you are frustrated and ignorant.

تَمَّ الْمِرَاءُ لَا يَخْلُو مِنْ أَرْبَعَةٍ أَوْجِهٍ إِمَّا أَنْ تَتَمَارَى أَنْتَ وَ صَاحِبُكَ فِيمَا تَعْلَمَانِ فَقَدْ تَرَكْتُمَا بِذَلِكَ النَّصِيحَةَ وَ طَلَبْتُمَا الْفُضِيحَةَ وَ أَضَعْتُمَا ذَلِكَ الْعِلْمَ أَوْ جَهْلَآئِهِ فَأَظْهَرْتُمَا جَهْلًا وَ حَاصِنْتُمَا جَهْلًا أَوْ تَعْلَمُهُ أَنْتَ فَطَلَمْتَ صَاحِبُكَ بِطَلَبِكَ عَثْرَتَهُ أَوْ يَعْلَمُهُ صَاحِبُكَ فَتَرَكْتَ حُرْمَتَهُ وَ لَمْ تُنْزِلْهُ مَنْزِلَتَهُ وَ هَذَا كُلُّهُ مُحَالٌ

Then the bitter arguments are not empty from four aspects – Either if you and your companion dispute regarding you both know, so both of you have neglected the advice and are seeking the scandal and place that knowledge, or you are both ignorant so you are both manifesting ignorance and are quarrelling ignorantly, or you know it and you are being unjust to your companion for your seeking his faults, or your companions knows, so you have neglected his sanctity and do not place him at his status. And all this is absurd.

فَمَنْ أَنْصَفَ وَ قَبِلَ الْحَقَّ وَ تَرَكَ الْمُمَارَاةَ فَقَدْ أَوْثَقَ إِيمَانَهُ وَ أَحْسَنَ صُحْبَةَ دِينِهِ وَ صَانَ عَقْلَهُ

So, one who is (upon) Just and accepts the truth and neglects the disputing, so he has affirmed his Eman, and improved the company of his Religion, and safeguarded his intellect.<sup>14</sup>

In another Hadith,

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَحْيَى عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ بْنِ عَيْسَى عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ يَحْيَى عَنْ غِيَاثِ بْنِ إِبْرَاهِيمَ قَالَ: كَانَ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع إِذَا مَرَّ بِجَمَاعَةٍ يَخْتَصِمُونَ لَا يَجُوزُهُمْ حَتَّى يَقُولَ ثَلَاثًا اتَّقُوا اللَّهَ يَرْفَعْ بِهَا صَوْتَهُ

Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn 'Isa from Muhammad ibn Yahya from Ghiyatb ibn Ibrahim who has said:

Abu Abd Allah<sup>asws</sup> upon coming across a group of people having an argument would not pass by without always saying three times loudly: 'You must maintain piety in the presence of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>'.<sup>15</sup>

### Amir Al-Momineen<sup>asws</sup> Stops Ammr from Debating:

وَ قَالَ ع لِعَمَّارِ بْنِ يَاسِرٍ وَ قَدْ سَمِعَهُ يُرَاجِعُ الْمُخِيرَةَ بِنَ شُعْبَةَ كَلَامًا دَعَا يَا عَمَّارُ فَإِنَّهُ لَمْ يَأْخُذْ مِنَ الدِّينِ إِلَّا مَا قَارَنَهُ مِنَ الدُّنْيَا وَ عَلَى عَمْدٍ لَبَسَ عَلَى نَفْسِهِ لِيَجْعَلَ الشُّبُهَاتِ عَازِرًا لِسَقَطَاتِهِ

<sup>14</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 17 H 32

<sup>15</sup> Al-Kafi, vol, 5, Ch. 21, h, 12

Amir Al-Momineen Imam Ali <sup>-asws</sup>, after hearing Ammr ibn Yasir asking and answering questions from Mughara Ibn Shaaba, said: 'O Ammr! Leave this man alone; he has only taken that part of the religion which he had required for the worldly benefits, (for the rest of the religion) he has, on purpose, embraced ambiguities so that he could justify his wrongdoing.<sup>16</sup>

### Debating from the books of others is Discouraged:

سر، السرائر أَبَانُ بْنُ تَعْلَبٍ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ الْحَكَمِ بْنِ الرَّبِيعِ عَنْ أَبِي بِنِ عُمَانَ عَنْ هَارُونَ بْنِ خَارِجَةَ قَالَ: قُلْتُ لِأَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عِ إِنَّا نَأْتِي هَؤُلَاءِ الْمُخَالِفِينَ فَتَسْمَعُ مِنْهُمْ الْحَدِيثَ يَكُونُ حُجَّةً لَنَا عَلَيْهِمْ

Aban Bin Taglub, from Ali Bin Al Hakam Bin Al Zubeyr, from Aban Bin Usman, from Haroun Bin Kharajat who said,

'I said to Abu Abdullah <sup>-asws</sup>, 'We go to those adversaries, and we hear the Hadeeth from them, would these happen to be an argument for us against them?'

قَالَ لَا تَأْتِهِمْ وَ لَا تَسْمَعُ مِنْهُمْ لَعْنَهُمُ اللَّهُ وَ لَعْنُ مِلَلِهِمُ الْمُشْرِكَةَ

The Imam <sup>-asws</sup> said: 'Don't go to them, nor hear from them. May Allah <sup>-azwj</sup> Curse them, and Curse their community, the Polytheists'.<sup>17</sup>

### Appendix I: Imam Al-Sadiq <sup>-asws</sup> Giving Leeway to Ummro

عن عبد الكريم بن عتبة الهاشمي كنت عند أبي عبد الله ع بمكة إذ دخل عليه أناس من المعتزلة فيهم عمرو بن عبيد واصل بن عطاء و حفص بن سالم و أناس من رؤسائهم و ذلك أنه حين قتل الوليد و اختلف أهل الشام بينهم فتكلموا فأكثروا و خطبوا فأطالوا فقال لهم أبو عبد الله جعفر بن محمد ع إنكم قد أكثرتم علي فأطالتم فأسندوا أمركم إلى رجل منكم فليتكلم بحدتكم و ليوجز فأسندوا أمرهم إلى عمرو بن عبيد فأبلغ و أطال فكان فيما قال أن قال قتل أهل الشام خليفتهم و ضرب الله بعضهم ببعض و تشتت أمرهم فنظرنا فوجدنا رجلا له دين و عقل و مروءة و معدن للخلافة و هو محمد بن عبد الله بن الحسن فأردنا أن نجتمع معه فنبايعه ثم نظهر أمرنا معه و ندعو الناس إليه فمن بايعه كنا معه و كان منا و من اعتزلنا كففنا عنه و من نصب لنا جاهدناه و نصبنا له على بغية و نرده إلى الحق و أهله و قد أحببنا أن نعرض ذلك عليك فإنه لا غنى بنا عن مثلك لفضلك و لكثرة شيعتك فلما فرغ قال أبو عبد الله ع أكلكم على مثل ما قال عمرو قالوا نعم فحمد الله و أثنى عليه و صلى على النبي ثم قال إنما نسخط إذا عصي الله فإذا أطيع الله رضينا أخبرني يا عمرو لو أن الأمة قلدتك أمرها فملكته بغير قتال و لا مئونة فقيل لك ولها من شئت من كنت تولي قال كنت أجعلها شورى بين المسلمين قال بين كلهم قال نعم فقال بين فقهاهم و خيارهم قال نعم قال قريش و غيرهم قال العرب و العجم قال فأخبرني يا عمرو أتتولى أبا بكر و عمر أو تتبرأ منهما قال أتولاهما قال يا عمرو إن كنت رجلا تتبرأ منهما فإنه يجوز لك الخلاف عليهما و إن كنت تتولاهما فقد خالفتهما قد عهد عمر إلى أبي بكر فبايعه و لم يشاور أحدا ثم ردها أبو بكر عليه و لم يشاور أحدا ثم جعلها عمر شورى بين ستة فخرج منها الأنصار غير أولئك الستة من قريش ثم أوصى الناس فيهم بشيء ما أراك ترضى أنت و لا أصحابك قال و ما صنع قال أمر صهيبا أن يصلي بالناس ثلاثة أيام و أن يتشاور أولئك الستة ليس فيهم أحد سواهم إلا ابن عمر و يشاورونه و ليس له من الأمر شيء و أوصى من كان بحضرته من المهاجرين و الأنصار إن مضت ثلاثة أيام و لم يفرغوا و يبايعوا أن يضرب أعناق الستة جميعا و إن اجتمع أربعة قبل أن يمضي ثلاثة أيام و خالف اثنين أن يضرب أعناق

<sup>16</sup> Nahjul Balagha, saying no. 405

<sup>17</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar – V 2, The book of intellect, and the knowledge, and the ignorance, S 2 Ch 28 H 10

الاثنتين أفترضون بهذا فيما تجعلون من الشورى في المسلمين قالوا لا قال يا عمرو دع ذا أ رأيت لو بايعت صاحبك هذا الذي تدعو إليه ثم اجتمعت لكم الأمة و لم يختلف عليكم منها رجلا فأفضيتهم إلى المشركين الذين لم يسلموا و لم يؤدوا الجزية كان عندكم و عند صاحبكم من العلم ما تسبرون فيهم بسيرة رسول الله ص في المشركين في الجزية قالوا نعم قال فتصنعون ما ذا قالوا ندعوهم إلى الإسلام فإن أبوا دعوناهم إلى الجزية قال فإن كانوا مجوسا و أهل كتاب و عبدة النيران و البهائم و ليسوا بأهل كتاب قالوا سواء قال فأخبرني عن القرآن أ تقرأونه قال نعم

قال اقرأ قاتلوا الذين لا يؤمنون بالله و لا باليوم الآخر و لا يُحرمون ما حرم الله و رسوله و لا يدينون دين الحق من الذين أوتوا الكتاب حتى يغطوا الجزية عن يديهم و هم صاغرون قال فاستثنى الله عز و جل و اشترط من الذين أوتوا الكتاب فهم و الذين لم يؤتوا الكتاب سواء قال نعم قال ع عن أخذت هذا قال سمعت الناس يقولونه قال فدع ذا فإنهم إن أبوا الجزية فقاتلتهم فظهرت كيف تصنع بالغنيمة قال أخرج الخمس و أقسم أربعة أخماس بين من قاتل عليها قال تقسمه بين جميع من قاتل عليها قال نعم قال فقد خالفت رسول الله في فعله و في سيرته و بيني و بينك فقهاء أهل المدينة و مشيختهم فسلمهم فإنهم لا يختلفون و لا يتنازعون في أن رسول الله إنما صالح الأعراب على أن يدعهم في ديارهم و أن لا يهاجروا على أنه إن دهمه من عدوه دهم فيستفزههم فيقاتل بهم و ليس لهم من الغنيمة نصيب و أنت تقول بين جميعهم فقد خالفت رسول الله ص في سيرته في المشركين دع ذا ما تقول في الصدقة قال فقرأ عليه هذه الآية إِنَّمَا الصَّدَقَاتُ لِلْفُقَرَاءِ وَ الْمَسْكِينِ وَ الْعَامِلِينَ عَلَيْهَا إلى آخرها قال نعم فكيف تقسم بينهم قال أقسمها على ثمانية أجزاء فأعطي كل جزء من الثمانية جزءا فقال ع إن كان صنف منهم عشرة آلاف و صنف رجلا واحدا أو رجلين أو ثلاثة جعلت لهذا الواحد مثل ما جعلت للعشرة آلاف قال نعم قال و ما تصنع بين صدقات أهل الحضرة و أهل البوادي فتجعلهم فيها سواء قال نعم قال فخالفت رسول الله في كل ما أتى به كان رسول الله يقسم صدقة البوادي في أهل البوادي و صدقة الحضرة في أهل الحضرة و لا يقسم بينهم بالسوية إنما يقسمه قدر ما يحضره منهم و على قدر ما يحضره فإن كان في نفسك شيء مما قلت لك فإن فقهاء أهل المدينة و مشيختهم كلهم لا يختلفون في أن رسول الله كذا كان يصنع ثم أقبل على عمرو و قال اتق الله يا عمرو و أنتم أيضا الرهط فاتقوا الله فإن أبي حدثني و كان خير أهل الأرض و أعلمهم بكتاب الله و سنة رسوله أن رسول الله ص قال من ضرب الناس بسيفه و دعاهم إلى نفسه و في المسلمين من هو أعلم منه فهو ضال متكلف

Abd-ul-Karim bin Yatbah al-Hashami says: 'I was in the service of Imam Jafar-e-Sadiq<sup>asws</sup> in Mecca when a group of Al-Mutaziliy<sup>18</sup> came. Among them were Ummro bin Yubaid, Wasil bin Atta, and Haffaz bin Salim, along with some others consisting of the general public and some notables. It was the time when Walid had been assassinated, and the people of Sham had disagreements on the selection of his successor. They kept on discussing this issue for a very long time.

'(The) Imam<sup>asws</sup> said to them: 'You people have spoken a lot in front of me<sup>asws</sup>; why don't you appoint one person among you who can convey your opinion to me so that we cut the lengthy discussion short.' They selected Ummro ibn Yubaid, who talked for a very long time but basically said: 'The people of Sham have killed their ruler and some of them have overcome the others and are in serious disagreement regarding the appointment of a leader. Under these circumstances, we have selected a 'Leader' who has good understanding of the religion, is a very wise person and is the most suitable one to be 'Caliph,' he is Mohammed bin Abd Allah bin Al-Hassan. We all intend to pledge our support to him, and invite others toward him so that they also take an oath of allegiance. Whoever is in agreement with us we will be friendly with him, but whoever is against us we will oppose him, whoever will fight with us we will wage a war against him and will have enmity against him for his opposition to the just, until and unless we return the right to its inheritor (the caliph). We have come to you<sup>asws</sup>,

<sup>18</sup> Who claim to love Ahl Al-Bayt<sup>asws</sup> but also like Abu Bakr<sup>la</sup> & Ummer<sup>la</sup> (Promoters of Ittihad ban-ul-Muslameen)

since we are highly dependent on you<sup>-asws</sup>, due to your<sup>-asws</sup> elevated status and your<sup>-asws</sup> large number of supporters.'

'When he finished his speech, Imam Jafar<sup>-asws</sup> addressed (all of them): 'Do you all agree with what Ummro ibn Yubaid has said?' They all replied: 'Yes, we do.'

'(The) Imam<sup>-asws</sup>, then praised Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> and after reciting 'Salawat' on Muhammad<sup>-saww</sup> and Alay Muhammad<sup>-asws</sup>, said: 'Disobedience to Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> makes us<sup>-asws</sup> sad and obedience to Him<sup>-azwj</sup> pleases us<sup>-asws</sup>.'

**'(The) Imam<sup>-asws</sup> said:** 'O Ummro! Tell me, if all people would agree on you as an arbitrator without having to go through an anarchy and killing people. And if you were asked to select a ruler. How would you select a 'Wali'<sup>19</sup> or Ruler?'

**'Ummro:** 'I will form a 'Shura' (a consulting body) from Muslims.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'From all Muslims?'

**'Ummro:** 'Yes.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'Shura will consist of the notables and 'Fuqqah' from Muslim?'

**'Ummro:** 'Yes.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'Quraysh and non-Quraysh, including Arabs and non-Arabs?'

**'Ummro:** 'Yes.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'O Ummro! Do you like or dislike Abu Bakr and Umar?'

**'Ummro:** 'I adore them.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'O Ummro! If you were to dislike them then it would be possible for you to go against their traditions. Instead, you like them but still go against them! Since Umar, without any consultation, nominated Abu Bakr and then took (an) oath of allegiance (to him). Later on, Abu Bakr, without any consultation, handed over the reigns of Caliphate to Umar. However, (for the third caliph) Umar formed a 'Shura' of six people, in which he did not include anyone from the 'Ansars'<sup>20</sup> but only selected six people from the tribe of Quraysh and excluded all others. He (Umar) drafted a will about them (six people) which neither you nor your accomplice will approve.'

**'Ummro:** 'What did Umar do?'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'Suhaab was asked to lead people in Salat for three days in a row. All of them (Muslims) should gather and offer Salat (behind him), excluding these six people

---

<sup>19</sup> Having total authority

<sup>20</sup> People of Madina who support Prophet <sup>saww</sup> when he <sup>saww</sup> migrated to Madina.

along with a seventh one, the son of Umar. There should not be anyone with them and the seventh one should stay (in their company) but without giving any advice or involving in consultation. Umar then told all those present among the Immigrants and Ansars, if they (six of them) are unable to reach a consensus after three days, you should kill all six of them. If after three days, four of them are in agreement but two of them are not, then remove the heads of those two.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'O Ummro! Would you and your companions agree to form a Shura, the way Umar formed (one) to select a Ruler for Muslims?'

**'They all replied:** 'No we are not in favour (of Shura)!'.

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'O Ummro, let's leave it (you will not form Shura as per your earlier intentions). Now, let us suppose, you succeeded in selecting a ruler for Muslims and everyone agreed on this selection, not even two people disagreed among the whole Muslim nation. You went to non-believers, who neither accepted Islam nor agreed to offer 'Jazia'<sup>21</sup>. In this case, do you or your selected ruler and Amir have the knowledge (of) how Prophet Muhammad<sup>-saww</sup> implemented 'Jazia' on the non-believers so that your actions are in accordance with the traditions of the Prophet<sup>-saww</sup>'?

**'Ummro and others:** 'Yes, we do.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'How would you decide?'

**'Ummro and others:** 'We will first invite them to Islam but if they reject our invitation, we will force them to pay 'Jazia'.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'What if they were people of the Book or are from fire worshipers?'

**'Ummro:** 'Yes, regardless if they were the people of Book or the fire worshipers.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'What will you tell them if they were from those who worship fire and animals (Majusi)?'

**'Ummro:** 'They are all equal.'

**'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** 'Have you (on some occasion) read about them in the Holy Book?'

**'Ummro:** 'Yes, I have.'

**'(The) Imam<sup>-asws</sup>** then recited:

قَاتِلُوا الَّذِينَ لَا يُؤْمِنُونَ بِاللَّهِ وَلَا بِالْيَوْمِ الْآخِرِ وَلَا يُحَرِّمُونَ مَا حَرَّمَ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ وَلَا يَدِينُونَ دِينَ الْحَقِّ مِنَ الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْكِتَابَ حَتَّى يُعْطُوا الْجِزْيَةَ  
عَنْ يَدٍ وَهُمْ صَاغِرُونَ (9:29)

<sup>21</sup> An amount/wealth to paid in order to live within a Muslim ruler as a non-Muslim

***“Fight those who do not believe in Allah, nor in the latter day, nor do they prohibit what Allah and His Messenger have prohibited, nor follow the religion of truth, out of those who have been given the Book, until they pay the tax in acknowledgment of superiority and they are in a state of subjection.”***

**‘Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** ‘Since Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> has separated the people of the Book from others; even then you will treat them equally?’

**‘Ummro:** ‘Yes.’

**‘Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** ‘From where did you get this?’

**‘Ummro:** ‘I have heard people say that.’

**‘Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** ‘Let’s leave this (as he had no answer), suppose those people deny giving you ‘Jazia’ and you overcome them after killing some of them. How would you distribute the war booty?’

**‘Ummro:** ‘After separating the ‘Khums’ (one fifth), the rest four shares will be divided into the fighters.’

**‘Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** ‘Will you divide it equally into all war participants?’

**‘Ummro:** ‘Yes.’

**‘Imam<sup>-asws</sup>:** ‘In this case you have acted against the conduct of Prophet<sup>-saww</sup> and his<sup>-saww</sup> traditions. We have, between you and me<sup>-asws</sup>, some ‘Fuqha’<sup>22</sup> and knowledgeable people, from people of Madinah, if you ask them they will not disagree on it and confirm that (the) Prophet<sup>-saww</sup> had truce with Arabs living in desert on the conditions that they could stay in their land without having to migrate. If enemies of Prophet<sup>-saww</sup> attack, they would join (the) Prophet<sup>-saww</sup>’s forces but they will not have any share in the war booty. However, you say that you will equally divide the war booty and regarding the treatment of non-believers you have decided to go against the tradition of Prophet<sup>-saww</sup>. Let us leave it too but tell me what you say about the Zakat.’

**‘Ummro** Recited the Verse of Holy Quran:

إِنَّمَا الصَّدَقَاتُ لِلْفُقَرَاءِ وَالْمَسْكِينِ وَالْعَامِلِينَ عَلَيْهَا وَالْمُؤَلَّفَةِ قُلُوبُهُمْ وَفِي الرِّقَابِ وَالْغَارِمِينَ وَفِي سَبِيلِ اللَّهِ وَإِنَّ السَّبِيلَ فَرِيضَةٌ مِّنَ اللَّهِ وَاللَّهُ عَلِيمٌ  
حَكِيمٌ (9:60)

***“Alms are only for the poor and the needy, and the officials (appointed) over them, and those whose hearts are made to incline (to truth) and the (ransoming of)***

---

<sup>22</sup> Religious scholars

***captives and those in debts and in the way of Allah and the wayfarer; an ordinance from Allah; and Allah is knowing, Wise.'***

'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>: 'Yes, but tell me how are you going to distribute it?'

'Ummro: 'Zakat will be divided into eight portions and eight deserving persons will take one portion each.'

'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>: 'How about if one group consists of ten thousand people and one group will comprise of one or two or three people. Do you mean to give one portion to one person and divide one portion among ten thousands?'

'Ummro: 'Yes.'

'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>: 'Will you divide equally between the city and village people?'

'Ummro: 'Yes.'

'Imam<sup>-asws</sup>: 'You have gone against all traditions of (the) Prophet<sup>-saww</sup>. (The) Prophet<sup>-saww</sup> of Islam used to distribute the Zakat/Elms of people of desert among deserving ones from desert and distribute Zakat of city people among the poor from cities. However, Prophet<sup>-saww</sup> did not, distribute (Zakat/Elms) equally but as per the number of deserving ones and also considering their requirements. If you are not fully convinced, what I have told to you, you can verify from the scholars of Medina, who will never disagree with what I have had told you. Indeed, this is how Prophet Muhammad<sup>-saww</sup> used to distribute (Zakat).'

'The Imam<sup>-asws</sup> then went closer to Ummro and said: 'O Ummro, Fear Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! And O people, you too Fear Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>! Indeed, my father<sup>-asws</sup> had narrated to me<sup>-asws</sup>, no doubt my father<sup>-asws</sup> was the most knowledgeable person of Holy Quran and Ahadith, among all the inhabitant of the Earth, after (the) Prophet<sup>-saww</sup>, a hadith of the Prophet: Whoever invites public toward him, by shear force of sword (revolt against government), while an even more learned person exists among Muslims, he is the worst one in deriving people toward disbelief.'<sup>23</sup>

## **Appendix II: Imam Ali Amir Al-Momineen<sup>-asws</sup>'s Advice to believers**

الخصال الأربعة قال أمير المؤمنين ع من أحبنا فليعمل بعملنا ولا يستعن بالويع فإنه أفضل ما يستعان به في أمر الدنيا والآخرة

(The book) 'Al Khisaal' – (The Hadeeth) 'Al Arbami'a' –

Amir Al-Momineen<sup>-asws</sup> said: 'One who loves us<sup>-asws</sup>, let him work with our<sup>-asws</sup> work, and let him be strive with the devoutness for it is the best of what one can be assisted with in the matters of the world and the Hereafter.'

<sup>23</sup> Ehtijaj-e-Tabrasi, vol. 2, pg. 363 ( 363 : ج 2 : ص : 363 ), also Al-Kafi, vol. 5, pg 23 (H 8184, Ch. 7, h 1)

وَلَا تُجَالِسُوا لَنَا عَائِبًا وَلَا تَمْتَدِحُوا بِنَا عِنْدَ عَدُوِّنَا مُعْلِنِينَ بِإِظْهَارِ حُبِّنَا فَتَدَلَّلُوا أَنْفُسَكُمْ عِنْدَ سُلْطَانِكُمْ

**'And do not be sitting with ones faulting us<sup>-asws</sup>, and do not be praising us<sup>-asws</sup> in the presence of our<sup>-asws</sup> enemies by manifesting our<sup>-asws</sup> love for you will be humiliating yourselves in the presence of your ruling authorities.**

الرُّمُومَ الصِّدْقِ فَإِنَّهُ مَنْحَاةٌ وَارْغَبُوا فِيمَا عِنْدَ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ وَاطْلُبُوا طَاعَتَهُ وَاصْبِرُوا عَلَيْهَا

**'Necessitate the truthfulness for it is a saviour and be desirous regarding what is in the Presence of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic, and seek His<sup>-azwj</sup> obedience and be patient upon it.**

فَمَا أَفْبَحَ بِالْمُؤْمِنِ أَنْ يَدْخُلَ الْجَنَّةَ وَهُوَ مَهْتُوكُ السِّتْرِ

**'How ugly it would be with the Momin if he were to enter the Paradise and his veil has been violated.**

لَا تُعْتُونَا فِي الطَّلَبِ وَالشَّفَاعَةِ لَكُمْ يَوْمَ الْقِيَامَةِ فِيمَا قَدَّمْتُمْ

**'Do not address us<sup>-asws</sup> in the seeking, and the intercession will be for you all regarding what you have sent forward.**

لَا تَفْضَحُوا أَنْفُسَكُمْ عِنْدَ عَدُوِّنَا فِي الْقِيَامَةِ وَلَا تُكَلِّبُوا أَنْفُسَكُمْ عِنْدَهُمْ فِي مَنْزِلَتِكُمْ عِنْدَ اللَّهِ بِالْحَقِيرِ مِنَ الدُّنْيَا

**'Do not expose yourselves in the presence of your enemies during the Qiyamah, and do not belie yourselves in their presence regarding your statuses in the Presence of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>, with the lowly ones from the world.**

تَمَسَّكُوا بِمَا أَمَرَكُمُ اللَّهُ بِهِ فَمَا بَيْنَ أَحَدِكُمْ وَبَيْنَ أَنْ يَغْتَبِطَ وَبَرَى مَا يُحِبُّ إِلَّا أَنْ يَحْضُرَهُ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَ وَ مَا عِنْدَ اللَّهِ خَيْرٌ وَأَبْقَى وَ تَأْتِيهِ الْبَشِيرَةُ مِنَ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ فَتَقَرُّ عَيْنُهُ وَ يُحِبُّ لِقَاءَ اللَّهِ.

**Hold on to what Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> has Commanded you with, for there is nothing between one of you and his exultation and him seeing what he loves, except that Rasool-Allah<sup>-saww</sup> will attend him, and whatever is in the Presence of Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> is better and more lasting, and the glad tiding will come to him from Allah<sup>-azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic, so his eyes will be delighted and he would love to meet Allah<sup>-azwj</sup>.<sup>24</sup>**

<sup>24</sup> Bihar Al-Anwaar V 68 - The book of Eman and Kufr - Ch 64 H 8