Disputing, filing lawsuits and passing Judgements www.hubeali.com

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ الحُمْدُ لِلَّهِ رَبِ الْعالَمِينِ, وَ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَى سَيِّدِنَا مُحَمَّدٍ وَ آلِهِ الطَّاهِرِينِ, وَسَلَّمَ تَسْلِيماً.

In the Name of Allah^{-azwj} the Beneficent, the Merciful. The Praise is for Allah^{-azwj} Lord^{-azwj} of the Worlds, and Blessing be upon our Chief Muhammad^{-saww} and his^{-saww} Purified Progeny^{-asws}, and greetings with abundant greetings.

ٱللَّهُمَّ صَلِّ عَلَى مُحَمَّدٍ وَآلِ مُحَمَّدٍ وَعَجِلْ فَرَجَهُمْ وَالْعَنْ أَعْدَائَهُمْ أَجْمَعِين

Disputing, filing lawsuits and passing Judgements

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Disputing, filing lawsuits and passing Judgements 3	3
Summary:	
Believers must appoint a Schoolar of Ahadith if they have a dispute:	. 3
Judgement of a Judge is always flawed:	. 7
A Fallible cannot be Just in his judgement	. 9
Fairness in dealing with an aggressor:	. 9

Summary:

The followers of Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws} have been instructed not to take their disputes to the judges appointed by the governments. If a believer gets his rights from the judgment of a ruler or a judge, he will neither reap the benefits nor find any blessings in what he succeeds in obtaining from his lawsuit. We have also been advised not to take a position of a judge, appointed by a government, e.g., Imam^{-asws} says: Therefore, shun the judging for you cannot stand with it (uphold it)!¹¹

Believers must appoint a Schoolar of Ahadith if they have a dispute:

الإحتجاج عَنْ عُمَرَ بْنِ حَنْظَلَةَ قَالَ: سَأَلْتُ أَبَا عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع عَنْ رَجُلَيْنِ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا بَيْنَهُمَا مُنَازَعَةٌ فِي دَيْنٍ أَوْ مِيرَاثٍ فَتَحَاكَمَا إِلَى السُّلْطَانِ وَ إِلَى السُّلْطَانِ وَ إِلَى السُّلْطَانِ وَ إِلَى السُّلْطَانِ وَ اللَّهِ عَنْ رَجُلَيْنِ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا بَيْنَهُمَا مُنَازَعَةٌ فِي دَيْنٍ أَوْ مِيرَاثٍ فَتَحَاكَمَا إِلَى السُّلْطَانِ وَ إِلَى السُّلْطَانِ وَ اللَّهِ عَنْ رَجُلَيْنِ مِنْ أَصْحَابِنَا بَيْنَهُمَا مُنَازَعَةٌ فِي دَيْنٍ أَوْ مِيرَاثٍ فَتَحَاكَمَا إِلَى السُّلْطَانِ وَ إِلَى

(The book) 'Al Ihtijaj' - From Umar Bin Hanzala who said,

'I asked Abu Abdullah^{-asws} about two men from our companions (people of Wilayah). There is a dispute between them regarding a debt or inheritance, so they take the case (dispute) to the ruler or to the judges (appointed by the ruler), 'Is that permissible?'

قَالَ ع مَنْ تَحَاكَمَ الِيَهِمْ فِي حَقِّ أَوْ بَاطِلٍ فَإِنَّمَا تَحَاكَمَ إِلَى الْجَيْتِ وَ الطَّاغُوتِ الْمَنْهِيِّ عَنْهُ وَ مَا حُكِمَ لَهُ بِهِ فَإِنَّمَا يَأْخُذُ سُحْتاً وَ إِنْ كَانَ حَقَّهُ ثَابِتاً لَهُ لِأَنَّهُ أَحَذَهُ بِحُكْمِ الطَّاغُوتِ وَ قَدْ أَمَرَ اللهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ أَنْ يَكُفُرَ بِهِ قَالَ اللهُ عَزَّ وَ جَلَّ لَيْتُحَفِّرُوا أَنْ يَكُفُرُوا

He^{-asws} said: 'Whoever refers to them for judgment, true or false, he has rather taken his case to the false god (*Jibt*) and the tyrant (*Taghout*) which he has been forbidden from, and whatever he judges for him with, he has rather taking an ill-gotten gain, and even if his right is established for him, because he has taken by a judgment of the tyrant, and Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic has Commanded him to disbelieve him. Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic Says: *They are intending to summon each other to the judgment of the tyrant, although they have been Commanded to disbelieve in him [4:60]*'.

قُلْتُ فَكَيْفَ يَصْنَعَانِ وَ قَد اخْتَلَفَا

I said, 'So how should they deal with it, and they have differed (disagreement regarding a matter)?'

-

¹ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 101 – The Book of Rulings – CH 5 H 6

He^{-asws} said: 'They should look for the one from you who has reported our^{-asws} Ahadith, and recognises our^{-asws} permissible(s) and our^{-asws} prohibitions, and recognises our^{-asws} rulings, so they should be satisfied with him as a judge, for I^{-asws} have made him (the narrator of the Ahadith) to be a judge upon you all!

If he were to judge with a ruling and he (disputant) does not accept it from him, rather he has taken lightly with a Ruling of Allah^{-azwj} and has rejected upon us^{-asws}, and the rejecter upon us is the rejecter upon Allah^{-azwj}, and he would be upon the borders of association (Shirk) with Allah^{-azwj}!'

I said, 'Supposing each one of them had chosen a man from our companions, and they agree that they would be looking into their rights, but they differ in what they judge, so the two judges differ regarding your-asws Ahadith?'

He^{-asws} said: 'The (final) judgment is what is judged by their most just, and their most understanding, and their most truthful regarding the Hadith, and their most devout (pious), and what the other one had judged with should not be turned to!'

I said, 'Supposing they are both just, satisfactory, well-known with that, one of them does not surpass the other?'

He^{-asws} said: 'It should be looked at what was from their reporting from us^{-asws} regarding that (case) which they had judged, what there is consensus upon between your companions. It should be taken from their rulings, and leave the unusual which isn't well-known in the presence of your companions, for where there is consensus, there is no doubt in it!

Disputing, filing lawsuits and passing Judgements www.hubeali.com

But rather, the matters are three – a matter its guidance is clear so it should be followed, and a matter its error is clear so it should be avoided, and a problematic matter. Its ruling should be referred to Allah^{-azwj} Mighty and Majestic and to His^{-azwj} Rasool^{-saww}.

And Rasool-Allah^{-saww} had said: 'Halal (Permissible) is clear, and Haram (Prohibition) is clear, and suspect matters fluctuate between that. The one who leaves the suspect matters will be saved from the Prohibitions, and the one who takes with the suspect matters will indulge in the Prohibitions, and he will be destroyed from where he does not know!'

I said, 'Supposing there were two Ahadith from you^{-asws} are well-known having been reported by the trusted ones, from you^{-asws} all (Imams^{-asws})?'

He^{-asws} said: 'Whatever his judgment is compatible with Judgment of the Book and the Sunnah and opposes the general Muslims should be taken with, and whatever of his judgment opposes Judgment of the Book and the Sunnah and is compatible to the general Muslims should be neglected!'

I said, 'May I be sacrificed for you^{-asws}! What is your^{-asws} view if they were both jurists, recognising its ruling from the Book and the Sunnah? Then we find one of the Hadith being compatible with the general Muslims and the other opposing, which of the two should we take from the two Ahadith?'

He^{-asws} said: 'One should look at when they are inclining towards, for whatever opposes the general Muslims, the rightful guidance is in it'.

قُلْتُ جُعِلْتُ فِدَاكَ فَإِنْ وَافَقَهُمُ الْخَبِرَانِ جَمِيعاً

Disputing, filing lawsuits and passing Judgements www.hubeali.com

I said, 'May I be sacrificed for you-asws! Supposing both the Ahadith are compatible with them all?'

He^{-asws} said: 'Look at what their rulers and their judges are inclining towards, leave it aside and take with the other one!'

I said, 'Supposing their rulers are compatible with both the Ahadith together?'

He^{-asws} said: 'When it was like that, postpone it and pause at it until you meet your Imam^{-asws}, for the pausing at the suspicious matters is better than the storming into the destruction, and Allah^{-azwj} is the Guide'.²

Tafseer Al-Ayyashi – From Yunus, a disciple of Ali,

From Abu Abdullah^{-asws} having said: 'One who has a dispute between him and his brother so he calls him to a man from his companion to judge between them but he refuses except that he will raise it to the ruler, he is like the one who has gone for judgment to the false god (Jibt) and the tyrant (Taghout), and Allah^{-azwj} has Said: *They are intending to summon each other to the judgment of the tyrant, although they have been Commanded to disbelieve in him, and the Satan intends to stray them with a far straying [4:60]*'.³

(The book) 'Tafseer Al Ayyashi' – From Abu Baseer,

From Abu Abdullah^{-asws} regarding Words of Allah^{-azwj} Exalted: *Have you not seen those who are alleging that they do believe in what is Revealed unto you and what was*

² Bihar Al-Anwaar V 101 – The Book of Rulings – CH 5 H 1

³ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 101 – The Book of Rulings – CH 5 H 7

Revealed from before you? They are intending to summon each other to the judgment of the tyrant [4:60].

فَقَالَ يَا أَبَا مُحُمَّدٍ إِنَّهُ لَوْ كَانَ لَكَ عَلَى رَجُلٍ حَقٌّ فَدَعَوْتَهُ إِلَى حُكَّامِ أَهْلِ الْعَدْلِ فَأَبَى عَلَيْكَ إِلَّا أَنْ يُرَافِعَكَ إِلَى حُكَّامِ أَهْلِ الْجَوْرِ لِيَقْضُوا لَهُ كَانَ مِمَّنْ حَاكَمَ إِلَى الطَّاغُوتِ.

He^{-asws} said: 'O Abu Muhammad! It is that if there was a right for you upon a man so you call him to the judges of the Just people (followers of Ahl Al-Bayt^{-asws}) but he refuses upon you except he will raise your case to the judges of the tyrannical people in order for them to judge for him, he would be from the ones taking a case to the tyrant'.⁴

Judgement of a Judge is always flawed:

الإحتجاج عَنْ سَعْدِ بْنِ أَبِي الْخُصِيبِ قَالَ: دَخَلْتُ أَنَا وَ ابْنُ أَبِي لَيْلَى الْمَدِينَةَ فَبَيْنَا كَثْنُ فِي مَسْجِدِ الرَّسُولِ صِ إِذْ دَخَلَ جَعْفُرُ بْنُ مُحُمَّدٍ ع فَقُمْنَا إِلَيْهِ فَسَاءَلَنِي عَنْ نَفْسِي وَ أَهْلِي ثُمُّ قَالَ مَنْ هَذَا مَعَكَ

(The book) 'Al Ihtijaj' – From Sa'ad Bin Abu Al Khaseyb who said,

'I and Ibn Abu Layla entered Al-Medina. While we were in Masjid of the Rasool^{-saww} when Ja'far^{-asws} Bin Muhammad^{-asws} entered. We stood up to him^{-asws}. He^{-asws} asked me about myself and my family, then said: 'Who is this one with you?'

فَقُلْتُ ابْنُ أَبِي لَيْلَى قَاضِي الْمُسْلِمِينَ

I said, 'Ibn Abu Layla, judge of the Muslims!'

فَقَالَ نَعَمْ

He-asws said: 'Yes'.

ثُمُّ قَالَ لَهُ تَأْخُذُ مَالَ هَذَا فَتُعْطِيهِ هَذَا وَ تُفَرِّقُ بَيْنَ الْمَرْءِ وَ زَوْجِهِ وَ لَا تَخَافُ في هَذَا أَحَداً

Then he-asws said to him: 'You take the wealth of this one and give it to this one, and you separate between the man and his wife and you don't fear anyone in this?'

قَالَ نَعَمْ

He said, 'Yes'.

⁴ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 101 – The Book of Rulings – CH 5 H 8

He-asws said: 'So by which thing do you judge?'

He said, 'With whatever has reached me from Rasool-Allah-saww, and from Abu Bakr and Umar'.

He^{-asws} said: 'Has it reached you that Rasool-Allah^{-saww} had said that your most judicial is Ali^{-asws}?'

قَالَ نَعَمْ

He said, 'Yes'.

He^{-asws} said: 'So how come you are judging with other than the judgment of Ali^{-asws}, and this has reached you?'

He (the narrator) said, 'The face of Ibn Abu Layla paled. Then he^{-asws} said: 'Seek a companion for yourself. By Allah^{-azwj}, I^{-asws} will not speak to you from my^{-asws} head a single word, ever!'⁵

الخصال ابْنُ الْمُتَوَكِّلِ عَنِ السَّعْدَآبَادِيِّ عَنِ الْبَرَقِيِّ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ ابْنِ أَبِي عُمَيْرٍ رَفَعَهُ إِلَى أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَ قَالَ: الْقُضَاةُ أَرْبَعَةٌ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُوَ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُوَ فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُوَ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُوَ فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُوَ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُوَ فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُوَ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُوَ فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُوَ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُو فِي الْبَاطِلُ وَ هُوَ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُو فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُوَ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُو فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُو يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُو فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُو يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُو فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُو يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُو فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُو يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُو فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُو يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُو فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُو يَعْلَمُ أَنَّةُ بَاطِلً الللَّهِ لَلْ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلًا فَلُو فَهُ إِلَّالِيْ فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى اللَّهُ مِنْ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلًا فَهُو فِي النَّالِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ الْمُنَالِقُولُ وَ اللَّهُ اللَّ

(The book) 'Al Khisaal' – Ibn Al Mutawakkil, from Al Sa'dabady, from Al Barqy, from his father, from Ibn Abu Umeyr raising it to,

Abu Abdullah^{-asws} said: '<u>The judgments are four – a judge judges with the truth and he does not know that it is the truth, so, he would be in the Hellfire</u>; and a judge judging with the falsehood and he does not know that it is false, so he would be in the Hellfire;

⁵ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 101 – The Book of Rulings – CH 5 H 2

and a judge judging with the falsehood and he knows that is it false, he would be in the Hellfire; and a judge judging with the truth and he knows that it is true, he would be in the Paradise'.⁶

A Fallible cannot be Just in his judgement

فقه الرضا عليه السلام اعْلَمْ أَنَّ الْقُضَاةَ أَرْبَعَةٌ قَاضٍ يَقْضِي بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُوَ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ بَاطِلٌ فَهُوَ فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ يَقْضِي بِالْبَاطِلِ وَ هُوَ لَا يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ حَقٌّ فَهُوَ فِي النَّارِ وَ قَاضٍ قَضَى بِالْحُقِّ وَ هُوَ يَعْلَمُ أَنَّهُ حَقٌّ فَهُوَ فِي الْجُنَّةِ فَاجْتَنِبِ القَضَاءَ فَإِنَّكَ لَا تُقِيمُ بِهِ.

(The book) 'Fiqh Al-Reza^{-asws'} – 'Know that the judgments are four – a judge judging with the falsehood <u>and he knows that</u> it is false, so he would be in the Hellfire; and a judge judging with the falsehood and <u>he does not know</u> that it is false, he would be in the Hellfire; and <u>a judge judging with the truth and he does not know it is true</u>, he would be in the Hellfire; and a judge judging with the truth and he knows it is true, he would be in the Paradise! <u>Therefore</u>, shun the judging for you cannot stand with it (uphold it)!'⁷

Fairness in dealing with an aggressor:

وَ [يُرْوَى] رُوِيَ أَنَّهُ عَكَانَ جَالِساً فِي أَصْحَابِهِ- [إِذْ مَرَّتْ] فَمَرَّتْ بِمِمْ امْرَأَةٌ جَمِيلَةٌ فَرَمَقَهَا الْقُوْمُ بِأَبْصَارِهِمْ فَقَالَ ع- إِنَّ أَبْصَارَ هَذِهِ الْفُحُولِ طَوَامِحُ وَ إِنَّ ذَلِكَ سَبَبُ هِبَاكِمَا فَإِذَا نَظَرَ أَحَدُكُمْ إِلَى امْرَأَةٍ تُعْجِبُهُ فَلْيُكَرْمِسْ أَهْلَهُ فَإِنَّمَا هِيَ امْرَأَةٌ كَامْرَأَتِهِ

And it is reported that he-asws (Ali Amir Al-Momineen-asws) was seated among his-asws companions when a beautiful woman passed by him-asws. The people gazed at her with their eyes. He-asws said: 'The eyes of these stallions are covetous, and that is the cause of their looking. So, whenever one of you looks at a woman who fascinates him, then let him touch his wife, for rather she is a woman like his woman'.

A man from the Kharijites said, 'May Allah^{-azwj} Kill him^{-asws} a Kafir! How understanding he^{-asws} is!' The people leapt up to kill him. He^{-asws} said: 'Gently! But rather it is an insult (reviling) for an insult (reviling) or pardoning from a sin''.⁸

⁶ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 101 – The Book of Rulings – CH 5 H 4

⁷ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 101 – The Book of Rulings – CH 5 H 6

⁸ Nahj Al Balagah – Saying 420

كِتَابُ الْغَارَاتِ، لِإِبْرَاهِيمَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ الثَّقَفيِّ عَنْ إِسْمَاعِيلَ بْنِ أَبَانٍ عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ شِمْرٍ عَنْ سَالِمِ الجُّعْفِيِّ عَنِ الشَّعْبِيِّ قَالَ: وَجَدَ عَلِيٌّ ع دِرْعاً لَهُ عِنْدَ نَصْرَائِيٍّ فَجَاءَ بِهِ إِلَى شُرَبْحٍ يُخَاصِمُهُ إِلَيْهِ فَلَمَّا نَظَرَ إِلَيْهِ شُرَيْحٌ ذَهَبَ يَتَنَحَّى وَ قَالَ مَكَانَكَ فَجَلَسَ إِلَى جَنْبِهِ وَ قَالَ يَا شُرَيْحُ أَمَا لَوْ كَانَ حَصْمِي مُسْلِماً مَا جَلَسْتُ إِلَّا مَعُهُ وَ لَكِنَّهُ نَصْرَانِ ً

(The book) 'Kitab Al Gharaat' of Ibrahim Bin Muhammad Al Saqafy, from Ismail Bin Aban, from Amro Bin Shimr, from Salim Al Jufy, from Al Shaby who said,

'Ali-asws found a shield of his-asws in the possession of a Christian. He-asws came with him to Shureyh (the judge) bringing his-asws dispute to him. When Shureyh looked at him he went on to move aside, and he-asws said: 'Stay in your place!' He-asws sat to his side and said: 'O Shureyh! If a Muslim had disputed me-asws, I-asws would not have sat except with him, but he is a Christian.

And Rasool-Allah^{-saww} had said: 'When you and them were in a road, drive them to its narrowness and belittle them just as Allah^{-azwj} has Belittle them without being oppressive'.

Then Ali-asws said: 'This is my-asws shield, I-asws did not sell nor did I-asws gift!'

He (Shureyh) said to the Christian, 'What is Amir Al-Momineen-asws saying?'

The Christian said, 'The shield is not except my shield, and Amir Al-Momineen-asws is not in my view except a liar!'

Shureyh turned to Ali-asws. He said, 'O Amir Al-Momineen-asws! Is there any proof?'

قَالَ لَا

He-asws said: 'No!'

فَقَضَى كِمَا لِلنَّصْرَانِيِّ فَمَشَى هُنَيْئَةً ثُمُّ أَقْبَلَ فَقَالَ أَمَّا أَنَا فَأَشْهَدُ أَنَّ هَذِهِ أَحْكَامُ النَّبِيِّينَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ يَمْشِي بِي إِلَى قَاضِيهِ وَ قَاضِيهِ يَقْضِي عَلَيْهِ أَشْهَدُ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللهُ وَحْدَهُ لَا شَرِيكَ لَهُ وَ أَنَّ مُحَمَّداً عَبْدُهُ وَ رَسُولُهُ الدِّرْعُ وَ اللّهِ دِرْعُكَ يَا أَمِيرَ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ So, he judged with it to be for the Christian. The man walked a while, then came back. He said, 'As for me, I testify that this is the ruling of the Prophet^{-as}! Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} walked with me to his^{-asws} judge, and his^{-asws} judged judges against him^{-asws}. I hereby testify that there is no god except Allah^{-azwj} Alone, there is no associate for Him^{-azwj}, and that Muhammad^{-saww} is His^{-azwj} servant and His^{-azwj} Rasool^{-saww}! By Allah^{-azwj}, the shield is your^{-asws} shield), O Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws}!'

He went out with Amir Al-Momineen^{-asws} to (the battle of) Siffeen. The one who saw him informed me, he fought the Kharijites along with Ali^{-asws} in (the battle of) Al-Naharwan'.⁹

⁹ Bihar Al-Anwaar V 101 – The Book of Rulings – CH 12 H 4