# **QUESTIONS**

# ON

## **IJTIHAD**



## **Dedication**

I hereby dedicate this book to my Master Imam Al Mahdi<sup>asws</sup> whose order of referring to the narrators of Hadeeth is being ignored by the people.

## THE HOLY IMAM AL MAHDI<sup>asws</sup>'S ORDER – AL IHTIJAJ AL TABARSI VOL. 2

مُحَمَّدِ بْن مُحَمَّدِ بْن عِصامٍ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْن يَعْقُوبَ عَن إسْحَاقَ بْن يَعْقُوبَ قَالَ سَأَلْتُ مُحَمَّدَ بْنَ عُثْمَانَ الْعَمْرِيَّ أَنْ يُوصِلَ لِي كِتَابًا قَدْ سَأَلْتُ فِيهِ عَنْ مَسَائِلَ أَشْكَلْت ْ عَلَيَّ فَورَدَ التَّوْقِيعُ بِخَطِّ مَوْلَانَا صَاحِبِ الْعَمْرِيُّ أَنْ يُوصِلَ لِي كِتَابًا قَدْ سَأَلْتُ فِيهِ عَنْ مَسَائِلَ أَشْكَلْت ْ عَلَيَّ فَورَدَ التَّوْقِيعُ بِخَطِّ مَوْلَانَا صَاحِبِ الْعَمْرِيُّ أَنْ يُوصِلَ لِي كِتَابًا قَدْ سَأَلْتُ عَلَيْ إِلَى أَنْ قَالَ وَ أَمَّا الْحَوَادِثُ الْوَاقِعَةُ فَارْجِعُوا فِيهَا إِلَى رُواةِ وَلِيثَا فَإِنَّهُمْ مُجَتِي عَلَيْكُمْ وَ أَنَا حُجَّةُ اللّه

Tradition from Imam Al-Mahdi<sup>asws</sup> in a reply to Ishaq ibn Ya'qub: "As far as newly occurring circumstances are concerned, you should refer to the **narrators of our Hadeeth**, for they are my proof over you and I<sup>asws</sup> am Allah<sup>azwi</sup>'s Proof."

# **INDEX**

INTRODUCTION	4
A BRIEF HISTORY	5
THE HAWZA COURSE	12
THE BOOK OF EMULATION	32
THE ACTIVITY	44
THE IJTIHAD OF UMAR IBN KHATTAB <sup>la</sup>	50
WILL THE MUJTAHID GO TO PARADISE	52
BEARING OF THE BURDEN	55
THE DEBATE	57
CONCLUSION	60
APPENDIX	62

## **INTRODUCTION**

*ljtihad* is the maximum effort of a jurist to enable him to get the presumption of a Sharia law. Whatever opinion that the Mujtahid finally concludes is regarded as sufficient both for himself and his emulators.

Note the operative word above – **Presumption**.

Religion is based on conviction, it is not based on doubt.

#### AL KAFI - H 2872, CH 165, h 7

The Holy Imam Muhammad Al Baqir<sup>asws</sup> said: 'No deed with doubt and denial will be of any benefit.'

## **A BRIEF HISTORY**

## **THE FIRST MUJTAHID**

The first one to reach a conclusion based on the tools of litihad was lblees<sup>la</sup>.

#### AL KAFI - H 176, Ch. 19, h20

علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، عن أحمد بن عبدالله العقيلي، عن عيسى بن عبدالله القرشي قال: دخل أبوحنيفة على أبي عبدالله عليه السلام فقال له: يا أبا حنيفة! بلغني أنك تقيس؟ قال: نعم قال: لا تقس فإن أول من قاس إبليس حين قال: خلقتني من نار وخلقته من طين، فقاس ما بين النار والطين، ولو قاس نورية آدم بنورية النار عرف فضل ما بين النورين، وصفاء أحدهما على الآخر

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from his father from Ahmad ibn 'Abd Allah al-'Aqili from 'Isa ibn 'Abd Allah al-Qurashi who has said the following: "Once, abu Hanifa came to see Imam abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who said to abu Hanifa, 'O abu Hanifa, do you practice analogy as I hear you do'? Abu Hanifa replied, 'Yes, I do practice analogy.' The Imam then said to him, 'Do not practice it; the first person who used analogy was Iblees when he said, "Lord, you have created me from fire and created him from clay." He analogised fire with clay. If he had compared the light in Adam and light of the fire, he would have learned about the difference between the two lights and the excellence of one over the other."

And so the foundation of litihad was laid.

## **THE FIRST FATWA**

As soon as the Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> departed from this world, the followers of Iblees<sup>la</sup> got together in a tent referred to as *Saqifa Bani Sa'da*. They used their intellect (*AqI*) that they needed a leader and got a consensus (*Ijma*) on a person called Abu Bakr<sup>la</sup> as being the first Caliph.

This process of using the tools of ljtihad - *Aql* and *ljma*, led to the **first fatwa** of the first Caliph that if **Ali Ibn Abi Talib**<sup>asws</sup> does not pay allegiance to the duly selected Caliph Abu Bakr<sup>la</sup>, then it is obligatory for him<sup>asws</sup> to be killed (*Waajib Ul Qatl*).

Take a look at these two references.

#### IBNE QUTAIBAH - AL IMAMIYA WAS SIYASAH - VOL 1

Ali<sup>asws</sup> refused to do Bay'at with Abu Bakr. Umar said to him<sup>asws</sup>, 'You<sup>asws</sup> are not free unless you give Bay'at.' They pulled him<sup>asws</sup> out of the house and took him<sup>asws</sup> to Abu Bakr who said, 'Give Bay'at.' Ali<sup>asws</sup> said: 'What if I don't?' They said, 'By God! We swear we would cut off your neck.'

#### AL IHTIJAJ AL TABARSI – VOL 1

Abu Bakr said to Qunfudh: 'If he, All<sup>asws</sup> comes out, it is all right. If not, attack him, and **if he refuses to give allegiance, burn his house with its occupants**.' Qunfudh set out with his associates as ordered, attacked the house without warning, entered it and put a black rope around All<sup>asws</sup>'s neck. Then they took All<sup>asws</sup> to Abu Bakr. The black rope was still around his<sup>asws</sup> neck. Umar was standing with a naked sword. Around Abu Bakr<sup>la</sup> were his companions holding swords. Umar threatened him<sup>asws</sup> and said: 'Do Bay'at!' All<sup>asws</sup> answered: 'What if I don't?' Umar said: 'We shall kill you disrespectfully.'

## **WAS IMAM HUSAYN KILLED BY A FATWA?**

It is common knowledge among the Shiites that when Yazeed Ibn Muawiya could not muster up an army to fight the Holy Imam Husayn<sup>asws</sup>, he resorted to the chief Justice Qadhi Shurayh for a Fatwa based on the incident above. After a lot of wealth had exchanged hands, Qadhi Shurayh issued a Fatwa that – Because Ali Ibn Abi Talib<sup>asws</sup>'s refusal to give allegiance to Abu Bakr made him Wajib Ul Qatl, therefore Husayn ibn Ali<sup>asws</sup>'s refusal to give allegiance to Caliph Yazeed also makes him Wajib Ul Qatl.

And so thousands upon thousands gathered to kill the Master of the Youths of Paradise<sup>asws</sup> in their blind emulation, whilst being fully aware that he<sup>asws</sup> was one of the Masters of the Youths of Paradise.

Dangerous stuff eh? This Fatwa business.

Very dangerous stuff.

## **FATWA AGAINST THE HOLY IMAM MAHDI** asws?

With the religion that we have been led to believe in, being so different from the one taught by the Divine Imams of the Holy Ah UI Bayt<sup>asws</sup>, it is little wonder that very few people will heed the call of the Holy Imam Mahdi<sup>asws</sup> when he<sup>asws</sup> makes his appearance out of major occultation. Especially the presence of the Arabs will be virtually non-existent.

#### AL KAFI - H 939, Ch. 83, h 2

محمد بن يحيى والحسن بن محمد، عن جعفر بن محمد، عن القاسم بن إسماعيل الانباري، عن الحسن بن علي عن أبي المغرا، عن ابن أبي يعفور قال سمعت أبا عبدالله عليه السلام يقول: ويل لطغاة العرب، من أمر قد اقترب، قلت: والله إن من يصف من أمر قد اقترب، قال: لا بد للناس من أن يمحصوا ويميزوا ويغربلوا ويستخرج في الغربال خلق كثير

Muhammad ibn Yahya and al-Hassan ibn Muhammad have narrated from al-Qasim ibn 'Isma'il al-Anbari from al-Husayn ibn Ali from abu al-Mighra' from abu Ya'fur who has said the following: "I heard abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, saying, 'Woe to the rebellious Arabs. The matter is coming closer.' I then asked, 'May Allah keep my soul in service for your cause, how many people from the Arab nation will be there with al-Qa'im?' The Imam said, 'Just very few.' I then said, 'By Allah, those who speak of this matter are quite many in number!' The Imam said, 'People must be refined, distinguished and examined. A sifting process proves a great deal of people as useless.'"

And what about the Mujtahids, a lot of whom are Arabs?

In fact the situation of the Arabs is even worse than this.

#### **BIHAR UL ANWAAR - V 52 - H 62**

الْفَضْلُ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ أَسْبَاطٍ عَنْ أبيهِ أَسْبَاطِ بْنِ سَالِمٍ عَنْ مُوسَى الْأَبَّارِ عَنْ أبي عَبْدِ اللّهِ ع أَنّهُ قَالَ اتَّقَ الْفَرَبَ فَإِنَّ لَهُمْ خَبَرَ سَوْءٍ أَمَا إِنَّهُ لَمْ يَخْرُجُ مَعَ الْقَائِمِ مِنْهُمْ وَاحِدٌ

From AI Fazal Bin Asbaat from his father Asbaat bin Saalim from Musa AI Abbaar from Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup> who<sup>asws</sup> said: 'Let the Arabs be afraid for there is evil news for them. There will <u>not be a single one of them</u> who will come out with AI Qaim<sup>asws</sup>'.

#### BIHAR UL ANWAAR - V 52 - H 101

Ibn Uqdat from Muhammad Bin Al Mufazzal Bin Ibrahim from Muhammad Bin Abdullah bin Zarara from Al Haaris bin Al Mughira and Zareeh Al Muharabi said that Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup> said: 'Nothing will remain between us<sup>asws</sup> and the Arabs except for **the slaughter**' – and he<sup>asws</sup> pointed his<sup>asws</sup> hand to his<sup>asws</sup> throat.

#### BIHAR UL ANWAAR – VOL 52 CH 27

قَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَر ع يَقُومُ الْقَائِمُ بِأَمْرِ جَدِيدٍ وَ كِتَابٍ جَدِيدٍ وَ قَضَاءٍ جَدِيدٍ عَلَى الْعَرَبِ شَدِيدٌ لَيْسَ شَائُهُ إِلَّا بِالسَّيْفِ لَا يَسْتَتِيبُ أَحَدًا وَ لَا يَأْخُدُهُ فِي اللَّهِ لَوْمَةُ لَائِمِ

The Holy Imam Muhammad Al Baqir<sup>asws</sup> said: 'Al Qaim<sup>asws</sup> will make a stand with **new ordinances, and a new Book and new judgments**, being harsh on the Arabs, will not deal will with them except by the sword, not sparing even one of them and will not take accusations against Allah<sup>azwj</sup> from any accuser.'

Now go and ask the Mujtahid Imams as to what Fatwa they would issue against the one who brings a new Religion and a new Book.

#### I repeat

Go and ask the Mujtahid Imams as to what Fatwa they would issue against the one who brings a new Religion and a new Book.

## THE FIRST BOOK OF EMULATION

The first one to produce a book called 'Risala' was the Sunni Imam Shafei, as he was the one who invented the principles of Ijtihad.

#### <u>'IJTEHAD' – AGHA MURTAZA MUTAHHARI</u>

In his famous book, the "Risala" which was the first book to be written on the principles of Islamic jurisprudence (usul al-fiqh), (...) al-Shafi`i insists that the only valid ijtihad according to hadith is qiyas

The common concept of the people is that this handy book of Islamic laws is their religion and that these are the laws of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>'s Religion.

Woe, then, to those who write the book with their hands and then say: This is from Allah, so that they may take for it a small price; therefore woe to them for what their hands have written and woe to them for what they earn -2:79

## **CONCLUSION**

The foundation of Ijithad was laid by Iblees<sup>la</sup>. The result of this Ijtihad was that he<sup>la</sup> became the eternally accursed and was thrown out of the gathering. He<sup>la</sup> will be in eternal damnation in the lowest part of Hell along with his<sup>la</sup> followers.

It was the followers of Iblees<sup>la</sup> who gathered at *Saqifa* and produced the first Fatwa against the Divine Guide<sup>asws</sup>. For this, they will also abide along with their master Iblees<sup>la</sup> for all eternity.

#### KITAB SUALYM BIN QAYS AL HILALI – H 4

فقال علي عليه السلام: لست بقائل غير شيئ واحد. أذكركم بالله أيها الأربعة - يعنيني وأبا ذر والزبير والمقداد سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله يقول: إن تابوتا من نار فيه اثنا عشر رجلا، ستة من الأولين وستة من الاخرين، ي جب في قعر جهنم في تابوت مقفل ، على ذلك الجب صخرة. فإذا أراد

الله أن يسعر جهنم كشف لك الصخرة عن ذلك الجب فاستعرت جهنم من و هج ذلك الجب ومن حره. قال علي عليه السلام: فسألت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله عنهم - وأنتم شهود به - عن الأولين، فقال: أما الأولون فابن آدم الذي قتل أخاه، فرعون الفراعنة، والذي حاج إبراهيم في ربه، ورجلان من بني إسرائيل بدلا كتابهم وغيرا سنتهم، أما أحدهما فهود اليهود والاخر نصر النصارى، وإبليس سادسهم. وفي الاخرين الدجال وهؤلاء الخمسة أصحاب الصحيفة والكتاب وجبتهم وطاغوتهم الذي تعاهدوا عليه وتعاقدوا على عداوتك يا أخي، وتظاهرون عليك بعدي، هذا وهذا حتى سماهم وعدهم لنا.

The Holy Imam All<sup>asws</sup>: 'I do not say anything except for this one, I remind you for the sake of Allah<sup>azwj</sup> O four people (Salman, Abu Dharr, Miqdad and Zubayr)! I am reminding you that I have heard the Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> say: Surely, there will be one coffin of fire in which there will be twelve people – six from the Awwaleen (First ones) and six from the Aakhireen (End ones), that will be in a well which is in the bottom level of the Hell. And this coffin will be the one that will be locked.

There will be a stone kept on the well. Whenever Allah<sup>azwj</sup> Wishes the Hell fire to be inflamed more, He will remove that stone from the top of the well. At that time the Hell will set alight with flames and heat of the well.'

The Holy Imam Ali<sup>asws</sup> continued: 'I asked the Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> and you were present, who are the ones from Awwaleen (First ones?). He<sup>saww</sup> replied: 'There will be Adam<sup>asws</sup>'s son who killed his brother (Kabeel), and Pharaoh of Pharaohs (Firawn) and the one who argued with the Prophet Ibrahim<sup>asws</sup> concerning God (Namrood) and two people of Bani Israeel who changed their Book and their Tradition – one of these two is the one who made a Jew a Jew (Samiri) and the other made a Christian a Christian (Paul). **Iblees will be the sixth of them.** 

And from the Aakhireen (Later ones) there is Dajjal, and these **five who are of Sahifa**, and Kitab and are Jibt and Taghut. (**Abu Bakr<sup>Ja</sup>**, **Umar Ibn Khattab<sup>Ia</sup>**, **Ma'az Bin Jaba<sup>Ia</sup>I, Ubaydullah Ibn Jarrah<sup>Ia</sup> and Saalim Mawla<sup>Ia</sup>**), O my<sup>saww</sup> brother, who made an agreement and contract of enmity towards you<sup>asws</sup>.

And after me, they will overpower you. This one and this one (Until he counted and gave names).

It was the Sunni Imam Shafei, who invented the principles of litihad and produced the first book of emulation.

Since then our boys have adopted his principles and have been producing their books of emulation until today, based on <u>his</u> principles.

#### <u>'IJTEHAD' – AGHA MURTAZA MUTAHHARI</u>

'The Sunnis said that the valid proofs were four in number: the Book, the Sunna, ijma and ijtihad (qiyas); the Shi`a said the valid proofs were four: the Book, the Sunna, ijma` and `aql (reason). **They merely substituted `aql for qiyas**.'

Ijtihad today, is the activity that has <u>never been authorised</u> by any of the Holy Imams<sup>asws</sup>, and is actually based on the religion of the enemies of the Holy Ahl UI Bayt<sup>asws</sup>.

But, more than 90% of the Shiites today are on this religion. If you take this jurisprudence out, they will have no Sharia left.

Now what?

It looks like they have no choice now but to follow the order of the Holy Imam Mahdi.

## THE HOLY IMAM AL MAHDI<sup>asws</sup>'S ORDER – AL IHTIJAJ AL TABARSI VOL. 2

مُحَمَّدِ بْن مُحَمَّدِ بْن عِصَامٍ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْن يَعْقُوبَ عَن إسْحَاقَ بْن يَعْقُوبَ قَالَ سَأَلْتُ مُحَمَّدَ بْنَ عُثْمَانَ الْعَمْرِيَّ أَنْ يُوصِلَ لِي كِتَابًا قَدْ سَأَلْتُ فِيهِ عَنْ مَسَائِلَ أَشْكَلْت عَلَيَّ فَورَدَ التَّوْقِيعُ بِخَطِّ مَوْلَانَا صَاحِبِ الزَّمَانِ عَلَيَّ فَورَدَ التَّوْقِيعُ بِخَطِّ مَوْلانَا صَاحِبِ الزَّمَانِ عِ أَمَّا الْحَوَادِثُ الْوَاقِعَةُ فَارْجِعُوا فِيهَا إلى رُواَةِ الزَّمَانِ عَ أَمَّا الْحَوَادِثُ الْوَاقِعَةُ فَارْجِعُوا فِيهَا إلى رُواَةِ حَدِيثِنَا فَإِنَّهُمْ مُجَتِي عَلَيْكُمْ وَ أَنَا حُجَّةُ اللَّه

Tradition from Imam Al-Mahdl<sup>asws</sup> in a reply to Ishaq ibn Ya'qub: "As far as newly occurring circumstances are concerned, you should refer to the **narrators of our Hadeeth**, for they are my proof over you and I<sup>asws</sup> am Allah<sup>azwi</sup>'s Proof."

## THE HAWZA COURSE

Heigh ho! Heigh ho! And its off to Hawza they go, to become Mujtahids, where they get taught twelve subjects.

(P.s. - This information has been taken from www.imamreza.net)

- 1. Mantiq (Logic)
- 2. Usul al-Figh (Principles of Jurisprudence)
- 3. Figh (Jurisprudence)
- 4. Tafsir al-Qur'an (Qur'an Exegesis)
- 5. 'Ulum al-Qur'an (Qur'an Sciences)
- 6. 'Ilm al-Hadith (The Study of Traditions)
- 7. 'Ilm ar-Rijal (Science of Narrators)
- 8. Tarikh (History)
- 9. Agaid / Kalam (Theology)
- 10. Lugha (Language Studies)
- 11. Falsafa (Islamic Philosophy)
- 12. 'Irfan (Islamic Mysticism)

At the end of this they become experts in one of these subjects and are declared as qualified Mujtahids. They give the qualified one a certificate saying that 'Taqleed is prohibited for him'. This means that other people can do his Taqleed but he cannot be in someone else's. Most of the Mujtahids, if not all, become experts in *Fiqh*, for that is the subject that they do their litihad in.

#### Pssssst!

This Figh is based on the principles of Imam Shafei.

Remember?

#### **QUESTION**

I wonder why they have ignored the obligatory Taqleed of the Holy Infallibles<sup>asws</sup>? (For more details read the article 'Questions On Taqleed' - <a href="http://hubeali.com/online-english-books">http://hubeali.com/online-english-books</a>)

Anyway, let us now examine these subjects being taught in the *Hawza* and what the Holy Infallibles<sup>asws</sup> have said about them.

#### 1. Mantiq (Logic)

This science bears a **very close resemblance** to the study of **Logic at Western universities** in the field of Mathematics or Philosophy. Mantiq is usually one of the first subjects to be taught at a Hawza.

But, is religion based on logic?

When you come to think of it, as an act of worship, Prayer is higher than a Fast. When a woman misses both of these acts of worship due to her monthly biological cycle, logically speaking, she should be making up her Prayers rather than her Fasts, or else if Prayers do not have to be paid back, then neither should the Fast.

But, according to religion she has to make up her Fasts and not her Prayers.

So much so for logic.

#### AL KAFI - H 171, Ch. 19, h15

محمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان، عن صفوان بن يحيى، عن عبد الرحمن بن الحجاج، عن أبان بن تغلب عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: إن السنة لا تقاس ألا ترى أن امرأة تقضي صومها ولا تقضى صلاتها يا أبان! إن السنة إذا قيست محق الدين

Muhammad ibn 'Isma'il has narrated from al-Fadl ibn Shadhan from Safwan Yahya from 'Abd al-Rahman ibn al-Hajjaj from Aban ibn Taghlib from abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "The Sunnah cannot be learned through analogy. Consider a woman who has to make up for her fasts missed but she does not have to make up for the prayers that she missed. O Aban, the use of analogy destroys religion."

#### 2. Usul al-Figh (Principles of Jurisprudence)

In the early days of Islam, scholars only relied on the Qur'an and hadith to understand the practical laws of Islam. They grouped all the traditions at their disposal based on jurisprudence issues. It has therefore been said that the early jurist (faqih) was in fact no more than today's expert of Hadith (Muhadith).

In time though, a jurist had to be skilled in other sciences as well because many practical issues arose that were beyond the scope of just a literal interpretation of the Qur'an and hadith. There was now a need for a science that, for example, discusses not only the jurisprudence content of a Qur'an verse or hadith but also the general principle(s) behind it that jurists could adhere to **when deriving other laws on other issues**.

It is the unanimous view of all the scholars that the first one to set the principles of jurisprudence was Imam Shafei of the Sunnis. The Shiite Priests then adopted these principles and made them the foundation of their studies.

#### 'IJTEHAD' – AGHA MURTAZA MUTAHHARI

'The Sunnis said that the valid proofs were four in number: the Book, the Sunna, ijma and ijtihad (qiyas); the Shi`a said the valid proofs were four: the Book, the Sunna, ijma` and `aql (reason). **They merely substituted `aql for qiyas**.'

Most students of the Hawzas do their lithad in Fiqh, the principles of which are from the Sunni Imam Shafei and have **nothing** to do with the teachings of the Holy Ahl Ul Bayt<sup>asws</sup>.

This is one of the subjects that was <u>NEVER</u> taught by the Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq<sup>asws</sup>. There is a record of him<sup>asws</sup> having taught approximately sixty seven subjects, and this one is **NOT** on that list.

#### <u>BIHAR UL ANWAAR – VOL. 2 CHAPTER ON TAQLEED H32</u>

ابن معروف، عن حماد بن عيسى، عن ربعي، عن فضيل، قال: سمعت أبا جعفر عليه السلام يقول: كل ما لم يخرج من هذا لبيت فهو باطل

It has been narrated from Ibn Marouf from Hammad Bin Isa from Raba'l from Fudhail who said that he heard the Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq<sup>asws</sup> that: 'Whatsoever that does not come out from this Household is void.'

And since this subject does not come from the Holy Household of the Holy Ahl Ul Bayt<sup>asws</sup>, it is therefore invalid.

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – TWO

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 3. Figh (Jurisprudence)

Fiqh (Jurisprudence) is a major (if not 'the major') science **around which most of the other subjects revolve**. The study of the practical laws of Islam and how to derive them is divided by areas of jurisprudence such as purification, prayers, fasting, hajj, marriage, trade, etc.

What can one say about the conclusions derived based on the principles of the Sunni Imam Shafei?

All these rules and regulations that get published in the books of emulation are based on these principles of jurisprudence. Since the principles are void, therefore the end result of these cannot possibly be valid.

#### WASAAIL AL SHIA - H 33193

[ 33193 ] 43 - محمد بن محمد المفيد في ( المجالس ) عن الصدوق ، عن محمد بن الحسن بن الوليد ، عن الصفار ، عن يعقوب بن يزيد ، عن حماد بن عيسى ، عن حماد بن عثمان ، عن زرارة بن أعين ، قال : قال لي أبو جعفر محمد بن علي ( عليهما السلام ) : يا زرارة ! إياك وأصحاب القياس في الدين ، فانهم تركوا علم ما وكلوا به ، وتكلفوا ما قد كفوه ، يتأولون الأخبار ، ويكذبون على الله عز وجل ، وكأني بالرجل منهم ينادى من بين يديه ، فيجيب من خلفه ، وينادى من خلفه ، فيجيب من بين يديه ، قد تاهوا وتحيروا في الأرض والدين .

H 33193 – Muhammad Bin Muhammad Al Mufeed in Al Majaalis from Al Sadouq, from Muhammad Bin Al Hassan Bin Al Waleed, from Al Saffar, from Yaqoub Bin Yazeed, from Hamaad Bin Isa, from Hamaad Bin Uthman, from Zararah Bin Ayn who said, 'Abu Ja'far Muhammad Bin Ali<sup>asws</sup> said to me: 'O Zararah! Beware of people of analogy in religion, for they have avoided the knowledge that they had been ordered to acquire, and strove for that which they had been told to avoid. They interpret the Akhbaar (Hadeeth), and they forge lies against Allah<sup>azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic, and they are like those if called from their front, they answer from the back, and if called from the back, they answer from the front. They follow desires and are confused in the earth and Religion'.

#### **BIHAR UL ANWAAR – VOL. 2 CHAPTER ON TAQLEED H32**

ير: ابن معروف، عن حماد بن عيسى، عن ربعي، عن فضيل، قال: سمعت أبا جعفر عليه السلام يقول: كل ما لم يخرج من هذا لبيت فهو باطل

It has been narrated from Ibn Marouf from Hammad Bin Isa from Raba'l from Fudhail who said that he heard the Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq<sup>asws</sup> that: 'Whatsoever that does not come out from this Household is void.'

And since this subject is based on the principles that do not come from the Holy Household of the Holy Ahl UI Bayt<sup>asws</sup>, it is therefore void.

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – THREE

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 4. Tafsir al-Qur'an (Qur'an Exegesis)

'Ilm al-Tafsir, or "the science of Qur'an exegesis" is usually a systematic (either sequential or thematic) exegetical study of the Qur'an's verses. This subject is widely studied by all Hawza students and one who chooses to specialize in this field becomes a mufassir or commentator of the Qur'an.

The two main commentaries that form part of the course are: -

<u>TAFSEER E NAMOONA</u> – This is taught to lower level students. This is a work that was carried out under the direction of Agha Makarim Shirazi by more than a dozen Priests. This commentary reflects the comments of Shiite as well as Sunni commentators (like Syed Qutb etc.) and is therefore a mixture of truth and falsehood.

#### **SURAH AL BAQARAH – VERSE 42**

وَلَّا تَلْسِسُوا الْحَقَّ بِالْبَاطِلِ وَتَكْثُمُوا الْحَقَّ وَأَنْتُمْ تَعْلَمُونَ

And do not mix up the truth with the falsehood, nor hide the truth while you know (it)

<u>TAFSEER AL MIZAN</u> – This is the commentary of Agha Muhammad Hussein Tabatabaie that is taught to higher level students. This commentary of his is based on theological and philosophical considerations.

Both of these are nothing but opinions, however an educated opinionated work it may be.

#### BIHAR UL ANWAAR - CH 89 H 15 - TAFSEER AYYASHI

عَنْ عَمَّار بْنِ مُوسَى عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قالَ سَأَلْتُ عَنِ الْحُكُومَةِ قالَ مَنْ حَكَمَ بِرَأَيهِ بَيْنَ اتْنَيْنِ فَقَدْ كَفَرَ وَ مَنْ فُسَّرَ آيَةً مِنْ كِتَابِ اللَّهِ فَقَدْ كَفْرَ

It has been narrated from Ammar Bin Musa who asked Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup> about the ordinances. He<sup>asws</sup> said: 'Whoever gives a ruling between the two has disbelieved. **Whoever interprets a Verse from the Book of Allah<sup>azwj</sup> has disbelieved**.

#### BIHAR UL ANWAAR – CH 89 H 20

عَنِ النَّبِيِّ صِ قَالَ مَنْ قَالَ فِي الْقُرْآنِ بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ فُلْيَتَبَوَّأُ مَقْعَدَهُ مِنَ النَّارِ وَ قَالَ صِ مَنْ تَكَلَّمَ فِي الْقُرْآنِ بِرَأْيِهِ فَأَصَابَ فَقَدْ أَدْمَا

The Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> said; 'Whoever speaks from the Quran without knowledge let him take his place in the fire.' And he<sup>saww</sup> said: 'Whoever speaks from the Quran by his opinion has erred.'

#### AL KAFI - H 549, Ch. 22, h1

عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن الحسين بن سعيد، عن النضر ابن سويد، عن أيوب بن الحر وعمران بن علي، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: نحن الراسخون في العلم ونحن نعلم تأويله

A number of our people have narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from al-Husayn ibn Sa'id from al-Nadr ibn Suwayd from Ayyub ibn Hurr and 'Imran ibn Ali from abu Basir from Abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "We are the people well-established in knowledge and we are the ones who know how to interpret it."

#### AL KAFI - H 184, Ch. 20, h6

محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن ابن فضال، عن ثعلبة بن ميمون، عمن حدثه، عن المعلى بن خنيس قال: قال أبو عبدالله عليه السلام: ما من أمر يختلف فيه اثنان إلا وله أصل في كتاب الله عزوجل ولكن لا تبلغه عقول الرجال

Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from ibn Faddal from Al-Tha'laba ibn Maymun from one he narrated from al-Mu'alla ibn Khunays who has said the following: "Abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, has said, 'For every issue disputed between two people there is a principle for it in the book of Allah, the Most Majestic, the Most Glorious, however, man's power of intelligence is not able to find it."

Hey wait a minute! If man's power of intelligence is not able to find it, then it is pointless to ask what they have found out so far over a thousand years eh?

Eh?

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – FOUR

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 5. 'Ulum al-Qur'an (Qur'an Sciences)

Unlike Tafsir al-Qur'an which explains and discusses the 6000+ verses of the Qur'an themselves, this science studies the Qur'an holistically. For example, the Qur'an's history, how it was revealed, the reasons that prompted revelations, how it was compiled, by whom and when, its preservation through the ages, the variations in its readings, the classification of verses into various categories etc.

There is nothing more controversial than this subject. After having learnt this subject, the Priests <u>refuse</u> to talk about the matter of the preservation and the question of alterations in the Holy Quran. Try it and see for yourself.

There are over two thousand Hadeeth on the subject of alteration alone, but the Holy Quran as it stands with us is sufficient for us as Proof.

#### AL KAFI - H 602, Ch. 35, h1

محمد بن يحيى، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن ابن محبوب، عن عمرو بن أبي المقدام عن جابر قال: سمعت أبا جعفر عليه السلام يقول: ما ادعى أحد من الناس أنه جمع القرآن كله كما أنزل إلا كذاب، وما جمعه وحفظه كما نزله الله تعالى إلا علي بن أبي طالب عليه السلام والائمة من بعده عليهم السلام

Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from ibn Mahbub from 'Amr ibn abu al-Miqdam from Jabir who has said that he heard abu Ja'far,

recipient of divine supreme covenant, say the following: "No one from the people has claimed to have collected the whole of the Holy Quran as it was revealed. If anyone comes up with such a claim, he is a liar. No one collected this Holy Book and memorized it as Allah, the Most Holy, the Most High, revealed it except Ali ibn abu Talib, recipient of divine supreme covenant, and 'A'immah after him."

#### BIHAR UL ANWAAR – VOL 52 CH 27

قَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ ع يَقُومُ الْقَائِمُ بِأَمْرٍ جَدِيدٍ وَ كِتَابٍ جَدِيدٍ وَ قَضَاءٍ جَدِيدٍ عَلَى الْعَرَبِ شَدِيدٌ لَيْسَ شَأَنْهُ إِلَّا بِالسَّيْفِ لَا يَسْتَتِيبُ أَحَداً وَ لَا يَأْخُذُهُ فِي اللَّهِ لَوْمَهُ لَائِمٍ

The Holy Imam Muhammad Al Baqir<sup>asws</sup> said: 'Al Qaim<sup>asws</sup> will make a stand with **new ordinances, and a new Book and new judgments**, being harsh on the Arabs, will not deal will with them except by the sword, not sparing even one of them and will not take accusations against Allah<sup>azwj</sup> from any accuser.'

#### BIHAR UL ANWAAR - VOL 89 P 74

قال جعفر بن محمد الصادق عليه السلام: أما والله لوقرئ القرآن كما انزل الافيتمونا فيه مسمين كما سمي من كان قبلنا، وقال عليه السلام: نزل القرآن أربعة أرباع: ربع فينا، وربع في عدونا، وربع قصص وأمثال، وربع قضايا وأحكام، ولنا أهل البيت فضائل القرآن.

So said Ja'far Bin Muhammad The Truthful<sup>asws</sup>: 'By Allah! If the Quran were to be read the way in which it was revealed you would have found our names therein the way the names of the previous people are found.' And then he<sup>asws</sup> said: 'The Quran has been revealed in four parts – A quarter of it is for us, a quarter is for our enemies, a quarter of it is stories and parables and a quarter of it is law and ordinances, and for us the people of the Household are the virtues of the Quran.'

#### **BIHAR UL ANWAAR – VOL 52 H 85**

روى جابر، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام أنه قال: إذا قام قائم آل محمد عليهم السلام ضرب فساطيط لمن يعلم الناس القرآن، على ما أنزل الله جل جلاله، فأصعب ما يكون على من حفظ اليوم لانه يخالف فيه التأليف

It has been narrated by Jabir from Abu Ka'far<sup>asws</sup> that: 'When the 'Al Qaim<sup>asws</sup>' of the Household of the Prophet<sup>saww</sup> makes a stand he will teach the people the Quran as it was Revealed by Allah<sup>azwj</sup>. It will be a problem for those who had memorized it as it is today, for **it will in a different order**.'

Are there any Verses from the Holy Quran which have not been explained by the Holy Infallibles assws?

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – FIVE

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 6. 'Ilm al-Hadith (The Study of Traditions)

'Ilm al-Hadith (or the Science of Hadith) is not about the narrations or traditions themselves; rather it discusses the history of traditions, their compilation and classification, their collection and preservation, and so forth.

Well! Well! Well! Isn't this an obvious giveaway? Read the above passage again.

<u>'Ilm al-Hadith (or the Science of Hadith) is not about the narrations or traditions themselves'</u>

And so the qualified people come out of the Hawzas being **totally unaware** of what the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> has said. Neither are they aware of what any of the Holy Imams<sup>asws</sup> have said either.

Don't believe me? Well, you have seen for yourself that I have been writing a series of papers on questions that arise on various matters, including this one, and **so far no Priest has been able to refute any of the arguments contained therein**.

This is because they have studied all the subjects that have **nothing** to do with the Holy Infallibles<sup>asws</sup>, and what they have not learnt is what they should have learnt in the first place.

They know more about the people who narrated the Hadeeth from the Holy Imams<sup>asws</sup>, than they do about the Hadeeth itself. This is like admiring the design and artwork surrounding a copy of the Holy Quran, and the quality of its paper, and the ink and the fonts used, whilst not bothering to read the Holy Quran itself.

What kind of expertise is that and what kind of expert would you end up as, after this?

#### AL KAFI - H 207, Ch. 22, h9

عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد بن خالد، عن أبيه، عن أبي إسماعيل إبراهيم بن إسحاق الازدي، عن أبي عثمان العبدي، عن جعفر، عن آبائه، عن أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله لا قول إلا بعمل، ولا قول ولا عمل إلا بنية، ولا قول ولا عمل ولا نية إلا بإصابة السنة.

A number of our people have narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn Khalid from his father from abu 'Isma'il Ibrahim ibn Ishaq al-Azdi from abu 'Uthman al-'Abdi from Ja'far from his ancestors from Amir al-Mu'minin Ali, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "The messenger of Allah has said, 'There are no words without action, there are no words or actions without intention and there are no words, actions and intentions without learning the Sunnah.

#### AL KAFI - H 208, Ch. 22, h10

علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، عن أحمد بن النضر، عن عمرو بن شمر، عن جابر، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: قال: ما من أحد إلا وله شرة وفترة فمن كانت فترته إلى سنة فقد اهتدى ومن كانت فترته إلى بدعة فقد غوى.

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from his father from Ahmad ibn al-Nadr from 'Amr ibn Shimr from Jabir from abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "There is no one without excitement and calmness. **Whoever's calmness leads him toward the Sunnah, is rightly guided,** but if it leads him toward innovations then he has gone astray."

## TAFSEER IMAM HASSAN AL ASKARI<sup>asws</sup> – S 26

26 ـ وأما قول أمير المؤمنين (عليه السلام) فهو قوله: يا معشر شيعتنا والمنتحلين ـ مودتنا ـ إياكم وأصحاب الرأي، فانهم أعداء السنن، تفلتت منهم الاحاديث أن يحفظوها وأعيتهم السنة أن يعوها، فاتخذوا عباد الله خولا، وماله دولا، فذلت لهم الرقاب وأطاعهم الخلق أشباه الكلاب، ونازعوا الحق أهله، وتمثلوا بالائمة الصادقين وهم من الجهال والكفار والملاعين، فسئلوا عما لا يعلمون، فأنفوا أن يعترفوا بأنهم لا يعلمون، فعارضوا الدين ـ بآرائهم فضلوا وأضلوا.

And the words of the Commander of the Faithful<sup>asws</sup>: 'O group of our Shiites and the claimants to be those that love us<sup>asws</sup>, beware of the people of opinion for they are the enemies of the Sunnah. Hadeeth have run away from their memories and they have tired of protecting the Sunnah. They have taken the servants of Allah azwi as their followers and their wealth to be their own riches. After having witnessed this, a lot of people have become obedient to them just like dogs. They have snatched away the rights from the rightful people and have become like the true Imams and they are from the ignorant ones and the unbelievers and the accursed. When they are asked about something they don't know about, they do not admit their ignorance, but make use of opinion and go astray and lead others astray.'

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – SIX

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 7. 'Ilm ar-Rijal (Science of Narrators)

Ilm ar-Rijal is, literally, "The Science of People". Any tradition (hadith) is usually made up of two parts: a header (called isnad or sanad) and the main text or narration itself (called matn). The header lists the chain of narrators, which is crucial in identifying the original source of a hadith and verifying its authenticity.

'Ilm ar-Rijal, as an off-shoot of 'Ilm al-Hadith, studies the individual lives of narrators to check their trustworthiness. This in turn is used as one factor (amongst others) in concluding the authenticity of narrations. Sometimes a narrator may be unknown and his history may simply be lost in time.

Here we go again. This is another subject that was NEVER taught by the Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq<sup>asws</sup>.

The first one to teach this was the Sunni Imam Abu Hanifa, and since then, the Shiite Priests have adopted this among themselves and have become experts in this field. One of the prominent ones has actually written over forty volumes on this subject.

I wonder if that makes him the father of wisdom or the father of ignorance?

They ask, 'How come in every Hadeeth a number of narrators are mentioned and this is how it should be, if there was no need to study their characters in detail?'

#### **WASAAIL AL SHIA – H 33259**

[ 33259 ] 14 - وعن علي بن إبراهيم ، عن أبيه ، وعن أحمد بن محمد ابن خالد ، عن النوفلي ، عن السكوني ، عن أبي عبدالله ( عليه السلام ) ، قال : قال أمير المؤمنين ( عليه السلام ) : إذا حدثتم بحديث فأسندوه إلى الذي حدثكم ، فان كان حقا فلكم ، وإن كان كذبا فعليه .

**H 33259** – And from Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, and from Ahmad Bin Muhammad Ibn Khalid, from Al Nawfaly, from Al Sakuni, from Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup>, said: 'The Commander of the Faithful<sup>asws</sup> said; 'When you narrate Hadeeth, then mention its chain (of narrators). If it was the truth then it is to you (its reward), and if it was false it is to them (its punishment)'.

So much so for Ilm Ul Rijaal, eh?

#### **BIHAR UL ANWAAR - VOL. 2 CHAPTER ON TAQLEED H32**

ير: ابن معروف، عن حماد بن عيسى، عن ربعي، عن فضيل، قال: سمعت أبا جعفر عليه السلام يقول: كل ما لم يخرج من هذا لبيت فهو باطل

It has been narrated from Ibn Marouf from Hammad Bin Isa from Raba'l from Fudhail who said that he heard the Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq<sup>asws</sup> that: 'Whatsoever that does not come out from this Household is void.'

And since this subject does not come from the Holy Household of the Holy Ahl Ul Bayt<sup>asws</sup>, it is therefore void.

This is such a bogus subject. But, the Priests go out of their way to justify their learning of this subject of the enemies of the Holy Ahl UI Bayt<sup>asws</sup>. They use the following Verse for it: -

#### <u>SURAH AL HUJURAAT – VERSE 6</u>

يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِنْ جَاءَكُمْ فَاسِقٌ بِنَبَإٍ فَتَبَيَّنُوا أَنْ تُصِيبُوا قَوْمًا بِجَهَالَةٍ فَتُصْبِحُوا عَلَىٰ مَا فَعَلْتُمْ نَادِمِينَ

O you who believe! If an evil-doer comes to you with a report, **look carefully into it**, lest you harm a people in ignorance, then be sorry for what you have done - 49:6

Can you believe it? Allah<sup>azwj</sup> Tells them to look into the report, and they end up looking into the reporters instead! The narrator has already been classified as an evil-doer, so what is the point of looking into him?

Talk about flying off on a tangent. The rules of ascertaining reports have been given out clearly by the Holy Imams<sup>asws</sup>. Take a look at one of them: -

#### AL KAFI - H 203, Ch. 22, h5

محمد بن إسماعيل، عن الفضل بن شاذان، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن هشام بن الحكم وغيره، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: خطب النبي صلى الله عليه وآله بمنى فقال: أيها الناس ما جاء كم عني يوافق كتاب الله فأنا قاته وما جاء كم يخالف كتاب الله فلم أقله.

Muhammad ibn 'Isma'il from al-Fadl ibn Shadhan from ibn abu 'Umayr from Hisham ibn al-Hakam and others from abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "The Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> once addressed the people in Mina (a place in Makka) saying, 'O people, whatever comes to you in the form of

my Hadith, if it agrees with the Holy Book of Allah, it is genuine, but whatever comes to you that does not agree with the book of Allah you must know that I have not said it."

And before you even say it – No sir! This is not a circular argument.

#### AL KAFI - H 549, Ch. 22, h1

عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن الحسين بن سعيد، عن النضر ابن سويد، عن أيوب بن الحر وعمران بن على أبي بعد الله عليه السلام قال: نحن الراسخون في العلم ونحن نعلم تأويله

A number of our people have narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from al-Husayn ibn Sa'id from al-Nadr ibn Suwayd from Ayyub ibn Hurr and 'Imran ibn Ali from abu Basir from Abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "We are the people well-established in knowledge and we are the ones who know how to interpret it."

The argument that they bring is that how can we say that a particular Hadeeth agrees with the Holy Quran unless we know the Holy Quran in the first place.

What the Holy Imam<sup>asws</sup> is saying is that even the Holy Quran is to be learnt according to Hadeeth. It is their<sup>asws</sup> explanation that is the correct one. The opinions of the Mujtahids are worth zilch.

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – SEVEN

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 8. Tarikh (History)

There are numerous works of Islamic history - both Shi'ah and Sunni. A work that is popular at Hawzas is the Al-Milal wa al-Nihal by Shahristani. Other popular books are the works of the famous Shi'ah historian Sayyid Murtada al-Askari.

#### AL KAFI - H 44, Ch. 2, h1

محمد بن الحسن وعلي بن محمد، عن سهل بن زياد، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن عبيد الله بن عبدالله الدهقان، عن درست الواسطي، عن إبراهيم بن عبدالحميد، عن أبي الحسن موسى عليه السلام قال: دخل رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله المسجد فإذا جماعة قد أطافوا برجل فقال: ما هذا؟ فقيل: علامة فقال: وما العلامة؟ فقالوا له: أعلم الناس بأنساب العرب ووقائعها، وأيام

الجاهلية، والاشعار العربية، قال: فقال النبي صلى الله عليه وآله: ذاك علم لا يضر من جهله، ولا ينفع من علمه، ثم قال النبي صلى الله عليه وآله: إنما العلم ثلاثة: آية محكمة، أو فريضة عادلة، أو سنة قائمة، وما خلاهن فهو فضل

Muhammad ibn al-Hassan has narrated from Ali ibn Muhammad from Sahl ibn Ziyad from Muhammad ibn 'Isa from 'Ubayd Allah al-Dihqan from Durust al Wasiti from Ibrahim ibn 'Abd al-Hamid from abu al-Hassan Musa, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "Once the Holy Prophet, recipient of divine supreme covenant, entered the Mosque and found a group of people gathered around a man. He asked, 'Who is he?' It was said that he was an Allama. Then he asked, 'What is that?' They replied that he is an expert in genealogy, chronology, and the history of the pre-Islamic days of darkness and poetry of Arabs. The Holy Prophet, recipient of divine supreme covenant, then told them, 'There are only three kinds of Knowledge: A decisive Verse, a justly enjoined obligation or an established tradition. Other than these are only something extra."

Now, is history a decisive Verse?

Is it a justly enjoined obligation?

Is it an established tradition (Sunnah/Hadeeth)?

So what is it?

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – EIGHT

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 9. Agaid (Theology)

Aqaid (theology) is also called 'Ilm al-Kalam' or '**Usul al-Deen'**. The latter title is rarely used in Hawzas, perhaps to avoid confusing it with Usul al-Fiqh (which is at times called 'Ilm al-Usul). Shi'ah theology usually discusses issues around five principles: **Tawhid** (Divine Unity), **Adalah** (Divine Justice), **Nubuwwah** (Prophethood), **Imamah** (Imamate) and **Ma'ad** (Day of Judgement, also called al-Qiyamah or the Resurrection).

Just look at the five principles that they teach. Are they not the same ones that we have grown up with?

Yes they are!

But, where did they come from?

This is not from the Holy Quran and therefore does not come from Allahazwi.

This is not from the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> as it is not to be found in any of his<sup>saww</sup> statements (Noble Hadeeth).

NONE of the Holy Infallibles<sup>asws</sup> have ever given them out as being the principles of our religion.

So where did they come from? Who created these?

Is this not just another one of the products **manufactured** by the people of this world, only to be passed on as the principles of a Divine religion?

Go and ask your local Priest and see if he knows where he got them from. He will just waffle on and on and <u>never</u> give you a straight answer, nor will he ever come to the point. Try it and see for yourself.

And the Bible Thumper knocks on my door and tells me that Jesus is God, and that he is the son of God and that he died on the cross. But, when I ask him to show it to me in the Bible, he fails to do so. But he claims these to be the First Principles of the religion of Jesus, although they are not to be found in the Bible.

The reality is, that he is doing the work of Satan in the name of God.

Similarly, the Priests tell me that the First Principles of Islam are five (*Tawheed, Adaalat, Nabuwwat, Imamat and Qiyamat*). When I ask them to show it to me in the Book of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>, they fail to do so.

When I ask them to show it to me in the statements of the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup>, they fail to do so.

When I ask them to show it to me in the statements of any of the twelve Imams<sup>asws</sup> they fail to do so.

Yet they claim these to be the First Principles of the religion of the People of the Household<sup>asws</sup>.

In reality, are they not also doing the work of Satan in the name of Allahazwi?

In this, what is the difference between the Christian Bible Thumpers and our Pirests? They are both going around giving out Principles of a religion which cannot be found in any of their respective Books.

The Holy Imam<sup>asws</sup> has in fact given out a different set of Principles.

#### AL KAFI - H 1480, CH 10, h 3

أبوعلي الاشعري، عن الحسن بن علي الكو في، عن عباس بن عامر، عن أبان بن عثمان، عن فضيل بن يسار، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: بني الاسلام على خمس: على الصلاة والزكاة والصوم والحج والولاية ولم يناد بشئ كما نودى بالولاية، فأخذ الناس بأربع وتركواهذه يعنى الولاية

Abu Ali al-Ash'ari has narrated from al-Hassan ibn Ali al-Kufi from 'Abbas ibn 'Amir from Aban ibn 'Uthman from Fudayl ibn Yasar from abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "Abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, has said, 'Islam is based on five principles. They are: Prayer, al-Zakat (charity), Fasting, Hajj and al-Wilayah. The call to none of the other principles has been as emphatic as it has been to al-Wilayah. People accepted the other four but they left aside this i.e. al-Wilayah."

Now go and check this out in the book of emulation of the Mujtahids. You will find the first four but you will **NEVER** find the fifth.

Go on, make an effort.

It has been replaced by Khums, which is actually not payable. (See the paper 'Questions On Khums' for detail - <a href="http://hubeali.com/online-english-books">http://hubeali.com/online-english-books</a>)

Talk about predictions coming true eh?

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – NINE

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 10. Lugha (Language Studies)

Studying the Arabic language will usually consists of – Grammar (Nahw), Syntax/Morphology (Sarf), Rhetoric (Balagah) and Vocabulary.

Yes, no doubt, learning of the Arabic language is important.

#### **WASAAIL US SHIA - VOL 3 CH 51 H 1 - 5989**

محمد بن علي بن الحسين في (الخصال) عن أبيه، عن سعد، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى، عن أحمد بن محمد بن أبي نصر البزنطي عن رجل من خزاعة، عن أسلمي، عن أبيه، عن أبيه، عن أبي عبد الله (عليه السلام) قال: تعلموا العربية فإنها كلام الله الذي تكلم به خلقه

It has been narrated from Muhammad Bin Ali Bin Al Husayn In 'Al Khisal' from his father from Sa'ad from Ahmad Bin Muhammad Bin Isa from Ahmad Bin Muhammad Bin Abi Nasr Al Bazanti from a person from Khaza'a from Aslami from his father from Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup> that: 'Learn Arabic from this is the language that Allah<sup>azwj</sup> has Communicated with His creatures.'

But, they are going overboard on this one.

#### **WASAAIL U SHIA - V 17 - H 22686**

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِدْرِيسَ فِي آخِرِ السَّرَائِرِ نَقْلًا مِنْ كِتَابِ جَعْفَرِ بْنِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ سِنَانِ الدِّهْقَانِ عَنْ عُبَيْدِ اللَّهِ عَنْ دُرُسْتَ عَنْ عَبْدِ الْحَمِيدِ بْنِ أَبِي الْعَلَاءِ عَنْ مُوسَى بْنِ جَعْفَرٍ عَنْ آبَائِهِ عَ قَالَ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنْ دُرُسْتَ عَنْ عَبْدِ الْحَمِيدِ بْنِ أَبِي الْعَلَاءِ عَنْ مُوسَى بْنِ جَعْفَرٍ عَنْ آبَائِهِ عَ قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص مَنِ انْهَمَكَ فِي طَلَبِ النَّحْوِ سُلِبَ الْخُشُوعَ

Muhammad Bin Idrees in 'The Last Secrets' quotes from the book of Ja'far Bin Muhammad Bin Sinan Al Dahqan from Ubaydullah from Durusta from Abdul Hameed Bin Abul A'la from Musa Bin Ja'far<sup>asws</sup> from his<sup>asws</sup> forefathers<sup>asws</sup> that the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> said: 'Whoever involves himself in the learning of syntax will crucify his humility.'

Not a very nice thing to do, going overboard in the learning of syntax.

#### WASAAIL U SHIA - V 6 - H 7781

مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَعْقُوبَ عَنْ عَلِيِّ بْنِ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ النَّوْقَلِيِّ عَنِ السَّكُونِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَ قَالَ قَالَ النَّبِيُّ صَ إِنَّ الرَّجُلَ الْأَعْجَمِيَّ مِنْ أُمَّتِي لَيَقْرَأُ الْقُرْآنَ بِعُجْمَتِهِ فَتَرْفَعُهُ الْمَلَائِكَةُ عَلَى عَرَبِيَّتِهِ

Muhammad Bin Yaqub has narrated from Ali Bin Ibrahim from his father from Al Nawffali from Al Sakuni from Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup> that: 'The Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> said, 'When a non-Arab man of my Ummah recites the Quran in his own accent, the Angels immediately raise it to Arabic.'

Hmmm! Reminds me of someone who said that the 'Seen' of Bilal is 'Sheen' with Allahazwj.

If expertise in Arabic language leads to the correct religion then all the Arabs would have been on it, But . . .

#### AL KAFI - H 939, Ch. 83, h 2

محمد بن يحيى والحسن بن محمد، عن جعفر بن محمد، عن القاسم بن إسماعيل الانباري، عن الحسن بن علي عن أبي المغرا، عن ابن أبي يعفور قال سمعت أبا عبدالله عليه السلام يقول: ويل لطغاة العرب، من أمر قد اقترب، قلت: والله إن من يصف هذا الامر منهم لكثير، قال: لا بد للناس من أن يمحصوا ويميزوا ويغربلوا ويستخرج في الغربال خلق كثير

Muhammad ibn Yahya and al-Hassan ibn Muhammad have narrated from al-Qasim ibn 'Isma'il al-Anbari from al-Husayn ibn Ali from abu al-Mighra' from abu Ya'fur who has said the following: "I heard abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, saying, 'Woe to the rebellious Arabs. The matter is coming closer.' I then asked, 'May Allah keep my soul in service for your cause, how many people from the Arab nation will be there with al-Qa'im?' The Imam said, 'Just very few.' I then said, 'By Allah, those who speak of this matter are quite many in number!' The Imam said, 'People must be refined, distinguished and examined. A sifting process proves a great deal of people as useless."

The sifting process will certainly prove most Mujtahids as useless for most of them are Arabs.

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – TEN

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 11. Falsafa (Islamic Philosophy)

Having studied Mantiq (Logic), those who wish to gain a deeper understanding of the philosophy of Islam will study Falsafa. At the hawzas, a large part of Islamic philosophy deals with theoretical metaphysics and mysticism, the practical aspects of which are covered in 'Irfan.

Yes, Philosphy. Started by Philo the Greek Sophist. The forbidden knowledge.

But, that is not going to stop our boys now is it?

#### MUSTADRIK AL WASAAIL – VOL 11 H 13308

الْعَلَامَةُ الْأَرْدَبِيلِيُّ فِي حَدِيقَةِ الشَّيعَةِ، نَقْلَا عَنِ الْسَيِّدِ الْمُرْتَضَى بْنِ الدَّاعِي الْحُسَيْنِيِّ الرَّازِيِّ بِإِسْنَادِهِ عَنْ الشَّيْخِ الْمُفِيدِ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مَحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنْ أَبِيهِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَنْ أَلْمَامُ الْحَسَنِ الْعَسْكَرِيِّ عِ أَنَّهُ قَالَ لِلْبِي هَاشِمِ الْجَغَفْرِيِّ يَا أَبَا هَاشِمٍ سَيَأْتِي زَمَانٌ عَلَى النَّاسِ وُجُوهُهُمْ ضَاحِكَةٌ مُسْتَبْشِرَةٌ وَ قُلُوبُهُمْ مُظْلِمَةٌ مُثَكِّرَةٌ السُّنَّة فِيهمْ بِدْعَةٌ وَ اللَّهِ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَلْمُ اللَّهُ فِيهمْ بِدْعَةٌ وَ اللَّهِ عَلَى النَّاسِ وَجُوهُهُمْ ضَاحِكَةٌ مُسْتَبْشِرَةٌ وَ قُلُوبُهُمْ مُظْلِمَةٌ مُثَكِدَرة السُّنَةُ فِيهمْ بِدْعَة وَ اللَّهِ اللَّهُ الْمُونُونَ عَلَى النَّسَوَةُ وَمَ الْفَقْرَاءِ وَ أَصَاغِرُهُمْ مَتَعَدَّمُونَ عَلَى الْكَبَرَاءِ وَ كُلُّ جَاهِلِ الْفُورِ اللَّهِ اللَّهُ عَلَى وَجْهِ الْأَرْضِ لِأَنَّهُمْ يَمِيلُونَ إلى الْمُعْلِقِ وَ الْمُعْرِقُونَ عَلَى الْكَبَرَاءِ وَ كُلُّ جَاهِلٍ عَلْدَهُمْ خَييرٌ وَ كُلُّ مُحِيلٍ عِنْدَهُمْ قَقِيرٌ لَا يُمَيِّرُونَ بَيْنَ الْمُخْلِصِ وَ الْمُرْتَابِ لَا يَعْرِفُونَ الْطَعَلَى مِنَ الدَّنَابِ الظَّلْمَةِ مَلْ اللَّهِ إِنَّهُمْ مِنْ الْمُؤْمِنِ عَلَى وَجْهِ الْأَرْضِ لِأَنَّهُمْ يَمِيلُونَ إلى الْقَلْسَفَةِ وَ التَصَوَّفِ وَ ايْمُ اللَّهِ إِنَّهُمْ مِنْ أَهْلِ عَلَى وَجْهِ الْأَرْضِ لِأَنَّهُمْ يَمِيلُونَ الْمَوْمِنِينَ وَ التَّصَوَفِ وَ ايْمُ اللَّهِ إِنَّهُمْ مِنْ أَهْلَ اللَّهُ عَلَى وَجْهِ الْأَرْضِ لِأَنَّهُمْ يَعْمُولُ وَ التَّكُولُ وَ التَّحَدُونَ فَلَ عَلَى الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَ اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى الْمَالِهِ الْمُهُ وَلَوْمَ الْولَا عَنْ الْمَالِهِ اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ عَلَى اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ الَا اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّهُ اللَّه

It has been narrated from the above chain of narrators that the Holy Imam Hasan Al Askari<sup>asws</sup> said to Hashim Al Ja'fari: 'O Abu Hashim! There will come a time upon the people when their faces will be smiling and hopeful and their hearts will be in darkness and sad. The Noble Sunnah within them will be considered as innovation while the innovation will be considered as the Noble Sunnah. The believer among them will be degraded and the mischievous one will be honoured. The wealthy among them will be ignorant and unjust while their scholars will the doors of darkness. The generous ones will steal the resources of the poor and their young ones will move ahead of their seniors. All of their ignorant ones will become experts and those in charge will not distinguish between the sincere and the insincere, the sheep from the wolves. Their scholars will be the most evil of the creatures of Allahazwi on the face of the earth because they will lean towards philosophy and mysticism and by Allahazwi they will be from their people of justice (judiciary). They will exaggerate in their praise of our opponents and they will mislead our Shiites and our slaves. If they get into positions (of power) they will not be satisfied and when they come down from it they worship Allahazwi to show off. They are the highway robbers of the believers and the advocates of the atheists. Whoever realises them as such will keep away from them and preserve his religion and his faith.' The he asws said: 'O Abu Hashim! This is what my father related to me from his father from Ja'far Bin Muhammadasws and this is from our secrets. Hide these except from its deserving ones'.

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – ELEVEN

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

#### 12. 'Irfan (Islamic Mysticism)

Irfan is generally divided into theoretical (nadhari) 'irfan and practical ('amali) 'irfan. Theoretical 'Irfan is the study of Islamic metaphysics and 'Transcendent Philosophy'. The latter is usually a discussion around the teachings of philosopher-mystics like Ibn Sina, Suhrawardi, Ibn 'Arabi and Mulla Sadra. 'Irfan however distinguishes its goal from that of religious philosophy by being more theosophical. In other words: Whereas falsafa seeks to know God with the mind and through rationalization, 'irfan seeks to know God through direct, personal experience. Practical 'Irfan is sometimes called sayr wa suluk (Spiritual wayfaring) and is in many ways synonymous to Sufism.

The above Hadeeth clearly negates the studying of this subject as well.

"Their scholars will be the most evil of the creatures of Allah<sup>azwj</sup> on the face of the earth because they will lean towards philosophy and mysticism."

A subject that is synonymous to Sufism clearly does not come from the Holy Ahl Ul Bayt<sup>asws</sup>. It is therefore void.

THE HOLY IMAM<sup>asws</sup> – TWELVE

**MUJTAHID - NIL** 

Now this is what I call a comprehensive defeat. Twelve Nil.

What a score line! With all twelve goals scored being own goals.

## THE BOOK OF EMULATION

This book is commonly known as either 'Tawzeeh Ul Masaail' or 'Risala Al Amaliyya'. Tawzeeh or Risala for short.

The qualified Mujtahid then produces his book of emulation once he becomes a Marja' of whom *Taqleed* is to be done by the people. The people then go and give him the Khums monies.

Let us now take a look at this book of emulation and examine it.

As mentioned before, this book normally covers the four principles of Islam – Prayer, Charity, Fast and Pilgrimage. It does not contain the fifth one 'Wilayah' although this is the most important one. In this book, the Mujtahid has replaced *Wilayah* with Khums, which is the most important for him.

#### AL KAFI - H 1480, CH 10, h 3

أبوعلي الاشعري، عن الحسن بن علي الكو في، عن عباس بن عامر، عن أبان بن عثمان، عن فضيل بن يسار، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: بني الاسلام على خمس: على الصلاة والزكاة والصوم والحج والولاية ولم يناد بشئ كما نودى بالولاية، فأخذ الناس بأربع وتركواهذه يعنى الولاية

Abu Ali al-Ash'ari has narrated from al-Hassan ibn Ali al-Kufi from 'Abbas ibn 'Amir from Aban ibn 'Uthman from Fudayl ibn Yasar from abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "Abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, has said, 'Islam is based on five principles. They are: Prayer, al-Zakat (charity), Fasting, Hajj and al-Wilayah. The call to none of the other principles has been as emphatic as it has been to al-Wilayah. People accepted the other four but they left aside this i.e. al-Wilayah."

#### Tell me about it.

Anyway, let us briefly look at the five subjects that the book of emulation normally covers. This is the book that is more studied by the general Shiite populace rather than the Book of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>, and this is my observation.

## **PRAYER (SALAAT)**

This section will have hundreds upon hundreds of regulations regarding the Prayers which hardly anyone among the people will have memorised all of them. And so when the people Pray, they generally remember some of them, but never all.

If the correct procedure of Praying is according to these rules then no one is Praying correctly for no one remembers all of these rules anyhow.

Secondly, if the book of one Mujtahid contains the correct rules then what about the rules in the book of another Mujtahid? And there have been thousands over the years with each of them producing different sets of rules. And there will probably be thousands more to come over time.

So which is the correct way of Praying then?

And according to which rules did one Mujtahid Pray before he wrote his own book of emulation which is different from the one he grew up with?

If his Prayers were valid when he used to pray according to a different set of rules then why should someone else's prayers be invalid when they pray to rules other than the ones produced by him?

And if his rules are the correct ones, then why do they become incorrect when he dies and the people then have to refer to a different Mujtahid and pray according to the new rules of the new Mujtahid?

Why does his book of emulation die with him if this is the correct religion? Surely, the correct Sharia will remain correct whether the Mujtahid lives or not.

It is obvious from the above that the Mujtahids themselves are not certain of their own findings and therefore regard all the rules of all the Mujtahids as having the possibility of being correct.

But then we have the saying of the Holy Imam Ali<sup>asws</sup>:

#### NAHJ UL BALAGAH – SAYING NO. 182

مَا تَلْفَتُ احْ دَعُورَتَانِ إِلَّا كَانَتْ إِحْدَاهُمَا ضَلَّالَّهُ

Where there are two differing claims then **one of them is a straying**. (If two opposite theories are propagated, **one will be wrong** – Official translation)

## AL KAFI - H 643, Ch. 41, h7 (EXTRACT)

أما علمنا فظاهر، وأما إبان أجلنا الذي يظهر فيه الدين منا حتى لا يكون بين الناس اختلاف، فإن له أجلا من ممر الليالي والايام، إذا أتى ظهر، وكان الامر واحدا. وأيم الله لقد قضي الامر أن لا يكون بين المؤمنين اختلاف

The Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq<sup>asws</sup> said: 'Our knowledge is clear. The appearance of the appointed time for us in which religion will stand supreme through us so much so that there will remain no differences among people, for such time there is an appointed time that passes through the nights and days. When that time comes, the Command of Allah will be only one. I swear by Allah, it is already decreed that there will be no differences among the believers'.

Since it has been decreed that there will be no differences among the believers, then in which category shall we place those that differ?

The unbelievers?

And the most important thing of all is the bearing of the Third Testimony which is not to be found in any of the books of emulation. (For detailed discussion refer to the paper 'Questions on the Third Testimony - <a href="http://hubeali.com/online-english-books">http://hubeali.com/online-english-books</a>)

## **FAST (SAWM)**

It is obvious that the biggest problem with regards to fasting these days is the sighting of the moon based on which the fasting has to start and end.

These books of emulation have completely failed to provide clear guidance to the people as far as the issue of moon sighting is concerned.

- محمد بن يحيى، عن محمد بن أحمد، عن السياري، عن محمد بن إسماعيل الرازي عن أبي جعفر الثاني (عليه السلام) قال: قلت له: جعلت فداك ما تقول في الصوم فإنه قد روي أنهم لا يوفقون لصوم؟ فقال: أما إنه قد اجببت دعوة الملك فيهم قال: فقلت: وكيف ذلك جعلت فداك؟ قال: إن الناس لما قتلوا

الحسين صلوات الله عليه أمر الله تبارك وتعالى ملكا ينادي أيتها الامة الظالمة القاتلة عترة نبيها لاوفقكم الله لصوم و لا لفطر.

The narrator asked from Imam<sup>asws</sup>: What would you say about those people who claim that their enemies will not get the opportunity to fast? Imam<sup>asws</sup> replied: True, this is due to the prayers of an angel. I asked; why is it so? Imam<sup>asws</sup> responded, Allah<sup>azwj</sup> asked one of His angels to declare the following when people martyred Imam Hussain<sup>asws</sup>: O! The nation of Rasool Allah<sup>asws</sup> why did you stage brutality against the family of Prophet<sup>saww</sup> and killed them, Allah<sup>azwj</sup> would not give you an opportunity to fast and give away 'Fitra'. - Faroo-e-Kafi, tradition 2, vol. 3, pp. 357

Everyone knows that most people today are fasting on the day of Eid according to one Mujtahid and are celebrating Eid when it is still the month of Fasting, according to another Mujtahid.

#### Whither shall I wander?

P.s. For more information on moon sighting refer to the article 'Questions On Moon Sighting' which is available free on <a href="http://hubeali.com/english-books/Questions-On-Moonsighting.pdf">http://hubeali.com/english-books/Questions-On-Moonsighting.pdf</a>

In fact, most people do not even know why the Eid UI Fitr is to be celebrated in the first place. (Coming soon – Questions on Eids).

## **HAJJ**

The rules of Pilgrimage are well defined in the books of emulation but the main purpose of it is missing from all of them.

#### AL KAFI - H 1016, Ch. 96, h 1

علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن ابن اذينة، عن الفضيل، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: نظر إلى الناس يطوفون حول الكعبة، فقال: هكذا كانوا يطوفون في الجاهلية، إنما امروا أن يطوفوا

بها، ثم ينفروا إلينا فيعلمونا ولايتهم ومودتهم ويعرضوا علينا نصرتهم، ثم قرأ هذه الآية " واجعل أفئدة من الناس تهوى إليهم

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from his father from ibn abu 'Umayr from ibn 'Udhayna from Fudayl who has said the following: "Abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, looked at the people perform Tawaf (walking around the Ka'ba seven times) and said, 'This is how they used to perform Tawaf in the times of ignorance (pre-Islamic era). What they are required to do is to perform Tawaf and come to us, declare their belief in our Wilayah (Leadership with Divine Authority), their love for us and express their support for us.' The Imam then recited this verse of the Holy Quran. 'Lord, fill the hearts of the people with love for them'' (14:37)

'Declare their belief in our Wilayah' said our Master<sup>asws</sup>. But, the Wilayah belongs to the Mujtahid say the scholars of today (Wilayat e Faqih). And, they have taken it out of the Books of Emulation anyway.

So, have the Pilgrims just been circumambulating like those from the Pre-Islamic era all these years?

'This is how they used to perform Tawaf in the times of ignorance'. These Holy words will reverberate in many an ear for many years to come.

Here is a dilemma for you (And for your local Priest, for that matter).

#### SURAH AL NISA – VERSE 64

[Shakir 4:64] And We did not send any messenger but that he should be obeyed by Allah's permission; and had they, when they were unjust to themselves, come to you and asked forgiveness of Allah and the Messenger had (also) asked forgiveness for them, they would have found Allah Oft-returning (to mercy), Merciful.

Read again and see that sinners have to first go to the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> to ask for forgiveness of Allah<sup>saww</sup>, and only when the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> forgives them and seeks their forgiveness that they will find Allah<sup>azwj</sup> to be Forgiving and Merciful.

Now, when you go to Hajj, should you not be going to Medina first and seek forgiveness there, before proceeding to Mecca to be Forgiven? So what about the sinners who go to Mecca first, do their sins get Forgiven, without the Messenger of

Allah<sup>saww</sup> having forgiven them first? Or are they just going round and round like the Hadeeth says,'*This is how they used to perform Tawaf in the times of ignorance* (pre-Islamic era)'.

And if they go to Medina first, get their sins forgiven, and then go to Mecca and complete their Hajj, how would they declare their belief in Wilayah? They will have to come back to Medina for that. The sacred resting places of the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> and the Holy Infallibles<sup>asws</sup> are in Medina.

As the Hadeeth says, 'What they are required to do is to perform Tawaf and come to us, declare their belief in our Wilayah (Leadership with Divine Authority), their love for us and express their support for us'. Would they still have performed their Tawaf as in the times of ignorance?

Interesting eh?

## **ZAKAAT**

Did you notice the position of this one? This principle of Islam actually comes second to Prayers but hardly anyone of the Shiites ever pays this? Most of the energy of the Mujtahids has been diverted to the collection of Khums which has in fact been waived. (For more details refer to the paper 'Questions On Khums' <a href="http://hubeali.com/online-english-books">http://hubeali.com/online-english-books</a>)

There are many Divine Verses if the Holy Quran where the payment of this has been attached with the establishment of Prayer. But the importance of *Zakaat* these days has been diminished due to the low amount being paid compared to *Khums*.

#### **SURAH AL BAQARAH – VERSE 43**

وَأَقِيمُوا الصَّلَاةَ وَآثُوا الزَّكَاةَ وَارْكَعُوا مَعَ الرَّاكِعِينَ

And keep up prayer and pay the poor-rate and bow down with those who bow down.

#### MUSTADRIK AL WASAAIL – VOL 7 CH 12 H 1

عَنِ النَّبِيِّ صِ قَالَ لَا صَلَاةَ لِمَنْ لَا زَكَاةَ لَهُ وَ إِنَّهَا مِنْ فِطْرَةِ الْإِسْلَامِ

The Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> said: 'There is no Prayer when there is no Zakaat with it for it is from the nature of Islam.'

#### BIHAR UL ANWAAR – VOL 93 P 29 H 1

عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صِ أَنَّهُ قَالَ لَا تَتِمُّ صَلَاةً إِلَّا بِزَكَاةٍ وَ لَا تُقْبَلُ صَدَقَةٌ مِنْ غُلُولٍ وَ لَا صَلَاةً لِمَنْ لَا زَكَاةً لَـهُ وَ لَا وَرَعَ لَهُ

The Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> said: **'Prayer is incomplete without Zakaat** and charity is not accepted from a fraudster and **there is no Prayer when there is no Zakaat with it** and there is no **Zakaat** from an impious person.'

Let us now look at our own lives and see how much Zakaat we have given in our lives. Perhaps most of us are still waiting for the Mujtahids to give them the green light on this one.

Meanwhile, what is happening to our Prayers then? Since hardly anyone pays Zakaat?

And how come this is not mentioned in any of the books of emulation?

## **KHUMS**

#### This is the main reason for the production of the book of emulation.

This book does not get produced until such time as the Mujtahid becomes a Marja and is in a position to collect these monies. If his rules were the correct rules for the guidance of the people, he should have produced them and shown them to the people as soon as he became aware of them. But he did not.

He produces this book as soon as the people chose him for the collection of Khums.

But this tax has actually been waived.

#### THE HOLY IMAM AL MAHDI<sup>asws</sup>'S ORDERS

الكليني، عن إسحاق بن يعقوب فيما خرج إليه من الناحية المقدسة على يد محمد بن عثمان العمري: وأما المتلبسون بأموالنا، فمن استحل منها شيئا فأكله فانما يأكل النيران، وأما الخمس فقد ابيح لشيعتنا وجعلوا منه في حل إلى وقت ظهور أمرنا لتطبب و لادتهم و لا تخبث

In reply to a letter sent to **Imam-e-Zamana** asws, The Holy Imam asws says: 'About Khums, **I waive my rights for our Shias** and make is permissible for our Shias until the time of my reappearance so that their **children are born clean and pious and remain legitimate**'. **Bihar-ul-Anwar, vol 53, Wasail Al Shia, vol. 6, Chapter 4, Tradition 16**.

For more details refer to the paper 'Questions On Khums' <a href="http://hubeali.com/online-english-books">http://hubeali.com/online-english-books</a>

There are those who are still arguing about this matter even after reading the above article, which contains some of the Hadeeth which have waived the payment of Khums by the Shiites. There are no differences among these Hadeeth. They are consistent.

On the other hand, there are fifteen different Fatwas from different Mujtahids over the years regarding the payment of Khums. (For those who wish to see them can email me for them).

## **WILAYAH**

Ooooops! I forgot. This has been left out of the books of emulation.

Silly me.

#### AL KAFI - H 1480, CH 10, h 3

أبوعلي الاشعري، عن الحسن بن علي الكو في، عن عباس بن عامر، عن أبان بن عثمان، عن فضيل بن يسار، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: بني الاسلام على خمس: على الصلاة والزكاة والصوم والحج والولاية ولم يناد بشئ كما نودي بالولاية، فأخذ الناس بأربع وتركواهذه يعني الولاية

Abu Ali al-Ash'ari has narrated from al-Hassan ibn Ali al-Kufi from 'Abbas ibn 'Amir from Aban ibn 'Uthman from Fudayl ibn Yasar from abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "Abu Ja'far, recipient of divine supreme covenant, has said, 'Islam is based on five principles. They are: Prayer, al-Zakat (charity), Fasting, Hajj and al-Wilayah. The call to none of the other principles has been as emphatic as it has been to al-Wilayah. People accepted the other four but they left aside this i.e. al-Wilayah."

But, they say, the book of emulation is a book of guidance.

But, guidance can only come from a guide, and how can he be a guide when he himself is in need of guidance?

#### **SURAH AL YUNUS – VERSE 35**

Say: Is there any of your associates who guides to the truth? Say: Allah guides to the truth. Is He then Who guides to the truth more worthy to be followed, or he who himself does not go aright unless he is guided? What then is the matter with you; how do you judge?

The book of guidance will therefore be the book which contains guidance of the Divine Guides - the Holy Infallibles<sup>asws</sup>. The books of their<sup>asws</sup> statements. Their<sup>asws</sup> Noble Hadeeth.

So now they have come up with an innovative concept of the Wilayah being for the Mujtahids of the time. (Wilayat E Faqih).

There is absolutely no evidence to be found anywhere for this nonsensical concept. This is for the Holy Infallibles<sup>asws</sup> only and not for anyone else.

## A BOOK OF OPINIONS

Allahazwi has Chosen Islam as a religion for us.

#### **SURAH AAL-E-IMRAAN VERSE 85**

And whoever desires a religion other than Islam, it shall not be accepted from him, and in the hereafter he shall be one of the losers - 3:85

The Archange Jibraeel, known as the 'Trustworthy Angel', brought it to the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup>. Neither did he omit nor add anything to it. He brought is down to him<sup>saww</sup> as it was.

#### SURAH AL SHU'ARA - VERSES 192 TO 194

And most surely this is a revelation from the Lord of the worlds. The Faithful Spirit has descended with it, Upon your heart that you may be of the warners - 26:192 - 4

The Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> gave it to the people as it was without adding anything to it from himself or omitting anything from it.

#### **SURAH AL NAJM - VERSES 1 TO 3**

I swear by the star when it goes down. Your companion does not err, nor does he go astray; **Nor does he speak out of desire - Shakir 53:1-3** 

The Holy Imams<sup>asws</sup> did the same.

#### AL KAFI - H 177, Ch. 19, h21

علي، عن محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس، عن قتيبة قال: سأل رجل أبا عبدالله عليه السلام عن مسألة فأجابه فيها، فقال الرجل: أرأيت إن كان كذا وكذا ما يكون القول فيها؟ فقال له: مه ما أجبتك فيه من شئ فهو عن رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله لسنا من: " أرأيت " في شئ

Ali has narrated from Muhammad ibn 'Isa from Yunus from Qutayba who has said the following: "Once a man asked Imam abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, about an issue and the Imam replied. The man then said, 'Have you considered if it had been so and so the opinion in it would not have been as such.' The Imam then said, 'Wait; whatever I said in answer was from the Messenger of Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant. We are not of the people, who give personal opinion in anything."

Along came the Mujtahids, who issued books with three thousand opinions in them, for people to follow.

What shall we do with these books of opinions?

#### AL KAFI - H 157, Ch. 19, h1

الحسين بن محمد الاشعري، عن معلى بن محمد، عن الحسن بن علي الوشاء، و عدة من أصحابنا، عن أحمد بن محمد، عن ابن فضال جميعا، عن عاصم بن حميد، عن محمد ابن مسلم، عن أبي جعفر عليه السلام قال: خطب أمير المؤمنين عليه السلام الناس فقال: أيها الناس إنما بدء وقوع الفتن أهواء تتبع، وأحكام تبتدع، يخالف فيها كتاب الله، يتولى فيها رجال رجالا، فلو أن الباطل خلص لم يخف على ذي حجى، ولو أن الحق خلص لم يكن اختلاف ولكن يؤخذ من هذا ضغث ومن هذا ضغث فيمزجان فيجيئان معا فهنالك استحوذ الشيطان على أوليائه ونجا الذين سبقت لهم من الله الحسنى

Al-Husayn ibn Muhammad al-Ash'ari has narrated from Mu'alla ibn Muhammad from al-Hassan ibn Ali al-Washsha' and a number of our people from Ahmad ibn Muhammad from ibn Faddal all from 'Asim ibn Humayd from Muhammad ibn Muslim from abu Ja'far , recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "Imam Ali, recipient of divine supreme covenant, in one of his sermons has said, 'O people, mischief begins with following certain desires and obeying certain man-made rules that are different from the rules and laws of the book of Allah. In such a case, people yield to other people as a higher authority. If falsehood had been clear it remained so to the people of Intelligence. If truth had been clearly distinct differences did not emerge. But (in practical life) people mix certain parts of truth with a few things from falsehood and present them together. In such case Satan overwhelms his friends and only those who have previously received protection from Allah remain safe."

#### **BIHAR UL ANWAAR - VOL 36**

علي بن محمد الخزاز في كتابه (الكفاية) في النصوص على عدد الأئمة (عليهم السلام) عن الحسين بن محمد بن سعيد، عن محمد بن أحمد الصفواني، عن مروان بن محمد السنجاري، عن أبي يحيى التميمي، عن يحيى البكاء، عن علي (عليه السلام) قال: قال رسول الله(صلى الله عليه وآله): ستفترق امتي على ثلاث وسبعين فرقة، فرقة منها ناجية والباقون هالكون، والناجون الذين يتمسكون بولايتكم، ويقتبسون من علمكم، ولا يعملون برأيهم، فاولئك ما عليهم من سبيل.

The Holy Imam Ali<sup>asws</sup> said: 'The Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> said: 'My nation will divide into seventy three Sects, <u>only one</u> of which will achieve salvation whilst the rest will be destroyed. The successful will be the ones who will adhere to your Mastership (Wilayah) and quote from your knowledge, **and they will not act according to their opinion**. They are the ones on the right Path.

But, the Priests are adamant that unless we follow the opinions of a particular Mujtahid, none of our deeds would be acceptable, regardless of the fact that different Mujtahids are issuing wildly differing opinions.

But, the Commander of the Faithful saws said: -

#### WASAAIL AL SHIA – H 33184

[ 33184 ] 34 - وعن أبيه ، عن عبدالله بن المغيرة ، ومحمد بن سنان جميعا ، عن طلحة بن زيد ، عن أبي عبدالله ( عليه السلام ) ، قال أقل أمير المؤمنين ( عليه السلام ) : Y(t) = (t) لا رأى في الدين .

**H 33184** – And from his father, from Abdullah bin Al Mughira, and Muhammad bin Sinan together, from Talha Bin Zayd, from Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup>, from his father<sup>asws</sup>, said: 'The Commander of the Faithfu <sup>asws</sup> said: 'There is no opinion in religion'.

And the Messenger of Allah saww said :

#### AL KAFI - VOL 8 H 479

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ النَّوْفَلِيِّ عَنِ السَّكُونِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ ع قالَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ ع قالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ص سَيَاتِي عَلَى النَّاسِ زَمَانٌ لَا يَبْقَى مِنَ الْقُرْآنِ إِلَّا رَسُمْهُ وَ مِنَ الْإِسْلَامِ إِلَّا اسْمُهُ يُسْمَوْنَ بِهِ وَ هُمْ أَبْعَدُ النَّاسِ مِنْهُ مَسَاجِدُهُمْ عَامِرَةً وَ هِيَ خَرَابٌ مِنَ الْهُدَى فَقَهَاءُ ذَلِكَ الزَّمَانِ شَرَّ فَقَهَاءَ تَحْتَ ظِلِّ السَّمَاءِ مِنْهُمْ خَرَجَتِ الْفَتِّنَةَ وَ إِلَيْهِمْ تَعُودُ

Ali Bin Ibrahim heard from his father from Nawfil from Sakuni from Abu Abdillah asws who said: 'The Commander of the Faithful asws said that the Holy Prophet saww said: "A time will come upon the people when the Quran will only remain as a custom and Islam will only remain in name and the mosques will be full of people but they will be bereft of guidance and the **Fuqaha of that period will be the most evil Fuqaha** under the shadow of the sky; evil will emanate from them and return towards them".

No wonder.

## THE ACTIVITY

So what are they actually doing when it is said that they are engaging in the activity of litihad?

Are they looking for rules which have never been provided by the Divine Guides assws sent for mankind? But, that would be pointing an accusing finger at them<sup>asws</sup> for not having provided complete guidance for mankind.

But, religion was completed on the plains of *Ghadeer Khumm*.

### **SURAH AL MAIDAH – VERSE 3**

الْيَوْمَ يَئِسَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا مِنْ دِينِكُمْ فَلَا تَحْشَوْهُمْ وَاحْشَوْنَ ۖ الْيَوْمَ أَكْمَلْتُ لَكُمْ دِينَكُمْ وَأَثْمَمْتُ عَلَيْكُمْ نِعْمَتِي وَرَضِيتُ لَكُمُ الْإسْلَامَ دِينًا

This day have those who disbelieve despaired of your religion, so fear them not, and fear Me. This day have I completed for you your religion and completed My favour on you and chosen for you Islam as a religion:

Or are they saying that the Noble statements of the Holy Infallibles as are insufficient and they need to find answers to different questions?

But . . .

#### AL KAFI - H 179, Ch. 20, h1

Muhammad ibn Yahya has narrated from Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn 'Isa from Ali ibn Hadid from Murazim from abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "Allah, the Most Holy, the Most High, has certainly revealed an explanation for all things. I swear by Allah, He has not left untold any rule that His servants would need up to the Day of Judgment. He has done so, so that people will not say, 'Would that such and such had been said in the Holy Quran.' The fact is that He has already said it in the Holy Quran."

#### AL KAFI - H 182, Ch. 20, h4

<u>AL KAFI - H 182, Un. 20, 114</u> عن محمد بن عيسى، عن يونس، عن حماد، عن أبي عبدالله عليه السلام قال: سمعته يقول: ما من شئ إلا وفيه كتاب أو سنة

Ali has narrated from Muhammad ibn "Isa from Yunus from Hammad from abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, who has said the following: "I heard the Imam saying, 'There is nothing but it is in the Book and the Sunnah.'

So what are they doing by engaging in this activity of litihad?

Aaaaarghh! I could tear out my hair on this one!

No need.

## NAHJ UL BALAGAH - SERMON NO. 18

## In disparagement of the differences of view among the theologians.

The Holy Imam Ali<sup>asws</sup> says: When a problem is placed before anyone of them he passes judgement on it from his imagination. When exactly the same problem is placed before another of them he passes an opposite verdict. Then these judges go to the chief who had appointed them and he confirms all the verdicts, although their Allah is One (and the same), their Prophet is one (and the same), their Book (the Qur'an) is one (and the same).

Is it that Allah ordered them to differ and they obeyed Him? Or He prohibited them from it but they disobeyed Him? Or (is it that) Allah sent an incomplete Faith and sought their help to complete it? Or they are His partners in the affairs, so that it is their share of duty to pronounce and He has to agree? Or is it that Allah the Glorified sent a perfect faith but the Prophet fell short of conveying it and handing it over (to the people)? The fact is that Allah the Glorified says:

... We have not neglected anything in the Book (Qur'an) ... (Qur'an, 6:38)

And says that one part of the Qur'an verifies another part and that there is no divergence in it as He says:

. . . And if it had been from any other than Allah, they would surely have found in it much discrepancy. (Qur'an, 4:82)

But I still can't figure out what they are actually up to with this activity.

They are doing research!

Ahaa! Finally we are getting somewhere.

But are we?

When someone does research into electricity and produces a light bulb then I can understand what research he has done. But when the next person simply repeats this process then all he has done is to read up on it and copied the other one. You can't have thousands upon thousands of people researching into electricity over a thousand years and each one of them ends up producing a light bulb. Is this what you would call research?

All the Mujtahids have done over the years is to become experts in jurisprudence and produce rules and regulations on the same half a dozen subjects. Why all this repetition if the rules being produced are the correct ones?

## AL KAFI - H 175, Ch. 19, h19

علي بن إبراهيم، عن محمد بن عيسى بن عبيد، عن يونس، عن حريز عن زرارةقال: سألت أبا عبدالله عليه السلام عن الحلال والحرام فقال: حلال محمد حلال أبدا إلى يوم القيامة، وحرامه حرام أبدا إلى يوم القيامة، لا يكون غيره ولا يجيئ غيره، وقال: قال على عليه السلام: ما أحد ابتدع بدعة إلا ترك بها سنة

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from Muhammad ibn 'Isa ibn 'Ubayd from Yunus from Hariz from Zurara who has said the following: "Once I asked Imam abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, about lawful and unlawful matters and he said, 'Whatever the Holy Prophet, recipient of divine supreme covenant, has made lawful will remain lawful forever up to the Day of Judgment and whatever he has made unlawful will remain unlawful forever up to the Day of Judgment. There will be no one other than him and there will come no one other than him.' He said that Imam Ali has said, 'No one has established any innovation (heresy) without abandoning an established noble tradition."

So now where is the scope for ljtihad? Are they supposed to find **something other** than what has already come to us by way of Revelation?

#### WASAAIL U SHIA - VOL 27 H 33392

وعنه عن أحمد بن محمد، عن علي بن الحكم، عن حسان أبي علي عن أبي عبد الله (عليه السلام) - في حديث - قال: حسبكم أن تقولوا ما نقول، وتصمتوا عما نصمت، إنكم قد رأيتم أن الله عز وجل لم يجعل لأحد في خلافنا خيرا

And it is reported from Ahmad Bin Muhammad, from Ali Bin Al Hakam, from Hisaan Abu Ali from Abu Abdlllah<sup>asws</sup> in a Hadeeth that: 'It is sufficient for you that you should **say that which we say, and observe silence in that in which we keep silent**, as you have seen that Allah<sup>azwj</sup> has not kept any good in any of our adversaries.'

#### WASAAIL US SHIA – VOL 27 H 33227

وعن علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، عن ابن أبي عمير، عن عبد الرحمن بن الحجاج، عن هاشم صاحب البريد قال: قال أبو عبد الله (عليه السلام) - في حديث: - أما انه شر عليكم أن تقولوا بشئ ما لم تسمعوه منا

It has been narrated from Ali Bin Ibrahim from his father from Ibn Abi Ameer from Abdul Rahmaan Bin Al Hajjaj from Hisham Sahib Al Bareed that Abu Abdillah<sup>asws</sup> said in a Hadeeth: 'It is a loss for you if you were to say anything which you have not heard from us.'

But, they say, the rules and regulations presented by the Mujtahid is exactly what the Holy Imams<sup>asws</sup> have said anyhow, and so where is the problem?

I say, if that is the case, and clearly it is not, for there are wild differences between the opinions of the Mujtahids, then why are they not saying so? What would be the harm in saying that this is from the Holy Imams<sup>asws</sup>? Why say on their books – 'Fatwas according to ...... (such and such Mujtahid)'?

#### WASAAIL AL SHIA – H 33400

33400 وَ عَنْ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ مُحَمَّدٍ عَنْ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ الْحَكَمِ عَنْ أَبِي بَكْرِ الْحَضْرَمِيِّ عَنِ الْحَجَّاجِ بْنِ الْصَبَّاحِ قَالَ قَلْتُ لِأَبِي جَعْفَرٍ ع إِنَّا نُحَدِّثُ عَنْكَ بِالْحَدِيثِ فَيَقُولُ بَعْضُنَا قُولُنَا قُولُهُمْ قَالَ قَمَا تُرِيدُ أَنْ تَكُونَ الْمَا يُقْتَدَى بِكَ مَنْ رَدَّ الْقُولُ النِّنَا فَقَدْ سَلِمَ

<u>H 33400</u> – And from Ahmad Bin Muhammad from Ali Bin Al Hakam from Abu Bakr Al Hazramy from Al Hajjaj Bin Al Sabbah who said that he said to Abu Ja'far<sup>asws</sup>, 'We narrate Hadeeth from you<sup>asws</sup>. Some of us say that our words are your<sup>asws</sup> words'. He<sup>asws</sup> said: 'What do you intend? **You want to be Imams and be followed**? The one who returns the words back to us<sup>asws</sup> will be safe'.

Therein lies the problem. If they say that these rules are from a Holy Imam<sup>asws</sup>, they will have to give the reference, and they will not be able to do it. So, each one of them puts his own name to it that it is his personal opinion.

Yes, but they have given us detailed rules and regulations on various subjects, they say.

Religion is simple, it is the idiots who have complicated it.

The Commander of the Faithful<sup>asws</sup> said: **'Knowledge is a dot, the ignoramuses have expanded it**'. (Khutba Iftikhariya).

One of them writes seventy volumes on purities and impurities and every one gets impressed by it. The other one writes forty volumes on the science of the narrators and people swoon at his feet. The more volumes written on a subject, the more knowledgeable he is regarded as.

What a contrast.

And then they go around quoting the following Hadeeth that the Imams<sup>asws</sup> only gave us the principles of religion, and that it is for the Mujtahids to derive the branches from these.

#### **WASAAIL U SHIA – H 33202**

ونقل من كتاب أحمد بن محمد بن أبي نصر، عن الرضا (عليه السلام) قال: علينا إلقاء الاصول و عليكم التفريع.

And copied from the book of Ahmad Bin Muhammad Bin Abu Nasr, from Al Ridha<sup>asws</sup>, said: 'On us<sup>asws</sup> is to give you the principles and on you is the branching'.

First of all, does it mean that the Imams<sup>asws</sup> ONLY gave out the principles and Never gave out the branches, and that ALL the branches have to be derived by the Mujtahids?

This is clearly not the case as more than 90% of the Hadeeth have clearly defined the branches of religion and do not deal with the principles.

Secondly, the deviousness of the Priests is clearly exposed by the fact that the Principles of Religion (*Usool E Deen*) have been manufactured by them as being – *Tawheed, Adaalat, Nabuwwat, Imamat, Qiyamat* – rather than having adopted the ones given out by the Imams<sup>asws</sup>.

So, what they did was manufacture the Principles first, and then derive the branches from them as they felt like, thereby contradicting the very argument that they present.

#### **WASAAIL AL SHIA - 33193**

- محمد بن محمد المفيد في (المجالس) عن الصدوق، عن محمد بن الحسن بن الوليد، عن الصفار، عن يعقوب بن يزيد، عن حماد بن عيسى، عن حماد بن عثمان، عن زرارة بن أعين قال: قال لي أبو جعفر محمد بن علي (عليهما السلام): يا زرارة! إياك وأصحاب القياس في الدين، فانهم تركوا علم ما وكلوا به وتكلفوا ما قد كفوه يتأولون الأخبار ويكذبون على لله عزوجل، وكأني بالرجل منهم ينادى من بين يديه، فيجيب من خلفه وينادى من خلفه فيجيب من بين يديه قد تاهوا وتحيروا في الأرض والدين.

Muhammad Bin Muhammad Al Mufeed in 'Al Majalis' from Al Sadouq, from Muhammad Bin Al Hasan Bin Al Waleed from Al Saffar, from Yaqoub Bin Yazeed, from Hamaad Bin Isa, from Hamaad Bin Usman, from Zararah Bin Aieen who said, ;Abu Ja'far<sup>asws</sup> said to me: 'O Zararah! Beware of the people of analogy in religion, for they have avoided the knowledge of what was assigned to them and entered into hair-splitting of matters, They interpreted the Akhbaar (Hadeeth) as they like and assigned lies to Allah<sup>azwj</sup> Mighty and Majestic. It is as if a man among them is called from the front, he answers the one behind him, and if called from behind, he answers the one in front of him. They are confused and wander aimlessly in the earth and in religion'.

# THE IJTIHAD OF UMAR IBN KHATTABIa

This litihad was initiated in opposition to the Holy Imam Aliasws.

#### KITAB SULAYM BIN QAYS AL HILALI – H 42

فغضب عمر وقال: إن ابن أبي طالب يحسب أنه ليس عند أحد علم غيره فمن كان يقرأ من القرآن شيئا فليأتنا به فكان إذا جاء رجل بقرآن فقرأه ومعه آخر كتبه، وإلا لم يكتبه. فمن قال - يا معاوية – إنه ضاع من القرآن شيئ فقد كذب، هو عند أهله مجموع محفوظ. أول إعلان رسمي عن إعمال الرأى في دين الله ثم أمر عمر قضاته وولاته: قال: (إجتهدوا رأيكم واتبعوا ما ترون أنه الحق) فلم يزل هو وبعض ولاته وقد وقعوا في عظيمة، فكان علي بن أبي طالب عليه السلام خبر هم بما يحتج به عليهم. وكان عماله وقضاته يحكمون في شيئ واحد بقضايا مختلفة فيجيز ها لهم، لأن الله لم يؤته الحكمة و فصل الخطاب.

The Holy Imam Ali<sup>asws</sup> said: 'The whole Quran cannot be reached except by those that are pure and that means us'.

Umar became angry with that and said: 'Ibn Abi Talib thinks that except him no one else has the knowledge. Whoever recites a little bit of Quran let him bring it to me.' So, whenever anyone brought a Quranic Verse and recited it, and also had another person with him, he (Umar) used to write it and sometimes he would not.

Umar said: 'O Muawiyah! Anyone who said that a bit of Quran was missing then he is a liar. It is safe with the one who is qualified and is present.' Then Umar ordered his reporters and governors and told them to do litihad in their opinion and follow whatever they understood to be the truth.

So he, and some of his governors always remained in trouble, so Ali Ibn Abi Talib<sup>asws</sup> used to tell them those matters in which he used to establish argument over them. <u>Umar's governors used to arrive at different decisions over the same matter and Umar used to endorse them as correct</u>, because Allah<sup>azwj</sup> did not give them the wisdom or qualification for correct decision.

Endorsing all differing decisions to be correct is the way of Umar Ibn Khattab<sup>la</sup>, whilst the Holy Imam Ali<sup>asws</sup> says: -

## NAHJ UL BALAGAH - SAYING NO. 182

مَا اخْتَلَفَتْ دَعُوتَانِ إِلَّا كَانَتْ إِحْدَاهُمَا ضَلَّالَّهُ

Where there are two differing claims then **one of them is a straying**. (If two opposite theories are propagated, **one will be wrong** – Official translation)

Is this not what is happening today? The Mujtahids are coming out with conflicting Fatwas and **ALL** their decisions are being regarded are correct.

Are they the followers of . . . . guess who?

Come on!

Take a wild guess!

## **WILL THE MUJTAHID GO TO PARADISE?**

He can either get it right or get it wrong. It cannot be both.

No! Say the Priests, for we have a Hadeeth for this. And so they present this one -

#### **SAHIH MUSLIM – B18 – H 4261**

عن عمرو بن العاص أنه سمع رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: إذا حكم الحاكم فاجتهد ثم أصاب، فله أجران. وإذا حكم فاجتهد، ثم أخطأ، فله أجر

'Amr b. al-'As reported that he heard Allah's Messenger (may peace be upon him) as saying: 'When a judge gives a decision by ljtihad and gets it right, there are two rewards for him; and if he gave a judgment by ljtihad but erred, there is one reward for him'.

First of all **this Hadeeth is not to be found in any of the Shiite books**. This is from the Sunni book called *Sahih Muslim*.

Secondly there is only one narrator mentioned in this Hadeeth – Amr Bin Al Aas, the arch enemy of the Holy Imam Ali<sup>asws</sup>, and the right hand man of Muawiya Bin Abu Sufyan<sup>la</sup>.

Thirdly, this Hadeeth is for the justification of the decisions made by the first Caliph Abu Bakr<sup>la</sup>.

## KANZ UL AMMAL – VOL 5 – AL MUTTAQI HINDI (SUNNI)

الله المحر عن موسى بن إبراهيم عن رجل من آل ربيعة أنه بلغه أن أبا بكر حين استُخلف قعد في بيته حزيناً ، فدخل عليه عمر فأقبل عليه يكومه وقال: أنت كلفتني هذا الأمر وشكا اليه الحكم بين الناس فقال له عمر : أو ما علمت أن رسول الله وقط الحق قال: إن الوالي إذا اجتهد فأصاب الحق فله أجران ، وإن اجتهد فأخطأ الحق فله أجر واحد فكأنه سهيل على أبي بكر . (ابن راهويه وخينمة في فضائل الصحابة هب) .

It has been narrated from Musa Bin Ibrahim from the people of Rabi'a who said that Abu Bakr was sitting in his house with fear and grief, when Umar entered, and he (Abu Bakr) accused him by saying: 'I find doubt in this decision of mine that I have given between people, which you gave me to do.' Umar said to him: 'I have known from the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> that: 'When a judge does Ijtihad and gets it right he gets two rewards for it, and if he does Ijtihad and gets it wrong he gets one reward.' Abu Bakr was then satisfied with this.

Fourthly, the Holy Imam Ali<sup>asws</sup> has said the following in the **first Shiite book of Hadeeth**.

#### KITAB SULAYM BIN QAYS AL HILALI – H 22

ما لقيت من هذه الامة من كذابيها ومنافقيها. لكأني بالقراء الضعفة المجتهدين قدرووا حديثه وصدقوه فيه واحتجوا . علينا أهل البيت بكذبه

'From this Ummah, what I have seen from its liars and hypocrites – Of course I can see those reciters who are weak and are Mujtahids have narrated his (Amr Bin Al Aas's) Hadeeth and confirm him and present his lies as arguments in opposition to us AhI UI Bayt<sup>asws</sup>'.

Fifthly, the Holy Imam Muhammad Al Baqirasws has said this: -

#### **WASAAIL AL SHIA – H33185**

[ 33185 ] 35 - وعن ابن محبوب أو غيره ، عن مثنى الحناط ، عن أبي بصير ، قال : قلت لابي جعفر ( عليه السلام ) : ترد علينا أشياء لا نجدها في الكتاب والسنة ، فنقول فيها برأينا ، فقال : أما أنك إن أصبت لم توجر ، وإن أخطأت كذبت على الله .

**H 33185** – And from Ibn Mahboub or another, from Mathni Al Hanaat, from Abu Baseer who said, 'I said to Abu Ja'far<sup>asws</sup>: 'Matters get referred to us whose existence we do not find in the Book and the Sunnah, we speak on them by opinion'. He<sup>asws</sup> said: 'If you get it right you will get no reward for it, and if you make a mistake you will have forged a lie against Allah<sup>azwj</sup>'.

And this is what Allahazwj has said about this:

## **SURAH AL YUNUS – VERSE 17**

فْمَنْ أَطْلَمُ مِمَّن افْتَرَى عَلَى اللّهِ كَذِبًا أَوْ كَذَّبَ بِآيَاتِهِ إِنَّهُ لا يُقْلِحُ الْمُجْرِمُونَ

Who is then more unjust than who forges a lie against Allah or (who) gives the lie to His communications? Surely the guilty shall not be successful.

If he gets it right he gets nothing for it.

If he gets it wrong, the fire of Hell awaits.

You figure this one out.

## **BEARING OF THE BURDEN**

Taking the easy way out, that is the normal approach of most people in this world. But is does not always work out, especially in Religion.

"Why should I read, when the Mujtahid can do it for me. Let him hold on to the two weighty things, and I shall hold on to him (being a third), and just sit back and have a cup of tea in the local Mosque waiting for my life to pass away, and then I can abide in never ending happiness in Paradise".

Sounds familiar? Well, be prepared to be shocked. The Mujtahid does not hold on to the two weighty things. As you have seen, Hadeeth does not form part of the Hawza course for litihad.

There goes one of the weighty things.

The second weighty thing, the Book of Allah<sup>azwj</sup>, is being interpreted by them by opinion, and so they have reserved a seat for themselves in the Fire. The Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> said that, and so you cannot argue with that one.

And even if you were to find someone who does hold on to the two weighty things, where is your justification in holding on to a third? Who has told you to do that?

The guarantee of salvation given by the Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> was based upon people holding on to the two weighty things. People decided to abandon these and instead decided to hold on to the third, a Mujtahid. Does this not invalidate the guarantee?

Allah<sup>azwj</sup> Says: -

#### **SURAH AL ANAAM – VERSE 64**

[Shakir 6:164] Say: What! Shall I seek a Lord other than Allah? And He is the Lord of all things; and no soul earns (evil) but against itself, and no bearer of burden shall bear the burden of another; then to your Lord is your return, so He will inform you of that in which you differed.

#### **SURAH FATIR - VERSE 18**

وَلَا تَزِرُ وَازِرَةٌ وِزْرَ أُخْرَى وَإِن تَدْعُ مُثْقَلَةٌ إِلَى حِمْلِهَا لَا يُحْمَلْ مِنْهُ شَيْءٌ وَلَوْ كَانَ ذَا قُرْبَى إِنَّمَا تُنذِرُ وَازِرَةٌ وِزْرَ أُخْرَى وَإِن تَدْعُ مُثْقَلَةٌ إِلَى حِمْلِهَا لَا يُحْمَلْ مِنْهُ شَيْءٌ وَلَوْ كَانَ ذَا قُرْبَى إِنَّمَا يَتَزَكَّى لِنَفْسِهِ وَإِلَى اللَّهِ الْمَصِيرُ تُتَذَرُ الَّذِينَ يَخْشَوْنَ رَبَّهُم بِالغَيْبِ وَأَقَامُوا الصَّلَاةَ وَمَن تَزَكَّى فَإِنَّمَا يَتَزَكَّى لِنَفْسِهِ وَإِلَى اللَّهِ الْمَصِيرُ

[Shakir 35:18] And a burdened soul cannot bear the burden of another and if one weighed down by burden should cry for (another to carry) its burden, not aught of it shall be carried, even though he is near of kin. You warn only those who fear their Lord in secret and keep up prayer; and whoever purifies himself, he purifies himself only for (the good of) his own soul; and to Allah is the eventual coming.

**Everyone will have to bear their own burden**. This is a negation of the view that if one were to act according to the *Fatwa* of a *Mujtahid* then the responsibility lies solely with the *Mujtahid* and one will be free from its consequences.

But then, we have this Hadeeth -

#### WASAAIL AL SHIA - H 33100

[ 33100 ] 1 - محمد بن يعقوب ، عن محمد بن يحيى ، عن أحمد بن محمد ، عن ابن محبوب ، عن ابن رئاب ، عن أبي عبيدة ، قال : قال أبو جعفر ( عليه السلام ) : من أفتى الناس بغير علم ، ولا هدى من الله لعنته ملائكة الرحمة ، وملائكة العذاب ، ولحقه وزر من عمل بفتياه .

<u>H 33100</u> – Muhammad Bin Yaqoub from Muhammad Bin Yahya from Ahmad Bin Muhammad from Ibn Mahboub from Ibn Ra'b Abu Ubeyda who said that Abu Ja'far<sup>asws</sup>: 'Whoever issues Fatwa to the people without knowledge, and **is not a Guide from Allah<sup>azwi</sup>**, gets cursed by the Angels of Mercy and the Angels of Punishment, **and the actions of those that act upon his Fatwa will be upon his back'**.

Do not worry, there is no contradiction here. Let me explain this by way of an example.

Imagine a person riding a donkey, while carrying a suitcase on his own head. He is still carrying his own burden, but the donkey is carrying both their burdens.

## THE DEBATE

A Mujtahid once came to the Holy Imam Ja'far Al Sadiq<sup>asws</sup> for debate. The following is an extract from that Hadeeth –

### AL KAFI - H 428, Ch. 1, h4

علي بن إبراهيم، عن أبيه، عمن ذكره، عن يونس بن يعقوب قال: كنت عند أبي عبدالله عليه السلام فورد عليه رجل من أهل الشام فقال: إني رجل صاحب كلام وفقه وفرائض وقد جئت لمناظرة أصحابك، فقال أبو عبدالله عليه السلام: كلامك من كلام رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله أو من عندك؟ فقال: من كلام رسول الله صلى الله عليه واله ومن عندى فقال ابو عبدالله: فأنت إذا شريك رسول الله؟ قال: لا، قال: فسمعت الوحي عن الله عزوجل يخبرك؟ قال: لا، قال: فتجب طاعتك كما تجب طاعة رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله؟ قال: لا، فالتفت ابو عبدالله عليه السلام الي فقال: يا يونس بن يعقوب هذا قد خصم نفسه قبل ان يتكلم

Ali ibn Ibrahim has narrated from his father from those he mentioned from Yunus ibn Ya'qub who has said the following: "Once I was in the presence of Imam abu 'Abd Allah, recipient of divine supreme covenant, when a man from Sham (Syria) came to him and said:

'I am a man of Kalam (theology), Fiqh (laws) and Fara'id (rules of obligations) and I have come to debate with your people.'

"Imam Abu 'Abd Allah<sup>asws</sup> asked, 'Are your meaningful words those of the Messenger of Allah or your own words?'

He replied, 'Something from the words of the Messenger of Allah and there is something of my own words.'

The Imam<sup>asws</sup> said, 'Are then you a partner of the Messenger of Allah?'

He said, 'No, I am not.'

The Imam<sup>asws</sup>, recipient of divine supreme covenant, asked, 'Have you received any revelation from Allah, the Most Holy, the Most High?'

He said, 'No, I have not.'

The Imam<sup>asws</sup> then asked, 'Is it obligatory to obey you just as it is obligatory to obey the Messenger of Allah?'

He said, 'No, it is not.'

The Imam<sup>asws</sup>, recipient of divine supreme covenant, then turned to me and said, 'O Yunus ibn Ya'qub, this man has just defeated himself before debating others.'

Why don't you ask the Mujtahids of today the same questions and see what answers you get?

Do not be surprised to see that human thinking has yet to evolve significantly over a thousand years.

## **HOW TO EASILY DEFEAT AN OPPONENT IN A DEBATE**

It works! I have tried it.

#### WASAAIL AL SHIA - H 33230

[ 33230 ] 28 - محمد بن عمر الكشي في كتاب ( الرجال ) عن محمد بن مسعود ، عن علي بن محمد القمي ، عن أحمد بن محمد بن عيسى ، عن علي بن الحكم ، عن فضيل بن عثمان ، عن أبي عبدالله ( عليه السلام ) - في حديث - أنه ذكر مؤمن الطاق ، فقال : بلغني : أنه جدل ، وأنه يتكلم  $^{(1)}$  ، قلت : أجل  $^{(2)}$  ، قال : أما لو شاء طريف  $^{(3)}$  من مخاصميه أن يخصمه فعل ؟ قلت : كيف ؟ قال  $^{(4)}$  : يقول : أخبرني عن كلامك هذا ، من كلام إمامك ؟ فان قال : نعم ، كذب علينا ، وإن قال :  $^{(4)}$  ديف تتكلم بكلام ،  $^{(5)}$  يتكلم به إمامك .

H 33230 – Muhammad Bin Umar Al Kashy in the Book Al Rijaal from Muhammad Bin Mas'ud, from Ali Bin Muhammad Al Qummi, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad Bin Isa, from Ali Bin Al Hakam, from Fuzayl Bin Uthman, from Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup> – in a Hadeeth – in which was a mention of 'Mo'min Al Taaq', said: 'I<sup>asws</sup> have been told that he argues extensively and uses theology? I said, 'Yes, he does'. He<sup>asws</sup> said: 'If a weak opponent so wishes he can defeat him in debate'. I said, 'How?' He<sup>asws</sup> said: 'By saying, 'Tell me about these statements of yours, are they from your Imam<sup>asws</sup>? If he replies, yes, then he has forged lies against us<sup>asws</sup>, and if he were to say, no, say to him, 'How can you say that which your Imam<sup>asws</sup> has not said?'

Basically, he can only say that which his Imam<sup>asws</sup> has said, and if such is the case then he will have to provide a reference for it, and he will not be able to do it if he has lied. If he has spoken the truth then fine, for he will be doing what I have been doing. Let the Holy Imam<sup>asws</sup> do the talking. Get a reference out of him though.

## WASAAIL AL SHIA – H 33227

[ 33227 ] 25 ـ وعن علي بن إبراهيم ، عن أبيه ، عن ابن أبي عمير ، عن عبد الرحمن بن الحجاج ، عن هاشم صاحب البريد ، قال : قال أبو عبدالله ( عليه السلام ) ـ في حديث ـ : أما انه شر عليكم أن تقولوا بشيء ما لم تسمعوه منا .

**H 33227** – And from Ali Bin Ibrahim, from his father, from Ibn Abu Uneyr, from Abdul Rahman bin Al Hajaaj, from Hisham Saahib Al Bareed who said that Abu Abdullah<sup>asws</sup> said in a Hadeeth: 'It is an evil for you that you should say anything that you have not heard from us<sup>asws</sup>.

## CONCLUSION

Iblees<sup>la</sup> laid the foundation of Ijtihad and was the first Mujtahid among the Jinn, when he used analogy to derive a conclusion.

Abu Bakr<sup>la</sup> and Umar<sup>la</sup> were the first Mujtahids among men who used *Aql* and *Ijma* at *Saqifa* to derive a conclusion.

The first Fatwa issued was to the execution of the Commander of the Faithful<sup>asws</sup> Ali Ibn Abu Talib<sup>asws</sup>.

If the Mujtahid does ijtihad and gets it right, he gets no reward for it, but if he gets it wrong, he will have forged a lie against Allah<sup>azwj</sup>.

No soul shall bear the burden of another except for the Mujtahid who will bear the burden of the followers of his Fatwas, over and above his own.

The people regard the Mujtahids as the most knowledgeable of all. The Holy Imams<sup>asws</sup> on the other hand do not recognise them at all.

## Wasaail Us Shia Vol 11 H 27; Bihar Ul Anwaar Vol. 82 H 2; Rijal Kashi Vol 3.

Imam Sadiq<sup>asws</sup> said: Understand the status of our Shites according to the good reports narrated from us for **we do not recognise the Faqih from among them to be a Faqih unless he becomes a Muhaddith** (Narrator of traditions)

The people regard the Mujtahids are the most respectable of all people. The Messenger of Allah<sup>saww</sup> on the other hand –

#### AL KAFI - VOL 8 H 479

عَلِيُّ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنِ النَّوْقَلِيِّ عَنِ السَّكُونِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ اللَّهِ عَ قَالَ أَمِيرُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ عِ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَ سَيَأْتِي عَلَى النَّاسِ زَمَانُ لَا يَبْقَى مِنَ الْقُرْآنِ إِلَّا رَسْمُهُ وَ مِنَ الْإِسْلَامِ إِلَّا اسْمُهُ يُسَمَّوْنَ بِهِ وَ هُمْ أَبْعَدُ النَّاسِ مِنْهُ مَسَاجِدُهُمْ عَامِرَةٌ وَ هِيَ خَرَابٌ مِنَ الْهُدَى فُقَهَاءُ ذَلِكَ الزَّمَانِ شَرُّ فُقَهَاءَ تَحْتَ ظِلًّ السَّمَاءِ مِنْهُمْ خَرَجَتِ الْقِثَنَةُ وَ إِلَيْهِمْ تَعُودُ السَّمَاءِ مِنْهُمْ خَرَجَتِ الْقِثَنَةُ وَ إِلَيْهِمْ تَعُودُ

Ali Bin Ibrahim heard from his father from Nawfil from Sakuni from Abu Abdillah<sup>asws</sup> who said: 'The Commander of the Faithful<sup>asws</sup> said that the Holy Prophet<sup>saww</sup> said: "A time will come upon the people when the Quran will only remain as a custom and Islam will only remain in name and the mosques will be full of people but they will be bereft of guidance and the **Fuqaha of that period will be the most evil Fuqaha** under the shadow of the sky; mischief will emanate from them and return towards them".

And when the Holy Imam Mahdi<sup>asws</sup> makes his re-appearance, will he<sup>asws</sup> embrace the Mujtahids or will he<sup>asws</sup> have them executed?

Why not ask the Priests themselves and see what they have to say about this?

One way to find out though.

Wait for it.

Bashir Alidina *June 2011* 

## **APPENDIX**

### WASAAIL AL SHIA - H 33224

[ 33224 ] 22 - وعنهم ، عن أحمد بن محمد ، عن الوشاء ، عن ثعلبة بن ميمون ، عن أبي مريم ، قال : قال أبو جعفر ( عليه السلام ) لسلمة بن كهيل ، والحكم بن عتيبة : شرقا وغربا فلا تجدان علما صحيحا إلا شيئا خرج من عندنا أهل البيت .

**H 33224** – An from them, from Ahmad Bin Muhammad, from Al Washa', from Tha'albat Bin Maymoun, from Abu Maryam who said that Abu Ja'far<sup>asws</sup> said to Salmat Bin Kaheel and Al Hakam Bin Uteybah: 'East or west, you will not find in them the correct knowledge except for what has come from us<sup>asws</sup> the People of the Household<sup>asws</sup>.